*ALTER*NATION

Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of the Arts and Humanities in Southern Africa Special Edition Number 19 (2017)
Electronic ISSN 2519-5476

Religion & Social Responsibility

* *Alter*nation is an international journal which publishes interdisciplinary contributions in the fields of the Arts and Humanities in Southern Africa.
* Prior to publication, each publication in *Alter*nation is reviewed by at least two independent peer reviewers.
* *Alter*nation is indexed in The Index to South African Periodicals (ISAP) and hosted online on the UKZN platform, on OJS, and by EBSCO
* *Alter*nation is published every semester. Special editions may be published p.a.
* *Alter*nation was accredited in 1996.

EDITOR Johannes A. Smit (UKZN)

ASSOCIATE EDITOR Nobuhle P. Hlongwa (UKZN)

ASSISTANT EDITOR: Denzil Chetty; **ASSISTANT EDITOR**: Beverly Vencatsamy

***Alter*nation Editorial Committee**

Catherine Addison (UNIZUL); Nyna Amin (UKZN); Urmilla Bob (UKZN); Denzil Chetty (UNISA); Rubby Dhunpath (UKZN); Judith Lütge Coullie (UCanterbury); Brian Fulela (UKZN); Nobuhle Hlongwa (UKZN); Rembrandt Klopper (UKZN/ UNISA); Sadhana Manik (UKZN); Jabulani Mkhize (UFH); Nhlanhla Mkhize (UKZN); Sikhumbuzo Mngadi (UJ); Shane Moran (UFH); Thabo Msibi (UKZN); Maheshvari Naidu (UKZN); Thengani Harold Ngwenya (DUT); Johannes A. Smit (UKZN); Graham Stewart (DUT); Beverley Vencatsamy (UKZN)

***Alter*nation Research Board**

Salim Akojee (Nottingham, UK); Robert Balfour (North-West University, SA); Lesiba Baloyi (Sefako Makgatho Health Sciences University, SA); Jaco Beyers (Pretoria, SA); Stephen Bigger (Worcester, SA); Victor M.H. Borden (Indiana, USA); Vivienne Bozalek (UWC, SA); Renato Bulcao de Moraes (Paulista, Brazil); Ezra Chitando (Zimbabwe); Hamish Coates (Melbourne, Aus); Ampie Coetzee (UWC, SA); Scarlett Cornelissen (Stellenbosch, SA); Chats Devroop (UKZN, SA); Simon During (Melbourne, AUS); Farid Esack (UJ, SA); Noel Gough (La Trobe University, Aus); Rosalind I.J. Hackett (Tennessee, USA); Jeanne-Marie Jackson (Johns Hopkins, USA); Tony Jackson (Skyline College, Oakland, NZ); Russell H. Kaschula (Rhodes, SA); Langa Khumalo (UKZN; SA); Elmar Lehmann (Duisberg-Essen, Germany); Janine Lewis (Tshwane University of Technology, SA); Sam Lubbe (Milpark, SA); Sibusiso Masondo (UKZN, SA); Stephan Meyer (Basel, Switzerland); Suriamurthee Moonsamy Maistry (UKZN, SA); Pholoho Morojele (UKZN, SA); Herbert Moyo (UKZN, SA); Wade Nobles (San Francisco State, USA); Maurice Joseph Nutt (Xavier, University of Louisiana, USA); Francis B. Nyamnjoh (UCT, SA); Beatrice Okyere-Manu (UKZN, SA); Bert Olivier (Free State University, SA); Charles O'Neill (British University in Egypt); Vivian Ojong (UKZN, SA); Kriben Pillay (UKZN, SA); Kathleen Pithouse-Morgan (UKZN, SA); Julia Preece (DUT, SA); Geo Quinot (Stellenbosch, SA); Lesibana J. Rafapa (UNISA, SA); Auwais Rafudeen (UNISA, SA); Mogobe Ramose (Sefako Makgatho Health Sciences University, SA); Erhard Reckwitz (Duisberg-Essen, Germany); Dan Remenyi (UWC/ Dublin); Cornelia Roux (Stellenbosch, SA); Hemduth Rugbeer (UNIZUL, SA); Michael Samuel (UKZN, SA); Federico Settler (UKZN, SA); Anand Singh (UKZN, SA); Lilian C. Siwila (UKZN, SA); Tholene Sodi (Limpopo, SA); Crain Soudien (HSRC, SA); Lesley Stainbank (UKZN/ DUT, SA); Kamilla Swart (American University, Dubai); Nisbert T. Taringa (Zimbabwe); Wilfred Isioma Ukpere (UJ, SA); Goolam Vahed (UKZN, SA); Gina Wisker (Brighton, UK)

COVER

A.W. Kruger

CORRESPONDENCE ADDRESS

The Editor: Alternation, Univ. of KwaZulu-Natal, Priv. Bag X10, Dalbridge, 4041, DURBAN, South Africa; Tel: +27-(0)31-260-7303; Fax: +27-(0)31-260-7286; Web: http://alternation.ukzn.ac.za
e-mail: smitj@ukzn.ac.za; Hlongwan1@ukzn.ac.za; chettd@unisa.ac.za; vencatsamyb@ukzn.ac.za

Print ISSN: 1023-1757; Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476

Copyright Reserved: *Alter*nation

*Alter*nation

Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of the Arts and Humanities in Southern Africa

Religion and Social Responsibility

Guest Editors
Johannes A. Smit,
Lilian Siwila
and
Denzil Chetty

2017

CSSALL
Durban

Acknowledgement of Reviewers

We wish to acknowledge the participation of the following reviewers in the production of this issue of *Alter*nation.

M. Elijah Baloyi – University of South Africa
Sophia Chirongoma – Midlands State University
Agnes Chiwara – University of Zimbabwe
Marie Engh – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Julius M. Gathogo – Kenyatta University
Nirmala Gopal – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Muhammed Haron – University of Botswana
Roderick Hewitt – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Sokfa John – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Mutale Kaunda – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Sultan Khan – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Kapya John Kaoma – Boston University
Simanga R. Kumalo – Seth Mokitimi Methodist Seminary
Clint le Bruyns – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Tapiwa Praise Mapuranga – University of Zimbabwe
Sibusiso Masondo – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Henry Mbaya – Stellenbosch University
Herbert Moyo – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Nelly Mwale – University of Zambia
Prof. Philomena N. Mwaura – Kenyatta University
Maheshvari Naidu – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Samuel J. Ngale – University of Zimbabwe
Sinenhlanhla Ngwenya – University of South Africa
Fidelis Nkomazana – University of Botswana
Beatrice Okyere-manu – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Jan Platvoet – Leiden University
Moji Ruele – University of Botswana
Xolani Sakuba – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Tabona Shoko – University of Zimbabwe
Lilian Siwila – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Nicholas Southey – University of South Africa
Nisbert Taringa – University of Zimbabwe
Charlene van der Walt – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Beverly Vencatsamy – University of KwaZulu-Natal
Sithembiso Zwane – University of KwaZulu-Natal

***Alter*nation Special Edition 19, 2017**
Electronic ISSN 2519-5476

Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of the Arts and Humanities in Southern Africa

ARTICLES

Johannes A. Smit, Lilian Siwila and Denzil Chetty Editorial: Religion and Social Responsibility 1
Johannes A. Smit Social Responsibility and Power I: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions For and On Behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) 12
Johannes A. Smit Social Responsibility and Power II: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions For and On Behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) 45
S.A. Chembea *Waqf*s and the Dynamics of Muslim Charity in Secular Milieus, Kenya, 1900 – 2010 88
Roderick R. Hewitt Ecclesial Leadership and Social Responsibility within the African Context of Economic Injustice 115
Nelly Mwale and Joseph Chita The Church's Social Responsibility in Zambia: The Catholic Response to the 2016 Prejudiced Attacks on 'Others' 132
Storia Sietisho and *Lilian Cheelo Siwila* Religion as Situated Knowledge for Social Transformation: The Case of the Mashobye Women's Manyano of Limpopo Province 157
AbdulGafar Olawale Fahm Muslim Women and Social Responsibility in Nigeria: Contributions of the Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) 175
Zorodzai Dube Theorising Steve Biko's 'Human Face' Challenge alongside Gabriel Marcel's Embodied Hermeneutics 192
Dennis Masaka and *Sarah Yeukai Mukungurutse* Confronting the Exclusive Dominance of Christianity in Zimbabwe's Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus through Africanisation 206
Ezra Chitando, Henrietta Nyamnjoh and *Damaris Parsitau* 'Citizens of both Heaven and Earth': Pentecostalism and Social Transformation in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya 232
Loreen Maseno 'The Glory is Here!' Faith Brands and Rituals of Self-Affirmation for Social Responsibility in Kenya 252
Jaco Beyers Where 'Heaven' and Earth Meet: Religion and Social Responsibility 268
Contributors 290

PRINT CONNECTION Tel (031) 202-7766; 202-7766

Editorial: Religion and Social Responsibility

Johannes A. Smit
Lilian Siwila
Denzil Chetty

In our decolonising, digitalising, and neo- and post-colonial world, the scholarly focus on 'Religion and Social Responsibility' is here to stay. As Smit (this issue) cogently points out, it has become common purchase not only within traditional socially-minded religious discursive traditions such as the historical Social Gospel Movement, the Catholic Church's socially conscious and social justice statements and programmes since at least the eighteenth century, and the large variety of missionary movements of the nineteenth century, but that it has also been embraced by more conservative sectors of global religious society. Following the wide variety of social responsibility programmes developed and implemented – with a variety of measures of success – by the capitalist business sectors of the world since the mid-twentieth century, social responsibility programmes as forms of social intervention, or, for the purposes of social transformation and social and economic development, have become common cause for many institutions. With this issue of *Alternation*, we wish to place this item firmly on the scholarly agenda of not only institutions of higher learning, but also religious organisations across the religions. We also affirm the socially conscious engagement of society by the business and corporate world. After all, it is these sectors that not only drive the world economy and world development, but also, as individuals and companies, benefit the most from a continuously developing world political and socio-cultural economy.

Furthermore, within the religious and spiritual arena, and especially the scholarly study of our religions and spiritualities, it is imperative, that we continue to intellectualise the notion of 'religion and social responsibility'. Apart from the more obvious reasons – of the support and empowering of communities of the poor and destitute – it is incumbent of religious formations to more assertively fill the voids of silence and ideological acquiescence and

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a1

uncritical endemic ideological assent in our societies. It was in this context that we made the call for papers for this issue of *Alternation*. Needless to say, in our opinion, we have only started to scratch the surface of this multiply religio-cultural challenge. Compared to our original call, and even though some issues have been addressed by scholars on other platforms, some of the main challenges that remain are, for instance: continued endemic corruption that has become embedded in the imperially created, and apartheid-entrenched 'tribal political-economies' of our continent; the so-called systems of patrimonialism that rule the roost across the continent; the endemic competition for (scarce) resources by poverty-stricken communities right in our midst; political and civil servants that are not held to account by civil society, and which have been only weakly challenged through 'service delivery protests', by impoverished, destitute and indigent communities suffering from chronic societal deprivation and abject poverty; and socio-political and so-called 'civil war' violence in sub-Saharan Africa, which has its roots in socio-cultural destitution socio-cultural impoverishment. We think, that, as in many other times in history, religious formations are called on to constructively engage the multiform challenges of 'social responsibility' in the interests of the tangible furthering of socio-cultural equality; gender, social, and ecological justice; and the unreserved promotion of the dignity and freedom of all, trans-religiously, and irrespective of religious or cultural affiliation and association. In this context, it is incumbent on religious formations on the continent, to become more socioculturally conscientised, and to collaborate ecumenically across cultural, social, and religions' systems, in the interests of realising these goals. We know, that the religious formations do have the resources, that they have been a blessing to many millions of people over the centuries, and, not least, that they are present in the grassroots environments of our continent. They encounter the raw material realities of the sociocultural challenges of our continent's people on a daily basis, wherever they serve. We also know, that they do have the know-how and the age-old critical resources to keep leaders, managers, principals, chiefs, directors, superiors and supervisors of any ilk or profession accountable. And, it stands to reason, that, in order to be responsive to the challenges and needs of the communities we serve, we need to promote and fast-track responsive and responsible religious, political, economic, and civil leadership, accountable governance and responsible citizenship.

The articles in this issue of *Alternation*, then, provide a few brief, and exploratory perspectives under this rubric. We think that it is incumbent on us

in the Arts and Humanities, especially in the religions – but also in the Humanities disciplines more broadly speaking, that study the religions and religious formations – to take up this topic as part of constructively engaging the complex and multiform socio-cultural challenges our continent faces, for transformation and development, the narrowing of the inequality gap, and to do this in trans-disciplinary ways, and in a multi-cultural fashion.

In a previous article, Smit traced J.T .van der Kemp's link to the British anti-slavery network, argued that his position on the exploitation of the Khoi paralleled his views on slavery, and that his civil rights activism for and on behalf of the Khoi mirrored his anti-slavery advocacy (cf. Smit 2016). In this article, 'Social Responsibility and Power I', he continues his analysis of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century archive which Van der Kemp formed part of, and here focuses on Van der Kemp's interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi (1801 – 1806) and power. His hypothesis is that starting with Van der Kemp, the interventions of Christian missions vis-à-vis the colonising governments and the frontier settler farmers, and later beyond the frontier, on behalf of the indigenous people of the Eastern Cape, were the manifestations of late eighteenth and nineteenth century 'social responsibility'. As indicated in his topic, such taking up of 'social responsibility' includes the 'power' or more particularly, in Foucault's terminology, the 'power effects' of the missions on indigenous people. In this article he consecutively provides some background related to twentieth century, as well as late eighteenth and nineteenth century notions of 'social responsibility', Van der Kemp's change of plans to not continue with mission work among the Xhosa but to switch to the Khoi, and his and his fellow missionary James Read's interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi asserting their 'freedom' and their 'civilisation'. For these focuses, he mainly draws on Van der Kemp's correspondence from his extant South African texts – mainly his diary and letters published by the former non-conformist and ecumenical colonial British mission agency, the London Missionary Society (LMS) in its *Transactions* (1804; 1806; and 1812). For 'power' or 'power relations' and 'power effects' in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, he draws on the theoretical and discursive historical studies by Michel Foucault.

In 'Social Responsibility and Power II', Smit continues his research

on the social responsibility and power relations of J.T. van der Kemp (joined by James Read in 1801) as manifest in his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi vis-à-vis the British and later Batavian colonial governments, as well as the frontier settler farmers on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) (cf. Smit 2016a). Van der Kemp's own use of 'power' became manifest in his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi, his critique of both the colonial governments and the frontier settler farmers, his assertion of the freedom of the deterritorialised and landless Khoi, and his contention that they should receive a piece of land, to be allocated by government, for a mission station, where they would be subjected to education and be 'civilized'. He expounded what these developments meant in terms of the European 'archive' of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. This use of power, included, amongst others, the further de-culturalisation of the Khoi. In this article, Smit takes the argument further by focusing on the 'useful education', 'analytic education', 'institutionali-sation', the interaction with the colonial 'government' in these matters, and the 'pacification' of the Khoi by the mission as institution. In scholarship on Van der Kemp, and the archive, his thought and practices formed part of, there is a pre-Kantian limit, that has to be acknowledged (cf. Krom 1800,II:lxxf)].

S.A. Chembea, in his '*Waqfs*[1] and the Dynamics of Muslim Charity in Secular Milieus, Kenya 1900-2010', argues that *waqfs*, were the mainstay of a plethora of beneficiaries evolving into socio-economically secure constituencies of Muslims. Secured of socio-economic well-being, beneficiaries threatened and often advocated for social and political positions independent of and in opposition to political establishments. This saw the creation of state agencies to control *waqfs* as evident in both Muslim and colonial powers or institutions. State agencies did not, however, annihilate *waqfs* as envisaged but beneficiaries diversified into alternative charitable activities as provided by the Shari'a. Using James Scott's (2009) concept of 'symbolic resistance' and Talal Asad's (1986] 2009) view of Islam as a 'discursive tradition', he argues that use of uncontrolled charities like *sadaqa* and private trusts in Kenya's secular milieu do not only accord Muslims the wherewithal to negotiate the socio-cultural and economic spheres, but also provide a means to fulfilling religious obligations outside the purview of the state.

In his article, Roderick Hewitt addresses the matter of 'Ecclesial Lead-

[1] In Islam, *waqfs* denotes 'religious endowments'.

ership and Social Responsibility within the African Context of Economic Injustice' in Christian context. His article explores the phenomenon of ecclesial leadership and its relationship with social responsibility within Sub-Sahara Africa, where many nations are experiencing economic injustices. It argues that failure to adequately engage with the neo-liberal economic order has resulted in ecclesial leadership that is increasingly losing public trust as perceptions of the leaders and the offices that they control are being corrupted by their insatiable appetite for financial greed. Contemporary ecclesial leaderships are caught in an ethical conundrum through their inability to negotiate the spiritually disarming, attractive and additive lure of the ideologies of neoliberalism and neo-conservatism that are weakening the effectiveness of religious leaders who are easily entrapped because of their 'love of money'. Their inability to exercise critical distance from the infectious and addictive lure of greed has compromised the authenticity of their integrity and the witness of the church's mission in the world to be in solidarity with people that live on the margins of society (Keum 2012:14-16). The fall in ecclesial standards of leadership in exercising authentic social responsibility within communities of oppressed peoples living on the margins has now placed the need for ethical formation at the centre of ecclesial leadership within the African context. The fast growth in urbanization with millions of Africans being attracted to cities for work, study and living, has led to the rise of many independent charismatic/ Pentecostal communities led by self-styled charismatic 'Prophets', 'Apostles' 'Bishops' and 'Pastors'. They operate an all-inclusive ecclesial business with vast budgets within the communities of the poor that are experiencing socio-economic injustices that are fallouts from the neo-liberal economic policies that have been and continue to be adopted by their governments. The article concludes that the ethical formation that is needed to address the lack of credibility and public trust of ecclesial leadership serving communities experiencing socio-economic injustices, necessitates, in Christian context, radical reformation in which leaders rediscover what Orbery Hendricks describes as 'the politics of Jesus'. Christian leaders need to rediscover the true revolutionary nature of the historical Jesus' teachings and practices (2006:5-10). Within the African context it will necessitate engaging in a spirituality of resistance against life-denying forces, and to practice justice as a matter of faith confession and praxis. This would mean that African ecclesial leaders would embrace matters of economic and environmental justice, which are not only social, political, and moral issues but at the core, a

matter of confessing the Christian faith (The Accra Confession 2004).

Focusing on migrancy in the context of forced migration, and the social challenges faced by refugees, Nelly Mwale and Joseph Chita address the 'the Church's Social Responsibility in Zambia', engaging the issue of the Catholic Church's response to the 2016 prejudiced attacks on 'Others'. They especially refer to the events of April 2016, when Rwandan refugees and other foreign nationals in Zambia sought refuge in a Catholic church after days of violence. They were targeted after claims associating them with a series of ritual killings. Residents from compounds in Lusaka were reported to have resorted to riots and violence in a quest to defend themselves against the perceived threat from the refugees. They investigate the Catholic Church's response to these 'xenophobic' attacks in Zambia's residential compounds to mirror the church's role in social responsibility in contemporary times. In their case study they used data produced from document reviews (media reports) and recorded interviews with Priests from St. Ignatius parish. This was thematically analysed and interpreted. They conclude that the Catholic Church, guided by its social teaching was not only a mirror of society, but also a place of refuge by hosting the refugees and condemning the violence in various compounds in Lusaka, through pastoral letters and homilies.

Arguing that religion as a form of situated knowledge, and that it has historically influenced a gendered conception and acquisition of knowledge, Storia Sietisho and Lilian Cheelo Siwila address the topic of 'Religion as Situated Knowledge for Social Transformation: A Case of the Mashobye Manyano Women of Limpopo Province'. As one of the dominant voices in society, they argue, the Mashobye Manyano has created and maintained social hierarchies by inculcating and discriminating against the equal identity, interest and experiences of women. As a result, emerging ideologies, historical and socio-cultural factors normalized thought patterns of particularly an inferior and dependent perspective about women. In most of the African countries, missionary and colonial teaching undermined women's indigenous knowledge and agency with respect to food production and experiences as heads of households. Through the Victorian family model, women were removed from participating in agriculture, to the domestic sphere where they had to perform duties of housewifery. In terms of the challenge of transforming the prevalence of poverty, hunger and diseases in Sub-Saharan Africa and rural areas of South Africa in particular, it is argued, that religion continues to constrain processes of positive knowledge construction about women's roles and activities, when

these are mostly limited to private space. The aim of the article is to explore ways in which the Women's Manyano organization could be an agent of transformation in communities of women in the rural areas, for food autonomy and maternal health.

Similarly focusing on the agency of women and women's movements, AbdulGafar Olawale Fahm's topic is: 'Muslim Women and Social Responsibility in Nigeria: Contributions of the Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN)'. He explores the various ways in which the Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) has acted as a socially responsible organisation in Nigeria. Since the 1980s several Muslim women-led organisations have emerged in the Northern and Southern parts of Nigeria, some of which have formed social networks to advocate for Muslim women's rights. In line with these developments, and, in order to identify the contributions of FOMWAN in Nigeria, this article looks at the emergence of the Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) – an organisation that was established more than three decades ago. Drawing on empirical evidence from activities of FOMWAN and using historical and descriptive approaches to analyse the data, this study outlines how FOMWAN strategically engage in development projects and thus further their own vision of development. The research discovered that FOMWAN envisages a world where women are completely enabled to be good role models in making beneficial impacts in society. FOMWAN supports the religion of Islam in Nigeria through *Da'wah* (invitation and propagation), the establishment of educational institutions and other outreach activities. It also works towards the improvement of the conditions of the people, both rural and urban, especially women, youths and children through training, the provision of quality education, health, and humanitarian services, micro-enterprise schemes and advocacy, as ways of playing its social responsibility role in society. This research will add to the body of knowledge on Muslim women, especially as it relates to Nigeria, and provides some insights into Muslim women organisations operating in Nigeria.

Contextualising his contribution in current discourses on globalisation and multiculturalism as 'spaces of disjuncture and identity fissures', Zorodzai Dube addresses the question of the role of religion (Christianity) in terms of these discourses. In his 'Theorising Steve Biko's "Human Face" Challenge alongside Gabriel Marcel's Embodied Hermeneutics', he takes his interpretive perspective from views by Biko. He contextualises Biko's statement that

religion has a human public face, and put this perspective in dialogue with Gabriel Marcel's concept of embodiment. The paper concludes that a religion that has a public human face promotes empathy or interconnectedness, providing a conceptualisation of a religious anthropology anchored in empathy, participation and inter-subjectivity.

In their 'Confronting the Exclusive Dominance of Christianity in Zimbabwe's Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus through Africanisation', Dennis Masaka and Sarah Yeukai Mukungurutse focuse their research on syllabus and curriculum reform. In the light of the Christian religion's exclusive dominance of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus (9154) in present-day Zimbabwe, they argue that it should incorporate the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe. *Firstly*, they situate the exclusion of indigenous religion from the syllabus in the context of the colonial experience that demeaned and considered 'traditional religions' as unqualified to be part of the syllabus. This has given rise to the exclusive dominance of the Christian religion in the syllabus. *Secondly*, the current Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus is critiqued with the objective of highlighting that the exclusive dominance of the Christian religion ought to be contested. *Thirdly*, they argue that it is necessary for the Zimbabwean government to Africanise the curriculum so that it genuinely accommodates both the indigenous people of Zimbabwe's religion, but not excluding other religions, including Christianity. This is a matter of justice that seeks not only to establish parity between the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and others, but also to reject the contestable position that there are some religions that are superior to others. Though some have attempted to critique the dominance of the Christian religion in the so-called 'Religious Studies' syllabus, no-one has pointedly and systematically undertook to propose the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in present day Zimbabwe in the manner that they have done. The novelty of this article thus resides in its attempt to constructively engage Africanisation discourse in curriculum reform, in order to democratise the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in present day Zimbabwe.

The contribution by Ezra Chitando, Henrietta Nyamnjoh and Damaris Parsitau comprises of a brief engagement of 'Pentecostalism and Social Transformation in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya'. They argue that, as Pentecostalism enjoys unparalleled growth in most parts of sub-Saharan Africa, greater attention has been paid to its problematic expressions by some scholars, than its positive effects. Media images of the abuse of believers in

different contexts have been widely circulated. These include sexual abuse by charismatic (male) prophets, financial scandals, as well as the degrading treatment of clients/members by forcing them to eat grass/snakes and other questionable acts. While conceding that these aspects are challenging, this article seeks to provide a more balanced perspective by highlighting the extent to which selected Pentecostal churches in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya have sought to contribute to social transformation and social reconstruction in their respective countries. By examining the sermons and teachings on personal responsibility and having effective marriages, by the Pentecostal leaders, the article contends that they mobilise their members and audiences to become agents of social transformation. The article highlights the potential role of Pentecostalism in social transformation and social reconstruction in the selected countries.

For her, '"The Glory is Here!" Faith Brands and Rituals of Self-Affirmation for Social Responsibility in Kenya', Loreen Maseno focused her research on female Pentecostal-Charismatic (PC) church leaders, and their quest to legitimize their leadership at a variety of levels in society. This quest for acceptability and legitimacy to the congregation they lead, as wel las in the public sphere, can be daunting especially in the context of a male dominated religious field such as we have in Kenya. Some female PC leaders in Kenya manage the desires and beliefs of their audiences through religious programmes and slogans that enhance social participation and solidarity. This article examines the programme and slogan 'The Glory is Here' broadcasted by one Kenyan female PC Televangelist and church leader, Margaret Wanjiru of Jesus is Alive Ministries (JIAM). Through the faith brand 'The Glory is Here', Wanjiru, in the marketing of religion, distinguishes herself from others in the market place and promotes her product and services in order to develop a consumer base. The research found that the programme functions as an empowering ritual of self-affirmation. Her faith brand, as well as her programme, are focused on women, and incorporates and combines repeated rituals of self-affirmation. Thematically, they include seminal topics from Women's Theology, such as community, empowerment, liberation, a critical ecclesiology, Christology, ecology and missiology. She is seen as a trailblazer for women, and, taken together, her programmes are seen to serve to enhance women's self-affirmation, solidarity and inter-subjective communal and social support, and solidarity.

In his article, 'Where 'heaven and earth' Meet: Religion and Social

Responsibility', Jaco Beyers provides some insights as to the very notion of religious participation in social responsibilities. He questions the question: Does religion indeed have a social responsibility? In his view, there are two possible positions on this question: (i) it is obvious that religion has a social responsibility and should act upon it; and (ii) it is not so obvious that religion has a social responsibility and should refrain from social participation in social issues. Both positions are supported by good arguments. The *first* position is supported by the assumption that human nature is filled with virtue and humans have the moral capacity to influence society in a positive way. The religious idealists are convinced that an utopian society can be created on earth; almost make heaven touch earth. The *second* position is underlined by the argument that human virtue and moral capacity is over-estimated. Reinhold Niebuhr (1936) elaborated on this matter. Society is however much rather governed by self-interest and ignorance even under the veil of religion. There are dangers (i.e. reductionism, selectivism, antagonism and utopianism) involved when religion participates in social activities. The discussion here wants to present a *third* possible way by suggesting a tempered approach when religion participates in social activities. Rather, individuals ought to be educated to act morally and responsibly in society.

We then present these articles as a sample of critical scholarly analyses and reflections on our topic of 'Religion and Social Responsibility'. All the ideas, concepts, and critical analyses and viewpoints covered by the various articles, have significance for our developing scholarly discourse – both at the level of the production of knowledge in the academy, and at the level of the material and immaterial cultural productions of conditions that enhance the empirical well-being of our people. We believe, that, since current research, and teaching and learning across the African religions, have shown the remarkable involvement of the religions and the discursive religious traditions in participatory social action in, with and for communities, this phenomenon is in need of further study and intellectualising on our continent. The ways and means in which religions and religious formation traditions have formed part of a large variety of interventions for and on behalf of fellow citizens are not only extremely important in themselves, in the minimising of the traumatic impacts of colonisation, and interventions in the interests of peace and justice in contexts of violent action and conflict, but also crucial for us, as scholars to study. Acknowledging the intra-religious, but also trans-religious taking up of social responsibilities for the well-being of people in dire socio-economic,

socio-ecological or socio-political context, the scholarly fraternity need to respond likewise. And, in line with our original call for papers, we also think that, with this issue of *Alter*nation, we have only touched the tip of the proverbial iceberg. So, we foresee, the development of further research in this direction, in line with the many topics and sub-topics related to this theme.

References

Asad, T. 2009. The Idea of an Anthropology of Islam. *Qui Parle* 17, 2: 1–30.

Hendricks, M.O. Jr. 2006. *The Politics of Jesus.* New York: Doubleday.

Keum, J. (ed.) 2013. *Together towards Life: Mission and Evangelism in Changing Landscapes with a Practical Guide*. Geneva: WCC Publications.

Krom, Herm. I.O. 1800. Voorrede van de Uitgever. In Van der Kemp, J.T. 1802. *De Theodicée van Paulus.* Volume II. Dordrecht: A Blussé en Zoon.

Scott, J. 2009. *The Art of not being Governed: An Anarchist History of Upland South East Asia*. London: Yale University Press.

Smit, J.A. 2016. J.T. van der Kemp's Link to the British Anti-slavery Network and his Civil Rights Activism on Behalf of the Khoi (1801 – 1803). *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29,2 (2016) 5 – 28.

The Accra Confession 2004. World Alliance of Reformed Churches. Available at: http://wcrc.ch/accra/the-accra-confession. (Accessed on 01 November 2017.)

Johannes A. Smit
Religion and Social Transformation
University of KwaZulu-Natal
Pietermaritzburg and Durban
smitj@ukzn.ac.za

Lilian Cheelo Siwila
School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics
University of KwaZulu-Natal
Pietermaritzburg
Siwila@ukzn.ac.za

Denzil Chetty
Religious Studies and Arabic
University of South Africa
Pretoria
chettd@unisa.ac.za

Social Responsibility and Power I: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions For and on Behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806)

Johannes A. Smit

Abstract

In a previous article, I have traced Van der Kemp's link to the British anti-slavery network, argued that his position on the exploitation of the Khoi paralleled his views on slavery, and that his civil rights activism for and on behalf of the Khoi mirrored his anti-slavery advocacy (cf. Smit 2016b). In this article, I continue my analysis of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century archive which Van der Kemp formed part of, and here focus on Van der Kemp's interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi (1801 – 1806) and power. My hypothesis is that starting with Van der Kemp, the interventions of Christian missions vis-à-vis the governments and the frontier settler farmers, and later beyond the frontier, on behalf of indigenous people, were the manifestations of late eighteenth and nineteenth century 'social responsibility'. As indicated in my topic, such taking up of 'social responsibility' includes the 'power' or more particularly, in Foucault's terminology, the colonising 'power effects' of the missions on indigenous people. In this article I consecutively provide some background related to twentieth century, as well as late eighteenth and nineteenth century notions of 'social responsibility', Van der Kemp's change of plans to not continue with mission work among the Xhosa but to switch to the Khoi, and his and his fellow missionary James Read's interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi asserting their 'freedom' and their 'civilisation'. For these focuses, I mainly draw on Van der Kemp's correspondence from his extant South African texts. For 'power' or 'power

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a2

relations' and 'power effects' in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, I draw on the theoretical and discursive historical studies by Michel Foucault[1].

Keywords: J.T. van der Kemp, Khoi (or Khoikhoi/ Khoisan), social responsibility, power or power effects, Foucault

1 Introduction

In a previous article, I have traced J.T. van der Kemp's link to the British anti-slavery network, argued that his position on the exploitation of the Khoi paralleled his views on slavery, and that his civil rights activism for and on behalf of the Khoi mirrored his anti-slavery advocacy (cf. Smit 2016b; as well as Ross 1986:77-115). In this article, I continue my analysis of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century archive which Van der Kemp formed part of, and here focus on Van der Kemp's interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi (1801 – 1806) and power[2]. My hypothesis is that starting with Van der Kemp, the interventions of Christian missions vis-à-vis the governments and the frontier settler farmers, and later beyond the frontier, on behalf of indigenous people, were the manifestations of late eighteenth and nineteenth century 'social responsibility'. As indicated in my topic, such taking up of 'social responsibility' includes, in the terminology of Foucault, the 'power' or more particularly the 'power effects' of the missions on indigenous people. For these focuses, I mainly draw on Van der Kemp's correspondence from his extant South African texts – mainly his diary and letters published by the former non-conformist and ecumenical colonial British mission agency, the London Missionary Society (LMS) in its *Transactions* (1804; 1806; and 1812), and some letters published in Saxe Bannister's *Humane Policy* (1830). For

[1] The same topic will be further explored in a follow-up article.

[2] In brief, I take the notion of the 'archive', to comprise of all those statements, in Foucault's sense, or views, and thoughts or ideas, expressed, written down and published, or communicated and reported on or sometimes just alluded to, as part of the Knowledge, or more closely, the European and colonising Knowledge-Power complex that was in the process of formation, both in Europe and the colonies. In scholarship on Van der Kemp, and the archive his thought and practices formed part of, there is a pre-Kantian limit, that has to be acknowledged (cf. Krom 1800,II:lxxf).

'power' or 'power effects' in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, I draw on the theoretical and discursive historical studies by Michel Foucault (cf. also Carey & Festa 2009; and Koopman 2013).

In this article I then focus on a sample of Van der Kemp's own views of, and social responsibility interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi. For the latter, I shall also draw on a few perspectives of Foucault with regard to the significance of related governmental, civil and religious interventions on behalf of the general populace in late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century Britain and France, which were interventions that are symptomatically mirrored in the missionary discourses in Europe's colonies, contesting colonisation in its actual cruelty and de-humanising effects. These anticolonial Christian missionary movements in the colonies, mirror the anti-hegemonic power systems of seventeenth and eighteenth century Christian movements in Europe, and later America. This will provide some indication as to the even broader *episteme*[3], in which we must position Van der Kemp's own judgements, ideas and initiatives on the Eastern Cape frontier of the time, but

[3] In my perception, Foucault's notion of episteme, can usefully be understood as what we may call, an epochal historical, and historicisable, knowledge-power construct. While inherently quite diverse and pluriform, as well as developmental, in its internal Knowledge (or epistemological) and related institutional constitutional articulations, there are certain problematizing and conceptual features that allow different forms of knowledge to be grouped together. In this regard, there is some affinity with Thomas Kuhn's diachronic notion of 'paradigm' in his *Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (1962] 1970), as well as the latter's understanding of the 'incommensurability' of historically consecutive, but also parallel paradigms, synchronically understood. In this regard, Foucault's diachronically understood *episteme*, could also be usefully employed for the study of mutually-exclusionary knowledge-power constructs, especially during times where certain regions of the world, or maybe even the world of discursive formations, in some combined fashion, undergo some form of epochal transformation. The so-called 'linguistic turn' – where Saussurian linguistics impacted the cultural and social sciences – and the 'cultural turn' and the 'social turn' dating from the 1980s and 1990s respectively, are examples. With the rise of Information Technology and social media, and the increasing 'globalising' of the world, we are currently living through such an era, because there is socio-cultural data about our world that is being produced

also his own missionising power effects on the Khoi, even though he intervened with the government (and the frontier settler farmers, cf. Smit 2016a) on their behalf.

2 Background

2.1 The Twentieth Century and 'Social Responsibility'

Since the 1950's the notion and related practices of 'social responsibility' have been developed as part of 'corporate social responsibility' (cf. Carrol 1999), 'corporate social responsibility and ethics' (cf. Friedman 1970) or more broadly speaking, social responsibility focused on 'profits, political performance, social demands and ethical values' (Garriga & Melé 2004)[4]. Since the 1970s, this notion, and the various forms in which it was included in and practiced as part of capitalist formation strategies in civil life, have been severely criticised[5].

In the Christian context, for this article, I want to make three points in this, its first section. *Firstly*, the notion of the 'social responsibility of the Church' was first definitively broached by Richard Niebuhr in 1946 in his Chapter Five, 'The Church's Responsibility for Society' of the, *The Gospel, The World and the Church*[6]. Echoing the critiques of Nazism by the German Confessing Church (the '*Kirchenkampf*'), Dietrich Bonhoeffer (cf. Smit 2015a: 262-263) and especially world-famous theologian, Karl Barth amongst others, Niebuhr says:

> In our time, with its *dramatic revelations of evils of nationalism, of*

in society, that previous problematizations and objectifications and conceptualizations – or paradigms/ epistemes – cannot deal with analytically and interpretively.

[4] Cf. also Carroll (1999); Lydenburg (2005); and Lee (2008).

[5] Cf. Jacoby (1971:3-19); Garriga and Melé (2004); May, Cheney and Roper (2007); and Banerjee (2012) amongst others. But see Dierendonck and Patterson (2010), on the notion of 'servant leadership' within corporate context.

[6] Niebuhr was a postliberal engaged theologian, Sterling Professor of Christian Ethics at Yale University Divinity School, and part of the so-called 'Yale School' of thought. He also definitively impacted later world-renowned ethicists such as James Gustafson and Stanley Hauerwas.

> *racialism, and economic imperialism it is the evident responsibility of the Church to repudiate these attitudes within itself and to act as pioneer of society in doing so* (e.a.). The apostolic proclamation of good and bad news to the colored races without a pioneering repudiation of racial discrimination in the Church contains a note of insincerity and unbelief. The prophetic denunciation of nationalism without a resolute rejection of nationalism in the Church is mostly rhetorical. As the representative and pioneer of mankind (sic.) the Church meets its *social responsibility* when in its own thinking, organization and action it functions as a world society, undivided by race, class and national interests (e.a.).
>
> This seems to be *the highest form of social responsibility in the Church* (e.a.). It is the direct demonstration of love of God and neighbour rather than repetition of the commandment to self and others. It is the radical demonstration of faith. Where this responsibility is being exercised there is no longer any question about the reality of the Church. **In pioneering and representative action of response to God in Christ the invisible Church becomes visible and the deed of Christ is reduplicated** (bold e.i.o.).

These views would make a world-wide impact, also impacting Martin Luther Kind Jnr. and the American Civil Rights movement in the 1950s and 1960s.

Secondly, the so-called twentieth century 'neo-evangelicalism' came into being in the 1930's[7] and was critical of the Christian fundamentalist critique of the 'social Gospel'[8]. While remaining 'fundamentalist' in its theology (both Protestant and Catholic), it also propagated the church's engagement with 'the social', especially social ills such as 'racial hatred, a

[7] So labelled since 1947, or also labelled 'neo-fundamentalism' by 'liberal theology'.

[8] I.e. the 'Social Gospel' as it developed during the late eighteenth century, the span of the nineteenth century, and the first three decades of the twentieth century. The social gospel dealt with Christian social justice matters such as: inequality, poverty, inadequate schools, child labour, crime, racial oppression, slums, environmental pollution, misuse of alcohol, dysfunctional labour unions, and the atrocity of war. Numerous sources list these issues, amongst others, as part of the agenda of Social Gospel practitioners.

spiraling crime rate, the liquor and drug traffic, slums and violence'[9].

Significant leaders in neo-evangelicalism were Edward John Carnell, Bernard Ramm, Harold Ockenga[10], Carl F.H. Henry and Billy Graham – who also invited Martin Luther-King Jnr. to his rallies. Collectively, they (amongst others) are credited with the 'reformation' of conservative and non-sociallyengaged fundamentalist American evangelicalism. This 'reformation' basically meant the centrally positioned and inclusion of 'the social' into the broadly established Christian Biblical and theological fundamentalist tradition (cf. Marsden 1987 amongst others). Twentieth-first century developments, as we have in the conservative Australian 'Uniting Congregations' (2007) amongst others, would continue this tradition, in their four-pronged programme of 'social responsibility of the Church' as encompassing) a person's 'relationship with God in Jesus Christ'; 2) 'works of mercy, which include caring for the bodily needs of people (cf. Mt. 25:31-45; Ac. 6:1-7; Js. 2:15); 3) to constructively engage 'social, structural causes' of specific events in which people are made to suffer, for the purposes of promoting 'justice in social, political, and economic areas' (cf. Phil. 2: 5-11); and 4) to 'examine the ideological underpinnings which produce a society's structures, actions and attitudes' (cf. Cl 2:6 – 23). This latter point includes the church's 'self-examination' because it forms part of society and 'should not be lead astray'[11].

Thirdly, in Africa, the 'social responsibility of the Church' was initially mainly propagated by Catholicism, and dates back to the late eighteenth century (if not earlier) but especially the late nineteenth century (cf. Ziegler 10 April 2013). In twentieth century Catholicism, there is a signifycant history of this notion, focusing on the 'dignity of the human

[9] Cf. Benware (1971) for an overview, including scriptural arguments – that obviously count as major source for numerous evangelically-conscious, but also sometimes very un-prophetic positionings.

[10] He was co-founder of the world-famous Fuller Theological Seminary in Pasadena, California.

[11] There is a wide array of scholarship of and about the 'social gospel' movement which is not addressed here, but centrally important for this topic for obvious reasons. For a 'liberal' interpretation covering the twentieth century, cf. Dawley (1991); for a comparison of the church's social responsibility vis-a-vis the 'corporation', cf. Sethi (1972.)

person/ one's neighbour', 'the human community' and the 'essential equality of all: social justice', 'women and justice', the 'denouncing of injustice', delivery from 'oppression and slavery', the setting free of the 'needy and oppressed' (Lk 6:21-23)', the furtherance of 'justice and peace' and 'development and justice', the work for the 'common good', 'solidarity' with the 'poor and oppressed' (which includes 'the spiritual', and non-Christian religions), the working class as well as with the labour unions that struggle for equity, and social justice in the areas of 'economics and ecology' impacting people materially, socially, culturally, and spiritually. In summary, it means that,

> [a]t the heart of social justice, then, is the firm intention of individuals, employers, rulers, and nations to pursue the common good. According to Catholic teaching, it is an intention made manifest in respect for human dignity and human rights, in the paying of a just wage, and in consideration for poorer nations in trade relations (cf. Ziegler 14 May 2013; for both Protestant and Catholic views, cf. Hauerwas 1995).

For the current 'evangelical' situation, the 'integral' gospel that includes both 'evangelisation' and intervention and caring for the poor dates from the evangelical revivals and British anti-slavery movement of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, including the 'social action' of John Wesley and the eighteenth century emerging Methodist Church. For current practice – especially in the Global South, Rey's view is indicative. He says:

> It is now normal to find next to a church, regardless of its size, a health center, a school, a soup kitchen, etc. The majority of the churches have understood that they have an integral mission and that evangelization goes hand in hand with social responsibility (cited in Penyak & Petry eds. 2006:360).

In his exposition of 'social responsibility in Africa, George Ehusani (1999) draws on pronouncements from the Second Vatican Council's '*Gaudium et Spes*' 1-3 (1962-1965) (Joy and Hope), the 1971 statement, 'Justice in the World by the World Synod of Catholic Bishops', and more specifically focused on Africa, on Pope John Paul II's post-synodal document titled 'Ecclesia in Africa' of 1995. The latter focuses mostly on the Church's

contribution to 'justice and social peace', 'justice, liberation, development and peace', 'becoming the voice of the voiceless', the church's 'prophetic role', 'the condemnation of injustices' and 'the injustices and violations of human rights', and the promotion of 'greater social justice and good government'. In his exposition, Ehusani focuses on a sample of all the social ills that face African people, spanning the African continent from Christians conforming to the dictates of corrupt despots and governments, and apathy, to government corruption and the exploitation of citizens. (Cf. also Kodia 2005.)

Focusing on the beginning of the nineteenth century, this article does not follow any of these trajectories. These mainly developed in the twentieth century, with some socio-ethical genealogical scholarly ancestry, dating to the germination of critique of mechanisation and the beginnings of industrialisation, slavery, and capital accumulation or mercantilism. These forms of critique also obviously had their own excesses. These are not dealt with in this article. The main hypothesis rather, is that it was the various Christian missionary movements and their networks, which as an even though divergently networked social formation, took up the challenges of both an often precarious and paradoxical colonial critique and what we call social responsibility today. This was the case, both at home in the metropole, and on and beyond the colonial frontiers in the colonies. Granted that the main objective of the Christian missions was to Christianize (or bring to 'salvation') indigenous populations, by founding their mission stations, they also played a critical role to protect indigenous populations against the continuous encroaching colonising practices (mostly by violence) of settler colonialism and colonising governments, by intervening on behalf of indigenous populations. Critical of the deterritorializing of indigenous inhabitants by force (through forced settlements, the barrel of a gun, murder, rape, enslavement and forced labour) these missionary formations and their establishments intervened on behalf of indigenous populations vis-à-vis the colonising governments, leveraged some spaces for indigenous resistance and critique, as well as succeeded in grooming an indigenous intellectual elite equally critical of colonisation, oppression and (labour) exploitation. It is this variegated formation that laid the foundations for the wide variety of liberation movements in the colonies during the twentieth century, and the successful wresting of independence from the forces of colonisation. But let us start at one of the beginning points of this history.

2.2 The Beginning of Christian Missions at the End of the Eighteenth and Beginning of the Nineteenth Centuries in South Africa

Given the varied practices and rationales for taking social responsibility and intervening on behalf of indigenous people, J.T. van der Kemp was the founder of missions in South Africa[12]. The argument is that when Van der Kemp saw the destitute conditions of the Khoi at Graaff Reinet in 1801, it was his sense of social responsibility that moved him to engage in a process, the outcome of which was the establishment of the world famous mission station, Bethelsdorp. This article traces this process[13]. It also contextualises the study in terms of the theorising of the notion of 'power' or power effects at the end of the eighteenth and beginning of the nineteenth centuries as developed by especially Michel Foucault.

Central to the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries Enlightenment was the removal of 'monarchical sovereignty' founded in 'divine right' and the establishing of some forms of democratic systems in some states in Western Europe. The monarchical systems were starting to lose their grip. In Britain it meant that its monarchy was pushed to only govern in consultation with and consent of parliament (since 1688)[14]. As such, it started to follow Hobbes's (1651) and Locke's (in his *Second Treatise*, 1689) Philosophy concerning the co-existence of the monarchy and 'civil society' (but Hobbes and Locke did differ in the detail on this point). The French Revolution in France (1789) in the eighteenth century resulted in a different system, in that it did away with the monarchy in line with the theory of 'civil society' deriving from the state of nature as developed by Jean-Jacques Rousseau in his chapter on 'Civil Society' in the 'Social Contract' (Rousseau ([1762] 1882]). Accompanying these developments was the explosion of scholarship in Philosophy and the sciences, as well as a focus on ordinary citizens and the organisation of 'civil

[12] For the purposes of this argument, we are not taking into account the the work of the Moravian mission station at Baviaanskloof/ Genadendal since 1792, and its earlier attempt dating to George Schmidt's establishment of 1737 – cf. Viljoen (1995).

[13] This is in addition to arguments and evidence put forward in Smit (2016a; and Smit (2016b).

[14] England also passed its Bill of Rights in 1688.

society', esp. for the improvement of the economic conditions of citizens (cf. Foucault [1983] 1994:372) – to draw them into the armies and barracks for training, to build schools for the education of children, to found orphanages for orphans, prisons for criminals, hospitals for the sick and infirm, and psychiatric asylums for people with psychological problems or the 'mad'. These forms of institution building in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries also formed part of the rising tide of industrialisation and urbanisation, but also management of previously rurally-based people. This was a widespread phenomenon in Western Europe. Foucault is famous for researching and analysing these developments, as these relate to the production of knowledge(s), and their power (or power effects), related to 'madness', asylums, the 'clinic', the 'sciences of man', and prisons[15]. Growing from his initial studies in the early 1960s, he gradually shifted his focus to not only analyse the knowledge produced, but also the power that accompanied such knowledge as well as the related institutions that were developed in line with the knowledge produced, in the 1970's. How Foucault's development of his notion of power, power relations, and power effects, especially in the last four to five years before his death in 1984, have significance in and for humanities discourses he analysed in the 1960s and early 1970s, still need to be thought through and written up. During the last few years of his life, he often refers to this fact – that in his study and analyses of the knowledge formations of the eighteenth century, he was in fact actually talking about power. Yet, how this is the case, is not evident, and, to my knowledge, no scholar has taken up this challenge that he posed, and which he constantly referred to in his last few years. But be that as it may.

To complement Foucault's research we need to also assert that the general advances in the establishing of parliamentary democracies, and institution building in Europe, also impacted Christian organisations, for many Christian denominations and charities of the time participated in these developments. Similarly, they founded institutions such as schools, orphanages, hospitals, asylums, and old age homes (cf. Foucault [1973] 1994: 60). This would also impact on the missions that critically accompanied colonisation which started in the 1890s. The missions – as well as the British anti-slavery movement – must also be seen in the context of the rising importance

[15] Cf. Foucault ([1961] 1982a); ([1963] 1973); ([1970] 1982b); ([1975] 1979).

of the notion of civil society as an independent social formation space, towards the end of the eighteenth century and beginning of the nineteenth century (cf. Smit 2016b). This philosophers' notion opened up the social or civil space for an increasing social leverage for the wide variety of Christian organisations which came into existence during the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Mostly critical of colonisation (cf. Smit 2016a), the missions in South Africa and the West Indies – with their slavery and plantation slavery systems – would serve the indigenous populations during the nineteenth century, with mission stations, mission schools, hospitals, asylums, orphanages and havens for run-away and later destitute freed slaves. As such, they constituted institutions that took social responsibility for indigenous popula-tions in the face of the direct and cruel colonising powers' theorisings and their practices. Due to Van der Kemp's submissions on settler farmer 'cruelty and injustice' (LMS II AR 1804:241) towards the Khoi (cf. Smit 2016a:23,36,42-47) – he also calls them 'cruel murderers' (LMS I TVDK 1800:424) – the colonial government conceded that there was indeed 'cruel treatment experienced by the Khoi' at the hands of the settler farmers (cf. H. Ross's letter to Van der Kemp on behalf of Governor Dundas in Bannister 1830:clxii), and conceded to many of his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi.

This is the context in which we must understand Van der Kemp. Given that he was not only an ordained minister in the Presbyterian Church of Scotland but also a noted philosopher, philologist, and qualified medical doctor, he would, amongst others impact on the Khoi population through his mission work, his medical assistance as well as through education[16]. But, as with Foucault's studies, we cannot only look at his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi in the face of the cruelties of colonisation. We must also reckon in the notion of 'power' as was the case in the founding of the other Western European Institutions that Foucault studied. As such, this article looks at the 'facts of this power', quoting from Van der Kemp's reports and letters to the London Missionary Society (LMS). Even though critical of colonisation, his practices included power effects in the colony, such as his critique of both the settler farmers and the colonial government (cf. Smit 2016a), but also his impact for and on behalf of the Khoi community. As such, his eventual founding of Bethelsdorp as place for the deterritorialised and landless Khoi,

[16] He was known for teaching 'reading and writing' to the illiterate in Europe as well as to the Xhosa and Khoi.

and his notions of the introduction of 'civilisation' and 'discipline' practices in the Khoi community are not only similar to what was happening in Europe, but also symptomatic of his own power effects in the community. So, it is reasonable to say that his intervention and the 'social responsibility' Van der Kemp took for the Khoi, was not without its own power effects.

3 From a Mission for the Xhosa to One for the Khoi

From missionary to the Xhosa, with practices akin to non-professional-intellectual travellers and early anthropologists of the time[17], Van der Kemp decided to switch his intended establishment of a mission amongst the Xhosa, to a mission for the Khoi. There are a few references in the *Transactions* to Van der Kemp's decision to make this switch. The first reference appears in the journal entry for July 29 1801.

> Whilst *we are in suspence as to our future station, the Lord has evidently shewn us, that he has conducted us to Graaff Reinet, for the sake of a number of [Khoi] and Heathen of other nations*, whom we found collected at and near this place, and it has pleased him *to raise a Mission among this people, contrary to our intentions*; and as he has raised it he has also blessed it .... The number of Heathen under instruction is about two hundred, of these, however, only thirty-two have yet given in their names as Catechumens, or persons who have declared themselves desirous, after being instructed in the way of salvation, to walk in that way, and *to submit to our discipline* (LMS I TVDK 1801:486; e.a.).

Compared to the one convert Van der Kemp made during his fifteen months stay amongst the Xhosa, it appears that the success of his endeavours amongst the Khoi during a mere two and a half months prompted him to switch his mission to the Khoi. Even though he still contemplated the possibility of starting a mission among the Xhosa at his meeting with Ngqika (August 19 1801), the decision that a mission was to be established for the Khoi had already been taken when he returned to Graaff Reinet from his short excursion back into Xhosaland (August 12 – August 27 1801). For September 7 1801, he writes:

[17] Cf. his text on Xhosa culture and government in LMS I 1804.

> The number of children at present in our school is sixty-two. *We have resolved to fix a small Missionary settlement at Graaff Reinet, under the care of one Missionary, consisting of a hall for keeping meetings and a school, and a house for the Missionary*; the Commissioner Maynier gave us for this purpose a piece of ground *on the banks of the Sunday's river*, about two thousand six hundred and sixty feet long, and five hundred and thirty-seven feet broad; this we accepted in the name of the Missionary Society (LMS I TVDK 1801:490f; e.a.).

The 'free conversation' he had with local Graaff Reinet Commissioner and Landrost Honoratus, Christiaan David Maynier on October 29 1801 (cf. below) - just after the disagreements with the Colonists were settled - and Governor Francis Dundas' letter of October 30, paved the way for the establishment of the mission for the Khoi[18]. Van der Kemp then thanked Dundas in his letter of November 11 1801 as follows:

> After I had been informed that *it has pleased your excellency to offer me a piece of ground in any part of the Colony which I might judge best calculated for the erection of a Missionary settlement, for the instruction of the [Khoi] nation in the doctrine of Christ*, the resident Commissioner Maynier communicated to me a period of your Excellency's letter, dated October the 30th, in which your Excellency expresses a desire to have my ideas respecting such an institution laid before you (LMS I TVDK 1801:495; e.a.).

Even so, it was not only Van der Kemp's success among the Khoi, but also the 'state' or 'condition' in which this 'nation' found themselves, which saw him deciding to take social responsibility on their behalf, and prompted him to change his missionary objective from the Xhosa to the Khoi. This is clear from his letter to Dundas where, after describing the Khoi's conditions, he says:

[18] Maynier became Landrost in 1793 and resident-Commissioner on 25 December 1799. He garnered more accusations from the settlers, was called back to Cape Town, and was found not guilty of the accusations in 1802, and absolved. Dundas was British Governor at the Cape of Good Hope twice, viz. 1798 – 1799 (acting); and 1801 – 1803.

> These reflections have induced us *to suspend for a while our Missionary attempts among the [Xhosa] and [Khoisan], and to devote ourselves to the instruction of the [Khoi] in this village*, that we might be instrumental to afford them spiritual blessings, till it should please the Lord, by sending us a sufficient number of Missionary brethren for help, to enable us *to re-establish the [Xhosa] Mission, and for an establishment near the Great River for the use of the [Khoisan]*. And, though it were not in our power to sublevate the temporal calamities of the [Khoi], we hoped and trusted that the Lord would in his time open a way to answer also in this respect our ardent wishes (LMS I TVDK 1801:496; e.a.).

To this letter, Governor Dundas replied in his undated letter as follows.

> I have only time, by the present opportunity, to acknowledge the receipt of your Letter, dated November 11, containing some heads of a plan for a [Khoi] establishment, which I am desirous to encourage, seeing the necessity of endeavouring to ameliorate the spiritual and temporal condition of those *unhappy people, whom, upon every principle of humanity and justice*, Government is bound to protect. ….
>
> The Secretary of the Colony has this day received my directions to acquaint the Landdrosst with my wishes upon this subject, being extremely anxious that this plan should be carried into effect as soon as possible, and the [Khoi] moved towards their proposed establishment without delay, where every reasonable assistance at the outset, *to enable them hereafter to provide themselves with provision and other necessaries, it is my intention to afford them at the expence of the Colony* (LMS I TVDK 1801:499; e.a.).

Apart from the significance of this letter within the context of the colonial government's approval of the mission and assistance in the expenses the Khoi would incur, and that it had been accepted at this level that the mission among the Khoi could now proceed, its discursive significance lies in the concepts Dundas used to capture Van der Kemp's description of the 'condition' of the Khoi in his letter - 'those *unhappy people*, whom, upon *every principle of humanity and justice*, Government is bound to protect'. Within the eighteenth-century archive, these concepts had particular significance, as did those with

which Van der Kemp used to describe the conditions of the Khoi. It is to an analysis of these conditions that I now turn.

4 Freedom

Six days after the hostilities of the Boor rebels (cf. Smit 2016a; Van der Kemp's denotation/ spelling) against Commissioner Maynier and the missionaries ceased – the June, July and October uprising against the government by the settler farmers in 1801 – Van der Kemp reports for October 29 1801 on a 'free conversation' he had with the Commissioner. He says:

> I had a free conversation with the Commissioner on *the state of the [Khoi] nation*, and *the present calamities*, and gave as my opinion that *the [Khoi] should be perfectly free, upon an equal footing in every respect with the Colonists*, and *by no sort of compulsion brought under a necessity to enter their service*, but *have a piece of ground given to them by Government as their own* (LMS I TVDK 1801:494; e.a.).

The significance if this journal entry is four-fold. *Firstly*, the 'state of the [Khoi] nation' is articulated with regard to '*the present calamities*'. The latter refers to the Boor uprising. Through some mechanisms, Maynier and Van der Kemp met their complaints (cf. below) except one - that the Khoi were 'put upon an equal footing with the Christians'. This complaint was in this 'free conversation' countered by Van der Kemp's assertion that the Khoi should be 'perfectly free, upon an equal footing in every respect [!] with the Colonists'. This assertion of 'freedom' meant that they were to be treated as subjects with the same privileges but also duties as the farmers, i.e. under the then British colonial government. As I have argued, the Khoi were in fact treated similar to slaves by the frontier settler farmers though (cf. Smit 2016b). In this regard it is significant that Foucault ([1982a] 1994: 342) points out that institutionalisation and education in the eighteenth century could only proceed if people were 'free' (Cf. also Foucault [1984a] 1994: 292). He argues that slaves were not free, and could therefore not be made subject to disciplinary power and knowledge. In the Khoi's situation, however, part and parcel of Van der Kemp's argument for 'freedom' was not only for the benefit of the Khoi, but also that of the missionary exercise of 'power' vis-à-vis that of the exercise of power impacting the Khoi by the then British colonial government and the frontier settler farmers. If they were institutionalised at the mission, it would

mean that they would switch from these two institutions of power to that of the power of the mission – including in their labour (cf. Van der Kemp and James Read's 'Annual Report' below – (LMS II AR 1803:165; e.a.).

Secondly, on what Van der Kemp understood under the '*state of the Khoi*' is evident from his description of the 'conditions' in which he found the Khoi at Graaff Reinet and with which he introduced the 'ideas' that he sent through to Governor Dundas thirteen days later on November 11 1801. Here he said:

> It was God, Sir! who brought me by a chain of unexpected events out of [Xhosaland] to Graaff Reinet, where I met with my associates in the [Xhosa] Mission, Read and Van der Lingen. We were witnesses of the *deplorable and wretched conditions into which the [Khoi] nation is sunk* for *want of food, destruction, liberty, useful employments and spot*, which they under the *superintendance* of Government might in some measure call their own home (LMS TVDK 1801:496; e.a.).

That he depicted their 'conditions' as 'deplorable and wretched' indicates - by the use of this word 'wretch' - that he saw the Khoi as similar to the 'wretches' in Europe: those who are not 'useful' to society - peasants, the unemployed, the vagabonds and criminals (cf. Foucault 1979:88). This understanding is also evident from his description of them as having 'sunk' into such conditions - meaning that they have had much better living conditions before colonisation, and had 'degenerated' to this level. It appears as if Van der Kemp developed a similar view of the illiterate frontier settler farmers (cf. LMS II AR 1804:241).

Moreover, what makes these conditions 'deplorable and wretched' in themselves but which was also the cause of them, was that the Khoi had 'sunk' to this level due to 'want of food, destruction, liberty, useful employments and spot'. In other words, as causes,

> 1) 'want of food' the Khoi were no more in a position to produce food for themselves[19];

[19] Because they have lost their land to the continuous intrusion on their lands by the encroaching settler farmers – which caused the colonial border to be shifted inland sporadically.

> 2) 'destruction', that, if the Colonists and the Xhosa had governments, customs, history and systems of 'crimes and punishments'[20], the Khoi had lost theirs, and that this in part caused their wretchedness;
>
> 3) want of 'liberty', that they could not exercise their freedom in the same way they did before, nor could they, now that they are in effect citizens under the colonial regime, use and practice their liberty as behoved free citizens;
>
> 4) the want of 'useful employments' – the term for accommodating the previously excluded peoples into the modernisation or civilisation processes of national and colonial regimes; and
>
> 5) that they did not have a 'spot' – that they have lost their land due to the encroaching deterritorialising settler farmers, and that they did not have any land which they could cultivate for their own agricultural use.

Significantly, Van der Kemp summarised this description by qualifying the 'spot' they needed - and by implication also the other elements of wretchedness he pointed to - as a place which they, 'under the *superintendance* of Government might *in some measure* call their *own home*'. From Bannister (1830: cxxxviiil; and cxli) it is further clear that government would provide 'ground' to the Khoi as part of its own 'humane intentions' toward them. Even so, government would then require – as part of its own 'power' in the colony – that the Khoi should 'submit to regulations established by government'[21]. It is then clear that these were very important statements at the time and indicative of Van der Kemp's social responsibility and intervention for and on behalf of the Khoi with government.

A general sense of homelessness, impacted the living conditions of the Khoi, and it was - in Van der Kemp's understanding - only by having a 'spot' and a 'home' that their conditions could be changed for the better. This, then, does not only qualify Van der Kemp's understanding of the 'state' of the Khoi in general, but also the *fourth* suggestion he made to Maynier - that the Khoi should have '*a piece of ground given to them by Government as their own*'. If

[20] Cf. Van der Kemp's text on Xhosa culture and government in LMS I (1804).
[21] H. Ross in a letter to Van der Kemp on behalf of Dundas – cf. Bannister (1830: cxlii).

they could have land and cultivate it for their own benefit, then they could also function as citizens of the colony and potentially make a contribution to the production of food (and goods) in the colony.

Further, even though they could get a place which they could call 'home', Van der Kemp's reference to the 'superintendence' of government is not without its archival significance. As in Europe, the assumption is that the 'cultivation' of the 'wretch' does not come by itself. It needs to be 'superintended', and that by government. This direct link to government is a further reference to the fact that the underlying assumption was to make the Khoi into useful citizens under government supervision and at government's instigation.

Thirdly, however, Van der Kemp asserted in his 'free discussion' with Commissioner Maynier that the Khoi should '*by no sort of compulsion [be] brought under a necessity to enter their [the frontier farmers'] service*'. This was one of the missionaries' prime areas of contestation with the farmers and would in time contribute towards the Black Circuit Court of 1812 after Van der Kemp's death in Cape Town in 1811 (cf. Smit 2016a).

5 Civilisation

If these were elements of Van der Kemp's assessment of the 'state' or 'conditions' of the Khoi at this point, then these are expounded upon even further in the 'ideas' he sent through to Governor Dundas thirteen days later. Significantly, he states here that the Khoi at the time 'repair' to Graaff Reinet 'as to an asylum' or that they 'shelter themselves' from the 'barbarities of the Colonists' by living among the Xhosa.

> I am speaking of *their condition at Graaff Reinet, the very place in which numbers of them by the present circumstances are compelled to repair as to an asylum,* where they may be *nourished at the expense of Government,* while still a greater number prefers *to shelter themselves among the [Xhosa] on the side of the Great Fish River against the Barbarities of the Colonists* (LMS TVDK 1801:496; e.a.).

Significant for our argument is that Van der Kemp here compares the colonial 'frontier town' Graaff Reinet, to an 'asylum' in Europe. Here, and contrary to earlier asylums for the 'mad' and 'insane' where mental patients would be treated inhumanely and often put in chains (cf. Foucault 1982a), the late eighteenth century saw a change both in Britain and in France where,

> Quaker reformers such as William Tuke also began to advocate for humane treatment [of the mad] with the creation of the York Retreat in 1796, which treated clients by removing their chains and substituting occupational tasks, good food, and pleasant surroundings for the chains and disorderly environment of many existing facilities (cf. *The History of the Asylum* 2010).

Since Van der Kemp equated the subjection to and power of the settler farmers over the Khoi to that of slavery conditions (cf. Smit 2016b), one can understand his comparison of them fleeing the inhumane conditions of the farms, and aggregating at Graaf Reinet, with the changes taking place in Europe with regard to people being treated differently in its asylums – read, colonial frontier town providing food to the deterritorialized and destitute Khoi. Significantly, and not only metaphorically, for Van der Kemp, his understanding of this town, but also his mission station, would also mean that 'chains' would be removed.

So, as for the current situation in which Van der Kemp positioned the mission, it was to be an intervention. The letter continues:

> Among this number are found the hordes of Klaas Stuurman and Ourson, who repeatedly requested me to come to them to *instruct* them, but constantly refused to settle themselves at or in the proximity of Graaff Reinet. The *consequences of such a condition* can be no others than *idleness, poverty, or enormous expenses to entertain them, an aversion and actual separation from civilized society, vices of every kind, which may end in plundering, murders and irregularities of a different nature*, but all tending to *reverse the happiness and usefulness of that nation and the safety of the Colony* (LMS TVDK 1801:496; e.a.).

The instruction which the missionaries would bring to the Khoi meant that 'idleness' and 'poverty', would be remedied, by introducing 'useful occupational tasks' in then emergent asylum discourse, but also that government expenses would be curbed. It would also change or 'reverse' the Khoi 'aversion and actual separation from civilized society' and their 'vices of every kind, which may end in plundering, murders and irregularities of a different nature' to that of 'happiness' and 'usefulness', and so contribute to the 'safety of the Colony'. Similar to church interventions in Europe, such an intervention for the Khoi

through 'instruction' at a mission, would transform the Khoi from slaves to to citizens and curb their own struggles for survival through 'plundering', even 'murder' and other 'irregularities', in the wake of their loss of land. If the missionaries would be allowed to instruct the Khoi – and even colonial fugitives like the famous Stuurman and Ourson and their followers beyond the colonial frontier (who often raided colonists' cattle which they have 'plundered' from them in the first place) – then the safety of the colony would be increased. Moreover, such instruction would add to Khoi 'happiness and usefulness'.

The notion of 'happiness' in political philosophy, dates from the time of Socrates (in Plato's *Republic* 352a on how we ought to live our lives – cf. Zefnik 2014:i) and came in vogue in seventeenth and eighteenth century Europe as part of the social and economic objectives of living as citizens and their *experience* (!) of 'happiness'. In Christian context, 'happiness' was a common seventeenth and eighteenth century code for both 'salvation' and the happiness of people in actual 'experience' and 'existence' – or the 'good feeling on earth in connection with the affirmation of everyday life'[22]. Zefnik (2014:x) comments, that the Christian context included the notion of 'happiness' as that of 'the ideal of human existence' and that it 'not only became possible already in this world, but also that it became perceived as entirely achievable with human efforts'. 'Salvation' also included material 'happiness' in this world (Zefnik 2014:96-102) and without 'salvation', 'happiness' had a similar meaning in a 'secular' context (Zefnik 2014:102ff)[23].

'Usefulness' similarly referred to the rising tide of urbanisation and the urbanised engaging in work as citizens, and so to contribute to the outputs and productions of a country in Europe. As such, they would not remain illiterate or at worst 'wretches' and 'vagabonds' (and rural) and eke out a living, but would be able to engage education, and care for themselves and their offspring. It would also mean that they would not depend on governments

[22] Cf. Zefnik's 2014:ix; as well as his Chapters 4 – 6, in his study of Foucault's oeuvre focused on the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

[23] In the twentieth (and twenty-first century), '(the birth of) happiness is presented as essential to our understanding of a broader context in which important aspects of individual and social life – such as consumer culture, the modern state, economic system, science and technology, idea of progress, etc. – have emerged in the West' (Zefnik 2014:x); but also internationally.

for their well-being and wellness[24].

Of all the concepts Van der Kemp employs to depict the kind of intervention the mission would have in the then current 'state' but also criminal activities – not only of the farmers but especially the Khoi – 'civilization' seems to have had profound significance. That this was the case, is also evident from the last report of the Directors of the LMS for 1803 as well as the 'Annual Report' by van der Kemp and his fellow missionary who assisted him with the Khoi, James Read, of 1803.

The Directors' report mentions 'civilization' in two contexts. In the first, they say:

> ... Excellency General Dundas ... prompted by the humanity of his disposition, and the just sentiments he entertained of the influence of Missionary exertions in *civilizing the natives*, and promoting the peace and prosperity of the colony, requested [Dr. Van der Kemp] to furnish him with a plan for the formation of a *[Khoi]*-village, *with a view to their civilization* (LMS II DR 1803:54;e.a.).

In their understanding, 'civilizing' meant the same as in Europe – that it would intervene in the 'criminal' activities of illiterate and uneducated people that found themselves still outside 'civilized (modern) life, and those who were not usefully employed. The converting, educational and institutionalisation of indigenous people through the intervention of the missionaries would bring about 'peace and prosperity'. As such, it would intervene in the state of war between the colonists and the Khoi (also theorised by Hobbes, Locke, and Rousseau). Significantly (as in Europe) the establishing of a Khoi 'village' with all the demands of (peaceful) village life, as well as the overseeing functions by the missionaries and government, and their governmental 'power', would bring about 'civilization'. Centrally, this would mean the introduction of Khoi life into the emerging mode of urbanisation and village labour in the colony[25].

[24] John Philip (1828) represents a similar understanding. This is echoed by Comaroff and Comaroff (1997:408f), who summarise, saying that 'civility' meant, 'possessive individualism, commercial production, wage work, contractual relations, ethnicized identity'.

[25] The nineteenth century missions in Africa would continue along this track.

In their second reference, they did so by comparing the conditions under which the missionaries went out to work, with those of 'civilized society' in Europe. They say:

> Actuated, we trust, by the noblest motives by which the human mind can be swayed; [the Missionaries] *have relinquished the enjoyments of civilized society*, for the disgusting intercourse of the rude and uninstructed heathen; some of them have suffered the want of all things; have been, like the apostle, in deaths oft, in perils of waters, in perils of robbers, in perils of the heathen, in perils of the wilderness, in weariness and painfulness, in watchings often, in hunger and thirst, in fastings often, in cold and nakedness (LMS II DR 1803:56; e.a.).

In this reference, we find the whole gamut of emerging modern, upwardly mobile democratic European life as the standard against which missionary life in the colony is measured.

In their list, quoting from the Apostle Paul, the directors actually compare their existence with his reported sufferings, and also as such, make their efforts on taking social responsibility for the Khoi – existentially identifying with the plight of the Khoi – praiseworthy.

On 'civilisation', another indication comes from a letter James Read wrote to the LMS in London. He says that, even though he and Van der Kemp have not had a place allocated for their mission, they 'continue civilizing and instructing the *[Khoi]*, at or near Graaff Reinet' (LMS I EL1 1802:503). Even though it is not clear what he means by 'civilizing', his mention of 'instruction' is seminal to the spread of education amongst those outside bourgeois life and culture, both in Europe, and in the colonies.

A closer specification of 'civilization' however, becomes clearer in Van der Kemp and Read's 'Annual Report' of 1803. They say:

> ... but the state of poverty in which most of them are, obliges many to go to the Boors to work; others go from their own free choice, as these have no care upon them to provide for themselves, which is one of the characteristics of a [Khoi]. Others choose to lie in the bushes, and live upon the roots of the field, rather than *be subject to the discipline of a civilized life*. Laziness is the most prevalent evil among our people, which exposes them to the greatest distresses. Some, however, are

> willing to work, if we could employ them; this we cannot do, not having been able for more than a year to get any money from the Cape, so that we cannot pay them for their labour, which circumstances subjects both them and us to many inconveniences (LMS II AR 1803:165; e.a.).

To this we may add Van der Kemp's report on Governor Jan Willem Janssens' unwillingness to allow the missionaries teach reading and writing - especially the latter[26]. Whereas Janssens' rationale for his rule that '[n]o instruction in writing' was to be given the Khoi was that it 'is not absolutely necessary in the commencement of cultivation', Van der Kemp's interpretation of this 'prejudice' was that he [Janssens] considered them [the Khoi] 'not to be sufficiently *civilized* to make proper use of it' (cf. LMS II P 1805:236; LMS AR 1803:162; e.a.)[27].

Archivally speaking, the most general conceptual formulation - but also the most telling - can then be said to have been that of instructing the Khoi to become 'subject to the discipline of a civilized life'. If they would live such a life, they would not remain in 'poverty', or go and work on settler farmers and be subjected to the latter's cruelty, or 'live upon the roots of the field' but work and produce for themselves and their own well-being. Significantly – and this notion must have been written down by Van der Kemp due to his philosophy background dealing with Classical Greek Philosophy as used in his Interpretation and then new translation of the Letter to the Romans[28]. He says that the Khoi go and work for the frontier settler farmers – where they are also subjected to the latter's 'cruelty' (cf. Smit 2016a: 42-47), sometimes out of their own free choice', since they 'have no care upon them to provide for themselves'. Here, we find echoes of the classical Greek notion of 'care of the self' so famously analysed by Foucault. He did this under the rubric of

[26] Janssens was appointed Batavian Governor of the Cape in 1802, and served until it was taken back by the British in 1806. To some degree, he was popular with the frontier settler farmers, and hostile, to Van der Kemp and Read.

[27] The development of dictionaries, grammars and the teaching of reading and writing by the missions would in time lead to the developing of literatures in the indigenous African languages as well as the 'Africanisation' of Christianity; cf. Pawliková-Vilhanová (2007); and Smit (forthcomingb).

[28] Cf. Van der Kemp (1799, 1800, 1802).

Ethics[29][30]. What is significant in this case, is that where people do not take care of themselves, there is need for intervention, as was the case in the dialogue between Socrates and Alcibiades (ascribed to Plato) that Foucault (1988:23-30) analysed. (Cf. also the many references to the *Alcibiades* in Foucault [1981 - 1982] 2004.) In the case of the destitute Khoi – and to use a twentieth century notion coined by Sampie Terreblanche (1977), their 'chronic societal poverty' due to colonialism, deterritorialisation (their loss of their ancestral lands), disenfranchisement and oppression and exploitation – the missionaries' interventions on their behalf stand out as luminary examples of the taking up of social responsibility and to intervene on the behalf, of the poor and destitute – both with government and with the frontier settler farmers.

Furthermore, if this objective is offset against the repeated statement on the 'idleness' and 'laziness' of the Khoi, then, according to the eighteenth-century archive of power, the Khoi were here seen on a same footing as the peasants, the 'lazy', the 'vagabonds and the criminals' of Europe - that class of people, of which Le Trosne even said: 'A reward of ten pounds is given for anyone who kills a wolf. A vagabond is infinitely more dangerous for society' (cf. Foucault 1979:88)[31]. They, therefore, had to be rounded up in the countryside and from the forests, be imprisoned or at least institutionalised for their own 'cultivation' and 'instruction'. This class of people - perceived as criminal and 'useless' in principle in the modernising Europe, had to receive such an education in the prisons, schools, orphanages, and military academies of Europe. Slaves to the state, they were to become 'useful' for its general prosperity. In Europe - and as it appears to have been also in the understanding of Van der Kemp for the missionary movement - this was to be achieved through institutionalisation. Even more telling of the 'power effects' this would bring about is that the missionaries assume that the Khoi should work for the mission and that the mission should pay them for such work. Even so, the 'civilization' of the Khoi would also mean that they be made subjected to a

[29] Foucault ([1986] 1988: 16 – 49); ([1982b] 1994: 242 – 249); and ([1984b] 1994: 284 - 288).

[30] Cf. Smit (forthcominga). This planned article is a follow-up on Smit (2015b).

[31] This kind of rhetoric is pathologically part and parcel of colonising discourse, because it simultaneously legitimates the superiority of the coloniser, as well as the excesses of colonising practices (cf. Smit 2017a).

'useful' and an 'analytic pedagogy', and to 'institutionalisation', that they be 'governed' and that they as a result, be 'pacified'. (Cf. the follow-up article[32].)

6 Conclusion

I have endeavoured to provide an argument for the social responsibility and power of Van der Kemp, joined by Read in 1801. Their social responsibility manifested in their interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806). Central to the argument is that we should not understand 'social responsibility' in the colonies in terms of twentieth century notions of 'corporate social responsibility', as set out by the various documents released by the Catholic Church during this century, that also deals with 'social responsibility', and as in late twentieth century understandings of the social responsibility of African Christianity for African citizens. Rather, the late eighteenth century missionary interventions on behalf of indigenous people in the southern African colony (as well as more broadly in Africa and the West-Indies for example), must be understood in terms of how they mirrored the governmental and civil society interventions (esp. those by the various ecclesiastical denominations) on behalf of a mostly illiterate and uneducated populace in Europe. More specifically, these interventions were asserted on behalf of indigenous people as they were viciously being deterritorialized and culturally colonised by both colonial governments and frontier settler farmers. These two realities were the background to Van der Kemp and Read's interventions and would continue throughout the nineteenth century in the southern African colony as well as further afield in other African colonies.

[32] I have stayed close to the actual in-context use of the notion of 'civilization' here, and have not articulated it in terms of the broader scholarly considerations of the time, related to 'Mahometanism', and Chinese Confucianism, as debated by deists (cf. Harrison1990). A former staunch deist, Van der Kemp's usage of 'civilization' should be understood within this broader ambit of the discursive formation at the time. And, contrary to Benjamin's ([1955] 2001) messianic '[t]here is no document of civilization which is not at the same time a document of barbarism', and Freud's diagnosis of 'civilisations and its discontents' (cf. Smit 1998), Van der Kemp's denoted a complex of both anti-colonial civil rights intervention, resistance, and push-back activism, as well as a calculated and guarded support of Empire, in so far as it abolished the slave trade.

For this first part of the research, I have indicated that Van der Kemp initially came to South Africa to start a mission among the Xhosa beyond the frontier, but was disappointed because he was not successful. The reason was that they preferred their own cultural systems (which Van der Kemp described, including rules for click sounds and a Vocabulary of isiXhosa – cf. LMS *Transactions* I) and refused the foreign system, even though they were open to being 'instructed', or educated (cf. Social Responsibility & Power II). On his return to the colony, Van der Kemp noticed the destitute conditions of the Khoi, due to their progressive loss of land and because of the encroaching settler colonialism, and the fact that they could not provide for themselves anymore. This made him to petition the British colonial government for land for the Khoi on which he could start a mission station, and for financial support by government for Khoi living conditions and food. Once the mission station had been founded, he would continue to petition government – including the Batavian government (1803 - 1806) for such support.

In this first part of the research I have dealt with the topics of 'freedom' and 'civilisation'. When the Khoi, due to their destitute conditions, were coerced to work for both government and frontier settler farmers under atrocious conditions, Van der Kemp resisted this. He asserted that the Khoi were '*perfectly free',* and that they should therefore be treated '*upon an equal footing in every respect with the Colonists*'. This is very significant because the frontier farmers looked down on the Khoi and treated them 'cruelly', and 'murdered' those who would plunder them due to their destitute condition. As such, the merciless and brutal physical power relations between Khoi and settler farmers constituted a complex in which Van der Kemp sought to intervene on behalf of the Khoi. This he did, and he also succeeded to some degree in this regard. With regard to the colonial government, it used some Khoi as troops, but also to work for the colonial government in what could broadly be characterised as 'public works' like clearing vegetation for ox-wagon roads. They were paid a pittance – about which the missionaries continuously complained to government. Even so, the missionaries succeeded to found Bethelsdorp within the colony's borders close to the colonial frontier. This would give many Khoi a 'spot' or 'home' as the missionaries argued for many years to come.

Given these realities, part of Van der Kemp and Read's arguments for a piece of land for the Khoi was that they said that this would also be a place for their 'civilization'. Similar to how institutionalisation in Europe was meant

to improve the quality of life for mostly illiterate and uneducated people, the missionaries argued that the same should happen on behalf of the Khoi. At the mission, the missionaries would strive for their 'conversion' and 'salvation', but also subject them to education. Because the Khoi lost their lands due to colonisation and were increasingly de-culturalized by being displaced from their ancestral lands, the missionaries sought to give them a Western Education. As education was part and parcel of both West European and missionary practices in the colonies, it impacted the Khoi.

Even so, the missionaries did not strive to rebuild the Khoi culturally in terms of their own cultural heritage. Rather, they were subjected to the power of a foreign religion as well as educated culture. Moreover, we see in one of Read's letters to the LMS directors in London, that he argued that rather than working for the settler farmers, the Khoi should work for the mission station. In brief, they should switch their subjection to power from the colonial government and frontier settler farmers on the one hand to the mission station on the other. This was part of the beginning of missions and would continue into the nineteenth century. We may reason – as Van der Kemp intimated – that the mission station would assist the Khoi to 'take care of themselves'. The historical truth however, is that this challenge had to be taken up while they were being subjected to missionary 'useful education', 'institutionalisation' and 'surveillance', and 'pacification'. This argument will be developed further in my 'Social Responsibility and Power II'.

Acknowledgements

***** I want to extend my sincere thanks to the detailed comments of the two independent reviewers, on whose wisdom I could draw for the improving of my argument in this article.

* In addition, I want to thank the University of KwaZulu-Natal for the sabbatical during which I could do the research and write-up this article, amongst others.

* I would also like to extend my sincere gratitude for the multiform assistance and help that I have received from Ms. Faith Bhengu, UKZN Principal Librarian (Durban), Ms. Celeste Johns, Circulation Supervisor, Mr. John Timms, Circulation Desk (Interlibrary Loans), and Mss. Shanitha Bhim and Bronwyn Tayler, Circulation Desk (Pietermaritzburg).

References

Banerjee, S.B. 2012. Corporate Social Responsibility: The Good, the Bad and the Ugly. doi/abs/10.1177/0896920507084623. (Accessed on 01/03/2017.)

Bannister, S. 1830. *Humane Policy; or, Justice to the Aborigines of New Settlements, Essential to a Due Expenditure of British Money and to the Best Interests of the Settlers, with Suggestions how to Civilise the Natives by an Improved Administration of Existing Means.* London: Thomas and George Underwood.

Benjamin, W. [1955] 2001. On the Concept of History. In *Gessamelte Schriften* I.2. Frankfurt a.M.: Suhrkamp.

Benware, P. 1971. The Social Responsibility of the Church. *Grace Journal* 12,1,Winter: 3-17.

Carey, D. & L. Festa (eds.) 2009. *The Postcolonial Enlightenment: Eighteenth-century Colonialism and Postcolonial Theory.* Oxford: OUP.

Carroll, A.B. 1999. Corporate Social Responsibility: Evolution of a Definitional Construct. *Business and Society* September, 38, 3: 268 – 295.

Comaroff, J.L. & J. Comaroff 1997. *Of Revelation and Revolution. The Dialectics of Modernity on a South African Frontier.* Volume 2. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press.

Dawley, A. 1991. *Struggles for Justice: Social Responsibility and the Liberal State.* Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University.

Dierendonck, D. & K. Patterson 2010. *Servant Leadership in Theory and Research.* London: Palgrave MacMillan.

Ehusani, G. 1999. The Church and Social Responsibility. Available at: http://www.georgeehusani.org/home/index.php/papers-and-essays/194-the-church-and-social-responsibility. (Accessed on 01 March 2017.)

Garriga, E. & D. Melé 2004. Corporate Social Responsibility Theories: Mapping the Territory. *Journal of Business Ethics* August,53,1:51 – 71.

Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World – Gaudiam et Spes (1962 – 1965). Second Vatican Council, 1965 Part One and Part Two. Available at: http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_cons_19651207_gaudium-et-spes_en.html. (Accessed on 01 March 2017.)

Foucault, M. [1961] 1982a. *Madness and Civilisation. A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason.* Howard, R. (trans.). London: Tavistock.

Foucault, M. [1963] 1973. *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical*

Perception. Sheridan-Smith, A. (trans.). London: Tavistock.
Foucault, M. [1970] 1982b. *The Order of Things. An Archaeology of the Human Sciences.* London: Tavistock.
Foucault, M. [1973] 1994. Truth and Juridical Forms. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Power.* London: Penguin.
Foucault, M. [1975] 1979. *Discipline and Punish. The Birth of the Prison.* Sheridan, A. (trans.). London: Penguin.
Foucault, M. [1981- 1982] 2004. *The Hermeneutics of the Subject. Lectures at the College de France, 1981 – 1982.* New York: Picador.
Foucault, M. [1982a] 1994. The Subject and Power. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Power.* London: Penguin.
Foucault, M. [1982b] 1994. Technologies of the Self. In Rabinow, P. (ed.): *Essential Works of Foucault 1954 – 1984: Ethics.* Volume 1. London: Penguin Books.
Foucault, M. [1983] 1994. The Risks of Security. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Power.* London: Penguin Books.
Foucault, M. [1984a] 1994. The Ethics of the Concern for Self as a Practice of Freedom. In Rabinow, P. (ed.): *Essential Works of Foucault 1954 – 1984: Ethics.* Volume I. London: Penguin.
Foucault, M. [1984b] 1994. The Ethics of the Concern for Self as a Practice of Freedom. In Rabinow, P. (ed.): *Essential Works of Foucault 1954 – 1984: Ethics.* Volume 1. London: Penguin Books. (Also as Appendix to: Dreyfus, H. & P. Rabinow (eds.) 1982. *Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Foucault, M. [1986]1988. *Care of the Self. Volume 3 of the History of Sexuality.* Hurley Robert (trans). London: Allen Lane; The Penguin Press.
Foucault, M. 1988. *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*. Martin, L.H., H. Gutman & P.H. Hutton (eds.): London: Tavistock.
Friedman, M. 1970. The Social Responsibility of Business is to Increase its Profits. *New York Times* 13 September: 1 - 6.
Harrison, P. 1990. 'Religion' and the Religions in the English Enlightenment. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Hauerwas, S. 1995. *In Good we Trust: The Church as Polis.* Notre Dame: Notre Dame Press.
Hobbes, T. 1651. *Leviathan.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
Jacoby, N.H. 1973. *Corporate Power and Social Responsibility.* New York: Macmillan.

Kodia, D.H. 2005. *Poverty in Grace: Social Responsibility of the Church and Society in War against Poverty.* Nairobi: Uzima Publishing House.

Koopman, C. 2013. *Genealogy as Critique: Foucault and the Problems of Modernity (American Philosophy).* Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Lee, M-D. 2008. Theory of Corporate Social Responsibility – A Review of the Theories of Corporate Social Responsibility: Its Evolutionary Path and the Road Ahead. *International Journal of Management Reviews* 10,1: 53 – 73. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2370.2007.00226.x. (Accessed on 01/03/2017.)

Lydenburg, S.D. 2005. Corporations and the Public Interest: Guiding the Invisible Hand. San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler.

Locke, J. 1689. *Two Treatises of Government: In the Former the False Principles and Foundation of Sir Robert Filmer and his Followers are Detected and Overthrown. The Latter is an Essay Concerning the True Original, Extent and End of Civil Government.* London: Whimore & Penn.

Marsden, G. 1987. *Reforming Fundamentalism: Fuller Seminary and the New Evangelicalism.* Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans.

May, S., G. Cheney & J. Roper 2007. *The Debate over Corporate Social Responsibility.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Niebuhr, R.H. 1946. The Responsibility of the Church for Society. In Latourette, K.S. (ed.): *The Gospel, The World and the Church.* New York & London: Harper Bros.

Paul, Pope John 1995. 'Ecclesia in Africa'. Available at: http://w2.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/en/apost_exhortations/documents/hf_jp-iiexh14091 . 995_ecclesia-in-africa.html. (Accessed on 03 March 2017.)

Pawliková-Vilhanová, V. 2007. Christian Missions in Africa and their Role in the Transformation of African Societies. *Asian and African Studies* 16,2: 249-260.

Penyak, L.M. & W.J. Petry (eds.) 2006. *Religion in Latin America: A Documentary History.* Maryknoll: Orbis.

Philip, John 1828. *Researches in South Africa: Illustrating the Civil, Moral, and Religious Condition of the Native Tribes: Including Journals of the Author's Travels in the Interior: Together with Detailed Accounts of the Progress of the Christian Missions, Exhibiting the Influence of Christianity in Promoting Civilization.* Volumes I and II. London: James Duncan. Potkay, Adam.

Ross, R. 1986. *John Philip (1775 – 1851): Missions, Race and Politics in South Africa.* Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.

Rousseau, J-J. [1762] 1782. Civil Society. In *The Social Contract*. Cole, G.D.H. (trans.). Available at: http://www.constitution.org/jjr/socon.htm. (Accessed on 01 March 2017.)

Sethi, S.P. 1972. The Corporation and the Church: Institutional Conflict and Social Responsibility. *California Management Review* 15,1: 63-74. DOI: 10.2307/41164401. (Accessed on 01203/2017.)

Smit, J.A. 1998. The Marginal. *Alternation* 5,2: 1 – 9.

Smit, J.A. 2001. The Language of the Other. *Alternation* 8,2: 70 – 106.

Smit, J.A. 2015a. Critical Perspectives on Beyers Naudé as Postcolonial Theologian. *Alternation* Special Edition 14: 247 – 281.

Smit, J.A. 2015b. J.T. Van der Kemp and Eighteenth Century Coded Subjectivity. *Journal for the Study of Religion* 28: 6-41.

Smit, J.A. 2016a. J.T. van der Kemp and his Critique of the Settler Farmers on the South African Colonial Frontier (1799-1811). *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29,1: 6 – 56.

Smit, J.A. 2016b. J.T. van der Kemp's Link to the British Anti-slavery Network and his Civil Rights Activism on Behalf of the Khoi (1801 – 1803). *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29,2: 5 – 28.

Smit, J.A. 2017. #DecolonialEnlightenment and Education. *Alternation* Special Edition 19: 253 – 311.

Smit, J.A. J.T. van der Kemp and his Technologies of Grace on the South African Frontier (1799-1812). (Forthcominga.)

Smit, J.A. Xhosa Sovereignty and Power: J.T Van der Kemp's Mission amongst the Xhosa (1899 – 1801). (Forthcomingb.)

Terreblanche, S. 1977. Gemeenskaparmoede, Perspektief op Chroniese Armoede in die Kleurling-gemeenskap. (Community Poverty, Perspectives on Chronic Poverty in the Coloured-community). Kaapstad: Tafelberg.

The Church's Social Responsibility 2007. A Document of the Assembly of Confessing Congregations within the Uniting Church of Australia. Available at: http://www.confessingcongregations.com/national/item/the-churchs-social-responsibility/. (Accessed on 05 March 2017.)

The History of the Asylum: The Eighteenth Century 2010. Available at: http://history.med.ufl.edu/files/2010/10/The-18th-Century-Asylum.pdf. 31 May 2017.)

Transactions of the London Missionary Society. Volume I, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria, and History &c. of*

Caffraria, 1804. pp. 323-507.

Transactions of the London Missionary Society. Volume II. 1806. pp. 1-253.

Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume III. 1812. pp. 2-10,249f,398-409.

Van der Kemp, J.T. 1799, 1800, 1802. *De Thedicée van Paulus, of de Rechtvaardigheid Gods door het Euangelium uit het Geloof, aangetoond tot Geloof, in Eenige Aanmerkingen of deszelfs Brief aan de Romeinen, met Eene Nieuwe Vertaling en Paraphrase.* Volumes I, II, and III. Dordrecht: A. Blussé en Zoon.

Viljoen, R. 1995. Moravian Missionaries, Khoisan Labour and the Overberg Colonists at the End of the VOC Era, 1792-5. In Bredekamp, H. & R. Ross (eds.): *Missions and Christianity in South African History.* Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.

Zefnik, L. 2014. *Critical Perspectives in Happiness Research: The Birth of Modern Happiness.* Heidelberg, New York, Dordrecht & London: Springer.

Ziegler, J.J. 2013. What is Social Justice? Parts 1 and 2. *Catholic World Report* 10 April and 14 May.

World Synod of Catholic Bishops 1971. Justice in the World. Available at: https://www.cctwincities.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/Justicia-in-Mundo.pdf. (Accessed on 16 March 2017.)

Archival Sources

LMS I EL1 1801. *Extracts from Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions I. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 92-95.

LMS I TVDK 1800. *Transactions of Dr. Vanderkemp, in the Year 1801. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria, and History &c. of Caffraria*, 1804. pp. 323-507.

LMS I TVDK 1801. *Transactions of Dr. Vanderkemp, in the Year 1801. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria, and History &c. of Caffraria*, 1804. pp. 323-507.

LMS I EL1 1802. *Extracts from Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions I. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804.

LMS II AR 1803. *Annual Report of the Missionaries at Bethelsdorp, South Africa, for the Year 1803, From the Missionaries Vanderkemp and Read. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1806. pp. 1-253.

LMS II DR 1803. Directors' Report. *Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1806. pp. 1-253.

LMS II AR 1805. Van der Kemp, JT. *Extracts from the Annual Report of the Missionary Institution of Bethelsdorp for the year 1805.* pp. 401-404. *Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1806. pp. 2-10,249f; 398-409.

LMS II P 1805. John William Janssens, Governor and Commander in Chief, together with the Members of the Board of Police at the Cape of Good Hope, &c. 1805. *Proclamation.* Dated February 20 1805. pp. 233-236. *Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1806. pp. 1-253.

Johannes A. Smit
School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics
University of KwaZulu-Natal
smitj@ukzn.ac.za

Social Responsibility and Power II: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions for and on behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806)

Johannes A. Smit

Abstract

In 'Social Responsibility and Power I', I have endeavoured to provide an argument for the social responsibility and power of J.T. van der Kemp (joined by James Read in 1801) as manifest in his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi vis-à-vis the British and later Batavian colonial governments, as well as the frontier settler farmers on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) (cf. Smit 2016a). His own 'power' became manifest in his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi and his critique of both the colonial governments and the frontier settler farmers. To this we may add his assertion of the freedom of the landless Khoi, and his contention that they should receive a piece of land, to be allocated by government, for a mission station, where they would be subjected to education and be 'civilized'. I have expounded what these developments meant in terms of the 'archive' of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. They included, amongst others, the further de-culturalisation of the Khoi. In this article, I take the argument further by focusing on the 'useful education', 'analytic education', 'institutionalisation', the interaction with the colonial 'government' in these matters, and the 'pacification' of the Khoi by the mission as institution.

Keywords: J.T. van der Kemp, Khoi (or Khoikhoi/ Khoisan), social responsibility, power, Michel Foucault

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a3

1 Introduction

In 'Social Responsibility and Power I', I have endeavoured to provide an argument for the social responsibility and power of J.T. van der Kemp (joined by James Read in 1801) 1801 – 1806 as manifest in his interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi vis-à-vis the British and later Batavian colonial governments, as well as the frontier settler farmers on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) (cf. Smit 2016a). His own 'power' became manifest in his intervention for and on behalf of the Khoi and his critique of both the colonial governments as well as the frontier settler farmers. To this we may add his assertion of the freedom of the landless and destitute Khoi, and his contention that the Khoi should receive a piece of land, to be allocated by the government, for a mission station, where they would be educated and 'civilized'. I have expounded what these developments meant in terms of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries 'archive'[1].

With regard to the Khoi, missionary power came to the front then in especially their assertion of the 'freedom' of the Khoi vis-à-vis the British colonial government: that they were not slaves (cf. Smit 2016b); that they should have their own piece of land; and that government should provide them with a missionary station for the Khoi. I also dealt with the missionary objective of the 'civilization' of the Khoi and what that entailed, and also expounded this notion from a communication coming from the LMS Directors in London. In a nutshell, my argument was developed in terms of the rising importance of civil society in Europe since the seventeenth century through the eighteenth century. There, Christian denominations formed part of civil society and had started to intervene on behalf of the poor, illiterate, and uneducated through especially education (the building of schools), health (the building of hospitals), the care of orphans (through the building of orphanages) and institutions for the old and infirm. European Governments did so too,

[1] In brief, I take the notion of the 'archive', to comprise of all those statements, in Foucault's sense, together with scholarly views, and thoughts or ideas, expressed, written down and published, or communicated and reported on or sometimes just alluded to, as part of the Knowledge, or more closely, the European and colonising Knowledge-Power complex that was in the process of formation, both in Europe and the colonies during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. In Van der Kemp's case, there is a pre-Kantian limit, that has to be acknowledged (cf. Krom 1800,II:lxxf).

especially through the building of asylums, hospitals, schools, orphanages, and prisons, and the setting up of barracks with their accompanying training of soldiers. Government-supporting academics (and sometimes anti-government intellectuals) developed the requisite 'knowledge' that accompanied the setting up of these institutions[2]. The legal fraternity also formed part of these developments, and even though Foucault refer to comparative legal developments in his published work, interviews and lectures, he did not make this a primary focus as for instance, in his enquiries as in the ones he published books on (but see Foucault [1973] 1994). On these topics – which he often called 'limit-experiences' – he primarily worked in the area of knowledge and relations of power (knowledge-power or power-knowledge), and how these intersect with notions of the subject and knowledge, and as these were being produced during the late eighteenth and into the nineteenth centuries (cf. Said 2002a).

In this second article on this topic, I aim to demonstrate that we should understand 'social responsibility' in the late eighteenth century as well as at least the first half of the nineteenth century as part of the interventions of the great denominational variety of Christian missions for and on behalf of indigenous people in the colonies vis-à-vis colonising governments and their (frontier) settler farmers (cf. Ross 1986)[3]. Accompanying the early missions' social responsibility interventions was also their own power or power effects on the indigenous populations of the colonies though. Such power, I reason, was similar to 'power' as it developed hand in hand with the production of the accompanying knowledge by academics and intellectuals as part of the sixteenth through the eighteenth century European Enlightenment, which occurred parallel to the industrialization and modernization of Europe. By implementing discursive practises that resonated with the European Enlightenment, in the colonies, the missions would exert power over indigenous populations, similar to that exerted by both Christian denominations and governments in Europe when they institutionalised the poor, uneducated, illiterate, criminals, as well as the 'lazy', and the 'vagabonds'. This all formed part of the introduction of all citizens into the productive labour force of the

[2] Cf. Foucault's research – Foucault ([1961] 1982a); ([1963] 1973); ([1975] 1979).

[3] Cf. also Freund 1989: 339 - 343, who states that the 'critical tradition' started by Van der Kemp and continued by Philip continued well into the twentieth century.

then rising industrial-capital-labour complexes – both in Europe and the colonies. As in the earlier article, I mainly draw on Van der Kemp's correspondence from his extant South African texts: mainly his diary and letters published by the London Missionary Society (LMS) in its *Transactions* (1804; 1806; and 1812), and on some letters published in Saxe Bannister's *Humane Policy* (1830). For 'power', and 'power effects' in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries' 'power relations' and 'power networks', I draw on the theory and discursive historical studies by Michel Foucault[4].

In this article I then continue my focus on a sample of Van der Kemp's own views and social responsibility interventions for and on behalf of the Khoi in the 'power relations' and 'power networks' of the colony. For the latter, I shall also draw on a few perspectives of Foucault with regard to the significance of related governmental, civil and religious interventions on behalf of the general populace in late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century Britain and France, which are interventions that are symptomatically mirrored in the missionary discourses in Europe's colonies, contesting colonisation in its actual cruelty and de-humanisation effects but also exerting power through their own missionary and institutionalising practices. Even though counterhegemonic, the missions would develop their own 'power relations', 'power effects', and 'power networks' among the colonised, or yet to be colonised. This will provide some indication as to the even broader *episteme*[5], in which we must position Van der Kemp's own judgements,

[4] Cf. Foucault (1994 463); ([1983] 1994: 451); and ([1984] 1994:299) amongst others).

[5] In my perception, Foucault's notion of episteme, can usefully be understood as what we may call, an epochal historical, and historicisable, knowledge-power construct. While inherently quite diverse and pluriform, as well as developmental, in its internal Knowledge (or epistemological) and related institutional constitutional articulations, there are certain problematizing and conceptual features that allow different forms of knowledge to be grouped together. In this regard, there is some affinity with Thomas Kuhn's diachronic notion of 'paradigm' in his *Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (1962] 1970), as well as the latter's understanding of the 'incommensurability' of historically consecutive, but also parallel paradigms, synchronically understood. In this regard, Foucault's diachronically understood *episteme*, could also be usefully employed for the study of mutually-exclusionary knowledge-power constructs,

decisions, ideas and initiatives on the Eastern Cape frontier at the beginning of the 'century of missions' in South Africa, but also his own power effects on the Khoi, even though he intervened with government (and the frontier settler farmers, cf. Smit 2016a) on their behalf. (At this point of the research, I do not address the issue of whether there was a discursive 'break' in the Christianities of the time – similar to the discursive epistemic 'break' in the Human Sciences of language, life and labour, toward the end of the eighteenth and beginning of the nineteenth centuries (cf. Foucault ([1970] 1982b)[6].

2 Background

In order for the churches to have had space for their development of their own processes and projects for taking social responsibility for populations – both in Europe and the colonies – the notion of 'civil society' was fundamental as it developed since the seventeenth century. Their initiatives also fall within the ambit of the variable 'Social Contract' tradition as put forward by Thomas Hobbes (1651), John Locke (1689), and especially Jean-Jacques Rousseau (1782; cf. also Pletsch 1996). The significant difference though, was that whereas the philosophers argued for the existence of 'civil society' and a related 'moral civil liberty' vis-à-vis the universal 'state of nature' underlying

especially during times where certain regions of the world, or maybe even the world of scholarship in some combined fashion, undergo some form of epochal transformation. The so-called 'linguistic turn' – where Saussurian linguistics impacted the cultural and social sciences – and the 'cultural turn' and the 'social turn' dating from the 1980s and 1990s respectively, are examples. With the rise of Information Technology and social media, and the increasing 'globalising' of the world, we are currently living through such an era, because there is socio-cultural data about our world that is being produced in society, that previous problematizations and objectifications and conceptualizations – or paradigms/ epistemes – cannot deal with analytically and interpretively. (On request of a reviewer, I repeat this note on the issue of episteme, in 'Social Responsibility and Power I').

[6] The issue at stake, concerns the actual status of what the perception of Christianity or the Christianities, of the time were with regard to the emergence of the discourses on language, life, and labour as 'science' (cf. Foucault 1980:197.)

civilization, the Christian denominations based their understanding of their self-organisation, and that of their communities, on Scripture and also (in some denominations) on the Reformed tradition and its Presbyterian system (cf. Tomkins 2010). As such, they organised themselves in local ecclesiastical organisations – the local churches or presbyteries – which formed the basis of the church denomination and its social responsibility outreach programmes. In general, Foucault ([1973] 1994: 60) says:

> … at a relatively low levels of the social scale, [these] spontaneous groups of persons … assigned themselves, without any delegation from a higher authority, *the task of maintaining order* and of *creating new instruments for ensuring order*, for their own purposes. These groups were numerous, and they proliferated during the entire eighteenth century (e.a.).

In England, Foucault ([1973] 1994:60-64) points out – as I also did with regard to the founding and organisation of the anti-slavery movement and its developments (cf. Smit 2016b:10) – that these initiatives originated amongst the Quakers in the late seventeenth century through the eighteenth century, and amongst the Methodists, especially in the second half of the eighteenth century. The nonconformist Christian Religious organisations and churches joined by some Anglican clergy in the late eighteenth century – attempted amongst others to root out 'drunkenness, adultery, refusal to work', and took on the dual task of 'supervision and welfare assistance'.

> They took on the task of helping *those who didn't possess the means of subsistence, those too old to work, the sick, the mentally ill*. At the same time as they offered assistance, though, they accorded themselves the possibility and right to *observe the conditions* in which the assistance was given: observing whether the individual who wasn't working, was actually ill, whether his poverty and his misery were not due to debauchery, drunkenness, the vices. So these [Christian movements] involved groups *establishing their own internal supervision*, one with a *deeply religious origin, operation, and ideology* (e.a.; Foucault [1973] 1994:60f).

In summary, on the Methodists, Foucault ([1973] 1994:61) points out that John Wesley revived the essentially secular movement, the Society for the

Reform of Manners dating from the late 1700s, in the second half of the eighteenth century.

> It set out to *reform manners* getting peoples to *respect Sunday, …… preventing gambling and drunkenness, curbing prostitution, adultery, cursing, blasphemy – everything that might show contempt for God*. As Wesley said in his sermons, it was a matter of *preventing the lowest and basest class from taking advantage of inexperienced young people and fleecing them for money* (e.a.).

Important for our argument – with Van der Kemp asserting the importance of land ownership by the Khoi (cf. Smit 2017a) – is that the religious development of their organisations in England differed from those in France, except with regard to how land-ownership developed, which was similar in both counties (cf. Foucault [1973] 1994:69f).

> [They] … formed from the petty bourgeoisie …. [and] organized themselves to try to suppress vice, to reform manners, were lower-middle class-citizens, grouped together for the obvious purpose of establishing *order* among themselves and around them. But this desire to establish order was basically *a way of escaping from political pow*er, because the latter possessed a formidable, terrifying, and sanguinary instrument – penal legislation. Indeed, for more than three hundred kinds of offense one could be hung [in England]. This meant that it was very easy for authority, for the aristocracy, for those who controlled the juridical apparatus, to bring terrible pressures on the popular strata. It is easy to understand how it was in the interest of religious groups to try and escape from a judicial authority so bloodthirsty and threatening (Foucault [1973] 1994:62f).
>
> …. To escape that judicial authority, individuals organized into moral reform societies, prohibited drunkenness, prostitution, theft, everything that would enable state power to attack the group, destroy it, to use any pretext to send people to the gallows. So it was more a matter of groups for self-defense against the law than of effective surveillance organizations. The strengthening of self-organized penal processes was a way of escaping from the penal regime of the state (Foucault [1973] 1994:63).

In the course of the eighteenth century, as these groups became more wealthy, they shifted their focus away from the recruiting of the petit-bourgeois. This was the second phase.

> … At the end of the eighteenth century, it was the aristocracy, the bishops, the richest persons who were initiated into these groups of moral self-defense, these leagues for the elimination of vice.
>
> We thus have a social shift that indicates perfectly well how this moral reform enterprise stopped being a penal self-defense and became, on the contrary, a reinforcing power of penal justice itself. Alongside the dreadful penal instrument it possessed, state power was to lay claim to these instruments of pressure, of control. What was involved, in a sense, was *a mechanism for bringing social control organizations under state control* (Foucault [1973] 1994:63).

This shift or second phase in eighteenth century in England, meant that,

> This moral control was exerted by the upper classes, the holders of power, over the lower, poorer strata, the popular strata. It thus became an instrument for the wealthy over the poor, for the exploiting over the exploited, which conferred a new political and social polarity on these [Christian religious] agencies of control (Foucault [1973] 1994:63).

Whereas the aristocracy and bourgeois class did not themselves conform to the morality that was proclaimed by these Christian religious organizations – who still represented the petit bourgeoisie and poor, Foucault goes on to show that they appealed to them to also conform to the morality, so as to set 'an example' to the petit bourgeois and poor. Otherwise 'the poor [would] follow the example of the rich in not observing the laws'. Even though these laws were not made for the rich, if they would set the example, 'there will be at least the possibility of controlling and supervising the poorer classes' (cf. Foucault [1973] 1994:64). Foucault interprets these developments further, by saying:

> In this gradual state takeover – in this transfer of the points of control from the hands of the petit-bourgeois groups trying to escape from state power to those of the social group actually holding power – in

> this whole evolution, we can observe how a morality with a religious origin was brought into and disseminated in a state appropriated penal system that, by definition, turned a blind eye to the immoral conduct [of the rich] and vowed to cut the ties with morality and religion. Bourgeois ideology, arisen and nurtured in the little Quaker and Methodist groups in England at the end of the eighteenth century, now sprang up at the other pole, at the other extremity of the social scale, on the side of power at the beginning of the nineteenth century (Foucault [1973] 1994:64)[7].

Against this background I then continue my analysis of Van der Kemp's social responsibility and interventions for an on behalf of the Khoi. As such, it formed part of the beginning of the numerous interventions of the missions and individual missionaries and ministers – both black and white – on behalf of the indigenous population vis-à-vis at least the first half of the nineteenth century colonial government. (How these formed part of this 'state takeover' of the petit bourgeois organisations, by the bourgeois, will be explicated at a later stage.)

3 Useful Pedagogy

For the pedagogy associated with the criminal and vagabond, the first question concerns identification. Eighteenth-century intellectuals developed 'tables' of crime, where crimes were described in detail. The most significant concerned those criminals who perpetrated crimes related to property, and for the frontier Khoi, due to their 'want of food' and the fact that they did not have land on which to work, this meant that the only option open was 'vices of every kind, which may end in plundering, murders and irregularities of a different nature' (LMS TVDK 1801:496). For Van der Kemp, in his estimation, they were functioning similarly to the criminals and vagabonds in the early industrialising Europe due to their want of land, their inability to work for their own well-being, and their struggle for survival. They were not useful, but according to

[7] France was different, in that it functioned through the *lettres de cachet* that mainly the land owners and bourgeois brought through the system to the king, for the incarceration of the poor and petit bourgeoisie – cf. Foucault ([1973] 1994:64-67).

the then penal laws in Europe, 'harmful to society' (cf. Foucault 19914a:53).

In Europe, due to the general increase of wealth and the production of goods during the eighteenth-century, and compared to medieval laws, crime, punishment and the legal process were also transformed (cf. Foucault 19914a:52ff). From a situation where crimes and punishment were mostly related to blood, they now became ever more related to goods.

> ... the shift from a criminality of blood to a criminality of fraud forms part of a whole complex mechanism, embracing the development of production, the increase of wealth, a higher juridical and moral value placed on property relations, stricter methods of surveillance, a tighter partitioning of the population, more efficient techniques of locating and obtaining information: the shift in illegal practices is correlative with an extension and a refinement of punitive practices (Foucault 1979:77).

In this transformation, the reformers of justice developed a whole new 'economy of power'. This was directed by the desire to do away with the excesses of the old economy and a replacing of the 'super-power' of the sovereign by that of civil society. The crime of pilfering or the illegal appropriation of ownership was not against the sovereign as in medieval Europe (cf. Foucault 1994a:42f), but against society and its citizens. The aim of the new economy was to 'insert the power to punish more deeply into the social body', to punish with greater universality, and 'punish better' (Foucault 1979:78-82).

The identification of other criminals in general was just as easy - they were those people who did not live and function as citizens: the 'vagabonds in the woods' and the 'lazy'. By definition, such people had already excluded themselves from civil society and the body politic. They did not function as citizens. They constituted the 'idle' who lived off the produce of others. It is for such people that the utilitarians developed a 'useful pedagogy'. Foucault (1979:122) comments:

> The useful pedagogy would revive for the lazy individual a liking for work, force him back into a system of interests in which labour would be more advantageous than laziness, form around him a small miniature, simplified, coercive society in which the maxim '*he who*

> *wants to live must work*', would be clearly revealed. *Work would be compulsory*, but so too would be *remuneration*, which enables the [criminal/ prisoner] to improve his lot during and after detention [instruction]. *'The man who does not find his subsistence must be made to desire to procure it for himself by work; he is offered it by supervision and discipline; in a sense, he is forced to acquire it; he is then tempted by the bait of gain; corrected in his morals, accustomed to work, his anxiety aroused by the little money he has kept for his release', he has learned to trade 'that will guarantee a subsistence without danger'* (Vilan) (e.a.).

This pedagogical process derives from the sixteenth-century cell in the monastery. The birth of *homo oeconomicus* and the religious conscience of the cell are here representationally co-extensive. The same rules of 'time-table', 'prohibitions and obligations, continual supervision, exhortations, religious readings, a whole complex of methods "to draw toward good" and "to turn away from evil" held the prisoners [and learners] in its grip ...'. But these mechanisms also meant the transformation of the individual through religious readings, the bible, prayer, and these practices' timetables. Habits of daily work had to be inculcated if the edification or rehabilitation of the individual was at stake. Work had to be done on the prisoner's soul continuously. The prison was a system of 'altering minds' and of rehabilitating individuals to accept their duties as full citizens and members of society - thereby becoming mutually responsible for the contract all shared (cf. Foucault 1979:122,120).

It appears as if the 'ideas' Van der Kemp advanced on the projected mission institution for the Khoi as well as how it became established and eventually functioned, fit this exposition of the 'useful pedagogy' – even though not in the context of the 'prison'. If seeing the Khoi as idle and lazy, and engaging 'vices of every kind, which may end in plundering, murders and irregularities of a different nature', made their existence criminal by definition, then to change this to a 'useful' existence, meant a whole arsenal of technologies of power. A few points can be made with regard to these assumptions.

Firstly, whenever Van der Kemp had the opportunity, he followed a rigorous daily, weekly, and monthly timetable of scripture readings, preaching, prayer, catechism, and schooling - on the ship, the Hillsborrough *en route* to the Cape in 1799, his trek to the Eastern Cape beyond the then frontier, his time

in the area of Ngqika, the time spent at Graaff Reinet, Bota's Place and also when Bethelsdorp was founded. Like timetables drawn up for the prisons, factories, schools, orphanages and academies in Europe, Van der Kemp's timetables also had to effect the training of a disciplined and useful individual. In proper institutional context, this indicates how time was used to exert disciplinary power over the body. In this context, Foucault (1979:125) observes:

> They are processes that effect a transformation of the individual as a whole - of his body and of his habits by the daily work that he is forced to perform, of his mind and his will by the spiritual attentions that are paid to him: 'Bibles and other books of religious practice are provided; the clergy of the different obediences to be found in the town and suburbs perform the services once a week and any other edifying person may have access to the prisoners at any time' (Teeters). But this transformation is entrusted to the administration itself. Solitude and self-examination are not enough; nor are purely religious exhortations. Work on the prisoner's soul must be carried out as often as possible. The prison, though an administrative apparatus, will at the same time be a machine for altering minds.

Secondly, the work on the 'soul' of the individual - mostly referred to as 'experimental meetings', presumably indicating an in-depth questioning and discussion of the spiritual state or well-being of individuals - often referred to in the Van der Kemp texts, did not merely indicate what Van der Kemp called the giving of 'a description of the present state of your soul' (LMS I TVDK 1801:491). As far as 'soul' is concerned, it meant that the power over the body - exerted through the timetable - was reduplicated in a strategic or tactical micro-physics of power on the soul, on the 'non-corporal' (cf. Foucault [1975] 1979: 29). The 'soul' was:

> ... the present correlative of a certain technology of power over the body .... it exists, it has a reality, it is produced permanently around, on, within the body by the functioning of a power that is exercised on those punished [instructed] - and, in a more general way, on those one supervises, trains and corrects, over madmen, children at home and at school, the colonized, over those who are stuck at a machine and

> supervised for the rest of their lives. This is the historical reality of this soul, which, unlike the soul represented by Christian theology, is not born in sin and subject to punishment, but is born rather out of methods of punishment, supervision and constraint. This real, non-corporal soul is not a substance; it is the element in which are articulated the effects of a certain power and the reference of a certain type of knowledge, the machinery by which the power relations give rise to a possible corpus of knowledge, and knowledge extends and reinforces the effects of this power .... The soul is the effect and instrument of political anatomy; the soul is the prison of the body (Foucault 1979: 29f).

Thirdly, if the Khoi were to be 'instructed' to become 'disciplined' and 'civilized', then, if they remained 'wretches' - a term Van der Kemp on at least one occasion also used for the frontier farmers - this meant that they continued to exist as 'criminals' against the citizenry. In this context, a 'wretched state' representationally indicated 'want of food, clothing, &c' and 'a life of plundering', while 'to be taken into [the missionary] Institution' meant an entry into being 'instructed in the knowledge of God' (LMS II AR 1803:160f).

Instruction and the 'useful pedagogy', then, meant the defence and protection of society. To remain a 'wretch', however, was to be equivalent to a 'monster', 'traitor' and an 'enemy of all'. This 'enemy of all',

> ... whom it is in the interest of all to track down, falls outside the pact, disqualifies himself as a citizen and emerges, bearing within him, as it were, wild fragments of nature; he appears as a villain, a monster, a madman, perhaps, a sick and, before long, an 'abnormal' individual. It is as such that, one day, we will belong to a scientific objectification and to the 'treatment' that is correlative to it (Foucault 1979:101).

The institutionalisation of the Khoi, then, meant that this event formed part of that whole divisioning which took place in Europe at the beginning of the nineteenth-century - where 'modern' society divided all social 'wretches' like madmen, criminals, the ill from the public sphere, had them incarcerated in institutions especially devised for them, and gave rise to the educational, bureaucratic and professional arrangements in and around them. It also gave rise to the production of various (disciplinary) knowledges related to these institutions. In all this, the modern individual was to emerge as the object of

knowledge. But such objectification was not applied to him (or her) from the outside; it originated 'in the very tactics of power and [in] the arrangement of its exercise' (Foucault 1979:102).

Fourthly, in the same way that the monster in natural history, illness in medicine, and crime in penal reform were seen as examples of 'disorder', social disorder representationally mirrored the disorder of illness. Van der Kemp used this concept especially for illness, but then as it afflicted a group of people - through an 'epidemic fever' - indicating its social significance, or a person's total existence - causing one to 'approach' death (cf. LMS I TVDK 1800:418; LMS II AR 1804:240). Once, however, he does refer to 'disorder' in the sense of non-civilized existence - when he reported that the missionaries did not 'oppos[e] the *disorders* of the savages but by christian admonitions and examples, of which they could see the effects in our [Khoi's] (LMS I EJBP 1802:89; e.a.). In terms of their impact on the Khoi, he also frequently referred to the missionaries' impact on the 'order' they created for and with them.

According to Janssens' understanding, Van der Kemp should promote the movement from 'disorder' to 'order', which should constitute the prime objective of his mission among the Khoi. In his 'Instructions to Van der Kemp' of May 31 1803, he says under articles 11 and 14:

> 11. The Institute has to *co-operate in the maintenance of general order, peace and safety*[8]. ….
> 14. Van der Kemp must use his influence to pacify Khoikhoi like Stuurman and *guide them to order and submission to the government*[9].

So the missionaries' prime civil impact on the Khoi – also those 'plundering' groups beyond he colonial frontier – should be that of bringing [civil] order, peace, and safety. This also meant their pacification – cf. below – and their 'submission' to the colonial government.

In Janssens' 'Proclamation' of 1805, this was specified even more clearly. Here he explicitly refers to the 'ideas of social order' 'in the "mother country"' – meaning revolutionary Batavian Holland – and compares that with 'this colony'. Missionary teaching was to be instrumental towards the promotion of that order. Moreover, as part of the power of the colonial

[8] This is echoed by Fiscal Van Ryneveld – cf. Bannister (1930: clvi).
[9] Stuurman was regarded as 'vagabond', cf. Bannister (1830: clv).

government, the missionaries were warned to only 'pray openly' for 'the Batavian republic and this colony' and no other. Janssens wrote:

> 12. As far as the capacity for the [Indigenous Inhabitants] is fit for comprehending *the first ideas of social order, such as exists in the mother country, and in this colony,* the Missionaries be *obliged to teach them* and the Missionaries be prohibited *to pray openly* in the institutions already established or that may be established hereafter, *for any other power or government, than for that of the Batavian republic and this colony* (LMS II P 1805:12).

To accommodate the monster even though it did not fit the natural history tables, to heal illness, to reform the criminal, and educate the lazy all simultaneously signified not only the restoration of social order, but also the prevention of the spread of social disorder. This meant that education and punishment acquired an added significance: these technologies were intended not merely to transform criminal existence and deter people from criminal acts, but to create a whole arsenal of signs which, once instilled in the 'conscience' of the social body, would in general prevent the future repetition and multiplication of this existence and its crimes - and therefore of disorder. This made the 'mind' and 'soul' of the citizen the target of instruction and educational technologies. As such, Van der Kemp's teaching of 'reading and writing' to indigenous people but also 'printing and publication' - three of the most important focuses of Van der Kemp's educational practices - receive archival significance: these were the means through which the mind could be influenced by multiple signs, giving rise to an economy of instruction. Not only the institutionalised body but also the mind had to be influenced - 'or rather a play of representations and signs circulating discreetly but necessarily and evidently in the minds of all' (Foucault 1979:101). The purpose was to create social order - or at least 'the first ideas' of it.

In the *fifth* place, Van der Kemp was to facilitate the transformation of the Khoi from 'useless' and 'unhappy' members of society, to 'useful' and 'happy' ones. In his letter to British Governor Francis Dundas, for example, he said under points 1 and 6:

> 1. ... [that the Khoi were to be] formed into a regular society; and, in the second place, [promote] the *temporal happiness and usefulness of this Society with respect to the country at large* (e.a.). ….

> 6. As we are of opinion that the rule laid down by Paul *'that if any would not work, neither should he eat'*, ought to be strictly observed in every Christian Society, our intention is to discourage idleness and laziness and to have all the individuals of our institution, as much as circumstances shall admit, employed in different *useful occupations, for the cultivation of their rational faculties or exercise of the body, as means of subsistence, and of promoting the well-fare of this society and the colony at large.* These occupations may be referred either to agriculture and farming, the management of cattle, or mechanical arts, and little manufacturies, e.g. soap-boiling, candle-making, spinning of thread, manufacturing of paper, tanning, potting, brickmaking, turnery, &c. (e.a.; cf. also the 'Reflections' in LMS I L1 1802:506).

Closely related to usefulness' or 'useful occupations' as he explicated, on behalf of the Khoi themselves and the colony, is also 'temporal happiness'. Significantly, from archival perspective, this meant how citizens 'experience' their 'existence' or the 'good feeling on earth in connection with the affirmation of everyday life'[10].

In the *sixth* place, the interrelationship of a person being able to take responsibility for his or her own subsistence and the dictum that all must work in order to eat (negatively stated above), also link up with Van der Kemp's exposition of payment for work done. Such payment was to be given for the 'occupations' mentioned under five above.

> 7. As the introduction of these employments will involve the European Missionary Societies in considerable expences, the workmen should be considered as journeymen in the service of the Society and be paid weekly for their labour; but the products of their labours should be the property of the Society and sold for its benefit. The fund, however, arising from the sale of these articles shall be entirely devoted for charitable institutions of a missionary nature …. e.g. the erection of other missionary settlements, an orphan house in which abandoned and fatherless children may be educated, or the subsistence of the sick, old and poor.

[10] Cf. Zefnik's 2014:ix; as well as his Chapters 4 – 6, in his study of Foucault's oeuvre focused on the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries; cf. also Smit 2017.

> By these measures we intend not to preclude any one, who by his industry and diligence shall be enabled to elevate himself above the class of journeymen from becoming a master and proprietor of his own business.

Apart from introducing a new economic system into the Colony through these proposals, on the level of the technologies of power, this explicitly links up with the kind of exposition Foucault gave above. Of special significance here is that the labours of the Khoi at the mission were to benefit the mission. This not only indicated a certain understanding of 'usefulness' but also ownership - everything was to belong to the institution and used for its benefit and expansion. As for the economy, it was to be not a subsistence economy or self-help scheme, but a money economy: all the workers at the mission were to be paid by the LMS - giving also the rationale for the continued complaints concerning the shortage of money at the mission. The proposal does allow though for individuals through their own 'industry and diligence' to become 'a master and proprietor of his own business'.

These data provide some idea as to how Van der Kemp indeed formed part of the eighteenth-century understanding of power and how his own exertion to educate the Khoi to be 'useful' - was to be used for making individuals into disciplined, civilised, useful and happy members of society, in the interests of creating social 'order'. The fact therefore, that he organised those who subjected themselves to the missionaries' 'discipline' according to an 'analytic pedagogy' adds a further perspective on how he formed part of a particular colonising epistemic formation of power.

4 Analytic Pedagogy

Van der Kemp's analytic scholarly interests in language (cf. Smit 2001), especially his interest in starting language education from the monosyllable, also has significance in the context of the technologies of power. This significance does not only lie in the representational understanding of language, but also in how this kind of language education had its own hierarchical analysis as part of how it was constituted. Foucault (1979:160) provides an overview in this regard.

> At the beginning of the eighteenth century Demia suggested a division of the process of learning to read into seven levels: the first, for those

> who are beginning to learn the letters, the second for those who are learning to spell, the third for those who are learning to join syllables together to make words, the fourth for those who are reading Latin in sentences or from punctuation to punctuation, the fifth for those who are beginning to read French, the sixth for the best readers, the seventh for those who can read manuscripts. But, where there are a great many pupils, further subdivisions were have to be introduced; the first class would comprise four streams; one for those who are learning the 'simple letter'; a second for those who are learning the 'mixed' letters; a third for those who are learning the abbreviated letters (*â, ê* ...); a fourth for those who are learning the double letters (*ff, ss, tt, st*). The second class would be divided into three streams for those who 'count each letter allowed before spelling the syllable, D.O., DO'; for those 'who spell the most difficult syllables, such as *bant brand spinx*' etc. (Demia). Each stage in the combinatory of elements must be inscribed within a great temporal series, which is both a natural progress of the mind and a code for educative procedures.

Such a process of education also led to individualising activities. It gave rise to the generating of knowledge of individuals, and also to their grouping within distinct classes, indicating a certain hierarchy. Foucault (1979:126) explains:

> This ever-growing knowledge of the individuals made it possible to divide them up in the prison not so much according to their crimes as according to the dispositions that they revealed. The prison became a sort of permanent observatory that made it possible to distribute the varieties of vice or weakness. From 1779, the prisoners were divided into four classes: the first for those who were explicitly condemned to solitary confinement or who had committed serious offences in the prison; the second for those who were 'well-known as old offenders ... whose depraved morality, dangerous character, irregular dispositions, or disorderly conduct' became apparent during the time they were in prison; the third, for those 'whose character and circumstances, before and after conviction, lead one to believe that they were not habitual offenders'; the fourth and last was a special section, a probationary class for those whose character was still not known, or who, if they

> were better known, did not deserve to be put in the preceding category (Teeters). A whole corpus of individualizing knowledge was being organized that took as its field of reference not so much the crime committed (at least in isolation), but the potentiality of danger that lies hidden in an individual and which is manifested in his observed everyday conduct. The prison functions in this as an *apparatus of knowledge* (e.a. Foucault 1979:126).

Similar to the hierarchising of education and other institutions such as prisons in Europe – apparatuses of knowledge – in his scheme, Van der Kemp divided individuals, in this case, settlers in Graaff Reinet in his religious instruction, into three classes.

> The settlers are to be divided as Christians, Catechumens and Hearers. By the last we understand Heathen who will flock to us to hear the word of God. By Catechumens, Heathen who are more particularly under our inspection and care, are instructed in the doctrines of the Gospel and submit to ecclesiastical discipline. Christians are those who will bring forth fruits of conversion, and are by baptism initiated as members of the church (LMS I EL1 1801:498).

This same scheme is duplicated and expanded in the text printed as 'African Missions'. This is the text which provided the rules according to which the LMS missions in areas under Batavian rule would be directed by the Dutch Missionary Society. It is said that Van der Kemp was not only the one who proposed this text, but that he also made a substantial contribution to it. The text reads:

> The people collected there being all Africans, or particularly [Khoi], ought, in order to have a regular plan of occupations for the Brethren Missionaries among them, to be considered as,
>
> 1. Baptized Christians, who already, by confession and baptism, are converted from Paganism to the Christian faith, and therefore are a Christian congregation among the Heathen, and who are in want of edification and confirmation in their faith:
> 2. As Catechumens, who receive instruction in the doctrine of the Gospel, and are prepared to be, from time to time, accepted as baptized into the congregation:

> 3. As Heathens, who are not yet admitted to the instruction, but must be brought into the kingdom of Christ, by making known to them the Gospel (LMS II AR 1803:170).

Such procedures meant that power was not only articulated directly onto time, but also space - a certain hierarchy which ensured social 'control' and 'progress' from one level or category to another, and analogical to that found in European educational systems.

But, if this was so for the Khoi, then the mission as an institution, itself, had to be organised in the interests of discipline and order.

5 Institutionalisation

In his recommendations to Governor Dundas, Van der Kemp set the pattern of mission institutions – according to how the missionaries were to form part of it and the basis on which people would be admitted or excluded.

Significant on the first point, is that the missionaries were not to lead a separate existence from the Khoi, but were to live with them and set 'an example' for them. Van der Kemp says:

> 2. The chief object and aim of the Missionaries, under which direction this settlement shall be established, ought to be to promote the knowledge of Christ, and the practice of real piety, *both by instruction and example, among the [Khoi] and other Heathen*, who shall be admitted, and *formed into a regular society*; and, *in the second place, the temporal happiness and usefulness of this Society with respect to the country at large* (e.a.).

That Van der Kemp integrated himself into the conditions and lives of the people he served is evident on numerous counts. He often refers to Xhosa and Khoi sleeping with him in his tent - on one occasion, including Ngqika. More significantly, for those who desired it, he often took people up in his household.

On individuals joining Van der Kemp's household, one report refers to the baptism of Mary Staffels who was not only 'educated' by the missionaries but also taken into 'our family' after her father was killed (LMS II AR 1804:237f). And, when Van der Kemp and Read had to leave for the

Cape in 1805, Van der Kemp reports that they had 'twelve souls' in their company - 'four brethren and two sisters' which included the [Khoi] wife of Read and the son of the Xhosa 'Captain Zautzoe', 'who was committed by his father to our care' (LMS II AR 1805:2).

Even so, at least on one occasion, he mentions that a woman taken up into his household in this manner, was most helpful in the household chores. However, it is evident from his vehement opposition to slavery and the fact that he washed his own clothes and linen, even in old age, that he took as much responsibility for his own daily chores as possible. It is evident from Van der Kemp's immersion into conditions of the people he made the object of his mission activities and from the fact that he and Read married a Mallagasi and Khoi woman respectively, that he did not form part of that discourse which would develop into a difference of class between missionaries and indigenous people they missionised in the nineteenth-century.

As far as their 'desire' or 'wish' to be instructed or join the mission is concerned, Van der Kemp continually reported on such persons. What is significant here is the rationale behind each of these reports minuted. On February 7 1800, Ngqika mentioned to Koenraad Buys that he,

> ... imagined, one time or other, he should be a Christian; and that his mother also [the rain maker of the Xhosa at that stage and also sovereign of the Tambouchi 'nation'] and another woman, wished to be instructed in the Christian religion (LMS I TVDK 1800:413).

On February 8, Ngqika repeated this request (LMS I TVDK 1800:414) as far as he himself was concerned. On this occasion, it was in the context of a request to Van der Kemp to 'pray' for 'two of his [three] wives [who] were dangerously ill'. For July 12 1800, Van der Kemp mentions that '[t]wo other *[Khoi]* women and a girl came to school for instruction', and that on July 20, two women belonging to these women's (Sarah's) family, also 'resolved to apply for instruction' (LMS TVDK 1800:420). Nearly a year later, again, Van der Kemp says that,

> Bruntjie brought us a message from the famous Klaas Stuurman, chief of the *[Khoi]* nation, *requesting us to come and settle at the Zwartkops river, that he and his people might be instructed in the doctrine of Christ*. This Captain Klaas had been the terror of the country, and

> committed, perhaps, more murders than any man upon earth. Having consulted my dear brother Read on this subject, *we were of opinion to decline, for the present, this request*, as we were employed in instructing a number of [Khoi], and expecting the return of Gika's [Xhosa], in order to re-establish the mission in [Xhosaland], if it should be the will of God. We promised, however, to take the mission to the Zwartkop's river into consideration (LMS I TVDK 1801:482).

This request by Stuurman on July 1 1801, was repeated on October 7 1801 - i.e. 'to be instructed in the Christian religion' (LMS I TVDK 1801:493).

On his brief return to Xhosaland, when he met up with Ngqika again, Van der Kemp says that Ngqika requested him to come and settle there.

> He said, that he should be happy if we were willing to live again in his country; and upon *my asking him if he would favour our design to instruct his people? he answered, that as to himself he was willing to receive instruction*, and that those of his subjects, who did not choose to follow his example, might let it alone .... (LMS I TVDK 1801:489; e.a.).

This theme of requesting instruction surfaces again on December 5 1803 when Van der Kemp writes:

> ... the [Xhosa] Captain, Gola, came to us, with his wife and four [Xhosa]. His object in coming, he said, was to hear if he could be taken up in *our Institution*, as he wished to be separated from his own people, whose irregular conduct exposed him to the greatest dangers; and *to be instructed (as he said) in the knowledge of good and evil* ... (LMS II AR 1803:164; e.a.).

On the one hand, these reports on requests for instruction may indicate Van der Kemp's playing up to the LMS Directors and the readers of the *Transactions*. Apart from other interpretations, it may also indicate the desire by these people to position themselves outside the silent dynamics of conflict in which they were caught up on and beyond the frontier. On yet another level, it may also show how the Khoi and Xhosa realised that the 'culture' Van der Kemp represented, could be appropriated and be put to use in their indigenous cultural resistance to the encroaching colonising settler culture.

As far as admission and expulsion are concerned, Van der Kemp advised in his letter to Governor Dundas:

> 3. Into this Society only those ought to be admitted who will engage themselves to *live according to the rules of its institution*.
> 4. The actual *admission and expulsion from this Society shall entirely depend upon the judgement of the Missionaries* ... (LMS I TVDK 1801:497; e.a.).

Apart from the events precipitated by 'admission', it appears that Van der Kemp's actual admission into instruction was subject to the decision of the people making the request, to 'leave off drunkenness, swearing, stealing, whoredom, &c.' and to become 'subject to our discipline' (LMS I TVDK 1801:483,486). To this may be added, resolutions to 'leave [a] former life of plundering' (LMS II AR 1803:160f).

On exclusion, Van der Kemp suggested to Dundas as follows:

> 10. *We have no severer punishment than excommunication from the church and expulsion from the Society*. If we shall be compelled to proceed to this last step, we shall think it our duty to acquaint the Landdrosst of the district with the case (LMS I L1 1801:498).

This practice of 'excommunication' was only carried out when 'adultery' was concerned, also reflecting the patriarchal attitude in the mission. In their Annual Report for 1804, Van der Kemp and Read report that:

> We have been obliged to cut off from our communion, one of our sisters on account of adultery; and to dismiss from our institution the person with whom she was guilty (LMS II AR 1804:241).

As for the general regulations of the mission, the text, 'African Missions' - instigated by Van der Kemp's submissions to the LMS as well as the Dutch Missionary Society - became necessary with the changeover of government from British to Batavian rule. Mostly regulatory in nature it treats the following issues, and speaks for itself.

Concerning the general instructions of the missions, nine points were made which had to function as 'general plan'. These concern,

1) 'religion' and its articulation with 'civil and social affairs';
2) the position of the head or Superintendent of the mission;
3) the division of public and private instruction duties among missionaries and/ or teachers at a mission, [which is the responsibility of the Superintendent];
4) the position(s) for and the actual organisation of the school;
5) the position(s) for and organisation of the 'social concerns' of the mission;
6) the aim of all these regulations - to 'promote the general happiness';
7) conducting regular meetings for the missionaries and teachers 'religiously' - i.e. to 'begin with prayer and close with thanksgiving' - in which issues relevant to the mission are discussed, such as:
    7.1) the sending of missionaries into parts of Africa 'to extend more and more the Gospel';
    7.2) 'provisions and necessaries' - of which 'bills of exchange' had to be sent to the Netherlands Missionary Society (NMS) treasurer - Mr. Uytenbroek;
    7.3) their 'cloaths, and other necessaries of the kind';
8) keeping a journal 'in which everything remarkable [was] to be daily written', and of which at least an 'extract' was to be sent to the NMS every six months;
9) choosing 'by majority' another Superintendent in the case of the death of a current one - of which the Directors were to be informed as soon as possible (LMS II AR 1803:172).

Then follow specific rules for each of the positions in a missionary 'establishment' (LMS II AR 1803:173-175): 1) the Principal and Minister; 2) the Director of the School - married male; 3) two Schoolmasters and teachers - two unmarried males; 4) one male, to function as Regulator of the civil and household affairs; 5) one male, to function as Coadjutor of the Regulator of the social affairs. For these positions, women are not mentioned.

The issues and their content broached in these regulations and rules all impact on 1) the question of the sovereignty of religion during the eighteenth-century; 2) 'exchange'; and, obviously, 3) the disciplinary power involved through the mission station as knowledge apparatus. The generalised statement as to the aim of all these regulations (point 6), however, shows that the general framework was to be seen within the context of the utilitarian philosophy one

of promoting 'general happiness' (LMS II AR 1803: 171).

This text was in effect the outcome of the suggestion Van der Kemp initially made to Governor Dundas as article 9 about two years earlier - that '[g]ood order and domestic discipline is to be maintained by the missionaries themselves' (LMS I TVDK 1801:498).

Furthermore, the text, 'Extracts from the Journals of Dr. Van der Kemp and Mr. Read after their settlement at Bota's Place' contains important information on the institutionalising activities activated with settlement in 1802. It covers issues such as available grass, timber, and limestone; housing and how Van der Kemp meted out eight hundred square paces for each Khoi family; regular meetings related to worship, instruction in reading and writing, sermons, catechism, love-feasts, experimental meetings and the printing of a spelling book containing 3138 monosyllables (LMS I EJBP 1802:82-95).

Due to the fact that some of the Khoi did not settle permanently at Bota's Place and would stay in the woods around it, Van der Kemp thought it important to acquire a bell, at the ringing of which people could come from the woods to attend the various meetings at the mission. They acquired one by default when a ship sent from Governor Dundas to the frontier, sank and its bell washed up on shore (LMS EJBP II 1802:85f).

As far as institutional activities and events in general are concerned, one unnamed woman at Bethelsdorp was appointed to take responsibility for 'the spiritual inspection of our women' as well as those at Graaff Reinet (LMS II AR 1804:238). It also relates that Van der Kemp and Read printed an outline of 'Christian religion in the form of a catechism' in Khoi, called *Tzitzika Thuickwedi miko Khwekhwenama - Principles of the word of God for the [Khoi] nation* (LMS II AR 1804:239).

At Bethelsdorp, they had

> seven persons chosen as a kind of Judges, to settle small quarrels and disputes, which daily take place, too numerous for us to attend to, and of too little importance to be brought before the magistrate of the country (LMS II AR 1803:165f).

As far as rites were concerned, baptism was the most important one symbolising entrance into the 'Society' or 'Institution' - not 'church' - as a full member. For this reason, Van der Kemp and Read included statistics of those baptised annually. From Briggs (1952:65), these statistics are as follows:

Year	Adults baptised	Children baptised
1806	9	15
1807	3	11
1808	7	9
1809	4	14
1810	4	10
1811	0	6

These then provide some information on Van der Kemp's institutionalising of his mission. Needless to say, whatever he did was to be approved by first the British and then the Dutch Batavian colonial governments. As such, he was not free from instructions, directives and dictates of the colonial government, similar to the constraints of state in Britain upon civil society organisations such as the nonconformist and reformed religious organisations in the late eighteenth century. They could only operate within the space, and according to the reason of state the government provided.

6 The Colonial Government

From the extensive correspondence of Van der kemp with the governors, it is evident that, from government perspective, there was a two-way split it had to regulate with regard to the mission: one marked the colonial government's regulation of missionary institutions and their practices - the nature of the labours of the missionaries among the Khoi as this impacted on government; the other was the regulation of the interaction of the Khoi at the mission stations with the farmers and those on the farms with the mission stations.

Firstly, in his 'Instructions' to Van der Kemp (May 31 1803), Janssens, for example, started off his letter by saying:

> *The present situation of your [Khoi], being unemployed and destitute is utterly untenable*. The new place allocated to you on the Roodepan, which on your request will be known in future as Bethelsdorp, is very suitable for cattle-breeding, cultivation of wheat and vegetables. The details pertaining to this will later be specified (in Enklaar 1988:131; Briggs 1952:37f; e.a.).

And, on the 'Moravian establishment at the Baviaans Clove', he said in his

'Proclamation', the mission had to endeavour,

> ... to act in all respects according to the *intention of the government ... to impress upon the Natives as much as possible industry*, and *to convince them of the bad consequences from idleness* (LMS II P 1805:235).

Van der Kemp shared these sentiments - Khoi 'destitution', 'unemployment, 'industry' and 'idleness' and other perspectives on such issues as they were part of the common archive in Europe. However, to get a thriving mission established was not easy.

In one of his most poignant statements, Van der Kemp gives a report on the 'state of poverty' of the Khoi:

> .... *Others choose to lie in the bushes, and live upon the roots of the field, rather than be subject to the discipline of a civilized life. Laziness is the most prevalent evil among our people, which exposes them to the greatest distresses*. *Some, however, are willing to work, if we could employ them; this we cannot do, not having been able for more than a year to get any money from the Cape*, so that we cannot pay them for their *labour*, which circumstances subject both them and us to many inconveniences (LMS II AR 1803:165; e.a.).

If Van der Kemp shared such sentiments, then he also agreed with the fact that the activities at the missions - including crime - were to fall under the jurisdiction of the local commander (at Fort Frederick) or 'Landdrosst' (at Graaff Reinet for example).

As for government control of the missionaries, and aiming to control their ambivalent relations with the colonising government, Janssens' general rules were:

> 1. That all Missionaries, who are upon legal authority in this colony, have freedom to proceed into the interior of this Cape for the purpose of teaching and promoting religion and cultivation among the heathen nations (LMS II P 1805:234). ….
> 4. That all Missionaries, before they proceed to the interior of the country, have to make themselves known to the Governor and

> Commander in Chief, and also to mention the place, where they intend to settle themselves, in which case they obtain a certificate from him, in which such a place or district is expressed in order that government may know at all times where the Missionaries are labouring (LMS II P 1805:234).

In addition, Janssens required 'reports' from the missionaries – which provides a brief template for the kind of information the colonial government would find useful for the unstated objective of even further colonisation in future:

> 5. That the Missionaries we oblige to send to government at every convenient opportunity a written account of the state of their schools, in order to know, what effect the cultivation of the [Indigenous Inhabitants] has had through their care, - from what they get their subsistence, - what cattle and other things they possess - the nature of the soil which they occupy and plough, the climate, &c. (LMS II P 1805:234).

Secondly, government regulation of the interaction of the Khoi at the mission stations with the farmers and those on the farms with the missions show that Janssens was set on driving a wedge between himself and especially Van der Kemp. The reason was that he firmly regulated that no interaction take place except one - that of Khoi coming from the missions to work on the farms. For Van der Kemp, this rule was untenable.

As far as Janssens' general regulations are concerned, he instructed the Moravian mission at Baviaans Kloof 'to take care not to seduce any Native or Bastard from the service of their masters to their instruction' (LMS II P 1805:235). For Van der Kemp, the regulations were even more explicit. Janssens ruled:

> B. That only wandering [Khoi] or others who from this institution have gone into the service of the inhabitants shall be permitted to receive instruction; *But no [Khoi] who are actually serving the inhabitants; or have served them in the course of the preceding year, be permitted to be received in it* (LMS II P 1805:236; e.a.). ….
> 11. *No instruction in writing*, as *this is not absolutely necessary in the commencement of cultivation*, shall be permitted in the schools already

> established, or that may be established hereafter; but this instruction shall be postponed till express licence from the Governor and Commander in Chief be obtained for it (LMS II P 1805:236; e.a.).

On the fact that Janssens did not rule on Khoi going from the missions to the farms, it appears that it was personally communicated earlier to Van der Kemp that the missionaries were in fact to actively encourage this practice. This Van der Kemp opposed and it may be the reason why this rule was in the end not included in Janssens' regulations. In his Annual Report for 1804, Van der Kemp writes that he sent a letter to Janssens - dated April 18 1804:

> We *thought it our duty to declare ... that our consciences would not permit us any longer to observe that hard article of the settlement granted to our institution, by which we were recommended to encourage the voluntary engagement of the [Khoi] into the service of the Colonists*, on account of the *cruelty* and *injustice* with which those who entered into their service were treated ... (LMS II AR 1804:241; cf. also Smit 2016a).

While government and Van der Kemp shared views on the 'cultivation' of the Khoi, 'industry' at the mission and the transformation of this people from a life of 'laziness' - which amongst others, belonged to the general discourse of crime and the criminalisation of the illiterate and uneducated in Europe - their views on Khoi working on the farms differed. Suffice to say that despite this difference of 'opinion', it appears that at archival level - as far as it concerned the operationalising of technologies of power at the missions and the 'cruelty' of the farmers - there was not much to choose between these two options. Among others, this may be substantiated (from a Khoi perspective) by Van der Kemp's report of their 'aversion from every other kind of mental or bodily exercise', that they 'have no care upon them to provide for themselves', and that they would 'lie in the bushes, and live upon the roots of the field', rather, than being 'subject to a disciplined life' (LMS II L 1804:152; II AR 1803:165). Even though for many Khoi, joining the mission was a last option, there certainly was much aversion to that choice too.

With regard to the eighteenth century archive, it is indicative that all the institutions generated by both governments and by most nonconformist religious organisations in civil society in Europe and in the colonies – for

education, for health, for orphans, for the old and infirm, and in the case of governments, also asylums, prisons, and barracks for soldiers – included both 'mental' and 'bodily' exercises. Continuously emphasising the teaching of 'reading and writing' – also vis-à-vis the colonial governor's non-support of the teaching of writing – Van der Kemp here also adds 'bodily' exercise. We do not have any data as to the nature of this bodily exercise at Bethelsdorp at this point, but it is significant that Van der Kemp adds this datum as part of his social and individual care for the Khoi. Furthermore, he contrasts not to 'care … and provide for themselves' in terms of the colonial economy, and just living off the 'roots of the field' with a 'disciplined life'. The institutionalisation of a 'disciplined life', on the colonising frontier, was similar to its institutionalisation in the schools, barracks, and orphansages of Europe. This formed a primary rationale of Van der Kemp's intervention, and motivations for a mission station, as it did for both the colonial government and the LMS directors.

7 Pacification

If the objectives of freedom and civilisation, the operationalising of a useful and analytical pedagogy, institutionalisation and contending with government regulations all formed part of not only the eighteenth-century European archive but also its power exerted on the bodies and souls of people, then pacification was its outcome. This was also the outcome of the effects of power as employed in mission on South Africa's Easter Cape frontier.

The policies, acts or processes of pacifying the Khoi (and the Xhosa) were aimed not only at cultivating a 'docile' body and mind in the rising money economy of the time, but also the seeking of peace and the defusing of a situation of continuous warfare – with the plundering and banditry of the roaming landless Khoi groups, as well as the to-and-fro of cattle rustling and related cruelties between the settler farmers and the Xhosa.

Having arrived on the Eastern Cape frontier during the so-called third frontier war – where some Khoi and Xhosa cooperated in the attempt to stop the deterrilorialication the Khoi experienced due to the encroachment of settler farmers onto their lands, and the retro-raiding of settler farms – Van der Kemp was at pains to assert not only his 'neutrality' but also his non-alliance. This, however, did not deter him from playing an active role in intervening on the Khoi's behalf, in various conflicts, and in actively assisting in the pacifying of

the Khoi and attempts at the cessation of hostilities[11].

Despite his assertion of his non-alliance, the Xhosa suspected him of representing 'English' interests. On September 2 1799 - and before he met with Ngqika - Bruntjie, Van der Kemp's companion, pointed out to him that,

> ... the [Xhosa], seeing our musquets, had observed that these (pointing to the bayonets), were the very English instruments by which their countrymen were treacherously murdered; that they looked upon us as sent to betray them, and certainly, would betray us at the first commencement of war (LMS I SA 1799:391).

The same suspicion comes to the fore in Van der Kemp's interrogation at Ngqika's homestead.

> In the afternoon I was examined in Dutch by a Bengalese interpreter (sent by Gika's mother to welcome us) before two judges, and confronted with Bruntjie in the [Khoi] tongue. Many questions were put concerning our plan, political connexions, and if we were not sent over by the English. To this I answered in the negative; but said that we had found favour from every government with which we had to do; that the English Governor had permitted us to go to and fro the colony, and had given us a passport and a letter to General Vandeleur, not to hinder us ... (LMS I SA 1799:396)[12].

For October 4 1799, again, Van der Kemp says:

> The old accusation of our being Englishmen, and betrayers, was said to be renewed in the mind of Gika, and that we must not be surprized if we were all put to death the next day (LMS I SA 1799:398f).

He also reported:

[11] For a more elaborate explication of these dynamics, cf. Smit (2017a:275ff). These 'suspicions', are part of the still 'hidden transcript of anti-colonial resistance discourse among the Xhosa in the Eastern Cape in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century (cf. Smit 2017a: 255ff).

[12] General Vandeleur lead the colonial forces against the Xhosa.

> ... I asked leave from Gika to go with Brother Edmond to Graaff Reinet, urging the request of Governor Dundas; but he was so far from giving his consent to it, that he gave me no answer at all, and treated with contempt my proposals, which renewed his suspicions of our being connected with the English Government in prejudice to his country (LMS I SA 1799:409).

Within the context of war, and as part of the 'hidden transcript' of continuous suspicion of the indigenous population, not only endangered one's own life but also raised the possibility of the war escalating further. However, it appears that Van der Kemp's fifteen months in Ngqika's area, at least to some degree, defused hostilities. He may have had a hand in assisting a certain Prinslo to negotiate peace between Ngqika and Graaff Reinet's Resident Commissioner H.C.D. Maynier (LMS I FA 1799:387f). This, however, is not specified - but it did pave the way for Van der Kemp to make contact with Ngqika's people. That his mere presence beyond the frontier, however, played a role in Maynier not attacking the colonists beyond the frontier in Ngqika's area, is reported on May 14 1801[13]. He says that Maynier,

> ... told me that my stay with the emigrated Colonists in [Xhosaland] had been the only obstacle by which the march of a body of soldiers to seize them had been prevented, as he foresaw that this violent step would have exposed me to considerable danger (LMS I TVDK 1801:479).

To this may be added that Van der Kemp's settlement for a few months beyond the Keiskamma may have provided the opportunity for Maynier to venture into Xhosaland and to personally visit Ngqika (LMS I SA 1799:408f).

His journey from Graaff Reinet to Ngqika - and to see whether he could accompany the latter to Graaff Reinet to negotiate peace with Maynier - further shows that Van der Kemp was actively involved in peace negotiations (cf. LMS I JC 1801:487-490). That he was also ready to lay his life on the line, is evident from his willingness to stay on as hostage for the farmers during the rebellion of 1801 - something they declined, because they said: 'although our

[13] It is believed that is primarily these exiled or dissident colonists, but also deserters (soldiers) from the colonising military, who have introduced and provided the Xhosa with firearms.

commanders were killed, we should not like to kill you' (LMS I TVDK 1801:485).

Other examples come from Van der Kemp's insistence that all deserters and settlers beyond the frontier - not only some - were to receive 'pardon' from Maynier and company for their atrocities within the Colony (cf. LMS I FA 1799:384; I TVDK 1801:300). He also did not mind scolding both Xhosa and colonist for their atrocities (cf. LMS I TVDK 1801:472,485).

Against the background of such activities, Van der Kemp was perfectly clear about the fact that starting a mission establishment for the Khoi would also intervene in the common cause they made with the Xhosa against the colonists. The fact of this state of affairs was already mentioned on his first trek to Ngqika (LMS I 1799:383). That Van der Kemp's initiative to establish a mission for the Khoi would also mean the breaking up of this alliance, is evident not only from interactions with Maynier and Dundas but also with Janssens, when the latter granted the establishing of Bethelsdorp on the following conditions amongst others.

> 7. Only Van der Kemp, and no Khoikhoi, is allowed to possess any firearm. Permission has to be asked when firearms are needed for hunting purposes.
> 8. Only small amounts of gunpowder are allowed in the Institute.
> 9. New arrivals have to turn in their weapons.
> 11. The Institute has to co-operate in the maintenance of general order, peace and safety.
> 12. It will render the fullest co-operation to Fort Frederick.
> 14. Van der Kemp must use his influence to pacify Khoikhoi like Stuurman and guide them to order and submission to the government. (in Enklaar 1988:131; Briggs 1952:37f).

In this context, Van der Kemp asserted his and his mission's neutrality. In terms of actual hostilities and war, he says that he asserted that,

> ... we were neutral, having no quarrel with the [Xhosa]; that we should guard to our best against every hostile attempt, and defend ourselves against every personal attack (LMS I FA 1799:384).

This view is echoed in the Extracts of journals of 1802.

> We have always instructed our people, that *the duty of a christian required, that he is obliged rather to part with his earthly goods, than to save them by killing another; and that it was not permitted to kill any body, but when the safety of his own life, or that of a third person should render it absolutely necessary*. But our [Khoi] understood the business not in the same meaning, and looked upon themselves as competent to make use of their arms, as well to defend their goods as their lives; *they also shewed too plainly that they had obtained a certain pleasure in fighting*. We are not at all pleased with this, because our intention was *to gain our enemies by a soft and amiable behaviour, and thus by no means to provoke them by a hostile opposition* ... (LMS I EJBP 1802:89; e.a.).

In the face of some fighting and with colonists assisting the missionaries, they then decided to move the mission from Bota's Place to the fort - Fort Frederick. This led the colonists to assume that Van der Kemp would now support their own activities against the Khoi and Xhosa. This, however, he denied by stating again that they were 'neutral'.

> ... [T]he Colonists .... thought undoubtedly, that we should now make common cause against [the Xhosa]; but saw themselves deceived, when we told them the intention of our mission, and *that we should keep a complete neutrality in the war with the [Xhosa], and that we did not make use of arms, but only for unavoidable self-defence*, nor *opposed the disorders of the [Indigenous Inhabitants] but by christian admonitions and examples*, of which they could see the effects in our [Khoi] (LMS I EJBP 1802:89; e.a.).

Van der Kemp was not only to assist in the 'maintenance of general order, peace and safety' but actively to 'pacify Khoikhoi like Stuurman and guide them to order and submission to the government' as Governor Janssens required. In time, this submission, amongst the other effects of power the mission exerted, was one of the outcomes of their labours - not only among the Khoi, but also for other groups of indigenous people in South Africa among whom the LMS and other mission organisations established their missions. In the complex networks of the colonising deterritorialisation of indigenous populations, and indigenous resistance add defence, no-one is neutral.

8 Conclusion

This second article on social responsibility and power demonstrated further, that social intervention on behalf of indigenous populations by European missions, as part of their social responsibility vis-à-vis colonial governments and settler farmers, was not without its own uses of power. Such power extended European power as exercised in nonconformist institutions in Europe to the colonial frontiers of the world (cf. Said 1991:219-225). In general – and one can just peruse the great variety of reports to the LMS directors from all over the world where the LMS was active – we must see this as a global missionary phenomenon, not without its ambivalences (Cf. *Transactions* I – III). As far as the missionary institutionalising of indigenous populations is concerned, this would not only form part of the colonising activities of the colonial powers themselves – even though critical of colonisation as indicated – but would also resonate with the effects of similar religious organisations in Europe. As stated, in the colonies, these mostly nonconformist organisations formed part of civil society, but that, a civil society that could not operate outside the limits and constraints set by the colonising governments, even though they were competing with it, as part of the outside of *the* Colonial (cf. Smit 2017a:263 – 268).

When Van der Kemp saw the destitute conditions of the Khoi and intervened to set up a mission station for them, started a school, as well as campaigned against the cruelties they were subjected to be frontier settler farmers, the Khoi have already been subjected to the devastating impact of colonisation for nearly one and a half centuries. They had not only lost their ancestral lands, but also much of their culture. And even though Van der Kemp's interventions for them and on their behalf, would provide some kind of reprieve, they would also be subjected to the impacts of the power that the mission would exert on the personally as well as culturally. As the mission stretched beyond the colonial frontiers, this impact would not only be reserved for the Khoi but also impact other indigenous societies and groups in Southern Africa during the nineteenth century. The ambiguity of missions – or we may say their own ambivalence or paradox – where they would on the one hand take social responsibility and intervene for an on behalf of indigenous populations subjected to colonialization, but on the other hand subject them to a similar power exerted on citizens in Europe through a great variety of enlightenment institutions, 'westernising' them – would remain. As such, in

developing a discourse for the missions and for the indigenous people subjected to colonisation, Van der Kemp and the missionaries that would follow, had to both develop their own discourse as an 'object of struggle' vis-à-vis the colonising governments and settler farmers, as well as use this developing discourse 'as tool by which the struggle is conducted' (cf. Said 1991:216; and 2002b:113).

Finally, despite Van der Kemp's interventions and exertions for and on behalf of the Khoi, especially his critique of the cruelty, exploitation and repression of the frontier settler farmers and conflict with the colonial governor on this issue, his vehement resistance of and protest against slavery, his anti-slavery campaigning, as well as his critique of the use of Khoi in colonial government works, the colonial government and farmer exploitation of Khoi labour would escalate after his death. *Firstly*, it is indicative of Van der Kemp's outspokenness, that Philip quoted him in his *Researches* (1828) referring to the occasion of the 1809 visit to Bethelsdorp of Lieutenant-Colonel Collins 'appointed to visit the frontier districts of the colony'. The latter posed some questions to Van der Kemp (on instigation of the local Graaf Reinet Major Cuyler it was adduced). This was in the presence of the much criticised 'Major Cuyler, Mr Stockenstrom, the landdrost of Graaf-Reinet and Mr. A Stockenstrom, who has since succeeded his father as the chief magistrate of the district'[14]. The questions and answers – which also reflect on the realities of slavery experienced by both Khoi and Xhosa – were as follows:

> 'Will you, Sir, agree to send over to Uitenhage, [Khoi] whose services may be required by the magistrate, Major Cuyler?' To this Vanderkemp directly applied in the negative. Being requested to state the grounds on which he rested his objections, he remarked, 'that to apprehend men as prisoners, and force them to labour in the manner proposed, was no part of his duty.' To a question, 'whether he did not consider it his duty to compel the [Khoi] to labour,' he replied, 'No, Sir; the [Khoi] are recognized to be a free people, and the colonists have no more right to force them to labour in the way you propose, than you have to sell them as slaves.' Being asked why he would not obey the order of the landdrost, in calling in the [Khoi] who were

[14] Philip states that this is present in the latter's report to the colonial government back in England.

> among the farmers, when they were required by the landdrost; 'Because, Sir,' said he, 'that is the duty of the landdrost himself, and he is paid for it. Being asked, if he would agree to prohibit the [Xhosa] from visiting his institution; and whether he would send such as might report to him under pretext of coming to seek instruction, as prisoners to Uitenhage; he replied 'Sir, my commission is to preach the gospel to every creature, and I will preach the gospel to every one who chooses to hear me. God has sent me, not to put chains upon the legs of [Khoi] and [Xhosa], but to preach liberty to the captives, and the opening of the prison doors to them that are bound' (quoted in Philip 1828:124f).

This in a nutshell captures some of the moral imperatives Van der Kemp was committed to – also quoting the very significant Luke 4:18/ Isaiah 61:1 texts in this regard.

Secondly, with regard to what happened after his death in 1811, John Philip's section on 'Effects of Dr. Vanderkemp's Death on the Missions' in the first section of Chapter 10 of his *Researches in South Africa* (1828) is informative. His analysis is as follows:

> Without reflecting on the missionaries who survived Dr. Vanderkemp, we cannot suppose that his removal could happen without seriously affecting the prosperity of the mission. It is obvious from his correspondence, that Dr. Vanderkemp always considered [both] the [British and Dutch] colonial government[s] as favourably disposed towards the [Khoi] and that he viewed them as misled by the misrepresentations of the colonists and the local authorities of the districts. He never seems to have considered the opposition he had to encounter as a part of the colonial system. His mistake, in this instance, may be easily accounted for. The fear inspired by his abilities obliged the officers of government to conceal, as much as possible, their real views; and, in their answers to his representations, they either affected to disapprove of what could not be defended, or they attempted to make him believe that the indefensible case was an exception to a general rule; while the circumscribed sphere of his operations, which allowed him little opportunity *of seeing the working of the system*, except in his own case, and the remoteness of

> his situation from the seat of government, contributed their different points of influence to prevent him from discovering the universality of those feelings, which were viewed by him as merely local in their operation. This limitation of his views did not, however, render him less fit for the situation he then filled. A more *perfect knowledge of the system* might, perhaps, have proved unfavourable to the continuance of his exertions, and the final triumph of his principles; and it is probable that had he been acquainted with all the difficulties in his undertaking, it would have been abandoned in despair. While Dr. Vanderkemp lived, the missions and the aborigines found an able defender; after his death, the missions fell into a state of confusion, which furnished their enemies with the opportunity they had long wished for to successfully assail them (Philip 1828:198f; e.a.).

Indicative of this last point, is that Philip (1828:201) describes Bethelsdorp on his first visit in 1819, as follows:

> On the visit of the deputation (Campbell and Philip) to Bethelsdorp, we found that institution in a deplorable condition. The system of oppression, of which Dr. Vanderkemp so bitterly complained, and under which he sunk into his grave with a broken heart, had been carried on for years without a single check. The institution was virtually converted into a slave lodge, and the people were called out to labour at Uitenhage, to work on the public roads, to cultivate the lands of the local authorities, or to serve their friends, or the colonial government, receiving for their labours never more than a trifling remuneration, and very frequently none at all.

Significant for our purposes is that Philip describes Van der Kemp as oblivious to the fact that the opposition he and the Khoi experienced (from the frontier settler farmers, and to some degree from the governments) was ‘a part of the colonial system’. Philip then explains that his ignorance was due to the fact that the ‘officers of government’ were not honest with him and concealed their real views from him due to ‘the fear inspired by his abilities’. Furthermore, they agreed with him on his views in their ‘answers to his representations’ or argued that he could not universalise his views and that his submissions were exceptions to the ‘general rule’. With regard to Van der

Kemp's inability to detect such deception, Philip reasons that this was due to him not being able to see 'the working of the [colonial or colonising] system'. The opposition he experienced was in fact universal (inclusive of both frontier settler farmers and colonising officials), or as Philip avers, based on a 'universality of those feelings …. A more perfect knowledge of the system might, perhaps, have proved unfavourable to the continuance of his exertions, and the final triumph of his principles …. While Dr. Vanderkemp lived, the missions and the aborigines found an able defender; after his death, the missions fell into a state of confusion'. The first half of the nineteenth century missions in South Africa, especially under the leadership of John Philip (cf. Ross 1986), would be characterised by a continuation of Van der Kemp's taking up social responsibility for the exploited and repressed indigenous populations and his counterhegemonic struggles, to various degrees (cf. Said 1991:222, and 246 on Gramsci).

Acknowledgements

***** I want to extend my sincere thanks to the detailed comments of the two independent reviewers, on whose wisdom I could draw for the improving of my argument in this article.

* In addition, I want to thank the University of KwaZulu-Natal for the sabbatical during which I could do the research and write-up this article, amongst others.

* I would also like to extend my sincere gratitude for the multiform assistance and help that I have received from Ms. Faith Bhengu, UKZN Principal Librarian (Durban), Ms. Celeste Johns, Circulation Supervisor, Mr. John Timms, Circulation Desk (Interlibrary Loans), and Mss. Shanitha Bhim and Bronwyn Tayler, Circulation Desk (Pietermaritzburg).

References

Bannister, S. 1830. *Humane Policy; or, Justice to the Aborigines of New Settlements, Essential to a Due Expenditure of British Money and to the Best Interests of the Settlers, with Suggestions how to Civilise the Natives by an Improved Administration of Existing Means.* London: Thomas and George Underwood.

Briggs, D.R. 1952. *An Historical Survey of the Bethelsdorp Station of the London Missionary Society, from its Inception, and Until the Death of Doctor van der Kemp, in 1811*. BD Thesis, Rhodes University, Grahamstown.

Enklaar, I.H. 1988. *Life and Work of Dr. J. Th. van der Kemp, 1747-1811. Missionary Pioneer and Protagonist of Racial Equality in South Africa.* Cape Town & Rotterdam: AA Balkema.

Florence, M. 1994. Foucault. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Aesthetics.* London: Penguin Books.

Foucault, M. [1961] 1982a. *Madness and Civilisation. A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason.* Howard, R. (trans.). London: Tavistock.

Foucault, M. [1963] 1973. *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception.* Sheridan-Smith, A. (trans.). London: Tavistock.

Foucault, M. [1970] 1982b. *The Order of Things. An Archaeology of the Human Sciences.* London: Tavistock.

Foucault, M. [1973] 1994. Truth and Juridical Forms. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Power*. London: Penguin Books.

Foucault, M. [1975] 1979. *Discipline and Punish. The Birth of the Prison.* Sheridan, A. (trans.). London: Penguin.

Foucault, M. [1972] 1980. *Power/ Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977.* Gordon, C. (ed.). New York: Pantheon Books.

Foucault, M. [1982] 1994. The Subject and Power. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Power*. London: Penguin Books.

Foucault, M. [1983] 1994. The Risks of Security. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Power*. London: Penguin Books.

Foucault, M. [1983] 1994. Structuralism and Post-structuralism. In Faubion, J. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Aesthetics.* London: Penguin Books.

Foucault, M. [1984] 1994. The Ethics of a Concern of the Self, as a Practice of Freedom. In Rabinow, P. (ed.): *Essential Works of Michel Foucault, 1954 – 1984: Ethics.* London: Penguin.

Freund, W.M. 1989. The Cape under the Transitional Governments, 1795 – 1814. In Elphick, R. & H. Giliomee (eds.): *The Shaping of South African Society, 1652 – 1840.* Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.

Hobbes, T. 1651. *Leviathan.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Krom, Herm. I.O. 1800. Voorrede van de Uitgever. In Van der Kemp, JT. 1799, 1800, 1802. *De Theodicée van Paulus, of de Rechtvaardigheid Gods door het Euangelium uit het geloof, aangetoond tot geloof, in eenige Aanmerkingen op deszelfs Brief aan de Romeinen, met eene niewe vertaling en paraphrase.* (Volumes I-III.) Dordrecht: A Blussé en Zoon.

Locke, J. 1689. *Two Treatises of Government: In the Former the False Principles and Foundation of Sir Robert Filmer and his Followers are Detected and Overthrown. The Latter is an Essay Concerning the True Original, Extent and End of Civil Government.* London: Whitmore & Penn.

Philip, J. 1828. *Researches in South Africa: Illustrating the Civil, Moral, and Religious Condition of the Native Tribes: Including Journals of the Author's Travels in the Interior: Together with Detailed Accounts of the Progress of the Christian Missions, Exhibiting the Influence of Christianity in Promoting Civilization.* Volumes I and II. London: James Duncan. Potkay, Adam.

Pletsch, C. 1996. 'Civil Society' and Rousseau's Place in the Social Contract Tradition. *The European Legacy: Toward New Paradigms* 1,1:322 – 328.

Ross, R. 1986. *John Philip (1775 – 1851): Missions, Race and Politics in South Africa.* Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.

Rousseau, J-J. [1762] 1782. Civil Society. In *The Social Contract*. Cole, G.D.H. (trans.). Available at: http://www.constitution.org/jjr/socon.htm. (Accessed on 10 May 2017.)

Said, E. [1991] 1994. *The World, the Text, and the Critic.* London: Vintage.

Said, E. [1988] 2002a. The Ethics of Language: Review of Michel Foucault's *Archaeology of Knowledge and Discourse on Language*. In Smart, B. (ed.): *Michel Foucault: Critical Assessments.* Volume II. London & New York: Routledge.

Said, E. [1988] 2002b. The Problem of Textuality: Two Exemplary Positions. In Smart, B. (ed.): *Michel Foucault: Critical Assessments.* Volume II. London & New York: Routledge.

Smit, J.A. 2001. The Language of the Other. *Alternation* 8,2: 70 – 106.

Smit, J.A. 2016a. J.T. van der Kemp and his Critique of the Settler Farmers on the South African Colonial Frontier (1799-1811). *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29,1: 6 – 56.

Smit, J.A. 2016b. J.T. van der Kemp's Link to the British Anti-slavery Network and his Civil Rights Activism on Behalf of the Khoi (1801 – 1803). *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29,2 (2016) 5 – 28.

Smit, J.A. 2017a. #DecolonialEnlightenment and Education. *Alternation* Special Edition 19: 253 – 311. Available at: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/v24n2a13

Smit, J.A. 2017b. Social Responsibility and Power I: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions For and On Behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806). *Alternation* 24,2: 12 – 44.

Tomkins, S. 2010. *The Clapham Sect: How Wilberforce's Circle Transformed Britain.* Oxford: Lion Hudson.

Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria,* and History &c. of Caffraria, 1804. pp. 323-507.

Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II, 1806. pp. 1-253.

Zefnik, L. 2014. *Critical Perspectives in Happiness Research: The Birth of Modern Happiness.* Heidelberg, New York, Dordrecht & London: Springer.

Archival Resources

LMS I FA 1799. *First Attempt to Enter Caffraria. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria, and History &c. of Caffraria, Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, 1804. pp. 323-507.

LMS I JC 1801. *Journey to Caffraland.* Journals dated: August 10 - November 11, 1801. (pp. 487-505). *Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, 1804. pp. 323-507.

LMS I SA 1799. *Second Attempt to Enter Caffraria in the Year 1800. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria, and History &c. of Caffraria,* 1804. pp. 323-507.

LMS I TVDK 1800. *Transactions of Dr. Vanderkemp, in the Year 1801. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume I*, Including: *Dr. Vanderkemp's Specimen of the Caffra Language, Nature of the Country of Caffraria, An Account of the Quadrupeds of Caffraria, and History &c. of Caffraria,* 1804. pp. 323-507.

LMS I EL1 1801. *Extracts from Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions I. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 92-95.

LMS I EJBP 1802. *Extracts from the Journals of Dr. Vanderkemp and Mr. Read, after their Settlement at Bota's Place. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 1-253.

LMS I L1 1802. *Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions II. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 1-253.

LMS I EL1 1802. *Extracts from Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions I. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804.

LMS II AR 1803. *Annual Report of the Missionaries at Bethelsdorp, South Africa, for the year 1803, From the Missionaries Vanderkemp and Read. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 1-253.

LMS II L 1804. *Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions II. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 1-253.

LMS II L1 1801. *Letters of Van der Kemp from Transactions II. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 1-253.

LMS II AR 1804. *Annual Report of the Missionaries at Bethelsdorp, South Africa, for the year 1803, From the Missionaries Vanderkemp and Read. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1804. pp. 1-253.

LMS II AR 1805. *Annual Report of the Missionaries at Bethelsdorp, South Africa, for the year 1803, From the Missionaries Vanderkemp and Read. Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1806. pp. 1-253.

LMS II P 1805. John William Janssens, Governor and Commander in Chief, together with the Members of the Board of Police at the Cape of Good Hope, &c. 1805. *Proclamation.* Dated February 20 1805. pp. 233-236.

LMS II AR 1805. Van der Kemp, J.T. *Extracts from the Annual Report of the Missionary Institution of Bethelsdorp for the year 1805.* pp. 401-404. *Transactions of the London Missionary Society Volume II*, 1812. pp. 2-10,249f; 398-409.

Johannes A. Smit
Programme in Religion and Social Transformation
School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics
University of KwaZulu-Natal
smitj@ukzn.ac.za

*Waqf*s and the Dynamics of Muslim Charity in Secular Milieus, Kenya 1900-2010

S.A. Chembea[1]

Abstract

Waqfs (religious endowments) were the mainstay of a plethora of beneficiaries evolving to a socio-economically secure constituency of Muslims. Secured of socio-economic well-being, beneficiaries threatened and often advocated for social and political positions independent of and in opposition to political establishments. This saw the creation of state agencies to control *waqfs* as evident in both Muslim and colonial powers. State agencies did not, however, annihilate *waqfs* as envisaged but beneficiaries diversified into alternative charitable activities as provided by the Shari'a. Using James C. Scott's concept of 'symbolic resistance' and Talal Asad's view of Islam as a 'discursive tradition', I argue that use of uncontrolled charities like sadaqa and private trusts in Kenya's secular milieu does not only accord Muslims the wherewithal to negotiate the socio-cultural and economic spheres, but also provide a means to fulfilling religious obligations outside the purview of the state.

Keywords: *Waqf*, resource control, symbolic resistance, private trusts, discursive tradition.

[1] Chembea Suleiman is a Doctoral candidate at the Bayreuth International Graduate School of African Studies (BIGSAS), University of Bayreuth, Germany, funded by the Kenya-German Postgraduate Training Programme [50085235]. Contact address: Bussardweg, 41-018, Bayreuth 95445, Germany. Email: chembea.suleiman@uni-bayreuth.de.

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a4

Introduction: *Waqf*s and State Control in the Muslim World

Waqf consists of a revenue-generating or revenue-consuming property endowed for a specific pious purpose. The property is held in trust by a *mutawalli* (custodian) appointed by the *waqif* (endower) who directs its usufruct towards the set objectives for eternity (Barnes 1986; van Leeuwen 1999; Hennigan 2004). The institution of *waqf* lies somewhere between the Islamic law of *mirath* (inheritance) and *sadaqa* (charity) where the dedicator permanently gives out a section of his wealth that though its corpus remains inalienable, benefits are directed to predetermined causes. This gives us three distinct types of *waqf*s: *waqf awlad* (also *ahli*, or *dhurri*, posterity) for the economic and social security of the endower's progeny; *waqf khayri* (public or charitable), for the socio-cultural welfare of the society; and *waqf mushtarak* (mixed) that caters concurrently for posterity and public causes at agreed ratios (Hoexter 1995:140-141; Deguilhem 2008; Oberauer 2008). Consequently, *waqf*s catered for a wide range of social welfare services in the community including the socio-economic security of the endowers' descendants, education, religious institutions, and provision of water and health care outside the purview of political establishments. It is these inherent privileges that made *waqf*s to be perceived as invaluable platform for autonomous groups to coalesce into a constituency that could advocate for socio-cultural and economic interests of its members in opposition to the political establishments. Carmichael (1997:209) observes:

> *Waqf* is a uniquely Muslim institution rooted in religious ideals. Yet, its role at the interface of private property and various religious foundations, such as the mosques and Qur'anic schools that *waqf* funds support, make it an obvious instrument for exerting influence in many spheres of Muslim life. Therefore, it should not be surprising that the British sought a role in *waqf* management.

Although the context in the above observation was on the British colonial government in Kenya as shall be discussed herein, it could rightfully apply to several scenarios where the management of *waqf*s is seen as an avenue for exerting socio-economic and political power (Powers 1989; Burr & Collins 2006).

Along the East African coast, and Kenya in particular, the institution of *waqf* dates back to the eighth century when Islam was introduced in the

region. As an Islamic socio-cultural practice, *waqf*s were consecrated, mediated, and managed by and according to the Shari'a and the office of the *mutawalli*. The *kadhis* (Muslim judges) and '*ulama* (clerics) on their part, provided the interpretative insights on how endowers could achieve their set objectives of helping humanity as well as attaining *qurba* (divine closeness) and *sawab* (divine merit) apart from adjudicating disputes on *waqf*s. This is premised on the fact that the Shari'a, and *kadhi* courts for that matter, had largely been in existence in the region as an integral part of the Muslim judicial system long before the coming of the British colonial authorities (Sperling 1988; Anderson 2008; Stockreiter 2015).

As a legal administrative and dispute resolution institution, the Muslim judiciary encompassed all matters of the Shari'a. Muslim courts have historically no precedent of legal jurisdiction over issues affecting the society based on the nature of disputes. No separate courts for commercial disputes or civil litigation different from family law are recorded to have existed in the history of Islam (Powers 2011; Layish 1997; Reiter 1996). As far as *waqf*s are concerned, some commercial transactions like '*ana* (lease), *hikr* (rent), *istibdal* (exchange or sell), and *tasrif* (intra-*waqf* borrowing), are beyond the mandate of *mutawallis* and could only be sanctioned by the *kadhis* (Makdisi 1981; Cattan 1984; Sanjuan 2007).

Therefore, based on their position in the institution of *waqf* as interlocutors of Islamic knowledge and authority, *kadhis* and '*ulama* had control not only over economic and socio-cultural resources, but also a wider constituency of the socio-economically secure Muslim beneficiaries making them potential antagonists of colonial and Muslim political establishments. 'During the 19th century, however'. writes Powers (1989:538), 'the religious scholars came in to conflict with Muslim and non-Muslim rulers who wanted to weaken' their power by gaining access to *waqf*s. This saw the establishment of *diwan al awqaf* (departments or Ministries of Imperial *Waqf*) and civil guidelines to control the institution with personnel appointed by the state among collaborating Muslims (Kozlowski 2008; Powers 1989). This was replicated from the Abbasid Caliphate (A.D. 750-1258) to the Ottoman Empire (1299-1923); from the French Algeria, Syria and Lebanon, to the Italian colony of Libya (1911-1941), and the British East Africa Protectorate (1888-1963), India and Palestine (Deguilhem 2008; Medici 2011).

Since the establishment of secular policies and state agencies to regulate *waqf*s, life in the institution became a constant negotiation between

different actors for the control of economic, social, political, and symbolic privileges associated with such properties. This paper seeks to highlight such negotiations between the state secular-based policies and the institution of *waqf* among Muslims in Kenya. Figures from the Kenya National Bureau of Statistics (KNBS) derived from the 2009 National Population and Housing Census puts Muslims at 11.2% of the 38 million Kenyans[2]. Moreover, predominant Muslim regions, according to the survey, fade significantly against their Christian counterparts in socio-economic and cultural development predating the political (both colonial and postcolonial) (dis-) engagement with the community. Characterized by conflicting and competing socio-ethnic and jurisprudential affiliations, clearly, Muslims are a minority and marginalized group in a predominantly Christian society where *waqf*s are administered by a state body, the *Waqf* Commissioners of Kenya (WCK), through secular statutes like the *Waqf* Commissioners Act (1951). To what extent did secular policies and decisions by the civil institutions influence the development of *waqf*s? And how do Muslims negotiate these secular policies and civil constructs vis-à-vis the practices of *waqf*s? The answers to these questions concern the central focus of this article informed by ethnographic research grounded on two theoretical frameworks - Scott's concept of 'ideological (also symbolic) resistance' and Talal Asad's concept of 'Islam as a discursive tradition'. The article argues that state control of *waqf*s in Kenya interfered with normative precepts causing the loss of control of resources and socio-cultural privileges associated with the practice among Muslims. Consequently, a cross section of Muslims exited from the state controlled *waqf*s to uncontrolled charitable practices such as *zakat* (alms), *sadaqa* (charity), private trusts, and community based organizations provided by the Shari'a. This development did not only help them retain control of resources and socio-cultural power but also fulfill the religious obligation on charity.

[2] Several sources, however, contest the KNBS figures to give varied estimates of the Muslim population ranging from 8% to 25%. See KNBS, Population and Housing Census, Nairobi, 2009. Available at: file:///C:/Users/USER/Downloads/Volume%202Population%20and%20Household%20Distribution%20by%20Socio-Economic%20Characteristics%20(1).pdf. (Accessed on April, 2016); Oded (2000); Ndzovu (2014).

Judicial Space Control: Secular Policies and Civil Courts' Judgments Influencing *Waqf*s in Kenya Since Colonial Times

According to Mann and Roberts (1991), 'law formed an area in which Africans and Europeans engaged one another - a battleground as it were on which they contested access to resources and labor, relationship of power and authority, and interpretations of morality and culture' (quoted in Mwa-kimako 2011:332). This observation aptly describes the East African Protec-torate milieu, first by the British colonial authorities and inherited by subse-quent postcolonial regimes, where various legislative and civil judicial under-takings led to the control of *waqf*s as 'economic capital' (Bourdieu 1986:241; Mahr, Harker, and Wilkes, 1990) by the state. The Protectorate, a narrow coastal strip stretching only ten miles inland from the coast, from Vanga in the south to Kipini in the north, was part of the Zanzibar Sultanate administered according to the Shari'a different from the predominantly Christian upcountry Kenya colony (Hailey 1979; Carmichael 1997; Eliot 1996).

Until the establishment of the Protectorate in 1897, there was neither a legal body in-charge of *waqf*s nor separate court that adjudicated disputes related to the properties. Whereas litigation pertaining to *waqf*s fell under the jurisdiction of the Shari'a courts, management of the properties resided with *mutawallis* as required by normative traditions (Powers 1989; Hennigan 2004; Stockreiter 2015). Upon establishment of the Protectorate, however, the British colonial government established a wide range of secular policies and civil institutions to control resources, establish capitalist economy and consolidate political hegemony. These policies effectively restructured traditional institutions impacting normative precepts on *waqf*s in the region.

First was the East African Order in Council (1897) that re-organized the judiciary in two categories of 'Native Courts'. The first group was composed of the High Court, the Chief 'Native Court', Provincial Courts, District Courts and Assistant Collector's Courts. Presided by a British judicial officer, these courts were guided by the Indian Civil Procedure Code (CPC) and the Indian Penal and Criminal Procedure Codes (PCPC) introduced in the region. The second category consisted of the Shari'a courts and Court of local chiefs (African local courts) presided by a native authority, but also guided by the CPC and PCPC as well as the native laws or customs existing in their respective jurisdictions (Anderson 2008; Hashim 2005; 2010). This categorization enabled the British colonial government to closely supervise the

'native courts' and more significantly, vet their legal decisions since they lacked appellate powers. In other words, the courts presided by 'native juri-consultants' lost their independence to those presided by British judicial officers. Bang (2001:59-98) observes that 'native courts' were retained in the peripheries of the judiciary framework mainly to sanction and implement reforms initiated by the British administration and in the worst case scenario, interpret and apply Shari'a as understood in the British lenses. This led to the application of what Schacht (1982:94-96) describes as 'Anglo-Mohammedan jurisprudence' in the region.

The control of 'native courts' by the colonial government through foreign judicial principles adequately fits what Bourdieu (1985:16-71) regards as negotiations for the field – a 'social space of objective relationships' where infinite amount of daily life and interactions of social agents take place. In the case of the Protectorate, the judiciary became a field in which Muslims and the British colonial government contested access to control of economic and symbolic resources associated with the institution of *waqf*. *Kadhis*, the '*ulama*, *mutawallis*, and the British colonial officers, were merely agents in these struggles. On the other hand, close supervision of the judiciary by the British colonial government and insistence that it dispenses justice based on non-Islamic principles amounted to 'symbolic violence'. This is the 'gentle, invisible violence, unrecognized as such, chosen as much as undergone, that of trust, obligation, personal loyalty, hospitality, gifts, debts, piety, in a word, of all the virtues honored by the ethic of honor' (Bourdieu 1990:127; Bourdieu & Wacquant 2004:272-274). In this context, Muslim *kadhis*, who were mainly Arabs neither adept in English judicial practices nor English language in which the foreign judicial guidelines were expressed, were obliged to comply with the new order as a matter of official code. This was a clear deficiency in 'cultural capital' on the part of the *kadhis* that the colonial government of the time exploited in their control of the judicial field, and by extension, the legislations on *waqf*s.

The Mohammedan Marriage Divorce and Succession Ordinance of 1897 was another statute that further restricted the jurisdiction of the Shari'a courts. This Ordinance limited the jurisdiction of the *kadhi* courts to matters of Muslim personal status law that was narrowly defined to mean marriage, divorce, and inheritance between Muslim litigants in which the value of the subject-matter in dispute did not exceed one thousand Kenya shillings (Hashim 2005:27-51; Anderson 2008). In its wider context, however, as summarized by

Stockreiter (2010:562), 'personal status usually included marriage, divorce, inheritance [and] religious endowments (*waqf*)'. Therefore, narrowly interpreting Islamic personal status law was a conscious effort to transfer the jurisdiction of *waqf*s from *kadhi* courts to the new English judicial order. This is because, the development created a vacuum in the normative administration of *waqf*s leaving *mutawallis* and endowers without supervision necessitating the establishment of a state organ, the *Waqf* Commission of Kenya (WCK) in 1899, and a secular policy, the *Waqf* Commissioners ordinance (1900), to regulate the institution.

The establishment of the WCK was thus, in itself, a noble idea that could have streamlined the institution and improve efficiency. However, considering the political environment in which it was conceived and operated, it turned out to be an effective tool for checking the economic mainstay of the interlocutors of Islamic knowledge and authority and the various groups of beneficiaries against colonial hegemony. Moreover, regulating *waqf*s using secular policies and civil institutions helped in spearheading the capitalist economic ideals fronted by the British colonial government (Oberauer 2008; Kuran 2001; Fair 2001). Sections 12(1a) and (b) of the WCK ordinance particularly empowered the state agency to seize the administration of private *waqf*s whenever it 'appears to the commissioners that there is no properly constituted trustee of a *waqf* or any trustee is acting in an improper or unauthorized manner'. True to the powers invested on the state agency, some *waqf*s, like the Wakilifi *masjid* at *mji wa kale* (Old town) in Mombasa were usurped[3]. This trend was replicated during the postcolonial times interfering with the socio-economic welfare of various groups of beneficiaries of *waqf*s as discussed elsewhere in this paper.

Control of the judiciary by the colonial government also led to ambiguous application of the Shari'a invalidating some *waqf*s. A suitable reference is the *waqf ahli* of Fatuma bint Mohamed bin Salim invalidated by the High Court in 1952 for allegedly including many beneficiaries making the charitable cause impossible. The High Court decision was informed by the doctrine of precedence in Common law where similar *waqf*s were invalidated by the Privy Council judgment in India (1894) and the High Court decision in Zanzibar (1946) (Anderson 2008:96-97; Schacht 1982; Banday 2013).

[3] *Mombasa Times*, November 3 and 5, 1957; correspondence between WCK's Advocate and Naam bin Ali, June, 1957, WCK archive, Mombasa.

Although the doctrine of precedence does not apply in Shari'a, it formed the basis for more legal petitions during the postcolonial period evident in Civil Suit no. 55 of 2011 in the High Court in the matter of *waqf ahli* of Said bin Rashid al-Mandhry[4].

Apart from the *Waqf* Commissioners ordinance, the state agency was also subject to a variety of statutes that centralized the custody of *waqf*s hindering normative precepts (see below). As administration of *waqf*s became centralized, the colonial policy of divide-and-rule was applied in appointing commissioners among collaborating Muslims based on their socio-ethnic and regional affiliations to protect state interests rather than equitable representation of major stake holders. The net effect of this was the development of apathy from a cross section of Muslims whose interests were not catered for owing to lack of consultation and inclusion on the matters of the state agency. Clearly, secular policies that Muslims resented disregarded normative precepts on *waqf*s. This isolated a cross section of actors to accord the colonial government the power to define the 'official economic policy' where capitalism through house rents, land taxes, and paid labor, were favored over *waqf*s (Oberauer 2008; Fair 2001). Consequently, this caused resentment in the Muslim community forming the basis for ideological resistance against the state with a view to reverse the control of resources as argued in this article.

State Control of 'Economic Capital' in *Waqf*s through Civil Legislations since the Colonial Times

The place of land as a factor on production, both in the capitalist economy of the colonial government and in the Islamic institution of *waqf*, cannot be gainsaid. However, capitalist economy exclusively perceived land ownership from a private perspective defined by possession of a title deed as opposed to communal ownership manifested in the *waqf*s and other customary land rights among Muslims in the region. Consequently, from 1908, through the Land Titles Ordinance, huge tracts of land in the protectorate changed ownership

[4] Amended originating summons, ground 2, Civil Suit no. 55 of 2011 in the High Court of Kenya; order of the High Court, September 2011, WCK archive, Mombasa. During research (2014 – 2017), the case was still pending in the courts.

from community or 'native reserves' to 'Crown Lands' despite widespread protests and claims of historical tenure from the locals (Hailey 1979:106-107; Anderson 2008).

The Ordinance further empowered the Governor to 'grant lease or alienate Crown lands for any purpose and on any terms and conditions as he may think fit' (quoted in Anderson 2008:91). This provision of the Ordinance was anchored on the 1894 Land Acquisition Act of India introduced in the Protectorate giving the colonial government the right to seize 'native lands' supposedly for public purposes (Carmichael 1997; Pouwels 1987; Ndzovu 2014). The net effect of these ordinances was to abrogate rights of customary land ownership by the locals, majority of who were incidentally Muslims, reducing them to squatters and disrupting their socio-economic well-being. Accordingly, this development formed the genesis of protracted tussles over land control and ownership in the region whose solutions have remained elusive since the colonial times.

Moreover, the statutes inhibited land transactions without first being confirmed as owned and sanctioned by the colonial government. The legislations were, therefore, a blow to claims of land ownership by the locals in the region since they lacked the titles to prove ownership (Berg-Schlosser 1984). Lack of titles of ownership also inhibited development of land *waqf*s and other properties as evident in Malindi area from 1911 to 1912 (Carmichael 1997). Thus the shift in the perception to land ownership impacted both on the already established *waqf*s from being developed as well as prohibiting further consecration of land-based *waqf*s. On the strength of the statutes, the colonial government also compulsorily acquired some land *waqf*s without compensation. This was true of a cemetery land at Changamwe, Mombasa on which a rail way line was built eliciting claims by affected beneficiaries that the trains were moving over their ancestors' dead bodies for free (Carmichael 1997). Shari'a requires that compulsory acquired *waqf*s be compensated so that replacements could be established to carry on the initial causes. Thus, lack of compensation suggests that establishment of substitute *waqf*s was not realized disrupting the socio-economic and cultural well-being of beneficiaries, as well as the spiritual aspirations of endowers.

This is, nonetheless, not to negate other *waqf*s acquired and compensated by the colonial state under similar circumstances during the same period. They include the *waqf* land of *shaykh* Mbaruk bin Rashid bin Salim el-Kehlany in Mombasa acquired in 1954 but compensated in cash after the

colonial government allegedly failed to acquire 'suitable land at the coast which could be the subject of an exchange'[5]. Other *waqf*s are those that benefited *masjid* Mandhry and *masjid* Mwana Iki bint Suleiman in Mombasa for which the government also paid in cash. While the WCK records indicate that compensation for the later *waqf* was divided between the two holy *masjids* at Mecca and Medina as well as *masjid* Kikeshi following *shurut al-waqif* (conditions of the endower), that of the former was claimed to have been 'added to other amounts from similar *waqf*s for the purchase of other properties'[6]. However, as late as 2010, no replacement *waqf*s had been established for *shaykh* Mbaruk.

Paradoxically, the WCK Act neither contemplates the compulsory acquisition of *waqf*s nor specifies how compensation could be handled. The statute, however, empowers commissioners to dispose of *waqf*s in selected instances:

> If it appears to the *Waqf* Commissioners that in respect of any *waqf* the intentions of the maker cannot reasonably be carried into effect and that it is accordingly expedient that the property the subject of the *waqf* or any part thereof should be sold, the *Waqf* Commissioners may cause that property or part thereof to be sold, and shall apply the proceeds […] in such manner as the *Waqf* Commissioners think fit for the benefit of the beneficiaries of the *waqf* (Sections 16(2) and 17).

The charter thus, opines Bang (2001:77), empowered WCK to disregard the conditions of endowers and 'spend *waqf* revenues on causes other than those stipulated by the endower' on the belief that the decisions would be to the best interests of the beneficiaries. This was, however, not always the case as evident in the laments by beneficiaries of the *waqf* of *shaykh* Mbaruk where the commissioners failed in establishing alternative *waqf*s despite receiving compensation for the liquidated property. Other beneficiaries disenfranchised

[5] Compensation notice, March, 1955; correspondence between the government collector and the WCK, December, 1954; April, 1955, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[6] Minute 2068 of April, 1957, WCK archive, Mombasa; Personal interview with Muhammad Shalli, Mombasa, December, 2014.

by the decisions of the WCK include those of the *waqf*s of Bamkele and Abdallah bin Khamis, both in Mombasa, and Suleiman bin Amour Gheith al-Darmacky in Malindi[7]. Disenfranchisement resulted in prolonged court battles where, though often unsuccessful, beneficiaries sought to rescind the decisions of the WCK.

Moreover, there were some regulations on immovable properties that impeded *waqf* practices by logically prohibiting endowing. The African Property Preservation Ordinance (1916) established that:

> No building, standing coconut palm, standing fruit tree, or other standing tree situated in an area to which this Ordinance has been applied shall be sold, leased, hypothecated, mortgaged or pledged by any means whatsoever to any person who is not a member of an African tribe inhabiting such area and residing therein (as quoted in Anderson 2008:91).

Arguably, prohibiting 'pledge by any means whatsoever' as envisaged in the legislation also included the consecration of properties as *waqf*s. This statute did not take cognizance of the fact that Muslim charity and *qurba* on which *waqf* is founded is not limited by race, ethnicity, or locality making it a misplaced legislation.

In a typical case of divide-and-rule policy by the colonial government, the WCK ordinance did not also recognize some Asians as Muslims[8]. This suggests that some Asian Muslims were prohibited from

[7] Personal interviews with Mohammed Abdallah, Rahma Abdallah, and Ali bin Khamis, Mombasa, October, 2015; Ali Salim Bamkele, Abdurahman Bamkele, Ahmed Bahaidar Bamkele and Hamid Salim Bamkele, Mombasa, November, 2015; Said *sharif* Abdallah, Malindi, October, 2015. See also internal memo by the Secretary, WCK, to Commissioners, July, 2010; correspondence between Zubeda bint Salim bin Iddi Bamkele and the WCK, July, 1999, cc. the Chief *Kadhi*, the PC coast Province, and tenants of the contested *waqf*, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[8] Section 2 of the WCK Act (1900) defines a Muslim as '[…] an Arab, a member of the Twelve tribes [*Thenashara Taifa*, i.e. Swahili Muslims confederation], a Baluchi, a Somali, a Comoro Islander, a Malagasy or a native

establishing new *waqf*s considering the limitations placed upon them by the statute. Asian Muslim immigrants constitute a sizeable community having settled along the East African coast from the 8th century as traders, guards, or religio-political refugees (Fairs 2001; McIntosh 2009; Nicolini 2014). Despite settling for long, however, they maintained social and spiritual attachments with their ancestral homes that they designated as beneficiaries evident in several *waqf* deeds. These include the *waqf ahli* of Gulamhussein Adamji whose residual beneficiaries are the pilgrims of Karbala in Iraq[9]; the *waqf ahli* of Haji Ismael Haji Adam whose residual beneficiaries are poor and beggars at the two holy *masjids* in Mecca and Medina as well as those of Baghdad[10]; and many other *waqf*s whose primary and residual beneficiaries are non-Africans[11]. It is possible to argue that these legislations forced Asian Muslims to look for alternative means of practicing charity in the society and retain control of the resources and associated privileges as argued elsewhere in this paper.

With a hands-on approach to resource control, the colonial government also imposed compulsory registration of *waqf*s. *Mutawallis* who failed to comply with the registration requirement were 'guilty of an offense and liable to a fine not exceeding two thousand Kenya shillings or to imprisonment for a term not exceeding six months'[12]. Further, with collaborating commissioners and state officers seconded in the WCK, the colonial government influenced the decision making process regarding use of *waqf* revenues against designated causes. From 1911 to 1912 particularly, the government directed the WCK to use *waqf* funds in improving sanitation and public health in Malindi area apart from allocating undeveloped *waqf* lands to

of Africa of the Muslim faith'. See *Waqf* Commissioners Act, Cap 109, laws of Kenya.

[9] The *waqf* of Gulamhussein Adamji consisted of several parcels of land (*shambas*) and houses in Tudor, Mombasa. See *waqf* deeds of Gulamhussein Adamji, fols. 38-9, plots no. 3806-1 and 2519, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[10] See *waqf* deeds of Hajji Ismael Hajji Adam, fols. 51-52 on plot no. 5158; Hajji Ebrahim Adam, on plot no. 8173/5, fol. 67, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[11] See *waqf* deeds of Moosaji Issaji, fol. 120; Hajji Ismael Hajji Adam (above) for *waqf al- Haramayn* (Mecca and Medina); minute 2039 of 17/2/1956 on the compulsory acquisition of *waqf* of Mwanaiki bint Suleiman, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[12] See *Waqf* Commissioners Act, 1951, Cap 109, Section 10(4).

residents for farming (Carmichael 1997:301). It is a fact that the Shari'a allows *qabala* (also *mukhabara*, sharecropping) as a means of improving productivity of agricultural *waqf* lands (*Sahih al-Bukhari* 3:523, 532-537; Sanjuan 2007; Lahsasna 2014). Contrary to *qabala*, however, the argument of the colonial government implied opening the lands to private ownership. More importantly, the *waqf* lands in question had not become 'unproductive', but merely 'undeveloped', making the government directive on the *waqf* lands and their revenues as misplaced in view of the Shari'a for disregarding the wishes of the endowers.

On the same vein, from 1954 to 1955 the colonial government used the Preservation of Objects of Archaeological and Palaeontological Interest Ordinance, Cap 314, to convert the closed cemetery of the Mazrui and the ruined *Jamia masjid* of Wakilindini into national monuments[13]. The decision was, allegedly, in line with 'the policy of the city of London and most English cities for the last twenty years to convert closed cemeteries and ruined Churches into Public Gardens with flowers that is open to the public (sic)'[14]. Accordingly, WCK leased out the two *waqf*s to the Municipal council of Mombasa to restore and protect them 'as befitting the Mazrui family and also to maintain and beautify in the interest of Mombasa where it was seen by many visitors'[15]. This was despite protests by Muslims who also cited excerpts from the same statute that protect areas of worship from being used inconsistent with their character[16].

During the postcolonial period, the scramble for control over resources, particularly land, was intensified in the Protectorate as virtually all statutes related to *waqf* remained unchanged. The 'Crown lands' were used to reward political loyalty and settle non-indigenous people from other parts of

[13] The Ordinance is presently the National Museums and Heritage Act, Cap 216 [Revised 2012], Laws of Kenya.

[14] Correspondence between J. S. Kirkman and the District Commissioner, Mombasa, January, 1955, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[15] Minute 2 of the meeting held in the DC's Office, Mombasa, February, 1955, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[16] Letter of reply by *shaykh* Mbarak Ali Hinawy, the *liwali* of the coast, to the Town Clerk, Mombasa Municipality and copied to the PC, coast; DC, Mombasa; Secretary for Education, Labor and Lands, Nairobi and Secretary for Forest Development, Game and Fisheries, Nairobi, January, 1955.

the country leaving the local population as permanent squatters (McIntosh 2009; Ndzovu 2014). Two incidents involving land *waqf*s are occasionally re-enacted to epitomize these perceived historical injustices in relation to economic exploitation and socio-cultural exclusion of the Muslim community in the region. The first involves *waqf khayri* of the Mazrui established in 1914 through the Mazrui Lands Trust Act, but invalidated through the Mazrui Land Trust (Repeal) of 1989 without compensation[17]. The *waqf* took more than two decades of protracted court battle to be re-instated[18]. Apart from stagnated development and inhibited spiritual benefits during the period of invalidation, a large section of the *waqf* land was occupied by squatters that remain unto this day due to lack of protection by the government[19].

The second case involves the *waqf* of Salim Mbaruk bin Dahman at Kanamai, Kilifi district. In accordance with the *waqf* provision of '*ana*, the property comprising of a beach farm was leased to the National Council of Churches of Kenya (NCCK) around 1962. The agreement was contingent on the payment of a monthly rent and was conditional on no coconut trees being cut or a Church being established on the *waqf* land[20]. The NCCK, however, reneged in the agreement leading to a legal battle that spanned over a

[17] The Land Acquisition Act (1983), Section 5 on compensation provides '[…] as soon as practicable after entry has been made, the Commissioner shall make good or pay full compensation for any damage resulting from the entry'. See also Section 75(1), Constitution of Kenya (1963) and Article 40(3), Constitution of Kenya (2010) on compulsory acquisition of land.

[18] The land was registered as private under certificate of ownership number 409, of April, 1914, issued under the Land Titles Act (Cap 282) Laws of Kenya to *shaykh* Ali b. Salim. This contrasts with the southern Mazrui land reserves (Gazi) under Salim b. Mbaruk b. Rashid el-Mazrui composed of 3000 acres out of which 2000 were consecrated as *waqf*. See KNA/PC/Coast/1/11/41, Kenya National Archives, Nairobi.

[19] Personal interview with Rashid Muhammad Salim al-Mazrui, October 2015. See also judgment of the High Court of July 2012 on Civil Suit No. 185 of 1991, WCK archive, Mombasa; section 8, Land Acquisition Act, Cap 295 Laws of Kenya.

[20] Transfer of lease from Goolshan Ladies Wear Ltd to the NCCK, July, 1962, WCK archive, Mombasa.

decade[21]. While launching the Christian center it had established on the *waqf* land in 1972, the NCCK petitioned the President (*Mzee* Jomo Kenyatta) to have the WCK terminate its claim on the *waqf*. Subsequently, opines al-Mazrui (2004:7), 'with a view of not embarrassing the President', the WCK was forced to accept a three-bedroom Swahili house in waiver of the beach farm[22].

As argued in the above cases, therefore, both colonial and postcolonial governments appropriated legislative instruments and civil institutions to control the cultural and economic spaces in the Protectorate even where it involved disregard to religious feelings of the community. As illustrated in some instances, either the government took away *waqf*s without compensation or used its power to inhibit utility of the compensation funds. This inhibited execution of socio-cultural and economic causes of the *waqf*s subordinating the Muslim community. Accordingly, state policies on control of resources interfered with practices of *waqf* in the region partly setting ground for the economic, social, and cultural under-development of the Muslim community.

Symbolic Resistance: Covert Protests by Muslims against State Control of *Waqf*s

Control of resources by the colonial and postcolonial governments negated the perception to life as one totality among Muslims in the Protectorate. Majority of Muslims in the region perceive Islam not merely as a religion but a complete

[21] Minutes of the WCK meeting of September, 1970; minutes of the meeting of January, 1972; correspondences between the WCK, the NCCK, Commissioner of Lands, and the PC coast province, October - September, 1972, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[22] See also minutes of the WCK meeting of December, 1973; minute 143 of special meeting of the WCK and the NCCK, July, 1974; minute 26/76(1) of WCK meeting, July, 1976; the NCCK's correspondence to the PC coast province, September, 1972; PC's correspondence to the WCK, October, 1973; correspondence between the NCCK and the WCK, January – July, 1974; correspondence between the NCCK and the WCK, July - August, 1974, WCK archive, Mombasa.

way of life such that attempts to undermine a single aspect would have ripple effect on the entire system of life. In the case of *waqf*s, state control clearly interfered with a wide array of aspects from spiritual to social; legal to legislative; economic to symbolic. This went as far as questioning the institution of *waqf* altogether by invalidating what would have been valid *waqf*s under Shari'a during both the colonial and postcolonial periods evident in the invocation of the doctrine of precedence in Common law[23]. Consequently, the positions of *mutawalli*, '*ulama* and *kadhi* were rendered redundant contributing to their alienation and loss of social, economic, spiritual and symbolic significance in the community in contrast to the sharp rising influence of the state.

The control of *waqf*s by the government, for instance, interfered with the economic mainstay of the Muslim education institutions like the *madrasas* (Quranic schools), *duksis* (elementary schools) and orphanages as revenues were used against designated causes denying them support[24]. The impact was, arguably, felt since the colonial times when the government entrusted the introduction and provision of formal education to Christian missionaries who pegged admission into the mission schools on baptism (Mwakimako 2007a; Loimeire 2007). This admission requirement kept Muslim children out of the Christian-based institutions missing out on formal education as the state dragged its feet in establishing limited, ill-equipped, racially based formal schools for Muslims[25]. The inadequate provision of formal education for

[23] *Waqfs* were also invalidated during the postcolonial period as a consequence of legal clashes between the Shari'a and Common Law. They include the *waqfs* of Rukiyabhai, Civil Suit no. 60 of 2006 in the High Court; Said bin Rashid al-Mandhry, Civil Suit no. 55 of 2011 in the High Court; and Athman bin Kombo bin Hassan, Civil Appeal no. 17 of 2014 in the High Court, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[24] Among *waqfs* designated for Muslim educational causes include those of Salim Mbaruk bin Dahman, (Takaungu, unmarked); Latifa bint Saleh bin Awadh, fols. 100-101; Rehema bint Ali, fol. 254; Ali bin Salim, fols. 94-95; Amria bint Ali bin Khamis, fol. 36; Seif bin Salim bin Khalfan el-Bu Sai'di, fols. 20-21, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[25] Among the few colonial government-sponsored racially-based schools were the Arab girls' school (currently Serani Secondary, Mombasa); the Arab boys' school (currently Khamis Secondary, Mombasa); the Indian school (currently

Muslims during the colonial period effectively set ground for their economic backwardness and political exclusion in the postcolonial times as they could not compete favorably against their compatriots in national politics, job placements and civil service appointments (McIntosh 2009; Ndzovu 2014).

On the other hand, the change of perception to land ownership from 'native reserves' to 'Crown lands', and the compulsory acquisition of land *waqf*s without compensation or misuse of their compensation bread a large population of squatters faced with dwindling socio-economic fortunes. This population of squatters rose sharply in the early 20th century following abolition of slavery by the colonial government without contingent plans like repatriation or resettlement (McIntosh 2009:28, 55-58; Patridge & Gillard 1995; Mwinyihaji 2014). Manumitted slaves were joined by the Swahili, a distinct Muslim Arabo-African progeny of the slaves and Arab merchants making a large indigenous population jobless, economically insecure, and without permanent residence.

With the apparent failure by postcolonial regimes to establish policies to help the indigenous population catch up with the rest of the upcountry in development as aptly illustrated in the National Housing and Population Census (2009)[26], locals were (still are) a disenfranchised lot suffering prolonged periods of political marginalization, economic exclusion, and exploitation. As Cooper (1980:293) observes, this made the predominantly Muslim indigenous population in the region 'less independent, less secure, and more exposed to the vagaries of markets and politics… [where] food shortages have become chronic … [and] wage labor is more often a necessity' (quoted in McIntosh 2009:29).

Owing to the imperial authority of the colonial government, however, the indigenous population could not question the secular policies that put them into subordination. Nonetheless, their efforts to reverse the situation and regain

Aldina Visram, Mombasa) and the African school (currently Ronald Ngala, Mombasa). Personal interview with *mua'lim* Yussuf Bakari Mwamzandi, Msambweni, November -December, 2014.

[26] See Kenya National Bureau of Statistics (KNB), National Population and Housing Census (2009), vol. 2. Available at: file:///C:/Users/USER/Downloads/Volume%202-Population%20and%20Household%20Distribution%20by%20Socio-Economic%20Characteristics%20(1).pdf. (Accessed April, 2016).

control and ownership of resources could aptly be described using the prism of 'symbolic (also ideological) resistance'. Scott (2009:34) explains symbolic resistance as 'the ordinary means of class struggle [and] techniques of first-resort in the common historical circumstances in which open defiance was impossible and entailed mortal danger'. To avoid notice and detection that could result into direct confrontation with authorities, subordinate communities often employ a wide range of '*infrapolitics*' like sabotage, desertion, withdrawal, and feigned ignorance to official demands (Scott 1985; 2009).

In the case of *waqf*s, symbolic resistance involved non-compliance with the imposed compulsory registration rule evident in the decline of number of registered *waqf*s in the WCK registry. Only seven *waqf*s (6.7%) were registered from 1940 to 1960, two decades before the end of colonial rule. Compared with 74 *waqf*s (71.2%) registered from 1910 to 1930 upon establishment of the WCK, this translates to 54.8% decline over an equal length of time[27]. Non-compliance with the compulsory registration rule as shown in the figures was, however, neither coordinated nor declared in the conventional sense of a resistance movement in the Muslim community. It became a conspicuous but effective means through which the community expressed its dissatisfaction with the state interference with *waqf*s, and more importantly reverse control and ownership of resources.

With the lack of political will during the postcolonial period to redress the colonial policies of subjugation, non-compliance with the compulsory registration rule went on unabated. Only 13 *waqf*s (12.5%) were registered from 1970s to 2000s. Moreover, from the 1980s following the expansion of the democratic space in the country, Muslims 'exited' from state controlled *waqf*s to uncontrolled charitable alternatives like *sadaqa*, *zakat*, private trusts and community based associations including Non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The Mazrui land *waqf* above that was revoked through government legislation but later restored by the court correctly fits this scenario. Upon restoration of the *waqf* land in 2012, the beneficiaries established a Mazrui community land trust 'for the sake of preservation into perpetuity of the assets and properties comprised in the 2, 716 acres of land in Takaungu'[28]. As

[27] Statistics drawn from 104 sampled *waqf* deeds during research, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[28] Clause 3 of the trust deed of the Mazrui Community Land Trust, WCK archive, Mombasa.

contained in the spirit of the trust deed, the Mazrui trust is a non-labelled *waqf* since it provides for administration of the property 'according to Islamic Shari'a law [and the] *waqf* land cannot be sold, but the benefit accruing thereof may be enjoyed, leased, transmitted and/or passed on to the next generation'[29]. However, by being designated as a 'trust', it technically became independent from the rigours of the WCK and, by extension, the political manoeuvring and direct control of the government.

The 'Trust of the Mosque of Msalani', established in 2011 by a self-appointed executive committee in defiance of the WCK, provides another illustration of Muslims' symbolic resistance to state control of *waqf*s. As legal administrators of the *masjid* upon inquiry and takeover, allegedly owing to lack of an established *mutawalli*, the WCK appointed a caretaker who was opposed by the executive committee, that defiantly established the 'Trust of the Mosque of Msalani' instead[30]. Were it not for the land title deed that the WCK used to petition the Registrar of Titles and the Land Registry not to recognize the mosque committee, this would have taken the *waqf* out of the mandate of the WCK. This is not to forget the innumerable orphanages, *masjids*, integrated schools, and *madrasas*, as well as health centers run by local committees and registered under various bodies (see also Mwakimako 2007b). The majority, if not all of these alternative charities, have capitalized on the principles of *waqf* to harness resources for the socio-cultural welfare of the Muslim community outside the purview of the WCK.

The Muslim Education and Welfare Association (MEWA) of Mombasa and Tawfiq Hospital in Malindi would suffice as further illustrations of charitable institutions that have benefited from the ideals of *waqf*. MEWA was founded in 1985 as a local initiative in response to the falling standards of formal education for Muslims in the town. The community pulled resources

[29] Clause 2(a) of the trust deed of the Mazrui Community Land Trust, WCK archive, Mombasa.

[30] The 'executive committee', led by Salim Awadh, wanted to be recognized as trustees instead of Khamis Omar Khamis (Shaibo) who had usurped the role of imam since the demise of the initial *mutawalli*. See copy of inquiry, March, 1976; Shaibo's correspondence with the WCK, March, 2000; WCK's letter of appointment to Shaibo, July, 2000; Awadh's correspondence with the WCK, May-July, 2001; the WCK's correspondence with the Registrar of Titles, January, 2003, WCK archive, Mombasa.

together to provide bursaries, educational materials, and partial scholarships for advancing students. In 1993, the project was registered as an NGO. It currently runs one of the most prestigious hospitals in the region offering health care at subsidized rates. It also offers educational services in the range of library facilities, career training, and Ramadan *iftar* portions to poor Muslims[31].

Tawfiq Hospital in Malindi, a brainchild of two local groups, Tawfiq Muslim Youths and Muslim Education and Development Association (MEDA) of Malindi, was similarly established in the 1990s to provide subsidized health care in an area long neglected by the government. The hospital currently operates with support from the local community, volunteers and a plethora of well wishers, both local and international including the Islamic Development Bank (IDB), World Assembly of Muslim Youths (WAMY), the International Islamic Relief Organization (IIRO), and the Islamic Foundation (Saudi Arabia). The hospital also runs a Ramadan *iftar* programme, *zakat al-fitri*, and organizes funerals for the poor, care for the elderly and orphans, and *da'wa* (Islamic proselytization) through a well established *masjid* within the hospital. Support from international bodies for these initiatives often comes in the name of Muslim charity and also caters for orphanages, integrated schools, mosques, and *madrasas*[32].

Clearly, Muslims were disenfranchised by the state interference of *waqf*s and their withdrawal to uncontrolled alternatives corroborates this narrative. The proliferation of private trusts among Muslims in Kenya, and their preference for un-controlled and decentralized charitable initiatives such as *sadaqa* and community associations that operate within *waqf* principles are forms of symbolic resistance to state interference with the institution of *waqf*. This should be understood from the point of view of the subordinate community as valuable but inconspicuous means to express dissatisfaction with secular state policies that seek to reverse control and ownership of economic, symbolic, and social privileges.

[31] Personal interviews with Muhammad Shalli, Mombasa, November 2015; Zubeir Hussein Noor, Mombasa, November, 2015. See also https://www.betterplace.org/en/organisations/10087-mewa-muslim-education-and-welfare-association. (Accessed July, 2017).

[32] Personal interviews with Ahmed Aboud Hadi, Malindi, November, 2015; Hamdoun, WCK agent, Malindi, November, 2015.

In the same vein, the proliferation of non-labelled *waqf*s could be viewed through the lenses of Islamic 'discursive tradition' – 'a tradition of Muslim discourse that addresses itself to conceptions of the Islamic past and future, with reference to a particular Islamic practice in the present' (Asad 2009:20). This concept seeks to explain Muslim institutions as lived and negotiated across the global '*umma* (community of believers), not as a fossilized set of rules unrelated to the beliefs and practices of the faithful and incompatible with contemporary realities, but as a progressive discourse that relates to the past and the future through a present. It is a fact that *waqf*s are not textually enshrined in the Qur'an. The institution is, however, attributed to some *hadiths* of the Prophet during the seventh century, (*i.e. past*) and grew progressively through assumed rigid legal forms before reaching its peak in the thirteenth century (Hennigan 2004). During the last decades of the twentieth century, *waqf*s adopted internal regulation mechanisms against earlier operational and jurisprudential rigidity transforming to a modern institution capable of responding to challenges and demands in relation to charity and wealth distribution in the society (Kuran 2001), (*i.e. present*), and more significantly, as a religious practice meant for the attainment of *sawab* for the spiritual afterlife (*i.e. future*).

True to this point of view, the development of *waqf*s since inception in the seventh century assumed different faces at various epochs in response to local customs and needs, causing it to be lived and mediated in varied ways across the Muslim world. After suffering setbacks and near collapse between the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, several Muslim communities have, since the last decades of the twentieth century, established new policies and institutions to reinvigorate *waqf*s (Kahf 2003; Siraj & Hilary 2006; Dafterdar & Cizakca 2013). Transnational organizations inspired by the rise of civil society in Islam, including the subsidiaries of the IDB - the World *Waqf* Foundation [WWF] and the *Awqaf* Properties Investment Fund [APIF], IIRO, Islamic Relief (IR, UK), and WAMY, are at the forefront in re-inventing *waqf*s within corporate frameworks and re-interpreting theological principles that arguably held back the growth of the institution in the past. This explains their involvement in international socio-cultural welfare in the name of Muslim charities. These organizations encourage Muslims to make voluntary contributions towards specific initiatives in the form of *waqf* shares and certificates, which are pooled together and channeled to particular areas of need in the global Muslim *umma*. All these could readily find parallel in the

uncontrolled alternative charities among Muslims in Kenya as discussed above. The resultant effect is the according of a measure of independence and control of resources and the practice of a religious institution by the Muslim community in a secular state milieu.

In conclusion, the proliferation of charitable trusts; preference to uncontrolled and uncoordinated charitable initiatives like *sadaqa*, *zakat*; community associations evident in the cases of MEWA and Tawfiq Hospitals, and non-compliance with compulsory registration rule on *waqf*s should be understood within the lenses of symbolic resistance against state control of the institution in Kenya. These were (still are) valuable but inconspicuous means of expressing dissatisfaction with secular state policies on *waqf*s seeking to re-establish control over economic, symbolic, and social capital. As observed by Scott (2012:7-8), 'such petty acts of insubordination typically make no headlines. But as just millions of entozoan polyps create, willy-nilly, a coral reef, so do thousands acts of insubordination and evasion creates an economic or political barrier reef of their own'. In the same way, non-registration of *waqf*s with the WCK and preference to uncontrolled and uncoordinated charitable initiatives by the Muslim community in the country ordinarily pass unnoticed to deny the secular state the much needed control of the socio-economic and symbolic power espoused by *waqf*s.

Conclusion

Waqf is one of the oldest institutions with wide impact in the socio-economic and cultural fabric of a community in Islam. Establishing *waqf* is a religious undertaking involving the endower's demonstration of piety to the creator while at the same time showing responsibility to the community. It takes cognizance of the beneficiaries' role in appreciating the endower for understanding their socio-economic plight; the place of the '*ulama* in interpreting and guiding the endower in living to the Shari'a of consecration to the later; the position of the *mutawalli* in helping the endower fulfill the designated causes; and the political leader, if necessary, not only to establish *waqf* as part of his show of piety and social responsibility, but also to provide a conducive environment where endowers would fulfill their spiritual and social wishes. This is a complex socio-cultural mosaic that touches every aspect of the community, particularly where life is perceived as one in totality.

However, majority of political establishments, as evident in the colonial and postcolonial regimes in Kenya, did not acknowledge the complexity of *waqf*s choosing to perceive the institution exclusively in economic terms. Regulating the institution, especially using secular policies and civil institutions for political and economic expedience, therefore, disregards the various facets causing disequilibrium in the socio-economic and cultural well-being of the society. It is this disenfranchisement that occasionally pushes beneficiaries to seek for alternatives within the confines of Shari'a, not only to reverse control and ownership of resources, but also fulfill the religious requirement of charity. This is more pronounced, especially where Muslims constitute a minority marginalized population with religious institutions subjected to secular policies and civil institutions.

Reference

Al-Mazru'i, K. 2004. *Memorandum to the Commission of Inquiry into Illegal/ Irregular Allocation of Public Land.* Mombasa: WCK Archive.

Anderson, J. 2008. *Islamic Law in Africa*. New York: Routledge.

Asad, T. 2009. The Idea of an Anthropology of Islam. *Qui Parle* 17, 2: 1–30.

Banday, B. 2013. *Administration of Wakfs: Law and Practice in Kashmir*. New Delhi: Dilpreer Publishing House.

Bang, A. 2001. Intellectuals and Civil Servants: Early 20th Century Zanzibar '*ᶜUlama*' and the Colonial State. In Amoretti, S. (ed.): *Islam in East Africa*: *New Sources*. Roma: Herder Editrice E. Libreria.

Barnes, J. 1986. *An Introduction to Religious Foundations in the Ottoman Empire*. Leiden: Brill.

Berg-Schlosser, D. 1984. *Tradition and Change in Kenya: A Comparative Analysis of Seven Major Ethnic Groups*. München: Ferdinand Schöningh.

Bourdieu, P. 1985. The Genesis of the Concepts of Habitus and of Field. *Sociocriticism* 2: 11–24.

Bourdieu, P. 1986. Forms of Capital. In Richardson, J. (ed.): *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*. New York: Greenwood Press.

Bourdieu, P. 1990. *The Logic of Practice*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. & L. Wacquant. 2004. Symbolic Violence. In Bourgois P. & N. Scheper-Hughes (eds.): *Violence in War and Peace: An Anthology*. Carl-

ton: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.

Burr, M., & R. Collins. 2006. *Alms for Jihad: Charity and Terrorism in the Islamic World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Carmichael, T. 1997. British 'Practice' Towards Islam in the East Africa Protectorate: Muslim Officials, *Waqf* Administration, and Secular Education in Mombasa and Environs, 1895-1920. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 17, 2: 293–309.

Cattan, H. 1984. The Law of *Waqf*. In Khadduri M. & H. Liebesny (eds.): *Law in the Middle East: Origin and Development of Islamic Law*. Washington: The Middle East Institute.

Dafterdar, M. & M. Cizakca (eds.) 2013. The Role of *Awqaf* in the 21st Century: An Update on the Development of Islamic Foundations. Berlin: Maecenata Institut, 1-37. Available at www.maecenata.eu/english.

Deguilhem, R. 2008. The *Waqf* in the City. In Jayyusi, S. (ed.): *The City in the Islamic World.* Volume 2. Leiden: Brill.

Eliot, C. 1996. *The East Africa Protectorate.* London: Frank Cass and Company Limited.

Fair, L. 2001. *Pastimes and Politics: Culture, Community, and Identity in Post-Abolition Urban Zanzibar, 1890-1945*. Athens: Ohio University Press.

Government Printers, Kenya. National Museums and Heritage Act, Chapter 216 (Revised 2012). Available at: file:///C:/Users/USER/Downloads/National MuseumsandHeritageAct6of2006.pdf.

Government Printers, Kenya. The Land Acquisition Act, Chapter 295. Revised 2010. Available at: http://kenyalaw.org/kl/fileadmin/pdfdownloads/Acts/LandAcquisitionCap295.pdf.

Government Printers, Kenya. The Mazrui Lands Trust Act, Cap 289. Revised 1989. Available at: www.kenyalaw.org.

Government Printers, Kenya. *Wakf* Commissioners Act, 1951. Revised 1981, 2010. Available at: www.kenyalawresourcecenter.org/2011/07/waqf-wakf. html.

Hailey, W. 1979. *Native Administration in the British African Territories*. London: His Majesty's Stationery Office.

Hashim, A. 2005. Servants of *Sharia: Qadis* and the Politics of Accommodation in East Africa. *Sudanic Africa* 16, 27–51. Available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/25653424.

Hashim, A. 2010. Coping with Conflicts: Colonial Policy towards Muslim Personal Law in Kenya and Post-Colonial Court Practice. In Jeppie, S., E.

Moosa & R. Roberts (eds.): *Muslim Family Law in Sub-Saharan Africa: Colonial Legacies and Post-Colonial Challenges*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Hennigan, P. 2004. *The Birth of a Legal Institution: The Formation of the Waqf in Third-Century A.H. Hanafi Legal Discourse*. Leiden: Brill.

Hoexter, M. 1995. *Huquq* Allah and *Huquq al-Ibad* as Reflected in the *Waqf* Institution. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 19: 133-156.

Kahf, M. 2003. The Role of *Waqf* in Improving the *Ummah* Welfare. International Conference on *Waqf* as a Legal Private Body. Medan: The Islamic University of North Sumatra.

Kenya National Archives (KNA) 1941. Mazrui Lands Reserves. Nairobi: KNA/PC/COAST/1/11/41.

Kenya National Bureau of Statistics (KNB) 2009. National Population and Housing Census. Volume 2. Available at: file:///C:/Users/USER/Downloads/ Volume%202-Population%20and%20Household%20Distribution%20by %20Socio-Economic%20Characteristics%20(1).pdf.

Khan, M. 1979. *The Translation of the Meanings of Sahih al-Bukhari: Arabic-English.* Volumes 2, 3, 4, & 8. Lahore: Kazi Publications.

Kozlowski, G. 2008. *Muslim Endowments and Society in British India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kuran, T. 2001. The Provision of Public Goods under Islamic Law: Origins, Impact, and Limitations of the *Waqf* System. *Law & Society Review* 35, 4: 841–898.

Lahsasna, A. 2014. *Shari*ᶜ*ah Non-compliance Risk Management and Legal Documentations in Islamic Finance.* Singapore: John Wiley & Sons Singapore Pte. Ltd.

Layish, A. 1997. The Family *Waqf* and the Shariᶜa Law of Succession in Modern Times. *Islamic Law and Society* 4, 3: 352–388.

Loimeier, R. 2007. Perceptions of Marginalization: Muslims in Contemporary Tanzania. In Soares B. & R. Otayek (eds.): *Islam and Muslim Politics in Africa*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Mahr, C., R. Harker., & C. Wilkes. (1990). The Basic Theoretical Position. In Harker, R., C. Mahr, & C. Wilkes (eds.): *An Introduction to the Work of Pierre Bourdieu*. London: Macmillan Press Ltd.

Makdisi, G. 1981. *The Rise of Colleges: Institutions of Learning in Islam and the West*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

McIntosh, J. 2009. *The Edge of Islam: Power, Personhood, and Ethno-relig-*

ious Boundaries on the Kenya Coast. London: Duke University Press.

Medici, A. 2011. *Waqfs* of Cyrenaica and Italian Colonialism in Libya (1911-41). In Pascale, G. (ed.): *Held in Trust: Waqf in the Islamic World*. Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press.

Mwakimako, H. 2007a. Christian-Muslim Relations in Kenya: A Catalogue of Events and Meanings. *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 18, 2: 287-307.

Mwakimako, H. 2007b. *Mosques in Kenya: Muslim Opinions on Religion, Politics and Development.* Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag.

Mwakimako, H. 2011. The Historical Development of Muslim Courts: The *Kadhi*, *Mudir* and *Liwali* Courts and Civil Procedure and Criminal Procedure Ordinance, c. 1963. *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 5, 2: 329–343.

Mwinyihaji, E. 2014. Necessity Removes Restrictions: Swahili Muslim Women's Perspectives on their Participation in the Public Sphere. In Chesworth, J. & F. Kogelmann (eds.): *Shari^{c}a in Africa Today: Reactions and Responses*. Leiden: Brill.

Ndzovu, H. 2014. *Muslims in Kenyan Politics: Political Involvement, Marginalization, and Minority Status.* Evanston, Illinois: Northwestern University Press.

Nicolini, B. 2014. Notes on Asian Presence along the Swahili Coast during the Nineteenth Century. *Quaderni Asiatici* 107 (September): 61–86. Available at: http://publicatt.unicatt.it/bitstream/10807/59896/1/Nicolini 2014.pdf.

Oded, A. 2000. Islam and Politics in Kenya. London: Lynne Reinner Publishers.

Oberauer, N. 2008. 'Fantastic Charities': The Transformation of *Waqf* Practices in Colonial Zanzibar. *Islamic Law and Society* 15, 3: 315–370.

Partridge, M. & D. Gillard. (eds.) 1995. *British Documents on Foreign Affairs: Reports and Papers from the Foreign Office Confidential Print. British Africa, 1887-1905*. Volume 17. New York: University Publications of America.

Pouwels, R. 1987. *Horn and Crescent: Cultural Change and Traditional Islam on the East African Coast, 800-1900.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Powers, D. 1989. Orientalism, Colonialism, and Legal History: The Attack on Muslim Family Endowments in Algeria and India. *Comparative Studies*

in Society & History 31, 3: 535 -571.
Powers, D. 2011. *The Development of Islamic Law and Society in the Maghrib: Qadis, Muftis and Family Law.* Burlington: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.
Reiter, Y. 1996. *Islamic Endowments in Jerusalem under British Mandate*. London: Frank Cass and Company Limited.
Sanjuan, A. 2007. *Till God Inherits the Earth: Islamic Pious Endowments in al-Andalus* (*9-15th Centuries*). Leiden: Brill.
Schacht, J. 1982. *An Introduction to Islamic Law*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
Scott, J. 1985. *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance.* London: Yale University Press.
Scott, J. 2009. *The Art of not being Governed: An Anarchist History of Upland South East Asia*. London: Yale University Press.
Scott, J. 2012. *Two Cheers for Anarchism*. Oxford: Princeton University Press.
Siraj, S. & L. Hilary. 2006. *Land, Law and Islam. Property and Human Rights in the Muslim World.* London: Zed Books.
Sperling, D. 1988. *The Growth of Islam among the Mijikenda of the Kenya Coast, 1826-1933.* London: University of London, School of African and Oriental Studies.
Stockreiter, E. 2010. 'British *Kadhis*' and 'Muslim Judges': Modernization, Inconsistencies and Accommodation in Zanzibar's Colonial Judiciary. *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 4, 3: 560–576. Available at: http:// www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/17531055.2010.517423.
Stockreiter, E. 2015. *Islamic Law, Gender, and Social Change in Post-Abolition Zanzibar*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Van Leeuwen, R. 1999. *Waqfs and Urban Structures: The Case of Ottoman Damascus*. Leiden: Brill.

Suleiman Chembea (PhD)
Bayreuth International Graduate School of African Studies (BIGSAS),
Kenya-German Postgraduate Training Programme [50085235]
University of Bayreuth
Germany
chembea.suleiman@uni-bayreuth.de

Ecclesial Leadership and Social Responsibility within the African Context of Economic Injustice

Roderick R Hewitt[1]

Abstract

This article explores the phenomenon of ecclesial leadership and its relationship with social responsibility within the Sub-Saharan African context where many nations are experiencing economic injustices. It argues that failure to adequately engage with the neo-liberal economic order has resulted in ecclesial leadership that is increasingly losing public trust as perceptions of the leaders and the offices that they control are being corrupted by their insatiable appetite for financial greed. Contemporary ecclesial leaderships are caught in an ethical conundrum through their inability to missionally negotiate the spiritually disarming, attractive and additive lure of the ideologies of neoliberalism and neo-conservatism that are weakening the effectiveness of religious leaders who are easily entrapped because of their 'love of money'. Their inability to exercise critical distance from the infectious and addictive lure of greed has compromised the authenticity of their integrity and the witness of the church's mission in the world to be in solidarity with people that live on the margins of society (Keum 2012:14-16). The fall in ecclesial standards of leadership in exercising authentic social responsibility within communities of oppressed peoples living on the margins has now placed the need for ethical formation at the centre of ecclesial leadership within the African context. The fast growth in urbanization with millions of Africans being attracted to cities for work, study and living, has led to the rise of many

[1] Roderick R Hewitt (PhD) is Professor in the Systematic Theology discipline, School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics. He serves the institution as the Academic Leader for Research and Higher Degrees.

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a5

independent charismatic/ Pentecostal communities led by self-styled charismatic 'Prophets', 'Apostles' 'Bishops' and 'Pastors'. They operate an all-inclusive ecclesial business with vast budgets within the communities of the poor that are experiencing socio-economic injustices that are fallouts from the neo-liberal economic policies that have been and continue to be adopted by their governments. The article concludes that the ethical formation that is needed to address the lack of credibility and public trust of ecclesial leadership serving communities experiencing socio-economic injustices necessitates, in Christian context, radical reformation in which leaders rediscover what Orbery Hendricks describes as 'the politics of Jesus'. Christian leaders need to rediscover the true revolutionary nature of the historical Jesus' teachings and practices (2006:5-10). Within the African context it will necessitate engaging in a spirituality of resistance against life life-denying forces of neo-liberal greed, and to do justice as a matter of faith confession and praxis. This would mean that African ecclesial leaders would embrace matters of economic and environmental justice, which are not only social, political, and moral issues but at the core, a matter of confessing the Christian faith (The Accra Confession 2004).

Keywords: ecclesial leadership, neo-liberalism, social responsibility, social cohesion, spirituality, economic injustice

Introduction

Christianity function as the dominant religion in many nations of Sub-Saharan Africa. In Zambia the government changed the constitution to declare Zambia to be 'a Christian nation' (Kaunda 2017). In this era of African political discourse, many states are encountering economic instability that is having negative impacts on social cohesion. Africa fits into the landscape of what is classified as the 'Global South', a term that describes how developing economies, most of which are in the Southern hemisphere[2], are coping with the onslaught of the socio-economic impact of globalization (Boesak & Hansen 2009:59-72). New Zealand and Australia are the only two nations in the South that economically belong to the global North!

[2] I.e. with the two exceptions of the economies of Australia and New Zealand.

The liberation movements that fought against colonial governance of their nation eventually evolved into political parties that formed the government of their newly independent nation. However their success in defeating colonialism was not transferred into offering good governance. The promise of 'better life for all' has in many cases become an 'an own goal' in underdevelopment in which some states have become poorer since independence through increasing 'erosion of democracy', 'social polarization', political and economic instability (Boesak & Hansen 2009:23-25)

The contemporary socio-economic landscape of these African nations is characterized by a hybrid neo-liberal economic model[3] where transnational companies are given freedom to plunder the limited resources seeking raw materials and in so doing severely damaging the environment. Environmental degradation is accompanied by soil erosion, deforestation, climate change, drought, flood, disappearing of fish stocks and fresh water. The social consequences of such environmental changes have resulted in significant disruption and decline of social cohesion in many communities leaving increasing number of people living on the margins.

With political independence, many African nations welcomed nationalistic forms of governments that advocated a socialist model of economic development. However, their dream of having a sustained and growing economy that could respond to the needs of their growing population was short lived. International market forces exploited their vulnerable economy plus local factor of corruption and inefficiencies made the economies non-competitive at the global market place. The failure to generate sufficient funds to meet their budgetary needs as young nations, meant that borrowing to supplement the budget came from external sources at rate of interests and it so doing, the local currencies were severely devalued. The unbalanced development of the economy that favoured some sections of industry while impacting negatively on other areas, created increasing poverty levels, especially in many of the big cities of the African continent with tens of million in population.

Poor quality of governance therefore constitutes a burning issue in

[3] In the Accra confession of 2004, neo-liberalism: 'refers to a political-economic philosophy that de-emphasizes or rejects government or other intervention in the economy; it would allow the market to operate without restraints or protections'.

many countries of the Global South. The paradox is that the political movements of liberation have won electoral victory of the political left controlling government but the economic power has remained with the political right and their (neo-liberal economic policies) that offer a 'democracy' that produces progressive poverty, high inequalities and exclusion for the common people. Democracy in the contemporary neoliberal model functions like a bubble in a very delicate state of existence that can easily burst and have its life-sustaining contents spilt (Hewitt 2014: 1-3) The economy of these nations function under many regulations (red-tapes) that fosters corruption rather than honest and open competition. The highly indebted economies thrive on unfettered consumerism rather than indigenous built industries that use local resources. The acute pyramid-like structures of the economic make little or no room for social obligation that protects the poor and the weak. The processes of economic growth and wealth accumulation for the few takes priority over the welfare of the common good of the people.

In addition the current world economic disorder according to the 2004 Accra Confession statement demands great urgency because global economic injustice and ecological destruction that is *'imposed by global neoliberal capitalism and any other economic system, including absolute planned economies, which defy God's covenant by excluding the poor, the vulnerable and the whole of creation from the fullness of life*' (The Accra Confession: para 18-29)

Evans (2005:197) has argued that *'liberalism preaches the false universalism of 'free trade' for all, while, in reality, the contemporary neoliberal trading system does not even offer the South a level playing field'*. Therefore, internal (national) incompetence, inefficiencies and corruption mixed with external (imperial) financial assault through globalization on the African economies have destroyed millions of lives.

It is into this socio-economic landscape that ecclesial leadership within the diverse African context operates. The colonial environment in which ecclesial leadership was first introduced and developed sought to serve the people in contexts where their strategic partnerships with governments resulted in many social services such as schools, health services and in some cases agriculture and community development projects being delegated to the mission churches as first responders. However, with the departure of most European missionaries from the leadership of the local churches after independence their absence also contributed to the decline of external financial

resources for the support of the many social services that were handed over to the churches. Furthermore the newly independent states being overwhelmed with diverse demands on the national budget were unable allocate the needed financial resources support many of their institutions. Many of the former mission Churches that became 'independent' from their European sponsored Churches also failed to generate sufficient resources to maintain and further develop their inherited social welfare institutions such as schools and hospitals. In the end some were handed over to the state, others closed and a few continue to function as missional expressions of the churches.

The most pressing threat to life in many of the African countries are linked to the growing scandalous gulf of inequality between the minority economically empowered class and the economically dispossessed that is creating a fearful reaction resulting in social dislocation, collective mutiny/rebellion by desperate people crying out for justice.[4] In certain part of countries such as Northern Nigeria, South Sudan, Eritrea and Somalia are engaged in civil conflict that involved terror groups that transcends national boundaries and they serve as a magnet for the toxic mixtures of de-humanizing forces that feed on unresolved ethnic, religious, political and economic tensions. Rogue political and in some cases religious leaders have put their egos ahead of the interest of their people to exploit the unstable and fearful environment to ensure their hold on political power. Democracy in such contexts exists as a commodity to be captured and sold to the highest bidder.

All of this is happening within a global context of rapid technological changes in which the social media are creating shocks in different sectors of life that is pushing everyone to live life in the fast lane, and build their physical and emotional health on a diet of instant products. This new mode of living is identified as being in a 'liquid or plastics state' because life becomes,

[4] Tracing the process how poverty and inequality evolved within South Africa, Julian May POVERTY AND INEQUALITY IN SOUTH AFRICA, Centre for Social and Development Studies, University of Natal, http://s3.amazonaws.com/academia.edu.documents/31219257/presentation.pdf?AWSAccessKeyId=AKIAJ56TQJRTWSMTNPEA&Expires=1470738511&Signature=WZ2sAk1%2FmNFMBlJB01%2BQg1CB0sw%3D&response-content-disposition=inline%3B%20filename%3DPoverty_and_inequality_in_South_Africa.pdf. (Accessed on 09 August 2016.)

> shapelessly shifting as each disruptive innovation or abandoned certitude outstrips whatever fleeting sense of meaning was only recently embraced. A kind of foreboding of the times that have not yet arrived, a wariness about what's next, settles in (Gardel 2016)

Ecclesial leadership

Ecclesial leadership have historically played an important role in the development of African nations. Their role at this juncture when many states are encountering socio-political and economic raid unpredictable changes has posed important questions about the quality of leadership formation that is serving many African churches and the societies in which they serve. New attitudes and skills are needed especially in African societies where traditional leadership of the Elders is still the cultural norm. This article redefines ecclesial leadership as a complex phenomenon because of its symbiotic relationship between the secular and the spiritual world (Gibbs 2005:17).

Robert Banks and Bernice Ledbetter (2004:26-27) state that leadership,

> involves a person, group, or organization who shows the way in an area of life - whether in the short- or the long-term - and in doing so both influences and empowers enough people to bring about change in the area.

However, leadership does not function in isolation but in relation with a team. One of the sad features of contemporary ecclesial leadership is the perception of the public that its mode of operation is domineering and prestige seeking rather than being servant leadership modelled on the life and work of the historical Jesus who came *'not to be served but to serve'* (Mark 10:45)[5].

[5] Vis-à-vis the liberal-historicist nineteenth and twentieth century interpretations of the inquiry into the historical Jesus, there is a new emerging consensus among socio-cultural historians of Jesus as historical figure, *viz*., that Jesus was indeed a Jewish prophetic and wisdom, servant-leader, that proclaimed the coming of the rule/ Kingdom of God, the renewal of the covenant community promised to Israel in the Jewish Scriptures, and the calling of Israel to repentance, in Jewish-apocalyptic context. This picture is

According to Gibbs, ecclesial leadership must be shaped by context because different situations require distinctive forms of leadership gifts, endowed with character, charisma and competence (2005:27). To these I would also add, commitment, compassionate and consistent. A paradigm shift in ecclesial leadership matrix is overdue in this age that counter the addition to the 'lone ranger' and individual 'messiah complex' model that is popularised in many areas of contemporary African ecclesial leadership.

The Changing Landscape of African Christianity

African ecclesial leadership is serving in a postmodern context in which the landscape of global Christianity is radically changing. The World Council of Churches (WCC) 2013 Mission statement, 'Together Towards Life' (Keum 2013:5-6) identified the following shifts in the global changing landscape of Christianity since the 1980s, brought on by global forces of change,

- Majority of Christians either are living or have their origins in the global South and East;
- Migration has become a worldwide, multi-directional phenomenon which is reshaping the Christian landscape;
- The emergence of strong Pentecostal and charismatic movements from different localities is one of the most noteworthy characteristics of world Christianity today;
- people at the margins are claiming their key role as agents of mission and affirming mission as transformation;

---

very much correctly represented by the Gospel of Mark and Q (as represented, especially in the Gospel of Luke, but also Matthew). As is evident from these texts, the historical Jesus also operated in primarily rural Galilean, agricultural and fishing village context, and not in the two or three bigger Galilean cities. For this emerging consensus, cf. Crossan ([1991] 2010); Collins (2000); Horsley ([1997] 2002. 2001; 2008); Freyne (2004); Draper and Horsley in Horsley (2006); and Fiensy & Hawkins (2013). For an economic perspective, cf. Horsley (2009; and 2015) and the chapters in Fiensy & Hawkins (2013); and an integrative perspective, Horsley (2008). For the social-historical positioning of Jesus within the first century Christian movement, cf. also Stegemann and Stegemann (1999).

- The church lives in multi-religious and multi-cultural contexts and new communication technology is also bringing the people of the world into a greater awareness of one another's identities and pursuits.

These forces are also impacting on the development of Christianity within Africa. The global technocratic culture that is transported by economic globalisation is creating upheavals in all forms of traditional institutional arrangements of pedagogy and governance, whether they are religious, political or socio-economic. Institutional leaderships offered by schools, churches, political parties and security forces are increasing losing public trust and support.

The neo-liberal economic order with its *laissez faire* approach to life that accompanies the democratic ordering of society especially in the West has resulted in religious expressions and organizations operate without much government or legal controls. Contemporary society has seen a mushrooming of diverse charismatic personalities forming their 'own churches'. This type of populist brand of Christianity has been classified as the 'prosperity gospel' that adopt a kind of '*mallification of the church*'[6] in which everything done is for profit. The Lausanne Theology Working Group has defined Prosperity Gospel as, *'the teaching that believers have a right to the blessings of health and wealth and that they can obtain these blessings through positive confessions of faith and the 'sowing of seeds' through the faithful payments of tithes and offerings'*[7]. This relationship between faith and economic prosperity has resulted in a type of pornification of Christianity especially by leaders with an appetite for greed and the gratification of desire (Hewitt 2017:5). This commodification of the Christian faith by some ecclesial leaders has resulted in the power of money being used to buy 'miraculous healing' and so giving increased 'faith benefits to those with greater financial resources to reward the leader.

The 21st century has seen the *'ascendancy of moral lowlifes'* as the

[6] This coined term 'mallification' refers to the emerging architectural design of mega churches that are designed to look like shopping malls where they offer 'all in on services': worship centre, entertainment facilities, health centres, restaurants, gyms and end education institutions.

[7] The Lausanne Theology Working Group, Statement on the Prosperity Gospel 2010, https://www.lausanne.org/content/a-statement-on-the-prosperity-gospel

standard of leadership in many of institutions of governance (Hewitt: 2010). The perennial temptations of avarice and abuse of power and privileges by leaders has become toxic and destroying public trust in national leaders. Even among sections of the Church in Africa some of the leaders have succumbed to embracing a prosperity priority gospel built on greed and deception that appeals to the gullible crowd seeking instant health and wealth benefits from the miraculous religious leader. The bad media reports on institutional models of leadership have not escaped the ecclesial community. The questions that they asked are generally linked to the quality of leadership that is being offered to the society. Untrustworthy ecclesial leadership has been reported preying on the vulnerable and fleecing them of the little financial resources of the poor with promises of them receiving a miracle. Indeed, the trustworthy index of the clergy in some countries is declining and is viewed alongside the low trust that people have of politicians. Although in many African communities, the pastor is still regarded as a revered elder who must be treated with great cultural respect, the trust index at the national levels in much lower. In a generally declining economic environment of being experience by many countries, the religious sector is still a major significant growth industry as entrepreneurs actively invest in multi-media mass religious gatherings that are later established as profit-making businesses. This article therefore argues that the quality spirituality that informs such ecclesial leadership is ethically flawed and missional lacking in the politics of Jesus' servant leadership that Hendricks (2006: 99-190) describes as, 'treat people's needs as holy', 'give voice to the voiceless', 'expose the workings of oppression', 'call the demons by name', 'saves his anger for the mistreatment of others' 'take blows without returning them' and 'Don't just explain the alternative, show it'.

New African Ecclesial Leadership for Changing Times

Therefore, what is indispensable for ecclesial spiritual leadership to be authentic in contexts of political and economic injustice and environmental threats to life is an urgent need for radical ethical reformation that embraces social responsibility. This kind of spiritual leadership must be theological informed by an enlightened missional understanding of the connectivity between poverty, wealth and ecology, the three inescapable determinants of people's wellbeing in their communities (Mshana 2012: 7-11).

If the example of the historical Jesus's servant leadership is the model for all ecclesial leaders then their contemporary engagement in context of economic injustices cannot be a matter of dominion and lordship over others but of self –emptying (*kenosis*) spirituality. It is in this area that African ecclesial leaders should be learning from their local communities that put emphasis on traditional cultural and religious heritages of *Ubuntu* (I am because we are) /*uzima* (life in wholeness)/ *ujamaa* (humaneness) and *baraza* (consultative decision-making) that put a premium on the relational dimension of life (Mshana 2012:12). The African traditional way of life also requires authentic spiritualty that builds just social relationships for the wellbeing of a community. A return to this fundamental way of life constitutes one of the most urgent challenges facing African leadership. They must choose the unpopular option of embodying a spirituality that works towards the common good of all creation instead of surrendering to the selfish competitive forces that reward the greed of a few at the expense of the many who are usually poor. A radical re-appropriation of the God of life is needed in the contemporary era where expressions of faith have become commodified and packaged and sold to the global market place like designer drugs.

Theosis Spirituality for Social Responsibility

For African ecclesial leaders to be genuinely transformed to greater social responsibility within their context of economic injustices and environmental degradation, then, according to Michael Gorman (2015:1-20), they must radically embrace *'Becoming the Gospel'* in order to genuinely transform lives and the socioeconomic and the environmental context in which many people on the margins within the nations of Africa live. Theologically this kind of lifestyle can be described as embracing a spirituality of *theosis*. According to Gorman, in Christianity, 'the telos is about Divine intention and action, human transformation, and the telos of human existence - union with God (2004:5). The core focus of *theosis* is on becoming like and imitating the nature of God seen in the example of the historical Jesus, the teacher who has set the standard for a spiritual lifestyle. It involves transformative actions of participation in the life and character of the God of life as reflected in the Jesus ministry and mission (2015: 26-32). This means that the spirituality formation of church leaders for social transformation and social responsibility can only be

effectively formed through risk taking participation in the mission of God (*missio Dei*), who, according to the Judeo-Christian scriptures, is on a mission to liberate humanity and the entire cosmos (2015: 24-25).

Therefore the important challenge that ecclesial leaders within sub-Saharan Africa face is how best to live out responsible citizenship within the communities that they serve and also to become immerse into the praxis of *becoming the gospel* and to live it out in ways that can facilitate social responsibility within a climate of economic injustice. The concern is not so much about the status of the profession but the character of the leadership practitioners. Indeed, it could also be argued that the dilemma of trust that is facing many African churches is generated not only in the life style of the leaders but in their archaic undemocratic and unaccountable systems of governance that alienate and exclude stake holders from full participation in the important matters that affect their lives and work. The leaders offer words without life that are often used to wheel power and rule over others rather than to build life-affirming communities that love and forgive one another.

Spirituality for Resistance: Do Justice! Love Mercy! Walk Humble!

Pat Sheerattah-Bisnauth argues spirituality constitutes an indispensable resource that ultimately transforms the individual from being possessed with selfish agendas to focusing on the common good of the entire community (2009). There is no academic consensus on what exactly 'spirituality' really mean because of the vagueness in certain aspects of its identity. However, it remains a reality that is acknowledged and experienced in every human community as they seek for deeper meaning and purpose to the challenges of life (Hewitt 2014:1). It can therefore be argued that all institutional systems of belief 'sustain their identity, vocation and witness through an embedded spirituality that is not a fixed concept, but dynamic in that it is always transforming reality by embracing and relinquishing people's allegiance from time to time. It has to do with how we are being grasped by reality when we are in a liminal space' (Hewitt 2014:1). Spirituality is therefore an innate and intangible life-sustaining reality that communicates the quality, condition or uniqueness of one's identity. Whereas all religions possess different forms of spirituality, within the Christian religion, spirituality is focused on lifestyles

that demonstrate sacredness or holiness, mysticism and devoutness in order to achieve a specific purpose.

Konrad Raiser (Mshana 2004: 5) poses this pertinent question: What does spirituality have to do with wealth creation, economic globalization or the commodification of public goods'? In response, Raiser argues that the changing landscape has led to great understanding that spirituality cannot be restricted to the private sphere of life but must also engage with the public including financial and economic system (2004: 5). Therefore the traditional definition of spirituality that ecclesial leaders embrace tends to be linked to a lifestyle of prayer, fasting, contemplation and 'waiting upon God'. However in addition to this lifestyle which in monastic tradition is accompanied by vows of poverty, chastity and obedience, contemporary ecumenical focus on spirituality expands the understand to include struggles for justice and human dignity (2004:7). If then spirituality is about the struggle for life then authentic struggle embraces the mode of resistance …saying no to death-dealing powers and yes to Good's power for fullness of life.

Spirituality for Economic Justice

It is into this understanding of spirituality that one locates the imperative of the social responsibility challenges facing African ecclesial leaders.

> If any want to become my followers, let them deny themselves and take up their cross and follow me. For those who want to save their life will lose it, and those who lose their life for my sake, and for the sake of the gospel, will save it (Mark 8:34-35).

'Cross bearing' has become a vital ingredient for spirituality formation of church leaders. Cross bearing is usually associated with a willingness to suffer and risk one's personal freedom for the sake of truth and justice that will give others freedom (Mark 16:24). This sacrificial way of living becomes a powerful spiritual resource to fight against the imperial demonic systems of life denying powers in our contemporary world. A perquisite that informs the spirituality formation of leaders is the experience of demonstrating the power of prayer in the challenge of living out the Christian life in difficult socio-political contexts. Another necessary character trait for authentic spiritual leadershipis the rejection of the infectious virus of greed and embracing a

discipline life of self-control. This kind of lifestyle is urgently needed in the contemporary era where the tempting advertisements snares of the consumerist society of the global marketplace places value on acquiring material goods rather than caring for the wellbeing of people. Many African nations are increasingly becoming unstable because their leaders within the private and public sector have failed the citizens because of their corrupt behaviour. Political and economic corruption had become so endemic within the society that only radical surgery could address the systemic problem that necessitates enforcement of just laws that hold corrupt officials accountable and be fully punished by the judiciary process. Spirituality within the African context that is effective must therefore equip church leaders for life-giving transformative social relationship engagement and not to cut them off from the communities that they are serving. This spirituality must empower leaders to participate in the people's struggle for political and economic justice. Such a spirituality may equip a lifestyle that engenders fidelity to the practice of high moral standards in its political and economic ethic.

If African leaders are to take seriously their calling to provide leadership to the life denying contextual challenges facing the lives of ordinary people and the wider nation, then a mature and effective spirituality is needed at every level of their identity, vocation and witness that is oriented towards the building of wholesome and just social relationships. This model of spiritual engagement is fashioned on the notion that as the leader grows deeper with (imitating) Christ and is therefore equip for bold risk taking life-giving service. The tensions between the potential and the frailty of being a leader are real and it is therefore easy for leaders to wear mask or put their lives in compartments to hide their real identity, faking it week after week, 'keeping up of appearances' and deceiving their unsuspecting congregants! However, this faking of spiritualty among leaders can only last for a while because it lack authentic consistent life-giving power and authority for the medium and long haul journey with people in local communities who can discern a fraudulent leader who does not facilitate the building of wholesome social relationships

Authenticity cannot be Faked forever by a Consistently Deceptive Leader

Therefore the spirituality that is needed for leadership must be shaped by honest answers to some core and challenging questions: What is the African

ecclesial leader's understanding of her/his calling? Is a profession or a vocation? Is it a status symbol or service towards building social responsibility in local communities? The intense pressures for leaders to validate the authenticity of their social responsibility has resulted in many experiencing a spirituality identity crisis.

Leadership at the best of times, is a hard and demanding service with a high and costly calling and accountability. Measurement of the effectiveness is difficult because of perceptions about the transcendental nature of role that is incarnated with human frailties and this makes any measurement risky and questionable. This is because any measurement of spirituality will be a very subjective exercise and therefore failing to receive consensual agreement on the interpretation of the findings. In the contemporary climate of distrust of institutional leadership, those who are called or have chosen the path of ecclesial leadership within the African context must take the lead to work towards authentic spirituality that exhibits effective social responsibility if they are to regain and sustain trust of the common people and so increase their effectiveness within local communities. In is in the life of the local community seeking for fullness of life where the spirituality of the leaders is nurtured and developed for better or for worse. The leader and the members of the local community are in symbiotic relationship. They need each other and the quality of their identity, vocation and witness depends on the maturity of their spirituality.

Conclusion

The way forward points to an increasing need for a radical ethical reformation of African ecclesial leadership that intentionally embraces a spirituality that is expressed through the praxis of just social responsibility for economic and environmental justice and radically informed by Transformative Theosis. This change in lifestyle calls for risky participation in the struggles of people seeking justice and finding effective contemplative practices that will spiritually empower them to live positively in the fast changing postmodern culture (Delbecq Andre, June 2000). The Triune God of life and the theosis spirituality perspective model that undergirds this focus of nurturing the leaders' spirituality within the African context. Only so will they move toward a lifestyle of greater intentional interdependence between politics, economics and civil society and confession of faith. When the leader's spirituality

embraces the ordinary people struggle for justice, they will be will become the gospel by nurturing a spirituality that, 'ensures the ecological and social sustainability of competition and Strengthening the primacy of politics in a global context' (Re-modelling the Social Market Economy: 8).

References

Banks, R. & M.B. Ledbetter 2004, *Reviewing Leadership.* Baker: Grand Rapids.

Boesak, A. & L. Hansen (eds.) 2009. *Globalisation: The Politics of Empire, Justice and the Life of Faith.* Stellenbosch: Sun Press

Collins, J.J. 2000. *The Encyclopeadia of Apocalypticism: Volume I: The Origins of Apocalypticism in Judaism and Christianity.* New York & Lond: Continuum.

Crossan J.J. [1991] 2010. *The Historical Jesus: The Life of a Mediterranean Jewish Peasant.* New York: HarperCollins.

Draper, J. 2006. Jesus' Covenantal Discourse on the Plain (Luke 6:12 – 7:17) as Oral Performance. In Horsley, R. (ed.): *Oral Performance, Popular Tradition Hidden and Hidden Transcript in Q.* Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature.

Evans, F, 2005. *Neoliberalism as Political Economy.* In Gallgher, K.P. (ed.): *Putting Development First.* London, Zed Books.

Fiensy, D.A. & R.K. Hawkins 2013. *The Galilean Economy in the Time of Jesus.* Atlanta: The Society of Biblical Literature.

Freyne, S. 2004. *Jesus: A Jewish Galilean.* London & New York: T. & T. Clark International.

Horsley, R. & N.A. Silberman [1997] 2002. *The Message and the Kingdom: How Jesus and Paul Ignited a Revolution and Transformed the Ancient World.* Minneapolis: Fortress Press.

Horsley, R. 2001. *Hearing the Whole Story: The Politics of Plot in Mark's Gospel.* Louisville, London & New York: Westminster and John Knox Press.

Horsley, R. 2006. Moral Economy and Renewal Movement in Q. In Horsley, R. (ed.): *Oral Performance, Popular Tradition Hidden and Hidden Transcript in Q.* Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature.

Horsley, R. 2008. *Jesus in Context: Power, People, & Performance.* Minneapolis: Fortress Press.

Horsley, R. 2009. *Covenant Economics: A Biblical Vision of Justice for All.* Louisville: Westminster John Now Press.

Horsley, R. 2015. You Shall Not Bow Down and Worship Them: Economic Justice in the Bible. *Interpretation: A Journal of Bible and Theology* 69,4:415-431.

Gibbs, E. 2005, *Leadership Next: Changing Leaders in a Changing Culture.* Nottingham: Intervarsity Press.

Gorman, J., M, 2015, *Becoming the Gospel: Paul, Participation and Mission.* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Gorman, J.M. 2004. *Cruciformity: Paul's Narrative Spirituality of the Cross.* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Hendricks, M.O. Jr. 2006. *The Politics of Jesus.* New York: Doubleday.

Hewitt, R.R. 2014 Spirituality for Democracy: Spiritual Resources for Democratic Participation in the 21st Century. *Verbum et Ecclesia* 35,3: 1 - 7.

Hewitt, R.R. 2017. The Church as Christ's Broken Body Responding to the Emerging Global Challenges in a Divided World. *HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies* 73,3: a4648. https://doi.org/ 10.4102/hts. v73i3.4648.

Kaunda, J.C. 2017. From Fools for Christ to Fools for Politicians: A Critique of Zambian Pentecostal Theo-political Imagination. *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 41,4: 296-311.

Mshana, R.R. (ed.) 2012, *Poverty, Wealth and Ecology in Africa*. Geneva: World Council of Churches Publications.

Mshana, R.R. (ed.) 2003. *Passion for another World.* Geneva: World Council of Churches Publications.

Re-modelling the Social Market Economy: Evangelical Church of Westphalia, Altstädter Kirchplatz 5 / D-33602 Bielefeld, www.evangelisch-in-westfalen.de, quicklink no. 258, p.8.

Sheerattan-Bisnauth, P. 2009. *Power to Resist and Courage to Hope: Caribbean Churches Living out the Accra Confession*. Geneva: World Alliance of Reformed Churches.

Stegemann, E.W. & W. Stegemann 1999. *The Jesus Movement: A Social History of its First Century.* Minneapolis: Fortress Press.

Web Sources

Delbecq, A. June 2000. *Spirituality for Business Ethics.* Santa Clara Universi-

sity. Journal of Management Inquiry 9,2. Available at: http://web.lemoyne.edu/~oconnor/page2/assets/jmi%20delbecq.pdf.

Gardel, N. 2016. HuffPost. *When the World Falls Apart.* Available at: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/nathan-gardels/world-falling-apart_b_9553982.html. (Accessed on 13 April 2016.)

Keum, O. (ed.) 2013. *Together towards Life Mission and Evangelism in Changing Landscapes with a Practical Guide*. Geneva: WCC Publications. Available at: https://www.oikoumene.org/en/ resources/publications/TogethertowardsLife_SAMPLE.pdf. (Accessed on 20 September 2017.)

Hewitt, R. 2010. *The Moral Lowlife in Political Culture.* Available at: http://jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20100903/cleisure/cleisure2.html. (Accessed on 04 April 2016.)

May, J. 2016. Poverty and Inequality in South Africa. Centre for Social and Development Studies, University of Natal. Available at: http://s3.amazonaws.com/academia.edu.documents/31219257/presentation.pdf?AWSAccessKeyId=AKIAJ56TQJRTWSMTNPEA&Expires=1470738511&Signature=WZ2sAk1%2FmNFMBlJB01%2BQg1CB0sw%3D&response-content-disposition=inline%3B%20filename%3DPoverty_and_inequality_ in_South_Africa.pdf. (Accessed on 09 August 2016.)

The Lausanne Theology Working Group. *Statement on the Prosperity Gospel* 2010. Available at: https://www.lausanne.org/content/a-statement-on-the-prosperity-gospel. (Accessed on 11 October 2017.)

The Accra Confession 2004. World Alliance of Reformed Churches. Availabel at: http://wcrc.ch/accra/the-accra-confession. (Accessed on 01 November 2017.)

Roderick Hewitt
Systematic & Ecumenical Theology
School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics
University of Kwa Zulu Natal
Hewitt@ukzn.ac.za

The Church's Social Responsibility in Zambia: The Catholic Response to the 2016 Prejudiced Attacks on 'Others'

Nelly Mwale
Joseph Chita

In April 2016, Rwandan refugees and other foreign nationals in Zambia sought refugee in a Catholic church after days of violence. They were targeted after claims associating them with a series of ritual killings. Residents from compounds were reported to have resorted to riots and violence in a quest to safeguard their lives. This paper investigated the Catholic Church's response to these 'xenophobic' attacks in Zambia's residential compounds to mirror the church's role in social responsibility in contemporary times.

The case study employed document review (media reports) and recorded interviews with Priests from St. Ignatius parish as the main data collection methods, which was thematically analysed. The paper advances that the Catholic Church, guided by its social teaching was not only a mirror of society, but also a place of refugee by hosting the refugees and condemning the violence in various compounds in Lusaka through pastoral letters and homilies.

Keywords: social responsibility, Church, xenophobia, Catholic social teaching and social justice

Introduction

Xenophobia as used in this discussion is associated with 'fear or hatred of strangers or foreigners or of what is strange or foreign (Mish 1997; Nyamnjoh 2006:5). In other words, the phenomenon evokes attributes of dislike of certain foreigners (Warner *et al.* 2003) and as Harris (2002) adds, Xenophobia is not

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a6

just an attribute but an activity - a violent practice that results in bodily harm and damage. One factor that has been attributed to in explaining xenophobic violence is competition for scarce resources, which the insider and outsider are to share. The discourse of 'othering' is magnified when the insiders want to reclaim what is theirs from 'others' who they come to ascribe the tag to, of 'foreigners', 'refugees', and 'strangers', as was the case with Rwandan refugees (Bailey 2008:190).

> Othering is described as a 'process of construction of the identity of both the self and the Other. Kitzinger and Wilkinson (1996:8) define Othering as 'who and what Others are… we use Others to define ourselves: 'we' understand ourselves in relation to what we are not. Othering is essentially the construction of dualism.

Premised on the concept of othering, this paper explored therefore the social responsibility of the Church in contemporary Zambia with reference to the Catholic Church's response to what was deemed as 'xenophobic' violence on 'others – Rwandese' in April 2016 (Amnesty International Report 2016/17). The involvement of the church in the social sphere is not new in the history of Zambian Christianity, as different Christian Churches have been involved in the life of the country since inception and throughout the colonial era to the present (Hinfelaar 2004; Hinfelaar 2009; Mwale 2013). In all these different historical periods, the church has played a role that responds to the needs of the times though not to suggest that the church has not errorred in all these roles. Religion like any other cultural phenomena, religious community or institution, has used religious markers to mask itself when it wages war around rival claims to scarce resources … economic advantages (Lincoln 2003:74).

Gifford (1998:189) observes that the mainline churches have traditionally been involved in service delivery and today are considerably influential, particularly in the educational sector where a large number of secondary schools are run by the churches. In the case of Zambia, Carmody (1999; 2000; 2004; 2007) among other scholars has extensively reflected the role of the church in education. This role has however transformed over time. Gifford argues that after the 1980s, the churches played an increasingly major role in the wider society, 'a role that involved churches not only in the traditional activities of education, health, and development, but also in direct

political activity such as challenging political structures, urging reforms, advocating political change, and even presiding over the change itself' (Gifford 1995: 3). Phiri (1992) also affirms the political role played by the church in Zambia's political change.

The paper focused on what has been regarded as xenophobic violence because this was not only an aspect alien to the country's history, but also a phenomenon that is yet to receive attention in academia. The April 2016 attacks were thus received by shock by different organizations including the African Regional Organisation of the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC-Africa) against the backdrop of the historical reputation of Zambia as being a safe haven for persecuted Africans. Many people who have fled wars and political persecutions in countries such as Angola, Rwanda, Burundi and the Democratic Republic of Congo have sought refugee in Zambia, including political exiles from the Apartheid South Africa era, notably African National Congress members, were sheltered in Zambia (Larmer 2003).

The changing face of Zambia from being a beacon of peace in the region to one associated with disregard for refugees is made clear by the statement by Evangelical Fellowship of Zambia, Council of Churches and the Zambia Episcopal Conference to Commemorate World Refugee Day, 20 June 2005. They noted that:

> One does not have to look far for evidence of the fact that refugees are increasingly unwelcome in Zambia. We have seen a disturbing rise in the verbal abuse, harassment, arbitrary detention, and physical violence that refugees suffer in Zambia. The church regrets the fact that people with genuine protection concerns have been forcibly returned from Zambia to countries where their lives or freedom are in jeopardy. Needless to say, this practice violates the human rights of refugees and does not reflect well on Zambia's international image …'.

This article will therefore seek to demonstrate how the Catholic Church responded to a social challenge as part of her social responsibility by using the case of the xenophobic attacks against refugees in Zambia. The Catholic Church was selected because of the public role it played in the incidence. In addition, as observed by Gibbs and Ajulu (1999), of the mainline churches, the Catholics are probably the most numerous and certainly the most influential in

terms of advocacy work, which is called differently as either justice or social teachings in different circles in Zambia.

The Catholic church's institutions such as the Zambia Episcopal Conference (ZEC), Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP) and Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR) among others enable the church to often be found leading the way, both in terms of their involvement in service provision and in their prophetic role (Gibbs & Ajula 1999). This inquiry is deemed significant by way of contributing to the existing dialogue of religion and social responsibility from a Zambian context, a theme that has not received much attention in academia. This should be understood in light of contributing to the conversation on Xenophobia in the region as extensive studies have been covered from the South African context.

For example, Valji (2003) narrated the forms of Xenophobic discrimination and the crippling impact on the population by exploring the rise of the violent Xenophobic in the New South Africa while Neocosmos (2006) provided an explanation for the existence of Xenophobia, arguing that existing explanatory accounts were deficient as they were primarily asocial and apolitical. Palmary (2002) explored the role of local government in the provision of services to refugees in South African cities and contented that in a context where the role of local government in providing services to refugees was not spelt out, there was need to begin to identify their role in relation to providing services and safety to refugee communities.

These examples of the studies on Xenophobia demonstrate that studies and analysis on Xenophobia have focused on the economic and migratory elements of intolerance. Thus the main contribution of this article lies in extending the conversation to the church and in turn recording the contributions of the Catholic Church in social responsibility in the Zambian context for posterity.

Theoretical Framework

Creswell (2007:27), and Guba and Lincoln (1994:110) note that studies that are both sensitive to power imbalances and that help empower human beings to transcend constraints are associated with the critical theory as a theoretical orientation. Kincheloe and Mclaren (2003) point out that a critical social theory is concerned in particular with issues of power and justice and the ways that the economy, matters of race, class and gender, ideologies, discourses,

education, religion and other social institutions and cultural dynamics interact to construct a social system.

In this study, the call to work for social justice embedded in critical theory is seen through or aligned with a similar vocation rooted in the Catholic social teaching hence the Catholic Social Teaching is used as a lens to make meaning of how and why the Catholic church responded to the Xenophobic violence in Lusaka. The Catholic person must not only work to alter the circumstances of individuals, but also strive for institutional change (Roman and Baybado, 2008). This commitment represents a reliance on agency, whereby individuals have the ability and the obligation to work for justice, and is similar to that found among critical researchers.

Like critical theory, Catholic Social teaching emphasizes the distribution of power by calling upon Catholics to act alongside the oppressed in an effort to end repressive situations and structures. The linkage between Catholic social teaching and power should be understood in light of Neocosmos's theorizing on Xenophobia anchored on political and social connotations (2006). Bradley-Levine and Carr (2015) note that the earliest foundations of Catholic Social Teaching appear in the Old Testament where God guides the Israelites out of slavery in Egypt. Hearing the prayers of the oppressed, God acts to protect their interests including their liberty and right to earn a just wage (Roman & Baybado 2008). Bradley – Levine and Carr (2015) argue that the biblical example reflects the connectedness of individuals through which one person's actions have the potential to affect others in positive or negative ways, and individual's responsibility to respond to the needs of others—especially those who have been marginalized by oppressive situations, institutions, policies, histories, and so forth.

In its modern state, Catholic Social Teaching (CST) was developed through encyclicals and letters written by the Popes. These focused on a global world in which the human condition is shared rather than a world in which only a few hold power and privilege (Roman & Baybado 2008). Several current themes of CST describe the responsibilities of researchers engaged in critical research. For example, the call to care for family and community, recognizes that 'how we organize our society in economics and politics, in law and policy directly affects human dignity and the capacity of individuals to grow in community' (United States Conference of Catholic Bishops n.d.). The themes covered in the Catholic Social Teaching are supported through individual and Church work that preserve human rights and protect the poor and vulnerable,

including children. They distinctly oblige Catholics to seek equity and justice in our world.

In addition, Catholic Social Teaching also focuses on communalism for the purpose of achieving social justice and overcoming aspects of inequality. These responsibilities are supported by the Catholic Social Teaching theme of working toward human solidarity, or the unity of the human community (Komakoma 2003). Solidarity emphasizes cohesion and collaboration among all people regardless of 'national, racial, ethnic, economic, and ideological differences' and requires that people seek peace by working for justice (United States Conference of Catholic Bishops n.d).

Further, CST emphasizes the need for individuals to work in solidarity to resolve social issues and to take responsibility for one another's well-being. The *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (1994; 1997:524) states that socio-economic problems can be resolved only with the help of all forms of solidarity: solidarity of the poor among themselves, between rich and poor, of workers among themselves, between employers and employees, for example. Hence Catholic Social Teaching was adopted in the study as its themes reveal a commitment to struggling with local injustices in one's own community in ways that preserve human rights and protect the poor and vulnerable, in this case those who suffered the Xenophobic violence. This impartiality toward the most vulnerable aligns with the critical research mission to bring voice to those who have been silenced. *Gaudium et Spes* (Pope Paul VI 1965) also calls for attention to working for justice among the most vulnerable. The encyclical identifies that 'differences appear tied to age, physical abilities, intellectual or moral aptitudes, the benefits derived from social commerce, and the distribution of wealth' (#24). Because these are not dispensed equally, some people must contribute more than others in order to achieve a society that is socially just.

Defining Concepts

The discussion of the church and social responsibility is not without diverse understanding on the concept of church and its role in society. For example, Reken (1999) makes a clear distinction of the ways of thinking and speaking of the church between the church as an institution and the church as an organism and admits that neither one of these ways is right nor wrong as they both have legitimate use. Berkhof also considers the church in terms of its

threefold character (Berkhof 1979:339-422), as an institution, community, and its orientation to the world.

The church is an institution through a number of activities and ministries organised in a particular societal institution where the church ministers Christ to the people (Berkhof 1979). As an institution, the Church has nine different facets and activities and these include instruction, baptism, preaching, discussion of the sermon, the Lord's Supper, the diaconate, the meeting, office, and church order. Therefore, the church as an institution is a formal organisation that sets out to accomplish a specific purpose. The church is an agent, can do and say things and has its own voice (Reken 1999). This is because the church has its own purposes and plans, structure and officers, and its own mission. By this, it parallels other institutions, like governments or schools.

The church can also be conceived as an organism. This relates to perceiving the church as a body of believers, or the communion of believers. As a community, people are not only or even primarily in the church as institution, but are themselves and collectively the church, the communion of saints (Berkhof 1979:392-410; Kritzinger 2004). Reken distinguishes the church as organism from the church as institution by noting that the church as a community does not refer to the church, as a unified organisation, but rather as an aggregate of individual believers. In this aggregate, each Christian is a personal agent, and has a purpose and a call in God's plan, and a vocation. The church as a community thus has been given diverse gifts for the sake of building up the body of Christ.

The third dimension, the church's orientation to the world is also important as the final goal of the church cannot be the individual believer nor even the ecclesial community but the renewal of all of humanity, all of humanity's life, and all of creation (Berkhof 1979:345). Most importantly, Berkhof speaks of a chain running from Christ to the world: Christ is mediated to the congregation through the institution; the congregation mediates Christ to the world (Berkhof 1979). By focusing on the response of the Catholic Church to the April 2016 violence, the paper speaks of the church as an institution, community and its orientation to the world as will be demonstrated. Social responsibility is another concept that is significant in this paper. Social responsibility according to Pachamama Alliance (2017) 'is an ethical theory, in which individuals are accountable for fulfilling their civic duty; the action of an individual must benefit the whole of society …'. Further

conceptualization of Social responsibility has related it to an 'ethical framework and suggests that an entity, be it an organization or individual, has an obligation to act for the benefit of society at large'. Some scholars have put emphasis on public interest denoted in the theory.

In relation to the Church and Social Responsibility, it has been argued that 'Christian salvation also includes the social order; that the Christian Church is responsible for the social condition and must provide redemptive measures for the society' (www.questia.com/library/226732/thechurch-and-social-responsibility).

With regard to the relationship between the church and social responsibility, literature acknowledges the contributions of the Christian churches in promoting what the global economy now emphasises as corporate social responsibility in the pre- and post- industrialisation era. For example, Tounés, *et al.* (2011) suggest that the earliest proponents of corporate social responsibility were the Protestants in the United States of America and that both Protestantism and Catholicism shared the credit. They advocated the religious philosophies of 'public service' and 'stewardship' and implored the elites and aristocrats to support the society and the poor with their wealth.

As early as the 1950s, even Bowen (1953) had also acknowledged that corporate social responsibility draws from the old doctrine of social responsibility in American society called paternalism, a common nuance among the religious group. The goals of the public service and stewardship philosophies as taught by the Catholic and Protestant groups centred on spirit of selfless service and concerns for collective well being of the society (Raimi *et al.* 2013). It was the church's philosophy drawn from the Old and New Testaments that inspired ethical consciousness and personal sense of responsibility, which were later adopted and christened social responsibility (*Ibid*). The old doctrine of social responsibility in American society thus started as paternalism among the religious group (Bowen 1953; Tounés *et al.* 2011). Success was equated to public service, doing of good, love for the neighbour and shunning the evils of covetousness (Wilson 2009).

Thus, by exploring the Catholic Church and social responsibility, the paper acknowledges the long contribution of the church in social responsibility. Carroll (1999) alluded to this while exploring the origin and evolution of corporate social responsibility, but in this regard we seek to show how the church has played this role.

Context

Though the article focused on the Catholic Church, it is not the only Christian church in Zambia's religious landscape. The vast majority of Zambians are Christian. Cheyeka (2014) reported that of Zambia's population (14, 222, 000), 95.5 per cent were Christians, 0.5 per cent were Muslims, 0.1 per cent were Hindus, while other and non-affiliated categories accounted for 2 per cent and 1.9 per cent respectively.

A religious profile of the world by PEW research projected the future of world religions in Zambia from 2010 to 2020 as follows:

Years	**Christians**	**Muslims**	**Unaffiliated**	**Hindus**
	12,770,000	70,000	70,000	10,000
2010	97.6%	0.5%	0.5%	0.1%
2020	97.4%	0.6%	0.6%	0.1%

Years	**Buddhists**	**Folk Religions**	**Other**	**Jews**
	<10,000	40,000	120,000	<10,000
2010	<0.1%	0.3%	0.9%	<0.1%
2020	<0.1%	0.3%	0.9%	<0.1%

From the population of approximately 13,090,000 Zambian in 2010, PEW research reflected the religious distribution in Zambia with Christianity having the largest adherents (www.pewforum.org).

Cheyeka (2014) further observed that until the early 21st century, Zambia's Christianity was referred to in terms of three mother bodies: the Zambia Episcopal Conference (ZEC), the Council of Churches in Zambia (CCZ), and the Evangelical Fellowship of Zambia (EFZ). The CCZ was established in 1945 as the umbrella body of mainline Protestant churches. The EFZ was officially formed in 1964 to oversee evangelical churches. In 2001 a fourth umbrella body, the Independent Churches Organization of Zambia (ICOZ), was formed to bring together charismatic churches, ministries, fellowships, and centers.

Officially instituted in 1963, the ZEC is the administrative body of all Roman Catholic dioceses (Hinfelaar 2004). Needless to mention, there are a number of Catholic orders, primarily the White Fathers, Jesuits and Franciscans, and other religious congregations (both male and female) who have had a particular influence in their areas of operations (Weller & Linden

1984). Most importantly, Zambian diocesan priests and bishops are a major force throughout the country.

Refugee Legislation in Zambia

Darwin (2005) notes that Zambia does have a relatively tolerant policy towards refugees. As such, over time, many thousands of refugees have been granted asylum in Zambia and have grown up in Zambia, attended Zambian schools and universities and otherwise made Zambia their home. According to the Refugees (Control) (Declaration of Refugees) Order (No.2) of 1971, (which amends the Refugee Control Act) refugees are defined as,

> Persons who are, or prior to their entry in Zambia were, ordinarily resident outside Zambia and who have sought asylum in Zambia owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality membership of a particular social group or political opinion are declared to be refugees for the purposes of the Refugees Control Act, 1970.

Zambia is a party to both local and international treaties and conventions such as the 1951 Convention and 1967 Protocol as of 1969, including the 1990 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families (Party as of 1992) and the 2000 Palermo Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children (signed in 2002). As earlier noted, Zambia is a member of the Organisation for African Unity. Domestic legislation includes the Refugee Control Act 1970, Immigration and Deportation Act and the constitution among others.

Zambia has had a reputation for being a safe haven in southern Africa and thus since independence, the country has hosted more than 50,000 people that have fled wars in countries such as Angola, Rwanda, Burundi, and the Democratic Republic of Congo. Therefore, as many as 200,000 foreigners including refugees from Rwanda, Angola, Burundi and Congo have until the recent attacks coexisted peacefully alongside Zambian nationals (Gamble 2016).

According to the Minister of Disaster Preparedness and Refugee Affairs Seraphine Mukantabana, there are over 10,000 Rwandan refugees in

Zambia, mainly those who fled after the 1994 Genocide against the Tutsi and are acknowledged by the Zambian government and that a majority of these have remained for economic reasons with over 6,500 Rwandans running businesses in the capital Lusaka (The East Africa 2016; BBC News 2016; Onyango-Obbo 2016). Other official statistics indicates that out of the 4,200 refugees that were present in Zambia, only 400 former Rwandan refugees had their refugee status restored. The Minister of Home Affairs, expressed concern with 'how to humanely address the legal status of over 3,000 former Rwandan refugees currently living in Zambia illegally (Mwansa 2017). It is this community of refugees that have remained and been integrated in the Zambian communities, although this integration has been met with 'increasing difficulties … due to a resurgence of xenophobia and related violence' (UNHCR 2016) the case of April 2016 violence.

Methodology

The article is based on a qualitative case study of the Xenophobic attacks against refugees, that erupted in Lusaka in April 2016 and sought to demonstrate how the Catholic Church responded to this social challenge as part of her social responsibility. Consistent with the principles of case study research (Merriam 1998), the Catholic Church was purposively chosen due to her public role in the incidence.

For example, the ITUC-Africa saluted the responsiveness and empathy of the St. Ignatius Roman Catholic Church Parish, which unreservedly offered shelter to those who fled to it for refuge. Despite the problem having been known to the general public, no institution responded to the crisis with the urgency that it deserved, but the Church. The Church became a place of refuge, synonymous to the 'rock of ages' where the needy sought shelter.

The sources of data included document review (media reports) and recorded interviews with Priests from St. Ignatius parish (the parish that hosted the refugees). The authors were cognizant of the weaknesses associated with media reporting on migration in times of xenophobia. The following were in check when using the media reports on the phenomenon of inquiry: ascertaining facts over biases; knowledge of regulatory framework or pieces of law in use; show of ethical journalism; speaking for all; and challenging hate (EJN 2016).

Document reviews also included the study of policies that relate to

refugees in Zambia, both local and international treaties and conventions such as the 1951 Convention and 1967 Protocol as of 1969, the 1990 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families (Party as of 1992) and the 2000 Palermo Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children (signed in 2002) among others.

The data that was collected from these sources was inductively analysed through coding and analysis of recurring themes which have been presented.

Brief Perspectives on the Xenophobic 'Violence'

Different people have described the violence differently. Some have associated the violence to socio-economic and religious-economic situation. Those who hold such views share Peberdy (2001) argument that in the 'context of compounding frustrations and uncertainty, it is easy to turn migrants and 'other' minorities into scapegoats'. For example, Fr. Lungu observed that the attacks could be a reflection of the growing frustration in Zambia at the high levels of youth unemployment and the rising cost of living resulting in using the immigrants as scapegoats (Vatican Radio 22nd April 2016). Gary Van Staden (a Zambian analyst at NKC Africa Economics) also observed that:

> The attacks on foreign nationals are more likely prompted by the fact that they were targets and the victims of frustration and desperation… the fact that the violence occurred in generally poor and marginalized communities provides a clue as to the real underlying causes (26th April 2016).

Other than these purely economic reasons, the violence also had a religious dimension through the rumours of ritual killings. Ritual killings occur when human body parts and organs are needed to enhance the outcome of a particular situation (Lyncaster 2014). Gamble (2016) observed that to others, the violence was motivated by reports that foreign business owners were conducting ritualized murders so as to 'harvest' body parts for use as charms to support their struggling enterprises. This indicates that the religious worldview of the people can not be detached from the cause of the violence as Fr. Lungu (2016) further linked the so called ritual killings to the people's traditional beliefs of

witchcraft and the modern phenomenon of people believing and practicing Satanism or devil worship for economic advantage.

Radford (2009) had also expressed similar linkages between the belief in witchcraft and ritual killings in Africa. Similar forms of ritual killings have been reported over time in Lesotho and Swaziland (Evans 1993), South Africa (Vincent 2008) and other sub-Saharan countries (Bailey 2010; Rickard 2010) While the real cause of the violence cannot be easily isolated, the effects of the violence were however easily noticeable through the looting, damaged property, homelessness, loss of life and arrested suspects. Most importantly, while acknowledging the multifaceted nature of the possible causes of the violence, this paper rather concentrated on the role played by the church as part of her social responsibility.

Nature of the Violence

Since the violence broke out in April 2016, different views have been expressed over the nature of the violence. For example, Hill (2016) notes that the anti-foreigner violence started in a densely populated low-income area in the west of the city (George and Zingalume Townships) after residents accused a Rwandan shop-owner of being behind the killings. Weekly (9-16 September 2016) reports and discovery of bodies believed to have been ritually killed led to widespread riots in Lusaka, including looting of shops and houses belonging to foreigners, as residents vented their anger and fear. Residents looted shops and houses belonging to Rwandese in particular, though soon, the attacks had spread throughout Lusaka's poor residential areas and involved other nationalities.

Foreigners took refuge at police stations, while some brave residents sought to protect their shops and the police post in Zingalume from being vandalised for the second time (the police post was set on fire in March after the discovery of the first four bodies). The riots spread to Mandevu, Chipata, Chaisa, and Kabanana Townships in the north, and there were also reports of unrest in Lilanda and Chunga in the west and in Garden Township in town.

The Secretary General of Zambia Episcopal Conference (ZEC), Father Cleophas Lungu noted that the violence was two fold: On one hand, there were reports of at least four people who were killed by unknown people in some densely populated compounds of Lusaka whose bodies were found, with some

parts missing and rumours of ritual killings on the other.

> When rumours started circulating that these were ritual killings being perpetrated by foreign nationals doing business in Zambia, scores of residents in affected areas of Lusaka unfortunately took the law into their hands and started looting shops and business houses owned by foreign nationals and immigrants, especially those from Rwanda (Lungu Vatican Radio, 22nd April 2016).

Other than reporting the loss of lives, 62 shops were destroyed by gangs of marauding youths and several cars set ablaze. As a way of arresting the situation, the police arrested some suspects and the government put security measures by deploying over 1,000 Zambian troops.

Dachs (2016) reported that Zambia last deployed such a large number of police in 2014 to quell riots shortly after the death of President Michael Sata. The Zambian police arrested over 250 people linked to the attacks while dozens of Rwandese sought refuge at their country's High Commission and later at St. Ignatius Catholic parish (Chawe 2016). The foreign nationals were later taken to Mayukwayukwa refugee camp in Western province and Maheba Refugee camp in North-western Province while others were flown back home (Karuhanga 2016). Mayukwayukwa and Maheba are two of the six camps and settlements, which include Kala, Mwange, Nangweshi and Ukwimi.

It is in this violence that the Catholic Church took up a social responsibility to deal with the effects of the violence. While acknowledging that it was not the only church that responded to the violence, it is clear that it played a bigger public role than any other church as reflected in the Zambia's public media.

Catholic Response to Violence

Different Churches in many countries have played an important role in offering assistance to the poor and marginalized through both short and long term programmes and interventions for development. Notably, the churches have played a major role in the provision of basic social services since the nineteenth century when the missionaries began to set up mission schools, hospitals and dispensaries.

In addition to its role in service provision, the churches have also played a role in speaking out against abuses of human rights, social injustice, and poverty. Advocacy on behalf of poor, marginalized and the oppressed people has been and remains a major contribution of churches to civil society. The social responsibility of the church as demonstrated in the April violence is broadly categorized and discussed around the church as a mirror and voice of society, and as a place of refugee.

Catholic Church as Place or Home for Refugees

The church as a place of refugee was a home where the victims who were displaced in the April violence found refugee. This experience was not peculiar to Zambia alone, in 2008, the Central Methodist Mission (CMM) in central Johannesburg took in refugees after the spread of xenophobic violence in South Africa. Bompani (2012) observed that 'from being simply a religious site, this institution became a sort of improvised 'refugee camp' hosting around 3,000 migrants …'. Back home in Zambia, Fr. Lungu noted that one parish had provided refuge to victims of the acts of violence. More than 300 people from Rwanda, Burundi and the DR Congo sought protection at Saint Ignatius Catholic Church in Lusaka (*Zambia Weekly* 2016). The church did not only provide shelter to these victims, but also provided material support based on the Church's quest to respect human life and promote social justice. Catholics and other people of good - will generously came on board to offer food and provided some warm clothing (Fr. Lungu, interview 22nd April, 2016).

St. Ignatius Catholic Church priest, Father Chilinda said the Church had continued to take in more people and to this call; well wishers and church members from all walks of life came to the aid of the victims (in Hill 2016). For example, Cardinal Turkson urged Zambians to embrace Rwandese and other refugees when he delivered a card and an undisclosed amount of money to the affected families at St Ignatius' Kalemba Hall. Cardinal Turkson also expressed gratitude to the local church in Zambia for the hospitality and love it had shown to the affected communities during the period of riots and attacks (Hill 2016).

It was relieving on the part of the affected families to see that the world was standing with them during their difficult time as several people had come on board and donated a number of items to the affected people (Chilinda 2016).

In this way, by being a place of refugee, the church as an institution and community played a social role. This is what Bompani (2012) expresses as religion and religious institutions re-emerging as public actors and the only 'safe' alternative in a very adverse society.

Catholic Church as Mirrored in a Voice

The Church extended its social responsibility as a voice in different ways for the victims and itself. This voice was firstly that of condemnation. For example, the Catholic Church in Zambia condemned the violence in the country's capital following 'rumours about ritual killings' and subsequent reprisal attacks on some foreign nationals and termed the xenophobic assaults 'regrettable.' Fr. Cleophas Lungu, the Secretary General of ZEC, confirmed that the Catholic Church had 'issued statements condemning these barbaric acts of violence' and called for peace (Vatican Radio, 22nd April, 2016).

The Church voiced out on media reported acts of violence through the Jesuit Center for Theological Reflection - the Faith and Justice Programme. In the JCTR Press Release – 'Recent Disorders in the Nation', expressed concern over what it called a 'gross degradation of moral fiber… with reference to occurrences relating to ritual killing, looting of shops and subsequent displacement of foreigners … (JCTR March 12 2016). This was amidst silence in the face of grievous violence and senseless loss of human life. The Centre condemned the acts and appealed to relevant authorities to take appropriate action. Other Church mother bodies that issued statements that added to the voice of the church on xenophobic attacks acknowledged a missed opportunity in the case of the church in what would have prevented the April 2016 attacks. The Evangelical Fellowship of Zambia (EFZ 2012) remarked that:

> The church should have spoken loudly against the xenophobic violence and killings in South Africa, the post-election killings in Kenya in 2007, the genocide of Rwanda in 1994, or the seizure of white owned farms in Zimbabwe in 2000. In Zambia, the locals have been complaining that government contracts and business conditions favour foreigners and such utterances (if tolerated) can easily become a recipe for xenophobia. We should act early and prevent the worst from happening.

The voice of the church further challenged the government to act. Fr. Lungu noted that the Church had challenged the government of Zambia 'to be more proactive and do everything possible to bring an end to this unfortunate trend of behavior.' It is in this vein that President Lungu visited the foreign nationals seeking refuge at Kalemba Hall of St. Ignatius Catholic Church in Lusaka and assured them of full protection and security of person and property.

The church further spoke on behalf of the refugees on the repatriation calls. This involvement of the Church was not new. In 2012, the refugees had called upon the Church for help. Pintu (2012) observes that about 6,000 Rwandan refugees in Zambia wanted the Catholic Church to help stop the state plans to repatriate them and instead to regularise their Zambian citizenship. They also wanted the bishops' conference to remind the government to respect their human rights and right to choose where to settle, as indicated in documents by the U.N. High Commissioner for Refugees.

In this regard, the church addressed the compulsory repatriation as one of the topics in the bishops' pastoral letter in which they argued that it was not right for the office of the Zambian government's Commissioner for Refugees and the UNHCR to remove the refugee status from (Rwandan) nationals based in Zambia or those from other countries and to oblige them to return to their own country against their wishes. The Bishops asked the Zambian government to regularise the status of some refugees in the country and facilitate that they be accorded local integration, including freedom of movement and of employment (Catholic Bishops 2012). Resulting from these calls, some refugees were given Zambian citizenship.

By being a voice, the church's social responsibility was linked to advocacy, here taken as a very broad and overarching concept, which can involve engaging with the general public to raise awareness on an important issue as well as influencing policy-makers towards a desired solution (Gibbs and Ajulu 1999). While advocacy has been closely related to development agencies, concerned individuals and groups have for hundreds of years been involved in advocating for change and Churches in particular have had advocacy at the heart of their work, which they have called 'justice' or 'the churches' social teaching.' The work of the Catholic church as guided by her social teaching has been fully described by Komakoma (2003). In other words, most contexts and at most times, advocacy has been a recognised and important part of the churches' work.

Catholic Church as Protector

The church also played the role of being a protector by protecting the foreign nationals from those who were after them. The church was a protector when the victims were unsafe in the places where they had been integrated. The expressions of the church's protection were communicated in some sentiments of the people who were hosted at St. Ignatius parish. For example, Kezamahoro noted that 'I will not leave the St. Ignatius Roman Catholic church in Lusaka, even after President Edgar Lungu has assured me and more than 400 others that it was safe to return to our homes following anti-foreigner riots this week'. Another 27 year old, war refugee from the Democratic Republic of Congo when asked how long he would stay at the parish said, 'forever if possible… we are not safe.' Many others expressed being safe and protected at church. For example, Benigne Miyungeko was also not convinced that moving back to the Mayukwayukwa refugee camp was a good idea because of inadequate medical facilities and food supplies.

While the hand of the church in social life of the country is not new, the social teachings of the church were at the centre of the church's response to the violence. Fr. Lungu noted that as the church celebrated the Jubilee Year of Mercy and bearing in mind the fact that among the corporal works of mercy is the call and mission to welcome strangers, feed the hungry and shelter the homeless, the Church has responded with compassion (Vatican radio 22nd April 2016). This explains the church's open arms to the victims of violence.

This further illuminates the church's voice through statements issued to condemn barbaric acts of violence, calling for peace, and calm among the people, and at the same time challenging civil authorities to be more proactive and do everything possible to bring an end to this unfortunate trend of behaviour among our people. As Nthamburi (2003) notes, the proclamation of the kingdom of God may involve doing acts of mercy.

The Justice and Peace Commission under the umbrella of Caritas Zambia also sought to explore the root causes of what had transpired in order to find some long-term solutions. Once again, the Church as an institution, community coupled with its call to the world, fulfilled her social responsibility at an urgent moment. This merely demonstrates that the Catholic Church has had an advocacy role, but also a service provider for decades even in instances where no one comes to rescue the needy. For example, the bishops have issued a number of pastoral letters on different issues of not only the refugee status,

but also on the subject of economic decline and corruption (July 1990, one of the first, was entitled: 'Economics, Politics and Justice'). Other Catholic bodies such as the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP) also makes statements on diverse issues (Gifford 1998: 211). The Church through the Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR) also tackles the social realities and engages in initiatives, which enable a monitoring of the impacts of the economy on people's lives.

A particular contribution of the centre had been to start calculating on a monthly basis what a food basket for a family of six in Lusaka would cost (JCTR 2010). The basket includes mealie meal, charcoal, cooking oil, vegetables, meat, eggs, bread, sugar, salt, tea, soap, washing powder, and Vaseline but not the cost of housing, water, electricity, transport, clothing, education, healthcare or recreation et cetera.

The role of the church in social responsibility can be explained in diverse ways, but the response of the church to the violence mirrors the description of the church as an institution, as manifested through the collective response of church (leadership, structures), church as community (as individual members came on board to offer their time, food, clothes and other donations through cleaning the premises and cooking for the needy among other ways) and the church's orientation to the world by reaching out to humanity, which are all anchored on the Catholic Social Teaching. As Gifford (1995) argues that the Church has become more involved in the wider society. Most importantly, the Catholic church has been the voice that speaks to the people's living conditions, this is achieved through their pastoral work at the parish level in both rural and urban areas as well as through their service delivery work, in schools and hospitals. This gives them an understanding of people's living conditions and the problems they face and at the same time enables them to speak with authority and when combined with the legitimacy that their moral position in the community lends them, they undoubtedly have the potential for influence (Gibbs & Ajulu 1999).

While the Church has been driven by the social teachings in her social responsibility, others have opined that the levels of expertise and the professionalism of the Catholics, particularly those working in the CCJP and the ZEC, are of critical importance (*ibid*). This demonstrates that the multiple understanding of the church as institution, community and orientation to the world are significant for the church to take up her social responsibility. The church demonstrated the works of the historical Jesus whose ministry involved

attending to people's needs in totality… he fed them with food when they were hungry, … and spoke against the injustices of his time (Kamaara 2004:128).

Conclusion

The paper reflected on the church and social responsibility by exploring how the Catholic Church responded to the so-called 'xenophobic' violence of April 2016, which has been taken as a single event because this had never happened in the history of Zambia. The xenophobic violence in a nation where the majority of citizens are Christians, questions the faith of the perpetrators. Christians or not, history has demonstrated that people of faith have used violence to justify wrong. Its without doubt that some of the perpetrators of violence were actually Christians, who chose to undress their Christian faith during violence to put on their traditional dress as a lens to view the foreigners as threats - ritual killers who were using witchcraft as a means to grow their business. Scholars who studied African conversion to Christianity or Islam in Africa have explained before this syncretic tendency among Christians in Zambia, during the day Africans would profess the Christian faith, at night they would fall back on their traditional culture.

The paper observes that the church while being guided by her social teachings and celebrating the year of mercy, reached out by being a home or place of refugee, a protector and a voice of the foreign nationals who were displaced and had their homes and property destroyed. Therefore, the church as an institution and a community played its public role as it has done before.

References

Adu-amankwah, K. 2016. *Statement on the Xenophobic Attacks in Zambia.* Available at the African Regional Organization of the International Trade Union Confederation – ITUC: https://www.ituc-africa.org/Statement-on-the-xenophobic-attack-in-Zambia.html.

Amnesty International 2016/ 2017. *Amnesty International Report 2016/ 2017 – Zambia*, 22 February 2017. Available at: http://www.refworld.org/docid/58b033974.html. (Accessed on 30 August 2017.)

Bailey, A. 2008. *Culture, Risk and HIV/AIDS among Migrant and Mobile Men in Goa, India*. Amsterdam: Rozenberg Publishers.

Bailey, C. 2010. Muti Killings is a Way of Life in Rural Areas. IOLnews, January 16. Available at: http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/muti-killings-is-a-way-of-life-in-rural-areas-1.470603.

BBC News. *Zambia Xenophobic Riots: Two Burned Alive in Lusaka*. Available at: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-36092917. (Accessed on 31 August 2017.)

Berkhof, H. 1979. *Christian Faith: An Introduction to the Study of Faith.* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Bompani, B. 2013. 'It is not a shelter, it is a church!' Religious Organisations, the Public Sphere and Xenophobia in South Africa. In Hopkins, P., L. Kong & E. Olson (eds.): *Religion and Place: Landscape, Politics and Piety*. Dordrecht: Springer. (DOI: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-4685-5_8.)

Bowen, H.R. 1953. *Social Responsibilities of the Businessman*. New York: University of Iowa.

Carmody, B. 1999. *Education in Zambia: Catholic Perspectives*. Lusaka: Bookworld Publishers.

Bradley-Levine, J. & K.A. Carr 2015. Critical Theory and Catholic Social Teaching: A Research Framework for Catholic Schools. *Journal of Catholic Education* 18,2:27-43.

Carmody, B. 2004. *Religion and Education in Zambia*. Ndola: Mission Press.

Carmody, B. 2007. The Catholic Church and State Relations in Zambian Education: A Contemporary Analysis. *International Handbook of Catholic Education*. Netherlands: Springer.

Carmody, B. 2000. *The Evolution of Education in Zambia*. Lusaka: Book World Publishers.

Carroll, A.B. 1999. Corporate Social Responsibility: Evolution of a Definitional Construct. *Business and Society* 38,3: 268-295.

Chawe, M. 2016. When the Ghost of Xenophobia visited Zambia. *Societal Security Network* 26th April 2016. Available at: http://societalsecurity.net/MediaWatch/article/when-ghosts-xenophobia-visited-zambia.

Chawe, M. 2016. Zambia: Uneasy Calm Returns to Lusaka after Two Days of Riots. *East African* 21st April.

Cheyeka, A.M. 2014. Zambia. In *World Mark Encyclopaedia of Religious Practices* 4: 556-566.

Creswell, J.W. 2007. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches.* 2nd Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA.: Sage.

Dachs, B. 2016. Catholic Official says Zambians Shocked by Xenophobic Violence. *Catholic News Service* 22nd April.

Darwin, C. 2005. Report on the Situation of Refugees in Zambia. *Africa and Middle East Refugee Assistance*. Available at: http://www.matrixlaw.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/20_10_2014_09_30_27_Report-Refugees-Zambia.pdf.

Ethical Journalism Network 2016. *Five Point Guide for Migration Reporting: Communication on Migration in Times of Xenophobia*. Available at: http://ethicaljournalismnetwork.org/communicating-migration-xeno phobia. (Accessed on 30 August 2017.)

Evangelical Fellowship of Zambia, Council of Churches and the Zambia Episcopal Conference 2005. Statement to Commemorate World Refugee Day, 20 June.

Evans, J. 1993. 'here can we get a beast without hair?' Medicine Murder in Swaziland from 1970 to 1988. *African Studies* 52,1: 27-42.

Gamble, R. 2016. Rwandan Refugees Seek Sanctuary in Zambian Catholic Church as Five Killed in Riots. *The Tablet: The international Catholic News Weekly* 26th April 2016. Available at: http://www.thetablet.co.uk/news/5481/0/rwandan-refugees-seek-sanctuary-in-zambian-catholic-church-as-five-killed-in-riots.

Gibbs, S. & D. Ajulu 1999. *The Role of the Church in Advocacy: Case Studies from Southern and Eastern Africa*. Oxford: INTRAC.

Gifford, P. 1995. *The Christian Churches and the Democratisation of Africa.* Leiden*:* E. J. Brill.

Gifford, P. 1998. *African Christianity: Its Public Role.* London: Hurst and Company.

Harris, B. 2002. Xenophobia: A New Pathology for a New South Africa? In Hook, D. & G. Eagle (eds.): *Psychopathology and Social Prejudice*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Hill, M. 2016. Zambia's President Assures Sheltering Foreigners he has Ended Xenophobic Attacks. *Times of Zambia* 22nd April.

Hinfelaar, H. 2004. *History of the Catholic Church in Zambia 1895-1995.* Lusaka: Bookworld Publishers.

Hinfelaar, M. 2009. Legitimizing Powers: The Political Role of the Roman Catholic Church, 1972-1991. Gewald, J., M. Hinfelaar & G. Macola (eds.): *One Zambia, Many Histories – Towards a History of Post-colonial Zambia*. Lusaka: Lembani Trust.

Kamaara, E. 2004. Religion and Socio-Political Change in Kenya: 1978-2003. *Church-State Relations: A Challenge for African Christianity*. Nairobi: Acton Publishers.

Karuhanga, J. 2016. Zambia Xenophobic Attacks: Rwandans Who Lost Everything Flown Back Home. *The New Times* April 24.

Komakoma, J. 2003. *The Social Teaching of the Catholic Bishops and Other Christian Leaders in Zambia: Major Pastoral Letters and Statements 1953-2001*. Ndola: Mission Press.

Kritzinger, J.N.J. 2004. *Exploring Theology: An Introductory Dictionary*. Pretoria: Research Institute for Theology and Religion-UNISA.

Lincoln, B. 2003. *Holy Terror: Thinking about Religion after September 11*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Lyncaster, J.Y. 2014. *Connecting Bodies: Re-examining Ritual Murder in Venda.* Doctoral dissertation, Carleton University, Ottawa.

Merriam, S.B. 1998. *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Mish, F.C. 1997. *Merriam Webster Dictionary*. Massachusetts: Springfiled.

Mulenga, C. 2016. Xenophobic Attacks against Rwandans Sadden Pope. *Bloomberg* 28th April.

Mwale, N. 2013. Religion and Development in Zambia. *Alternation* 11:110-33.

Mwansa. A. 2017. 400 Rwandans Regain Refugee Status. *Zambia Daily Mail* 8th February 2017. Available at: https://www.daily-mail.co.zm/400-rwandans-regain-refugee-status/.

Mwanza, P.N. 2012. *The Role of the Church in Fighting Xenophobia.* Available from EFZ Secretariat at: http://www.efzsecretariat.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=116:the-role-of-the-church-in-fighting-xenophobia-rev-pukuta-n-mwanza&catid=14:recent&Itemid=61. (Accessed on 31 August 2017.)

Neocosmos, M. 2006, From 'Foreign Natives' to 'Native Foreigners'. Explaining *Xenophobia* in Post-apartheid South Africa. Citizenship and Nationalism, Identity and Politics. Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa. Senegal: CODESERIA Monograph Series.

Nyamnjoh, F.B. 2006. *Insiders and Outsiders: Citizenship and Xenophobia in Contemporary Southern Africa*. Dakar: CODESRIA Books.

Onyango-Obbo, C. 2016. Xenophobia in Zambia: Why it Won't Happen in East Africa. *Daily Nation.* Available at: http://www.theeastafrican.co.ke/

OpEd/comment/Xenophobia-in-Zambia-Why-it-wont-happen-in-East-Africa/434750-3173294-view-printVersion-ho5yk2z/index.html. (Acessed on 31 August 2017.)

Pachamama Alliance 2017. *Social Responsibility and Ethics.* Available at: https://www.pachamama.org/social-justice/social-responsibility-and-ethics. (Accessed on August 2017.)

Palmary, I. 2002. *Refugees, Safety and Xenophobia in South African Cities: The Role of Local Government. A Case Study of Cape Town.* Johannesburg: Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation.

Peberdy, S. 2001. Imagining Immigration: Inclusive Identities and Exclusive Policies in Post-1994 South Africa. *Africa Today* 48,3: 15-32.

Phiri, B. 1992. Decolonisation and Multi-Party Liberation in Northern Rhodesia: A Reassessment. *Zambia Journal of History* 5: 14 - 36.

Pillay, S. 2008. Democracy and Governance Programme. Citizenship, Violence and Xenophobia in South Africa: Perceptions from South African Communities. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council.

Pintu, M. 2012. Thousands of Rwandans want Church Help to Stay in Zambia. *Catholic News Service* 2nd February.

Radford, B. 2009. Belief in Witchcraft Leads to Murders in Africa. Live Science. Available at: http://www.livescience.com/10603-belief-witch craft-leads-murders-africa.html.

Raimi, L., A. Patel, I. Adelopo & T. Ajewole. 2013. Tackling the Poverty Crisis in the Muslim Majority Nations (MMNs): The Faith-Based Model (FBM) as an Alternative Policy Option. *Advanced Journal of Business Management and Entrepreneurship* 1,1: 1-12.

Reken, V.C.P. 1999. The Church's Role in Social Justice. *Calvin Theological Journal* 34,1: 198-202.

Rickard, B. 2010. Albino Muti Murders. *Fortean Times* March. Available at: http://www.forteantimes.com/strangedays/misc/3043/albino_muti_ murders.html.

The East Africa 2016. *Rwandan Nationals Suffer Attacks but are Reluctant to Return Home* 25th April 2016. Available at: [https://asokoinsight.com/ news/rwandan-nationals-suffer-attacks-but-are-reluctant-to-return-home.

Tounés, A., W. Chakroun & F. Gribaa. 2011. A Spatio-Temporal Odyssey Around the Concepts of Sustainable Development and Corporate Social Responsibility: Boundaries to be Determined? *Journal of Modern Accounting and Auditing* 7,10: 1158-1168.

UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). 2016. *Update on UNHCR's Operations in Africa* 23 September 2016. Available at: http://www.ref world.org/docid/57f254d14.html. (Accessed on 31 August 2017.)

Valji, N. 2003. *Creating the Nation: The Rise of Violent Xenophobia in the New South Africa.* Unpublished Masters thesis. York University. Available at: http://www.csvr.org.za.

Vatican Radio 2016. Viewed on 22nd April 2016. Available at: http://en. radiovaticana.va.

Vincent, L. 2008. New Magic for New Times: Muti Murder in Democratic South Africa. *Tribes and Tribals Special Volume* 2: 43-53.

Warner, C., G. Finchilescu& G. Finchelescu 2003. Living with Prejudice: Xenophobia and Race. *Agenda* 36-44.

Weller, J. & J. Linden 1984. *Mainstream Christianity to 1980 in Malawi, Zambia and Zimbabwe*. Gweru: Mambo Press.

Wilson, R. 2001. Business Ethics: Western and Islamic Perspectives. In Ahmed, K. & A.M. Sadeq (eds.): *Ethics in Business and Management: Islamic and Mainstream Approach*. London: Asean Academic Press.

Websites

www.jctr.org.zm
www.pewforum.org

Nelly Mwale
Department of Religious Studies
The University of Zambia
Lusaka, Zambia
nelmwa@gmail.com

Joseph Chita
Department of Religious Studies
The University of Zambia
Lusaka, Zambia
chonochitajoseph@gmail.com

Religion as Situated Knowledge for Social Transformation: The Case of the Mashobye Women's Manyano of Limpopo Province

Storia Seitisho
Lilian Cheelo Siwila

Abstract

Religion as a form of situated knowledge has historically influenced a gendered conception and acquisition of knowledge. As one of the dominant voices in society, it has created and maintained social hierarchies by discriminating the equal identity, interest and experiences of women. As a result, emerging ideologies, historical and socio-cultural factors normalized thought patterns of particularly an inferior and dependent perspective about women. In most of the African countries, missionary and colonial teaching undermined women's indigenous knowledge on food production and experiences as heads of households. Through the Victorian family model, women were removed from participating in agriculture to the domestic sphere where they had to perform duties of housewifery. In case of transforming a situation of poverty, hunger and diseases prevalent in Sub Saharan Africa and rural areas of South Africa in particular, religion constrained processes of positive knowledge construction as women's roles and activities were mostly limited to private space. The aim of this paper is to explore ways in which the Women's Manyano organization can be an agent of transformation to communities of women in the rural area for food autonomy and maternal health.

Keywords: religion, gender, food autonomy, social transformation, Manyano Women

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a7

Introduction

It is an undeniable truth that religion has played a significant role in social transformation in general. It also seems rather impossible to imagine any kind of society without the influence of some kind of religion. In Africa in particular, this truth is affirmed by a commonly known phrase of one leading theologian Mbiti that '*Africans are notoriously religious*' (1991:1). This also finds expression from a female African theologian, Kanyoro, who reckons that *religion and culture encompass all areas of one's total life because in African indigenous thought system, religion and culture are not distinct from each other* (2001:158-159). Implicitly, African people experience their lives according to what is religiously or culturally acceptable or taboo. As situated knowledge, religion in the same way as culture continues to shape, influence even foster or obstruct life-giving experiences for individuals and communities. This is mostly because the interpretation of religious text and teachings is mainly done from one religion to another or one belief system to the next. Incidentally, African people are said to have always been religious and gender relations within indigenous societies are believed to have been 'inclusive, exclusive and flexible' (Sofola 2006:60). Yet, patriarchal norms and indigenous social hierarchies that deny women political, economic, legal and educational rights are believed to have been reinforced and perpetuated by the missionary introduction of Christian religion (Akyeampong & Fofak 2012:22). In fact, Johnson states that there is 'no country in the world where these rights are equally enjoyed by women and men in practice' (1993:25). Hence, feminist theologians like Phiri and Nadar (2002) critique religion of its oppressive nature to women's health in the way in which it influences women's thoughts, emotions, personalities and social relationships as they seek their relationship with God. This article emerges from a research project conducted among the Methodist Manyano[1] Women and Prayer Service Union of Limpopo province

[1] This is a Xhosa name originally given to African women's prayer unions in South Africa, originating in the Methodist Church of Southern Africa. It is derived from the verb 'ukumanya' meaning 'to join' or 'unite', 'unity' or 'kopano' in Setswana or Sesotho. When the Methodist mission reached Natal at the end of the nineteenth century, a Xhosa hymn book was used. Thus it happened that a number of Xhosa words associated with the MCSA and Christianity entered the Zulu language. The term Manyano was adopted by the Methodists and has been used ever since to denote their church women's

in South Africa on food autonomy for maternal health. The article argues that traditionally in most African countries indigenous knowledge on household production and food autonomy was a woman's problem. They owned the power to the land and provided food for their families from the produce of their farms. The article further demonstrates how religion played an important role in removing women from the center to the periphery of agricultural production by introducing the Victorian model of a domestic housewife through missionary influence. The article concludes that although Christian religion is said to have destabilized African women's ability towards food autonomy, Methodist Manyano Women of Limpopo have proved that religion also has the potential to empower women with knowledge on food autonomy by revising women's indigenous knowledge on food production and experiences as heads of households. This is because Manyano Women's organizations have been proved to have the capacity to influence women's household views and perspectives. Hence the need to address the formation of Manyano movement.

Formation of Methodist Women's Prayer and Service Union in South Africa

A study by Kumalo (2009:89), found out that the Methodist Church of Southern Africa was the first to establish a Women's Manyano organization, in 1870 in Dundee, Natal. Gaitskel attributes the establishment of the Women's Manyano to the efforts of the wives of missionaries who mostly contributed by evangelizing African women, teaching them sewing and instructing them on the role of motherhood, wifehood and worker. This practice began in the Methodist Church and spread to the Anglican Church and American Board Mission (1997:18). Furthermore, the formalization of the MCSA women's organization, which is now known as the Methodist Women's Prayer and Service Union, is said to have happened in the 1830's among the Tswana and Zulu mission stations through weekly sewing classes. As Manyano developed, Gaitskel notes that, by the 1880's, Eastern Cape Missionary wives grouped women together for Bible studies, prayer and testimonies which became the lifeline for women's groups to date (1997:18). As Oduyoye (2002) notes,

organization. Manyano is also called 'Methodist Women's Prayer and Service Union' (see Theilen (2003); Jacka (2014: 189).

women have founded religious associations, initiated church communities and created ministries to make churches effective despite cultural constraints and societal and religious prejudice against women. Hence, Cragg and Millard regard the emergence of Women's Manyano as the 'most significant development in the life of the African Church as the organization evangelized, raised funds and positively influenced its member's family life' (2013:53).

Manyano Women Movement and the Victorian Model of Housewife.

As stated earlier, Missionary wives' supported their husbands in evangelizing native Africans by focusing on teaching and training basic home making (Gaitskel 1997:18). In order to do this, native African women were organized into weekly meetings for sewing. These weekly sewing meetings developed into a 'class' (Laws & Discipline 2007:27) for instruction on motherhood and family Christian formation. This was because dressing in Western clothes was regarded as a sign of seeking baptism, Christian instruction and conversion (Gaitskel 1997:19). The teachings offered by these missionary women were meant to inculcate Christian ideals of marriage, fidelity, wifehood, morality, maternal and domestic responsibility as a standard for a new life. From this kind of teaching a gender perspective suggests that women were responsible for household reproduction, production and caring even though their ability to achieve food autonomy and maternal health was restricted (Theilen 2003:63). Despite the tremendous contribution missionaries made through evangelism and education, their perception of Western culture as superior to African culture influenced them to impose both Christianity and a Western way of life, worldview and ideologies by undermining local religion, tradition and culture that located African women in agricultural production. For instance, Clifford notes the influence of the colonial teaching that was based on the Victorian family ideology and 'the cult of true womanhood' (2001:12). It was presumed that women have a superior morality because of their maternal nature. Therefore, they could be trusted to impart good moral values to children and become suitable homemakers for their husbands or male relatives, thereby contributing to a more humane society (Clifford 2001:24). Furthermore, the family model imposed by female missionaries on their subjects provided an 'ideal answer for a family model against Western industrialization' (Gaitskel

1983). However, it destroyed the African communal food production system and progressively isolated African women from achieving food autonomy by removing them from the agriculture sect. The new family model of 'Male breadwinner, dependent housekeeping wife and mother and dependent school going children' (Gaitskel 1983: 241) entrenched women's dependent and consumer status to the detriment of family food security and poor maternal health.

Similarly, the Victorian model of housewife coupled with a Western influence viewed agricultural production as man's work and that women's involvement rendered them a '*Beast of burden'* (Gaitskel 1983:225). As such, western religion discriminated women from participating in food production as was practiced in the African society during the pre-missionary era and reinforced their dependent and subordinate status as homemakers. This set a socio-religious norm that saw men involved in the public sphere making political and economic decisions, while women were confined to a domestic sphere 'producing and raising male citizens to lead society' (Clifford 2001:12). In this way, the role of motherhood was socially and religiously valued and 'elevated above professionalism' (Mead 1976:9). Following all these changes the social responsibility that women held as heads of households in terms of food production and food autonomy was challenged and diminished.

For instance, women and girls were taught to be good wives and mothers in a way to produce 'progressive wives' (Parpat 1996) or 'home makers' (Gaitskel 1983:223).*As a woman taking a course in domestic science was reported as saying, 'it would bring me in the way in which my husband would like…those who are learning now will not think they are improving…but when they go back they will find out what they know'* (Fraser 1943:240 in Parpart 1996). It was also because acquiring domestic training was seen as a sign of conversion and accepting Christian morality and ethics. Subsequently, it was this Western view of married women as the 'angel' in the domestic sphere and African appreciation of women as 'custodians of traditional knowledge' which made the integration of Western and African ideologies seemingly look like it was favouring women. However, missionaries' wives imposition of Victorian family model when training their African converts mainly redefined the concept of home and work for African society. This model formed the basis of the teachings and activities of Women's Organizations, later known as Manyanos. Even though it helped carry the Christian message to indigenous people, it not only contributed to the

destruction of the African communal food production system but progressively denied African women capacity towards food production, allocation and distribution. This finds credence from studies which suggest that Christianity was introduced in Africa to agricultural societies where women and men shared in the 'hardships and benefits of subsistence production' (Mead 1976:3). While the Victorian family ideology and 'the cult of true womanhood' provided an 'ideal answer for a family model against Western industrialization' (Gaitskell 1983:244), it contributed to poverty and food insecurity in most African societies. This became vivid when men begun to leave the rural agricultural sect to work in the city as miners or other industries. This migration left women with no male figures to continue with food production to the detriment of food security in the homes.

Research Method and Theoretical Framework for the Study

Empirical research for this study took place in the rural village of Mashobye situated in Vhembe district with the Manyano Women Movement of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa. Mashobye village forms part of the 27 villages that make up Thulamela municipality in the Northern part of rural Limpopo Province of South Africa. Limpopo is 'classified amongst the poorest provinces of South Africa with the Northern Cape and Eastern Cape'[2]. Mashobye village experiences poverty exacerbated by patriarchy, historical, socio-economic, political and gender inequality, and currently, poor service delivery like most rural villages in South Africa. Women head most of the households in this area because most men of working age migrate to cities in search of work. In addition, young people move to neighbouring towns to access institutions of higher learning as there are no tertiary institutions in the village or in close proximity.

This study employed a qualitative approach to data collection through the use of focus group discussions with 8 Mashobye Manyano women. The focus group discussion with these church women was intended to find out their perception of food autonomy and how religion can play a role in improving food autonomy for their households. The study generated a number of themes. For this study we will address only two of the themes which are; the role of

[2] For more information, see Department of Agriculture: Republic of South Africa, 2002, 22-24.

situated knowledge on women's effort to attain food security and the role of religion in enhancing women's effort for food autonomy. On the issue of situated knowledge, one of the key outcomes for this study was that, even though women in Mashobye are hard-working to attain food autonomy, they lack beneficial information like knowledge of the South African government's rural development Integrated Food Security Strategy[3] (IFSS). The body (IFSS) is meant to offer rural communities, particularly women and youth, skills, employment and income to redress their food insecurity status. IFSS is the South African democratic government's initiative consisting of six pillars aimed at overcoming poverty and increasing income and job opportunities in rural areas. In particular, the objective of Pillar 1 is to overcome rural food insecurity by increasing participation in food security in productive agriculture. A report by De Cock *et al.* states that 'women headed households are more affected by food insecurity than households headed by men (2013: 275)'. This is partly due to lack of information, inequality in income distribution and lack of asset ownership. Hence, FAO advocates for empowering rural communities, particularly women, to produce their own food for subsistence or income generation.[4] In this way, MWM emerge as an effective force to improve knowledge on women's autonomy to food production by mobilizing women using their weekly meetings.

The ability to make and implement personal decisions was highlighted as an important contributing factor to food autonomy for the achievement of nutrition outcomes among the women. As most participants in the group were heads of households, they argued that household responsibilities will entail the need for more knowledge on how to produce their own food. Women in this focus group discussion argued that the right to appropriate knowledge on food production affects their capacity to food security. According to the above responses, food autonomy gives women the capacity to make independent decisions that give them a sense of achievement. Further, Mead notes that women need to be concerned with what role they can have in shaping decisions that affect them (1995:11).

[3] This is the South African government strategy under the Department of Agriculture in partnership with the Department of Health and Social Development and Public Works focused on improving rural food insecurity.
[4] For more information, see Food and Agricultural Organisation (FAO). See www.fao.org. (Accessed on 22 May 2015.)

Beneria and Sen argue that economic agriculture disadvantaged women by 'creating class distinctions and emphasizing gender' (1981:290). The contribution of religion, gender, and key economic institutions needs to be addressed on topics relating to food autonomy and maternal health. Research results have shown women's participation in food production, or their desire to do so, and the shift in family headship this is despite maintenance responsibilities confronting most women as heads of households. Hence, this study found that women perceived societal responsibility towards household responsibilities are in many cases treated as though they have been fixed either by the Creator or culture. This is in contrast to indigenous African culture in which women were equated to the earth, had the right to land and respected as food producers and sustainers of life (Maimela 1995:28). Thus, women participation in food production enabled them to determine access to the quality and quantity of their individual and family food and nutrition because they could influence food allocation and distribution.

Religion as Situated Knowledge

Although religion has demonstrated some kind of transformation, the kind of transformation demonstrated can also be questionable. The historical negative portrayal of women has formed part of the Christian message through biblical interpretation and church teachings. From Augustine's classical view expressed in patriarchal anthropology to Aristotle's view of society as a 'hierarchy of graded subordination' (Ruether 1993:95), 'male was to govern female' (Clifford 2001:19). This was influenced by teachings such as: man created in the image of God and while women qualified only by association to a male (Ruether 1993:95). The portrayal of Eve as a 'gateway to hell, rendered all women 'morally weak, prone to sin, and needed to be kept under control to prevent a fall into sin and disorder' (Ruether 1993:90). This patriarchal ideology enabled the male gender to gain preeminence while the female gender was denied education, socio-economic, ecclesial and political participation. The religious distortion on social perceptions and ways of thinking that emerged is captured by Sofola's argument that whenever alien powers dislodged African men of their position of power they would dislodge their female counterparts from their own positions of power (2006:68). Thus, the idea of women participation in food production requires that religious ideologies that were put forward by missionaries be put to scrutiny of their

essence to create space for women emancipation. Therefore, a feminist standpoint theory, which addresses the theory of knowledge, becomes a relevant framework to analyze the power of knowledge in either subjecting or empowering women to make independent decisions. Several authors who have worked with this theory argue that feminist Standpoint theory begins from the lives of the oppressed. The differences found in these lives will produce differences in standpoint projects. It also raises important questions for feminists in relation to epistemological stand obtained. Nielsen (1990) further argues that standpoint epistemology begins with the idea that less powerful members of the society have the potential for a more complete view of social reality than others due to their disadvantaged position. The author further argues that according to standpoint epistemology the disadvantaged group has advantage to be more knowledgeable than the dominant group. Therefore, from the feminist standpoint theory, the kind of transformation that religion introduced in this study can also be questionable. This is because religion as a form of situated knowledge has historically influenced the way in which knowledge about the other gender (woman) is conceptualized and acquired. The other characteristic that is prominent in religion is the concept of power which is also a distinctive kind of obstacle to the production of knowledge in feminist standpoint theory.

The problems of knowledge, be it secular or religious, is central to feminist theorizing. Unless religious knowledge is taken into scrutiny it will continue to destabilize androcentric, mainstream thinking in the humanities and deny women of their social status as knowers. This is because knowledge and power cannot be separated. In concluding the concept of knowledge and standpoint theory Helen E. Longino asks a crucial question which needs to be understood in the context of this study saying:

> … why then is women's standpoint, in particular, a resource?... In the modern period, with its dichotomizing of public and private, women's symbolic place has been 'in the home,' in the private sphere. In the consciousness-raising groups of the 1960s and 1970s many women, consigned to the private domain as a site for (white middle-class) feminine fulfillment, learned how to describe their experience in terms they could own. Their struggle against mystified ideological descriptions of women's place can, however, be thought of as one occasion for the creation of rupture, rather than… its only occasion.

> The anticolonialist writers Frantz Fanon and Albert Memmi described similar struggles of the colonized against the ideology of the colonizer (1993:6).

Hence this study would continue to argue that knowledge drawn from Victorian model of housewife has had influence on the Manyano Women's movement in different ways.

Effects of the Victorian Model of House wife to Women Manyano Movement

Accordingly, the domestic ideology offered married women the status of 'angel' in a private and child-centered home, which found resonance with the African worldview of women as respected custodians of morals, culture, and rituals (Akyeampong & Fofack 2012:24). Yet, this model had a number of contributing factors on women. First, it prioritized Christian ideals on African mothers about their 'vital role of safeguarding female chastity, marital fidelity, maternal and domestic responsibility' (Gaitskel 1983:225). Second, it socialized African women into dependence on males for subsistence living and drove them to passivity. Third, it reinforced women's role of service and selfless giving to others at the expense of women's personal needs. Essentially, this characterized the nature of being an African Christian woman from which 'women had almost no way of freeing themselves' (Maimela 1995:27) from an ensuing dependent, consumer status and, particularly, their inability to achieve food autonomy. This domestic ideology continues to influence and even normalize women's struggles with household responsibilities in general, as societal expectation and assumption. Instead of living a life in a community of equals as promised by the Christian faith (Galatians 3:27-29), women are reduced to a status of 'survival strategists' (Bam 2005:10) as they face a life of worry, anxiety and a struggle for adequate food and subsequent maternal health.

In this way, missionary training created a 'social location' which reinforced prevailing socio-cultural norms and practices as MWPSU's beliefs, desires, and actions. As Clifford 2001:32 suggests, such a context enables dominant voices, values and ideologies to reinforce experiences and thought patterns of subjugation. Similarly, women's actions were constituted and influenced by the meaning inherent in the Church teachings that were

experienced in the weekly motherhood class. Despite envisaged Christian beneficial ideals, these women lost the status of worker and provider to that of 'consumer and dependent' (Jacka 2014:189)[5]. This entrenched the Western social assumption that women's duty is to 'satisfy men's needs', further affirmed by biblical interpretation and teachings that the 'female role as that of a helpmate' (Ruether 1993:95). In this way, Methodist Manyano Women's Prayer and Service Union teaching contributed towards women's inability to achieve food autonomy, thus limiting the promotion of maternal health. This negative influence on women's lives and their development could also be attributed to the 'unquestioned erroneous beliefs about women from developed Western countries to developing societies' (Mead: 1995:3).

Victorian Model of Housewife as a Space of Knowledge Production on Food Autonomy

Although this study has found out that Victorian family model disadvantaged women in as far as knowledge on food production is concerned, we also argue that Victorian family model can also be used as a catalyst for knowledge production on food autonomy among the Manyano women. The church comprises of individuals who are to live their values and beliefs in a way that will shape, influence and inform social responsibility among its members. For instance, Christians working to empower the poor to produce their own food, express hope for the world in which the poor are relieved from poverty and where equality and dignity is a possibility. In the world where only the few elite enjoy economic resources, this study found out that Manyano women have the power to use the same Victorian model through classes to encourage the women to attain food autonomy. This is demonstrated in the way in which the group studied used the same space to return to agriculture production and introduced food gardens within the church premises.

The women lived out their responsibilities as citizens by articulating goals towards social justice through food autonomy. Our study found out that the church as a trusted institution by the community has a responsibility to help the poor to theologize their own experiences, reasons and factors of poverty in

[5] See also Jacka (2014:189).

a way to create more just and equal societies. The Manyano Women Prayer and Service Union (MWPSU) through the Victorian model can be an empowering alternative in response to their experience of lack of food autonomy among many rural women in South Africa.

MWPSU empowered women in the domestic sphere, according to the Victorian ideology. The MWPSU can also use the same model through feminist ideologies of oneness and united sisterhood, organized support groups for women amidst absent or migrated husbands, and return to agricultural production as breadwinners. The women can use the Manyano spirit to achieve food autonomy and promote maternal health among themselves. The following statement confirms this:

> *Manyano helped me a lot, without it we would not have survived... It is just that if MMWPSU cannot help us produce our own food, nothing can help us if we don't stand up for ourselves*[6] *Manyano can help us kick-start an income generating project and we will sustain it*[7].

Mashobye women expressed faith that the organization can empower them beyond spiritual needs, towards the achievement of food autonomy and in promoting maternal health. In fact, these responses from the women show that African women are keen to obtain knowledge on food production. Therefore, the effectiveness of MWPSU teachings and activities in promoting this knowledge is inevitable through weekly prayer meetings, pastoral visitation and outreach projects where women continue to live out their faith. In this light, responses from participants were also appealing for MWPSU to develop a holistic model that will empower women to respond to challenges currently facing women in Sub Saharan Africa. Accordingly, MWPSU mission happens in a country where the Apartheid government's forced removals and community re-settlement were used as tools of oppression to deny Africans the right to food and participation in the economic mainstream. Therefore, Manyano women in this area were appealing to MWPSU to restore women's ability to produce food as a way of reclaiming the lost dignity of food autonomy as Africans through the loss of land.

[6] Response from participant (P1), in-depth interview held 20/11/2015.
[7] Response from discussion group (DG3), held on 21/11/2015.

One of John Wesley's imperatives was the 'preferential option for the poor' (L&D 2007:238), which the MCSA still believe holds a strong calling and motivation to redress poverty and social inequalities. In addition, the MCSA endorsed the Decade of Churches in Solidarity with Women, acknowledging that 'women are frequently victims of violence and of misinformation by media and anti-justice structures' (2007:233), amongst other things. Hence, the achievement of food autonomy can help transform MWPSU's dependent, subordinate and vulnerable status particularly prevalent in the rural social location, to equal participation with men. The following statement affirms these views:

> *Even though the organization is too small, almost not there, Manyano can unite women to join hands, help us to share ideas to start something together to create income and support each other to reduce this suffering from hunger*[8].
>
> *I would like other Manyanos to be aware that there are women struggling and suffering and that they need help*[9].

Studies have shown that the empowerment of women through skills training, material and economic resources and enabling access to necessary information will reduce poverty, improve nutrition and reduce diseases. In addition, MMWPSU's passion and motivation to produce food is particularly motivated by its 'gendered role' and 'social obligation' for household food provision and distribution. It is also a way of enabling the achievement of women's 'functionings' towards enhanced agency and well-being (Jacka 2014:189). Moreover, the condition of poverty, malnutrition and maternal mortality prevalent in most rural areas of Sub Saharan Africa, and Mashobye in particular, can be transformed when MWPSU is able to 'construct a guiding vision for women's liberation' (Clifford 2001:37), from lack of food autonomy which hinders maternal health. Moreover, MWPSU responses also reveal Mashobye women's dependent and vulnerable status because of their lack of food production, even though they have access to family backyards. Accordingly oppressed people tend to have a low self-esteem and to accept

[8] Response from discussion group (DG1), held on 25/04/2015.
[9] Response from participant (P4), in-depth interview held on 04/06/2015.

oppressive patriarchal conditioning 'as if it is the way things are meant to be' (Clifford 2001:28). Hence, Clifford reckons that transformation results from conscientizing the poor, and women in particular, about dominant and oppressive views, systems and structures, by closing the gap between the language of liberation and reality (Clifford 2001:36-37).

History of Apartheid and its Effect on Food Autonomy

As we close our discussion, we find it unfitting to end this study without reflecting on one of the major hindrances to women's ability to attain food autonomy. Feminist theologians claim that 'social location has a profound bearing on women's experiences' (Clifford 2001:250) of oppression and suffering, particularly because of its 'cultural conditioning of African women's thinking' (Kanyoro 2004). In addition, Koch suggests that the 'invasive poverty prevalent among most black South Africans resulted from their forced resettlement to arid and parched homelands', which was the Apartheid government way of reserving commercial farming land for White commercial farmers. Implicitly, the Apartheid government by denying Blacks the right to land, undermined 'food production for human consumption, ignored women's definition of what constitutes farming patterns, prevented production of adequate food, and separated women from mainstream development and conventional economic criteria' (Beneria & Sen 1981:283-285. This created a social location in which communities' and traditional livelihoods are displaced through land distribution. As a result, South Africa is rated amongst the 'most unequal societies in the world' (De Cock *et al*. 2013:271), a status mostly traceable to the colonial government and Apartheid regime. As patriarchal institutions, these government's food production systems reinforced African women's lower status through 'land privatization and property rights', land seizure, capital accumulation, and land accumulation, promoting racial discrimination, class stratification and unequal gender relations. Consequently, Apartheid benefited 55 000 Whites with ownership of 85% of the land, while 12 million Blacks inhabit only 17.1 million hectares of land – of which only 2.6 million hectares constitutes arable land[10]. A transformation for women's ability towards the achievement of food autonomy will require an intentional

[10] UNFAO, World Food Insecurity and Malnutrition,18.

inclination towards food models that commit not to 'more food but less hungry people, not higher production but greater distribution' (de Gruchy 2003). Essentially, a need to move away from the Apartheid and colonization views that reinforces a lens of tradition and culture through which women continue to be denied equality and justice. This will go hand in hand with theologizing cultural and traditional practices among rural communities that subordinates women to the same level as 'minors, children, and servants even alongside men's property'. Recognizing that with limited capacity for independent decision making, women's ability to achieve food autonomy will remain a challenge while vulnerability to poor maternal health, including malnutrition, continues to increase.

Conclusion

The history of women and agriculture has always been read through the social science lens with little attention to how religion can be related to issues such as food autonomy. In this study we have deliberated the way in which religion has contributed to the positioning of women in the agricultural setting of society. Through the use of the Victorian model of housewife, we have discovered that, through the use of the Victorian model of housewife, missionaries' wives contributed to the removal of African women from the food production agricultural duties. The removal of these women later affected food security in the homes hence the study called for a revisit of the role of women in food production for food autonomy. We therefore, conclude the study by stating that Manyano women can use the same Victorian model of gathering women for lessons to train women on food production by introducing household gardens. One of the calls of the MCSA is to facilitate women's access to reproductive health rights and food security (L&D 2007:283). Directing the organization's teachings and activities towards food production could form a response for MCSA to take the side of the poor and a call on poverty alleviation through the empowerment of rural women in particular (L &D 2007). In this way, the Church is directed towards 'advocacy and activism' as well as radical measures- to 'address levels of poverty, land reform and just wages … (Abrahams 2010:8).That is, religion as situated knowledge can be expected to have consequences for the transformation of knowledge within all spheres of society.

References

Abrahams, I.M. 2010. *Give us this day our daily bread. The Presiding Bishop's Address to the 120th MCSA Conference, Pietermaritzburg, South Africa, September 2009.* Cape Town: Methodist Publishing House and Book Depot.

Akyeampong, E. & H. Fofack 2012. The Contribution of African Women to Economic Growth and Development: Historical Perspectives and Policy Implications – Part I: The Pre-colonial and Colonial Periods. *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* 6051.

Bam, B. 2005. Women and the Church in (South) Africa: Women are the Church in (South) Africa. In Phiri, I.A. & S. Nadar (eds.): *On Being Church: Women's Voices and Visions.* Geneva: World Council of Churches.

Beneria, L. & G. Sen 1981. Accumulation, Reproduction and 'Women's Role in Economic Development': Boserup Revisited. *Signs* 7,2 *Development and the Sexual Division of Labour* Winter: 279-298.

Buffel, O. 2010. Preferential Option for the Poor in the Current Context of Poverty in South Africa: Doing Liberation Theology in the Footsteps of Simon Maimela. *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae* XXXVI: 99-113. Theology, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa. n.p.uir.unisa.ac.za >bitstream > handle > Buf … (Accessed on 10 April 2016.)

Clifford, A.M. 2001. *Introducing Feminist Theology*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books.

Cragg, D. & J. Millard 2013. *Open Doors Methodism in South Africa 1883-1933.* Salt River: Methodist Publishing House.

De Cock, N., M. D'Haese, N. Vink, V. van Rooyen, L. Staelens, H.C. Schönfeldt & L. D'Haese 2013. Food Security in Rural Areas of Limpopo Province, South Africa. Original Paper, Food Sec. (2013) 5:279. DOI 10.1007/s12571-013-0247-y, 271-275. link. scholar.sun.ac.za>handle. (Accessed on 22 June 2015.)

de Gruchy, S. 2003. *Biotechnology as 'Cultural Invasion': Theological Reflection on Food Sovereignty and Community Building in Africa*. *Scriptura* 82: 82 – 93.

Gaitskell, D. 1983. Housewife, Maids or Mothers: Some Contradictions of Domesticity for Christian Woman in Johannesburg, *Journal of African History* 24: 241-256.

Gaitskel, D. 1997. Power in Prayer and Service Women's Christian Orgniza-

tions. In Elphick, R. & R. Davenport (eds.): *Christianity in South Africa's Political, Social & Cultural History*. Cape Town: Creda Press (PTY) LTD.

Gould, K. 2015. Deep Food Autonomy. A Paper Presented at Indigenous Research Center of the Americas, Department of Native American Studies: U.C. Davis, 2004. Available at: http://www.escholarship.org/help_copyright. html#reuse.accessed. (Accessed on 22 October 2015.)

Jacka, T. 2014. Left Behind and Vulnerable? Conceptualizing Development and Older Women's Agency in Rural China. Australian National University. *Asian Studies Review* 38,2:189.

Johnson, E.A. 1993. *She Who is the Mystery of God in Feminist Theological Discourse*. New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company.

Kanyoro, M.R.A. 2001. *Introducing Feminist Cultural Hermeneutics*. London: Sheffield Academic Press.

Kumalo, S.R. 2009. *Methodists with a White History and a Black Future in South Africa: An Ecclesial and Socio-Political History of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa.* Johannesburg: Upper Room.

Maimela, S. 1995. Seeking to be a Christian in a Patriarchal Society. *Journal of Black Theology in South Africa* 9,2,November:27-42.

Mbiti, J.S. 1991. *Introduction to African Religion.* Second Edition. Dar es Salaam. East African EducationalPublishers Ltd.

Mead, M. 1976. A Comment on the Role of Women in Agriculture. In Tinker, I.B. & M.B. Bramsen (ed.): *Women and World Development*. American Association for the Advancement of Science. Washington D.C: Overseas Development Council.

Nielsen, M.J. 1990. Introduction. In Nielson, J.M. (ed.): *Feminist Research Methods: Exemplary Readings in the Social Sciences.* London: Westview Press.

Oduyoye, M.A. 2002. Preface: Naming Our Mothers. In Phiri, I.A., D.B. Govinden & S. Nadar (eds.): *Her-Stories: Hidden Histories of Women of Faith in Africa.* Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Parpart, J.L. 1986. *Women and the State in Afirca*. Department of History. Dalhousie University, Halifax, Canada. Working Paper #117 May 1986.

Phiri I.A, D.B. Govinden & S. Nadar 2002. *Her-Stories: Hidden Histories of Women of Faith in Africa.* Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Ruether, R.R. 1993. *Women-Church Theology and Practice*. San Francisco: Harper and Row Publishers.

Sofola, Z. 2006. Religion and Changing Gender Discourse. In Sackey, B.M. (ed.:) *New Directions in Gender and Religion: The Changing Status of Women in African Independent Churches*. Oxford: Lexington Books.

Van Reken, C.P. 1999. The Church's Role in Social Justice. *Calvin Theological Journal CTJ* 34: 198-202.

Theilen, U. 2003. *Gender, Race, Power and Religion: Women in the Methodist Church of Southern Africa in Post-Apartheid Society*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang. (Studien Zur Interkulturellen Geschichte Des Christentums.)

Longino, H.E. 2013. Feminist Standpoint Theory and the Problems of Knowledge. *Signs* 19,1,Autumn: 201-212. Available at: http://www.jstor.org/ stable/3174750. (Accessed on 22 March 2013.)

Storia Sietisho
School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics
University of KwaZulu-Natal
storias@msn.com

Lilian Cheelo Siwila
School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics
University of KwaZulu-Natal
Siwila@ukzn.ac.za

Muslim Women and Social Responsibility in Nigeria: Contributions of the Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN)

AbdulGafar Olawale Fahm

Abstract

This paper explores the various ways in which Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) has acted as a socially responsible organisation in Nigeria. Since the 1980s several Muslim women led organisations have emerged in Northern and Southern parts of Nigeria, some of which have formed networks to advocate for Muslim women's rights. Therefore, to identify the contributions of FOMWAN in Nigeria, this article looks at the emergence of Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) in particular, an organisation which was established more than three decades ago. Drawing empirical evidence from activities of FOMWAN and using historical and descriptive approaches to analyse the data, this study outlines how FOMWAN strategically engage in development projects and thus further their own vision of development. This paper discovers that FOMWAN envisages a world where women are completely enabled to be good role models in making a beneficial impact in the society. FOMWAN supports the religion of Islam in Nigeria through *Da'wah* (invitation and propagation), the establishment of educational institutions and other outreach activities. It also works towards the improvement of the conditions of the people, especially women, youths and children through training, provision of qualitative education, health, and humanitarian services, micro-enterprise scheme and advocacy as ways of playing its social responsibility role. It is, therefore, anticipated that this paper will add to the body of knowledge on Muslim women, especially as it relates to Nigeria and provides some insights to Muslim women organisations operating in Nigeria.

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a8

Keywords: FOMWAN, Muslim women, social responsibility, Nigeria, Islam

Introduction

Examining the contributions of West African Muslim women in social work – specifically in the areas of religion, economic development, health care, education, and youth development – can provide significant insights into the intricate connections of these sectors and social responsibilities of Muslim women. It has been observed that gender and development are framed in various ways to the extent that women are seen as beneficiaries of targeted development programmes, which in the end diminish their socio-economic and religious contributions (Wallace 2014). Hence, several scholars have opined that the predominant development standards often ignore the contributions of Muslim women to development efforts in their communities (Alidou 2005; Bordat, Davis & Kouzzi 2011; Callaway 1987; Hafez 2011; Mama 1996; 2001). This paper explores the extent to which Muslim women in Nigeria are contributing to the development of the country through non-governmental organisations (NGO), with a particular focus on Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) and how FOMWAN is providing a range of key development-related services.

Using historical and descriptive approaches, this research examines interactions between and within various Muslim women faith-based organisations. It also outlines how Nigeria Muslim women's organisations strategically engage in development projects and thus further their own vision of development. This study examines the experiences of Muslim women in Nigeria and makes three contributions. First, it provides significant empirical data on the contributions of a foremost Muslim women's faith-based NGO in Nigeria. Second, it shows the length at which Muslim women engage in activities in the public sphere. Finally, it asserts that Muslim women are engaged in NGOs as active participants in the development of the country rather than mere beneficiaries of the donor or government-driven development paradigms (Wallace 2014).

Based on prior studies that have noted the importance of faith-based organisations in development (Tomalin 2012; Wallace 2014; Para-Mallam 2006), this paper argues that FOMWAN, a Muslim women faith-based organisation can be regarded as a major contributor to development agenda in

Nigeria. By studying FOMWAN, this paper uncovers examples of the Nigerian Muslim women's promotion of social and political agenda which are of benefit to women and to Nigeria as a whole - in largely conservative communities - and the extent of the organisation success (Balogun 2010; O'Brien 2001; Pereira 2005). Pereira (2005) argues that FOMWAN has made significant contributions in political mobilization of women and has attempted to shift some of the hegemonic discourses on women to ones that are more favourable.

Underscoring Pereira's (2005) argument, Wallace (2014) notes that FOMWAN collaborates with other women organisations such as National Council of Women's Societies (NCWS), Women in Nigeria (WIN), Federation of Women Lawyers in Nigeria, on projects. Among the projects they have collaborated on include HIV/AIDS prevention and sensitization, reproductive health, women's economic empowerment, and elections. Olarinmoye (2013) speaks directly to the delicate nature of the society's reform when she argues that Muslim women through FOMWAN have been able to create an opening for themselves within the structure of Islam in Nigeria in recent times. One of the ways they have been able to achieve this is mainly through the discourse of Islamic reform but that such discourse of reform displays contradictions and could also be used as a source of legitimacy by more extremist groups with a negative effect in the area of women's empowerment (Olarinmoye 2013). It is, however, important to understand how Muslim women are not only negotiating their identity in contexts where they face pressures but also involved in socially responsible practices within their societies. This also helps in providing a deeper understanding of how Muslim women negotiate various development processes and how they emerge as development actors within a faith perspective (Wallace 2014). Much like Pereira's (2005) contribution to women political mobilization activities and the expansion of democratic space in Nigeria, this study analyses the varied experiences of FOMWAN as socially responsible actors to illustrate their contributions to the social, economic and political development in Nigeria. The study shall, therefore, proceed as follows; preliminary discussion on social responsibility, a historical background of FOMWAN, FOMWAN and social responsibility in Nigeria, challenges confronting FOMWAN, and conclusion.

Preliminary Discussion on Social Responsibility

Toker (2015: 396) defines corporate social responsibility as 'the common

ground which enables business and NGOs to get together for the well-being of society'. Social responsibility, according to Garriga & Melé (2004: 52), is described as 'an ethical obligation which applies to any organisation'. Maurrasse (2004) states that when legal practitioners speak of social responsibility they mean to support individual client's interest to the best of their ability, where the winning interest is formally viewed (and functions as) the best alternative for the community. From these definitions, it is evident that social responsibility is an ethical obligation and that social responsibility works for both corporate organisation and NGOs. Social responsibility also enables the wellbeing of the society and it is connected to championing the interest of the community.

In addition to the above definitions, available studies on social responsibility shed light on its nature. One of such studies shows that social responsibility entails an ethical orientation to look beyond legal obligations. In addition to moving beyond legal obligation, these scholars state that it can also be seen as a responsibility for the behaviours of people with whom organisation interacts and the consideration of the impact of the organisation's operations on the environment or community (Blowfield & Frynas 2005). It is therefore an important obligation on the part of governmental and non-governmental organisations.

It needs to be noted that close attention has not been paid to the role of social responsibility in the non-profit and public contexts (Zigan & Le Grys 2016). Many researchers often focus on social responsibility within a broader context about the role of business organisations in society (Haugh 2003; Maignan & Ferrell 2003; O'Riordan & Fairbrass 2008). This may be because social responsibility in some business organisations is usually used to track some well-targeted socially oriented purposes and a good example is regular donations to non-profit organisations, along with the goal of profit maximization (Antoci, Galeotti, Russu & Zarri 2006).

Whichever form social responsibility takes, it is usually linked to a number of factors. These factors include socio-economic problems, tackling poverty, health care provisions, infrastructural development, education, and promoting charitable and community courses (Amaeshi, Adi, Ogbechie, & Amao 2006; Bisesi & Lidman 2009; Brammer, Williams & Zinkin 2007; Hiilamo 2012; Riches 2011). Socio-economic problems in the Niger Delta, Nigeria, for example, are being tackled by Multinational companies such as Shell Petroleum Company with little contribution from the Nigerian

government. This is because there is a lack of national macroeconomic planning and management, backed by equitable resource allocation, and an enabling environment on the part of the Nigerian government (Ite 2004). More importantly, these have serious implications for the overall performance of social responsibility initiatives by organisations in developing countries.

In addition, incessant political unrests within Nigeria are not unconnected to the social and environmental issues that lie at the heart of organisations' social responsibility discussions. Teething troubles of poverty in the midst of plenty, environmental laxity, and bureau-political exploitation incriminate the Nigerian government. Also, Nigeria suffers from poor infrastructural development. An example of poor infrastructural development is the road networks in many parts of the country. Many of these roads can be regarded as underdeveloped which has led to communities being cut off from each other due to unassailable transportation networks. Moreover, the education system is largely under-funded leading to high rate of illiteracy. Boko Haram Insurgents have also made deliberate attacks on schools leading to the abduction of girls and use of schools as IDP camps, education has been seriously disrupted in the north-eastern part of Nigeria.

Nigeria has one of the worst health care systems in the world and the doctor-patient ratio is almost 1:1000. Poor hygienic behaviours are also contributing to outbreak of water-borne diseases, increase in mortality and morbidity. Lack of adequate emergency sanitation facilities also put individuals, particularly women and children at increased risk of protection issues. Furthermore, the public sector is in comatose and on top of these, corruption threatens to disintegrate the country. As such, compared to what is obtainable in the Western world, there is a near total collapse of infrastructures in Nigeria. Hence, businesses wishing to operate in Nigeria face significant constraints, from poor infrastructure, particularly road networks and electricity supply to inadequate physical security. These factors have deterred foreign organisations from assisting Nigeria and have led many Nigerians to take their skills abroad.

With this preliminary discussion, we will be able to examine the contributions of Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) and determine the extent to which such contributions have complied with the practice of social responsibility amongst Nigerian faith-based organisations and in shaping the socio-economic conditions of Nigerians. Before presenting the social responsibility contributions of

FOMWAN, it is instructive to provide a historical background of the organisation.

A Historical Background of FOMWAN

The Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria, (FOMWAN), was founded over thirty years ago. It partly owed its existence to the efforts of a few committed Muslim women who muted the idea of the need for an umbrella organisation at Muslim Sister's Organization (MSO) conference in 1984 (FOMWAN 2015c; Lemu 1997). Prior to the formation of FOMWAN, there was no distinct forum where the voice and yearnings of Muslim women could be co-ordinated in a united form. Hence, with the organizing ability and untiring energy of the first Amirah (Women Leader) of the organisation, Hajia Aisha Lemu, FOMWAN has become a household name not only within the Muslim circles in Nigeria but also among all progressive minds outside the country. Aisha Lemu, in her effort to see the formation of the organisation coming to fruition, invited some Muslim women organisations and other Muslim women (FOMWAN 2015c).

The resolution to establish a forum for Muslim women in Nigeria led to the birth of FOMWAN in Minna, Niger State on the 12th of October 1985 in the presence of delegates from Lagos, Ilorin, Minna, Kaduna, Zaria, Plateau and Sokoto States (FOMWAN 2015b). The first set of the National Executive Committee selected comprised of Hajia Aisha Lemu as the National Amirah, Hajia Jubril as Secretary and the interim Amirahs for the few states that were at the occasion; Hajia Aisha Lemu (Niger State), Alhaja Adiat Fahm (Lagos State), Hajia Muslimat Kamaldeen (Kwara State), and Hajia Saadiya Omar Bello (Sokoto State). After the meeting, the organisation registered with the Corporate Affairs Commission (FOMWAN 2015b).

Presently, FOMWAN has members in all the 36 states of the federation and Abuja, the Federal Capital Territory. Also, it has over six hundred affiliate groups nationwide which spread across villages and towns. It has also spread its tentacles to other countries in Africa, such as Gambia – FOMWAGA, Ghana – FOMWAG, Liberia – FOMWAL, Mauritius – FOMWAM, and Sierra Leone – FOMWASEL (FOMWAN 2015b). Furthermore, the urge to improve the socio-economic status of the populace (especially women, youth and children) and make its impact felt in various aspects of the community life spurred these Muslim women into taking these bold steps. Among the aims and

objectives of FOMWAN are:

(a) To create awareness of the true teachings of Islam in the Qur'an and *Sunnah* among Muslim women, and to encourage women to live in accordance with those teachings.
(b) To promote and propagate the cause of Islam in Nigeria and beyond.
(c) To make a positive impact on national matters both religious and secular with a view to safeguarding the interest of Islam.
(d) To unite and coordinate Muslim women's organisations in Nigeria so as to enable them to speak with one voice, by acting and making decisions together.
(e) To serve as a liaison body between Muslim women and the Governments (Federal, State, and Local) of Nigeria.
(f) To do away with sectarian, ethnic and other divisive factors among Muslim women in all parts of the country (FOMWAN 2007).

Besides these aims and objectives, the main goals are directed towards:

(i) Improving the moral and intellectual development of women, youth and children.
(ii) Improving the general health status of women, children, and youth in Nigeria.
(iii) Empowering women, youth, and children through skills acquisition and other financial and material support, and training for sustainable development.
(iv) Enhancing the level of understanding of the teachings of Islam amongst the '*Ummah*'
(v) Continuing to influence and effect positive changes in policies and issues that affect women, youth and children as well as the religion of Islam.
(vi) Improving the social and economic services in identified communities.
(vii) Continuing to mitigate the impact of disasters and distress on affected persons.

The attainment of the above goals will require women who are totally motivated to be socially responsible and totally empowered to be role models in making a positive impact in the society. Hence, conscious of this fact,

FOMWAN has a well-structured administrative unit in order for effective coordination and execution.

Administrative Structure of FOMWAN

For proper coordination of FOMWAN activities, Board of Trustees and Executive Committees at the National and State levels are chosen based on their dedication, illustrious and visionary contributions as well as faithfulness to the organisation. The Board of Trustees comprised of seven members and Hajia Aisha Lemu as the chairperson. The National Executive Council which is in charge of the activities of the organisation at the national level is composed of 16 members and is currently led by Hajia Amina B. Omoti. The National Executive Council although subjected to the advice and veto of the Board of Trustee is still considered the supreme authority of the Association. For all FOMWAN officials, except for Zonal Coordinators and Committee Chairpersons, the term of office is on a biennial basis. An official may also be re-elected to the same post for a period of two years, but after that period of a total number of four executive years, the official must stand down (FOMWAN 2007).

There are also 36 elected State Chairpersons of the State chapters. They are also considered members of the National Executive Council. In addition to the elected National Amirah (National President), Naibatu'l Amirah (Vice President), Secretary-General, Financial Secretary, *Da'wah*/Welfare Officer, Legal Adviser and a Public Relations Officer; FOMWAN also has an Education, Health, Publications, Finance, Welfare & Disciplinary and International Relations Boards headed by chairpersons who are also National Executive members. There are also five Zonal coordinators for the North East, North West, North Central, South West and South East (FOMWAN 2015c). With this structure in place, members of FOMWAN appear equipped for the realization of their goals. The key advances made by FOMWAN in the area of Social Responsibility in Nigeria will be examined in the next section of this paper.

FOMWAN and Social Responsibility in Nigeria

Based on the objectives and goals of FOMWAN to assist in various aspects of life, the major strides made by the association over the decades will be

carefully discussed under the following headings: educational development, health, *da'wah* and advocacy, capacity building and humanitarian services, internal and external relations, social and economic services, and disaster and distress management.

Contributions of FOMWAN to Educational Development

FOMWAN has always been at the forefront of improving the educational standards of schools in Nigeria. It has made effort in the expansion of some schools through construction of additional classrooms, acquisition of school buses, improvement in the number and quality of teachers as well as provision to improve teachers' effectiveness, integration of vocational training and basic education into curriculum of the Islamiyyah schools and award of scholarships at all levels of education, especially for females. Example of all these can be seen at FOMWAN School, Bashorun, Ibadan and FOMWAN School, Owode in Oyo State (Lawal 2015). FOMWAN also organizes workshops, training, seminars for members, and teachers. The activities of FOMWAN schools as well as community schools are also monitored regularly (FOMWAN 2015d).

In 2016, the 16th Annual National Education Summit was held in Gombe State. The Annual Education summit is a strategy used by FOMWAN to mobilize the populace and awaken the consciousness of relevant stakeholders in the country on the importance of the acquisition of functional education by all with a view to giving it the attention it deserves. The association is a lead partner in the Strategy for Implementing the Education Initiatives of a USAID Project. FOMWAN leads the process of community sensitization and enrolment drive of male and female youth, age 10-30, for participating in a learning opportunity in basic literacy and numeracy skills.

FOMWAN also has an Education Crisis Response Project that it is currently working on. ECR is a project that focuses on educationally challenged States in Nigeria such as Adamawa, Gombe and Bauchi States. The project is aimed at increasing State/Local Governments and Civil Society Organisations (CSO) support for non-formal education and alternative education option. The activities that the association has since carried out include; building the knowledge of key stakeholders in the target states about the roles of non-formal learning. The ECR Project is also aimed at expanding access to quality, protective, and relevant non-formal education (NFE) and alternative education (AE) opportunities for internally displaced out-of-school

children ages 6-17, in Adamawa, Bauchi, and Gombe. The Project is designed to address the main learning needs of internally displaced children and host learners affected by the crisis in North Eastern Nigeria by establishing Non-formal Learning Centres (NFLCs) Youth Learning Centres (YLCs), and Adolescent Girls Learning Centres (AGLCs) (FOMWAN 2015d).

In addition, FOMWAN being an education aimed organisation is committed to education especially for women and children. This is why it has 150 schools nationwide and more than 1,200 *Islamiyyah* schools and many Adult literacy and Vocational schools. Furthermore, from 2005 to 2010, FOMWAN was actively involved in the Ambassadors' Girls Scholarship Programme (AGSP), which was aimed at enhancing opportunities of the Girl-Child to education. The project was sponsored by US Agency for International Development (USAID) and the implementation was through World Education, Incorporation (FOMWAN 2015b). In the first year of the project (2005/2006) FOMWAN gave a total of 524 scholarships; 343 of which were for primary school girls. The association continued with funding of most of these young scholars and enrolled 200 more in the 2006/2007 session (FOMWAN 2015b). It also proposed the inclusion of boys and the Scholarship scheme was extended to boys in the second year of the project. Hence, in 2008, 748 female and 548 boys benefited in the scholarship programme and by June 2009, a total of 850 benefited from the same programme (FOMWAN 2015b). The programmes and activities coordinated by the association have helped lots of girls and boys through their education who would otherwise have been dropouts or street children.

Contributions to the Health Sector

FOMWAN is committed to healthy and good living. It has particularly taken interest in the productive and maternal health. Some of its activities in the health sector include provision of standard hospitals and clinics in states across the country e.g. FOMWAN Hospital in Kaduna State and FOMWAN Clinic in Plateau State, providing in-patients, out-patients, antenatal and postnatal, surgical, laboratory, radiography, VVF repairs and other services to the community (FOMWAN 2015b). It has also embarked on the creation of awareness of prevention and treatment of deadly and communicable disease like HIV/AID, EBOLA etc. Also, it has supported awareness programmes in communities on reproductive health, accessibility to service centres, available

services, their usefulness and otherwise to the community through religious leaders, community leaders, policymakers, media and the end users (FOMWAN 2015b). In addition, the association during meetings engages members on enlightenment talks on contemporary health issues. The National Health Committee through its selected members arranges, oversees and ensures implementation of all health programmes. These have led to the association collaborating with agencies, organisations, government, and other stakeholders to ensure proper dispensation of services (FOMWAN 2015b).

Currently, FOMWAN has reproductive health training programme in 10 states of the Northern part of Nigeria. It trains clinical health workers in HIV prevention and management. It organizes HIV training for religious and community leaders in 4 states (Kwara, Kaduna, Borno, and Bauchi) with sponsorship from the National Action Committee on AIDS (NACA). It trains workers in post-miscarriage care in FOMWAN hospitals in Jos, Kaduna, and other Muslim hospitals in Sokoto, Kano, and the Yobe States. It has also trained 114 Muslim health workers in Borno and Bauchi and often urges States to focus on HIV/AIDS. The organisation also engages in capacity building a workshop in reproductive health and advocacy through the sponsorship from Futures Group and Pathfinder/Packard funding for reproductive health (FOMWAN 2015c).

Contributions to Da'awah and Advocacy

Furthermore, the association continues to advocate for Girl Child Education through sensitization, mobilization of parents and other stakeholders on the importance of women/girls education, scholarship schemes for girls, and mentorship programmes. These have led to the retention and improvement in the quality of Girl-Child education (FOMWAN 2015b). It also advocates for the continuing education for married women, because marriage should not be a barrier to learning. It promotes education as a means to poverty eradication. It also promotes the integration of Qur'anic schools to include literacy, numeric and vocational training. As earlier stated, the association advocates the nomadic education and education for the handicapped and others in difficult exceptional circumstances. It promotes market women education in basic literacy skills and implementing a *shari'ah* and women right's projects in 12 Shari'ah implementing States (FOMWAN 2015a).

Contributions in Capacity Building and Humanitarian Services

The issue of unemployment is also tackled by FOMWAN through capacity building and engaging humanitarian services. In Nigeria, there have been instances when unemployed youths have been used as thugs during political campaigns and to perpetrate violence. Since unemployment leads to frustration and crimes, the association helps the community through empowering members and non-members economically, educationally, socially, and morally through the establishment of small scale businesses and vocational institutes (FOMWAN 2015b). FOMWAN has empowered many youths and women through various vocational and skill acquisition programmes in virtually all the states of the federation. The organisation has trained people including the physically challenged in sewing, fashion designing, tying, dyeing of material, soap and cosmetic production, Garri and wheat production, leather bags production, snail and fish farming, goat and cattle rearing and breeding, sachet water production (FOMWAN 2015a).

In 2015, FOMWAN commemorated Humanitarian Service Day with the theme 'Humanitarian Services a Path to Paradise'. The organisation national executive also visited the Ekiti State Teaching Hospital with a donation of bed sheets and other items. It also used the occasion to sell commemorative souvenirs and the returns used to raise fund for the running of the association. The association runs orphanage homes, care of orphans and vulnerable children in Ibadan and Osogbo. It also provides welfare for prisons and prison inmates, old people's homes, and remand homes.

Contributions in the Area of Internal and External Relations

As an organisation with consultative status with United Nations, FOMWAN makes inputs into policies through a partnership with government thereby earning it an official stakeholder status in the Federal Government's Universal Basic Education (UBE), the Nomadic Education programmes, and at the Joint Consultative Committee on Education (JCCE). The organisation is also involved in the FG/UNICEF Qur'anic Education programme. FOMWAN is a member, of the Civil Society Coalition on Education for All (CSACEFA), an initiative that was initially funded by Action Aid. Various State branches are

also networking and collaborating with other non-governmental organisations (NGOs) in education and rehabilitation of *Almajiris* (FOMWAN 2015c).

In addition, FOMWAN is one of the seven CSOs implementing the PACFAH project funded by the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation; a 3-year project which commenced in November 2014 and will end in 2017. The project assists CSOs work in promoting maternal and child health through enabling CSOs to form strong supportive partnerships which will work together to advocate for accountability, transparency and responsiveness of government at the national and state levels in areas of policy, budgets and administrative regulations for child and family health in Nigeria among others and promote implementation of the National Food and Nutrition Security Plan (FOMWAN 2015d).

FOMWAN collaborates with other relevant organisations for effective networking. It also generates enough goodwill through her activities so much as to represent Muslim women nationwide and serves as a liaison body between Muslim women and the Government. The organisation further collaborates with Government at all levels and network with civil society organisation in areas of women issues, health, social issues, legal rights, good governance and election monitoring.

Contributions in Mitigating the Impact of Disasters and Distress

It supports victims of flood disasters by providing food, shelter, and clothing. It also provides support services for government and other stakeholders' activities for distribution of funds to disaster areas, care, and management of victims of such mishaps. FOMWAN has rapid response teams that respond to local and national emergencies such as communal crisis, flood or fire incident, epidemics or insurgencies. It has also conducted a palace based sensitization meeting to communities on the benefit of supporting children in Internally Displaced People (IDP) and on hygiene practices.

Challenges Confronting FOMWAN and their Solutions

There are challenges that FOMWAN as an organisation has identified to be stumbling blocks to the progress of the association:

(i) Not financial independent, therefore, often depend on financial donations from philanthropists
(ii) Involvement with foreign donors at times divert the attention from *da'wah* projects and activities.
(iii) Inability to carry along some other women organizations in order to speak more often with one voice on issues affecting Muslim women.

Solutions were also proffered to these challenges and these include; the need to create a full business arm of FOMWAN, repositioning members orientation on involvement with a foreign donor, cautioning members from setting up parallel organisations with the same aims and missions as well as using the association's structure to execute their programmes.

From a political angle, FOMWAN needs to encourage more women to be actively involved in contesting for a leadership position. The association needs to give comprehensive backing to women aspirants and always make its position known on unpopular political decision especially those capable of causing untold hardships not just on women and children but on Nigerians as a whole. There is also the need for advocacy on the proper upbringing of children by parents or guardian. This will lead to a more peaceful and harmonious society.

Conclusion

This study showed the social responsibility practice of FOMWAN. Obviously, improving the different aspects of community life in Nigerian communities would require action on several fronts, including education development, health development, capacity building and humanitarian services. Therefore, this study urges that deliberate efforts should be made by Nigerian government to improve the conditions of the less privileged section of the population.

FOMWAN's social responsibility practices can be further seen in the diverse areas in which it contributes. Among faith-based organisations in Nigeria, FOMWAN has shown that it has the potentials to bring about an enhanced socio-economic condition of the people. This study has therefore examined social responsibility, emphasizing its meaning and scope. The historical background of the association was also provided showing its emergence, the objectives of its founders and organisational setup. The social responsibility endeavours of the association with examples were also put on

record as well as the challenges before the association and their solutions carefully articulated. While it is indisputable that FOMWAN has made positive contributions to its members and the entire Nigeria, it can do more if the enabling environment is created and members' tenacity to attain victory is unshaken.

References

Alidou, O.D. 2005. *Engaging Modernity: Muslim Women and the Politics of Agency in Postcolonial Niger*. *Women in Africa and the Diaspora*. Available at: http://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-007-0024-9.

Amaeshi, K.M., B.S. Adi, C. Ogbechie & O.O. Amao 2006. Corporate Social Responsibility in Nigeria: Western Mimicry or Indigenous influences ? *Journal of Corporate Citizenship* 24: 83–99. Available at: http://doi.org/ 10.2139/ssrn.896500.

Antoci, A., M. Galeotti, P. Russu & L. Zarri 2006. Generalized Trust and Sustainable Coexistence between Socially Responsible Firms and Nonprofit Organizations. *Chaos, Solitons & Fractals* 29,3: 783–802.

Balogun, A.S. 2010. Islamic Perspectives on HIV/AIDS and Antiretroviral Treatment: The Case of Nigeria. *African Journal of AIDS Research* 9,4: 459–466.

Bisesi, M. & R. Lidman 2009. Compassion and Power: Religion, Spirituality, and Public Administration. *International Journal of Public Administration* 32,1: 4–23.

Blowfield, M. & J.G. Frynas 2005. Editorial - Setting New Agendas: Critical Perspectives on Corporate Social Responsibility in the Developing World. *International Affairs* 81,3: 499–513.

Bordat, S.W., S.S. Davis & S. Kouzzi 2011. Women as Agents of Grassroots Change: Illustrating Micro-empowerment in Morocco. *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 7,1: 90–119.

Brammer, S., G. Williams & J. Zinkin 2007. Religion and Attitudes to Corporate Social Responsibility in a Large Crosscountry Sample. *Journal of Business Ethics* 71,3: 229–243.

Callaway, B.J. 1987. *Muslim Hausa Women in Nigeria: Tradition and Change*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.

FOMWAN 2007. *FOMWAN Constitution Code of Conduct & Guidelines*. Abuja: FOMWAN.

FOMWAN 2015a. *30 Years of Service of Islam.* Abuja: FOMWAN.

FOMWAN 2015b. *FOMWAN 30th Annual National Conference, Kwara 2015.* Abuja: Federation of Muslim Women Associations in Nigeria.

FOMWAN 2015c. Information about FOMWAN. *FOMWAN 30th Anniversary 1985 - 2015*. Abuja: FOMWAN.

FOMWAN 2015d. *Quarterly Report of Activities of The Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria.* Abuja: FOMWAN.

Federation of Muslim Women Association of Nigeria (FOMWAN). Available at: www.fomwan.org.ng.

Garriga, E. & D. Melé 2004. Corporate Social Responsibility Theories: Mapping the Territory. *Journal of Business Ethics* 53: 51–71. Available at: http://doi.org/10.1023/B:BUSI.0000039399.90587.34

Hafez, S. 2011. Women Developing Women: Islamic Approaches for Poverty Alleviation in Rural Egypt. *Feminist Review* 97: 56–73.

Haugh, R. 2003. Getting the Attention of Big Pharma. And Big Pharma is Listening. *Hospitals & Health Networks/ AHA* 77,10: 44–48.

Hiilamo, H. 2012. Rethinking the Role of the Church in a Socio-democratic Welfare State. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy* 32,7/8: 401–414.

Ite, U.E. 2004. Multinationals and Corporate Social Responsibility in Developing Countries: A Case Study of Nigeria. *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management* 11,1: 1–11.

Lawal, K.A. 2015. *Four Year Report of Activities of FOMWAN Oyo State Chapter. (July 2011-July 2015).* Ibadan: FOMWAN.

Lemu, A. 1997. FOMWAN History and Experience – A Case Study. *The Muslim Woman* 23–27.

Maignan, I. & O.C. Ferrell 2003. Nature of Corporate Responsibilities: Perspectives from American, French, and German Consumers. *Journal of Business Research* 56,1: 55–67.

Mama, A. 1996. *Women's Studies and Studies of African Women during the 1990s* (5 No. 96). Dakar.

Mama, A. 2001. Challenging Subjects: Gender and Power in African Contexts. *African Sociological Review* 5,2: 63–73.

Maurrasse, D. 2004. *A Future for Everyone: Innovative Social Responsibility and Community Partnerships*. Psychology Press.

O'Brien, S.M. 2001. Spirit Discipline: Gender, Islam, and Hierarchies of Treatment in Postcolonial Northern Nigeria. *Interventions: International Journal of Postcolonial Studies* 3,2: 222–241. Available at: http://doi.org/ 10.1080/ 13698010120059627.

O'Riordan, L. & J. Fairbrass 2008. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR): Models and Theories in Stakeholder Dialogue. *Journal of Business Ethics* 83,4: 745–758.

Olarinmoye, O.O. 2013. Negotiating Empowerment: Women and Identity in Nigeria. *International Journal of Sociology and Anthropology* 5,3: 59–65. Available at: http://doi.org/10.5897/IJSA10.115

Para-Mallam, O.J. 2006. Faith, Gender and Development Agendas in Nigeria: Conflicts, Challenges, and Opportunities. *Gender & Development* 14,3: 409–421. Available at: http://doi.org/10.1080/13552070600980898.

Pereira, C. 2005. Domesticating Women? Gender, Religion and the State in Nigeria under Colonial and Military Rule. *African Identities* 3,1: 69–94. Available at: http://doi.org/10.1080/14725840500065937

Riches, G. 2011. Thinking and Acting Outside the Charitable Food Box: Hunger and the Right to Food in Rich Societies. *Development in Practice* 21,4–5: 768–775.

Toker, H. 2015. NGOs. In Idowu, S.O., N. Capaldi, M. Fifka, L. Zu & R. Schmidpeter (eds.): *Dictionary of Corporate Social Responsibility*. Springer.

Tomalin, E. 2012. Thinking about Faith-based Organisations in Development: Where have we Got to and What Next? *Development in Practice* 22,5-6: 689–703.

Wallace, A. 2014. Agency through Development: Hausa Women's NGOs and CBOs in Kano, Nigeria. *Feminist Economics* 20,4: 281–305.

Zigan, K. & A. le Grys 2016. Towards an Understanding of Social Responsibility within the Church of England. *Journal of Business Ethics* 1–26.

AbdulGafar Olawale Fahm
Department of Religions
University of Ilorin
Ilorin
Nigeria
Fahm.ao@unilorin.edu.ng

Theorising Steve Biko's 'Human Face' Challenge alongside Gabriel Marcel's Embodied Hermeneutics

Zorodzai Dube

Abstract

Within a context of globalisation and multiculturalism –spaces of disjuncture and identity fissures, what role could religion (Christianity) play? Steve Biko's statement concerning religion having a human public face shall be contextualised and put into dialogue with Gabriel Marcel's concepts of embodiment. The paper concludes that a religion that has a public human face promotes empathy or interconnectedness, providing an alternative conceptualisation of anthropology anchored on empathy, participation and intersubjectivity.

Keywords: interconnected, religion, embodiment, human face

Introduction: Locating the Research Argument

Steve Bantu Biko though trained as a medical doctor was a philosopher, politician and a humanitarian. His ideas have been used in various disciplines where questions of identity and justice are raised. For example, recently, Steve Bantu Biko's ideas provided the epistemological material to the Fees Must Fall Movement, providing the epistemological sounding board for the articulation of sentiments of inequality and black experience. Biko, though not a theologian. reflected on questions of theology in the context of apartheid. My stating point on reflecting on Biko's views concerning the public role of religion is the profound statement that he made in respond to Christianity saying,

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a9

> We have set out on a quest for true humanity, and somewhere on the distant horizon we can see the glittering prize. Let us march forth with courage and determination drawing strength from our common plight and our brotherhood. In time we shall be in a position to bestow upon South Africa the greatest possible gift – a more human face (Oliphant 2008:214).

Though simple, the statement is pregnant with meaning. Two preliminary points are worthy highlighting. From the statement, Biko sees Christianity as an antithesis to humanity. Why colonial Christianity is inhumane are further explained below. The second aspect from Biko is that a religion with a human face derives its epistemological resources from the plight of the people; an aspect which is at the centre of Biko's argument in his articulation of the understanding of God and social relations (Mngxitama *et al*. 2008:15). Biko's call for a religion that has a human face, in my view, provides the discussion material upon which to talk about issues related to social disjuncture and disrespect of life in general. Among others, Biko allows us to raise questions such as: what kind of society is envisaged under a religion that has a human face? My task in this paper is to explain the characteristics of a religion with a public human face within the context of globalisation and multiculturalism – our context.

Challenges Associated with Globalisation and Multiculturalism

Globalisation is characterised by post-national realities; people and businesses travel and operate at a global stage and no longer bound by national boundaries. Globalisation and multiculturalism are related terms; while the later describes the post-national reality, the former refers to the condition of multinational identities existing within one geographic space. Advantages and disadvantages exists, such as the free movement of people and a rich culture based on various identities; the global co-existing with the local. Terms such as poly-identity and poly-phonic are often used to describe such contexts.

However, in recent years, globalization has resulted in inequalities (Fukuyama 1989:3). Contrary to expectation, as Anthony Gidden's (1990:13) poignantly notes, economic disparity and asymmetric social realities are often

the hallmark of current globalisation, celebrating individual success rather than the collective. Besides state welfare and intervention, global capitalism has little to offer towards welfare. Globally, while the rich are visibly rich through the usual symbols of flashy cars and luxurious houses, the consequence of inequality are visible through expanding urban shakes and concomitant social ills such as prostitutions, drugs and burglary. Jean Baudrillard (1983:20) who writes from the perspective of discourse analysis further comments saying, capitalism by not interrogating the structures that makes them poor, it lures people into pursuit for pleasure devoid of guarantee towards economic emancipation. The value of life has been replaced by the pursuit of profit and individual fame and pleasure. Such truth can be illustrated in countries such as South Africa where, instead of questioning the structures that causes limit on aspects such as –water, housing and employment, people people's attention is diverted towards xenophobic attacks (Dube 2016:1). The picture of the world under globalisation is one whereby people do not respect life and value human dignity.

Aspects of a Religion without a Human Face

For a better grasp of Biko's call for a religion with a public human face, a brief bibliography of Biko who lived a brief and yet fruitful life between 1946 till 1977 is given. Living during the height of apartheid in South Africa, a medical doctor by training, Biko was appalled by the manner in which the black people were treated. As a system, apartheid was anchored on an ideology that the white people are superior to the blacks and it spatially treated the two races as different (Maluleke 2008:65). Unlike other systems of governance, apartheid was actively supported by erroneous biblical interpretation of God who created the white race as superior and ruler, while black people were ideologically viewed as an inferior race. Thus spatially, the black people were not supposed to live together with the whites. Biko reflected on his experience saying, 'I have lived all my conscious life in the framework of institutionalised separate development. My friendships, my love, my education, my thinking and every other facet of my life have been carved and shaped within the context of separate development' (Biko 1987:29a). Christianity was used as a discourse to cement the subjugation of the black people and to create a false narrative that discursively portrays black people as inferior to white people (1987:81c).

First for Biko Christianity which is steeped in western mind-set has no public human face because it does not relate the lived experiences of the African people. Here Biko's comment should be understood from the perspective of contrasting worldviews of individualism versus collectivism. More importantly western Christianity during that time could not be separated from the entitlements of racism that describe Africans as less human. Thus for Biko the God espoused by Christianity has no resonance to the condition of the black people because he is removed from the plight of the black people. Biko gives insight saying,

> 'whereas Christianity had gone through rigorous cultural adaptation from ancient Judea through Rome, through London, through Brussels and Lisbon, somehow when it landed in the Cape, it was made to look fairly rigid. Christianity was made the central point of a culture which brought with it new styles of clothing, news customs, new forms of etiquette, new medical approaches, and perhaps new armaments' (Biko 1987:57).

Embedded within the above statement is the westerner's perception of the African as receivers of everything including God. Western missionaries, travellers and colonialist did not see the Africans as dialogue partners. This can be illustrated from David Livingstone, a traveller and explorer on behalf of the British government who understood the purpose of his expeditions as bring three 'Cs' –Christianity, commerce and civilisation to the African people. The west saw as part of their religious duty as that of bringing knowledge of God to the black people. Two sub-variables informs this mentality: first, Westerners whose mentality was steeped in evolutionary anthropology truly regarded Africans as less-human. Biko criticises the white people for regarding blacks with adjectives like dark, uncouth and godless (Biko 1987:85). Secondly and related to the above, God was supposed to be taught to the black people because they cannot think or rationalise about God. God was conceived as a being whose attributes are understandable through logic. Since God is understood from rigorous philosophical thinking, an aspect that was seen as non-existent among the African people, blacks were seen as having no clue regarding God. This whole mind-set informs the western's approach towards the Africans and God. Thus God was supposed to be transmitted via western lenses and such knowledge to be diligently transplanted into the native's minds. In several

insistences Biko debunked such prejudices, so also several African theologians such as John Mbiti (Mbiti 2015: 45). Biko's response is that God is an ever-present reality does not need to be learnt through the bible. However Biko had no problem with the Bible but with the assumption that only through the Bible can the Africans know God thus disregarding other sources through which God has spoken to the African people.

Second, the church has no public face because it is aloof and distant from the suffering of the black people. Biko has no kind words towards the church, missionaries and the collaborators – the black ministers. He sees the church, which he regarded as an oppressive institution, as a mere extension of colonisation, whose existence is to further stupefy the black people through discourses and teachings which defers their earthy bliss (1987:55c). Biko comments saying that,

> in a country teeming with injustice and fanatically committed to the practice of oppression, intolerance and blatant cruelty because of racism bigotry, in a country where all black people are made to feel the unwanted stepchildren of a God whose presence they cannot feel; in a country where father and son, mother and daughter alike develop daily into neurotic through sheer inability to relate the present to the future because of a completely engulfing sense of destitution, the Church further adds to their insecurity by its inward-directed definition of the concept of sin and its encouragement of the 'mea culpa' attitude (Biko 1987:57).

The above statement evokes the question – why did the church during colonialism, not speak to the social issues affecting the people? Biko lists concerning social ills such as cruelty, subjugation, poverty and racism and expects the church to begin its theology by addressing these issues, but alas, the church shifts attention to focusing on issues concerning sin and salvation. From the above statement Biko seems to be raising the profound statement regarding the allegiance of God. Biko seems to be arguing that if God is universal, loving and creator of all, then indeed, he would be enraged by the condition of the black people under colonialism. In view of this research we can deduce that a theology with no public face is one whose God is deaf to the cries of the people. But why? Such a God would be aloof is he is discursively constructed as having a particular colour. The colonial God was constructed as

a God of the white people whose activities were sanctioned by their God. Thus from Biko we can learn that colonialism was a political economic project with a theological engine as its discursive glue.

Third, for Biko the colonial church has no human face because it sidesteps the real questions of racism, injustice and subjugation. Biko raises this issue mainly in his discussion about black ministers. These in Biko's eyes should know better because they come from the people and share much in common with their fellow Africans compared to the white missionary. Biko retorts,

> our ministers are still top busy with moral trivialities. They blow these up as the most important things that Jesus had to say to people. They constantly urge the people to find fault in themselves and by so doing detract from the essence of the struggle in which the people are involved (Biko 1987:32).

This is one clearest instance where Biko expressed his relationship towards black ministers whose preaching does not relate to the main challenges facing the people –poverty, oppression and racism. Biko describes them as detractors who concentrate on moral vices than the real issues. While Biko did not condone criminality in the township, he sees it as consequence of the people's condition. A perspective by Jean and John Comaroff is plausible in understanding Biko' evaluation of Black ministers. In an article Christianity and colonisation in South Africa, they argue that like colonialism, Christianity had what they characterised as diffused agency (Comaroff & Comaroff 1986: 1-22). While colonisation was channelled towards the possession and extraction of resources from the blacks, colonial Christianity was devised as a tool to stupefy the natives. From this perspective Biko's statement makes much sense. Far from being regarded as agency of a good God, black ministers worked for the colonialist to provide the discourse that make the black people not to question the material condition of their existence. Biko makes a clear critique of Christianity saying,

> 'It was the missionaries who confused our people with their new religion. By some strange logic, they argued that theirs was a scientific religion and ours was mere superstition in spite of the biological discrepancies so obvious in the basis of their religion. They further

> went on to preach a theology of the existence of hell, scaring our fathers and mothers with stories about burning in eternal flames and gnashing of teeth and grinding of bone. This cold cruel religion was strange to us but our fore-fathers were sufficiently scared of the unknown impending anger to believe that it was worth a try. Down went our cultural values! (Biko 1987:44).

Though not clear, Biko's reference to the biological discrepancies within Christianity may refer to the unresolved issue of Immaculate Conception. Biko seem to cite this as evidence that, like in African religion, Christianity is not scientific as it claims; it too as myths. In addition, illustrated by the above citation is the idea that missionaries presented Christianity as a coercive religion; one that must be accepted if not you burn in hell. The conversion to Christianity was due to fear of burning in hell. Further implicitly from Biko is that the Christian God is cruel; his terms and condition are so strict that offenders, besides going to hell, have no second change. This further reinforce the argument that the primary focus of western Christianity was supplanting local religion with western worldviews; never about the welfare of the black people.

Perspective: Embodied Hermeneutics

Having explored Biko's critique of Christianity as lacking a human face, the next task is investigating what Biko meant by a religion with a human face. Andile Mngxitama *et al.* argues that Biko's call for human face should be prefaced within the larger argument of black communism. For Mngxitama et-al, Biko was not advancing an ethical argument because he fully knows that apartheid could not be overthrown overnight (Mngxitama *et al.* 2008: 1-20). Instead he was advocating for an alternative political system based on black communism which became the basis of his criticism of the black elite and white supremacy. While Mngxitama *et al.* presents a valuable argument by taking cognisance of the political context of Biko, I fear that much focus is on the political context, rather than the moral context behind the call – an argument presented by Andries Oliphant.

Oliphant (2009:217) postulates that Biko's call for a religion with a human face should be theorised from the perspective of African cultural resources, for example Ubuntu. According to Oliphant a religion with a human

face is characterised by 'human-centeredness; intimacy; trust; belief in the inherent goodness of human beings; communalism and cooperativeness; caring and sharing; collective ownership; a monotheistic religion with a benevolent God and ancestral deities; a situation-experiencing mind-set; communicative-ness; and a closeness to nature (Oliphant 2008:223). He further elaborates saying that 'the human-centeredness of African village communities, on the other hand, is manifest in the bonds of kinship and forms of social interaction not exclusively governed by economic interests or any other forms of exploitive instrumentality'.

It is plausible to say that Oliphant describes Ubuntu from a moral perspective emphasising on collective values and shared virtues. From Oliphant's perspective, a religion with a human face instils and expresses the moral imperatives of a God who wants his creation to live in harmony. There is a progressive linear argument underlying Oliphant's argument that starts from a moral and just God to the creation that is mandated to live in harmony. Several similar research have been done that seek to demonstrate the relevance of Ubuntu. For example Augustine Shuttle and John Bhengu advances the idea that Ubuntu is an essential moral canopy for the practising of democracy and ethics (Shutte 2001; Bhengu 1996). Equally Njongokhulu Ndungane in biography of his own life refers to a world with a human face of caring and equal access without giving much detail regarding the theoretical base upon which such caring can be realised (Ndungane 2003: 20).

In my view, a moral perspective represented by Oliphant fall short in explaining how God relates to creation. It seems Oliphant does not account for the constant re-definition of God based on people's experiences –a frequent idea from Biko's critique of Christianity. Biko accused Christianity of being stagnant in one culture –the western worldview and failing to metamorphosis into the experiences of the native people. Similarly a perspective such as that of Oliphant perceives God as stagnant and being a source of morality. As Biko critiques, it further locates God outside the experiences of people. Hence while I agree with the bulk of Oliphant's moral approach, I think Gabriel Marcel's embodied epistemology brings a much clearer explanation of Biko's view concerning a religion with a public human face. My focus is to bring the ideas of Biko in dialogue with those of Marcel to give a clearer explanation concerning his understanding of the public role of religion.

Gabriel Marcel, a child of a French diplomat, was born in Paris, France in 1889 and died in 1973. As a young man his condition of being hypertensive

made him ineligible to serve in the military during the world war one and two. Instead, he served in the Red Cross where he was responsible for the welfare of the combatants and delivering the news of death to relatives. From his biography, events of pain and death witnessed during the World War II shaped his philosophy about God and humanity (Marcel 1987:5). Marcel was deeply touched by the experience of pain, wounds, broken bodies which became his starting point in doing philosophy. As an existentialist, Marcel came to a conclusion that experience is the source of epistemology. Experiences such as pain, sorry or any other are felt within the body and not as something outside one's body. By saying so, Marcel criticised rationalism for objectification; separating the body from its meaning –experience.

In my view Biko and Marcel share similar challenges of trying to find sense of meaning or epistemology in relation to the body or self. I regard both arguing that meaning cannot be derived outside the Self. Thus concerning religion, they both argue that religion is an experienced relationship of self with other people and God – not dogma or creeds. From this background, what then is the religion with a public face?

First, the religion with a public human face begins with the identity of God as a non-detached God, an idea that should not be confused with the Christian idea of incarnation. In Christianity, incarnation refers to God who took a human form through Jesus. In Biko the idea of a non-detached God refers to God who derives his existence from people's experiences. Unlike in Christian theology where God visits to learn of human condition, Biko understands God as an embodiment of people experience. God is not a visitor, neither are his attributes located outside the people's experiences. From this perspective Biko struggles with the idea of an imported rigid God; only accessible through rigorous textual interpretive skill. Biko (1987:44c) explains saying,

> we did not believe that religion could be featured as a separate part of our existence on earth. It was manifest in our daily lives. We thanked God through our ancestors before we drank beer, married, worked etc. We would obviously find it artificial to create special occasions for worship. Neither did we see it logical to have a particular building in which all worship would be conducted. We believed that God was always in communication with us and therefore merited attention everywhere and anywhere.

Vuyani Vellem's views from a black theology perspective, helps us to better understand Biko's sentiments. Vellem sees a connection between modernity and racism or exploitation, arguing that modernity removed God from the reality of people's lives, to dehumanise them. He understands the current task of black theology as that of restoring life by denying the false anthropology of modernity (Vellem 2015: 1-6). I concur by saying that a theology of life calls for re-description of God in view of people's experiences. Instead of God who is high and lifted up, God is addressed with reciprocal titles such as 'God of migrates', the 'God of people in squatters', 'God of the homeless', 'God of the abused', 'God of the poor or God of the vulnerable'. Consequently, the reason western Christianity does not respond to the needs of the African people is due to its epistemology that places God outside human experience.

Biko's ideas echo similar views to those of Marcel, a Christian existentialist who argues that the identity of God is described by our experiences. Like Biko, Marcel criticises modernity for its dualistic thinking; God is located outside human experiences (Louis 1976:17). God is not outside my experiences, but defined by them.

What is the implication within a context of multiculturalism and globalisation? First it cautions against universalisation of regional and exclusive experiences which are not meant to be universal viewpoints of God. A public religion within a global and multicultural context demands a plural and multifaceted narratives of God, deconstructing imperial narratives that excludes the experiences of minorities such as women, gays and minorities. If the identity of God is embedded within our experiences then all experiences are valid articulations of God. Second it provides a critique for discourses that addresses God as high and lifted up in hymnal songs. Connected to this is a deconstruction of patriarchal terminology that are used to address God, such as God as 'father', 'king' or 'ruler', which locates him outside the realm of humans (Dube 2013:5).

Second, a religion with a public face within the context of multiculturalism is mediated through collective convictions towards the dignity of life. While the first point points to the re-configuration of the location and description of God, this second aspect focuses on the function of religion within the society. Biko sees religion as that of providing service to the people; to be wide-awake to the concerns of the community –not personal faith or escape to heaven. The challenge that Biko had with western form of Christianity was its lack of commitment towards servicing the people. Marcel

echoes similar ideas by using terms such as fidelity, inter-subjectivity and participation (Strauss & Machado 1984:123). Marcel whole understanding of society and its internal function can be best understood by his use of the term fidelity. Fidelity, inter-subjectivity and participation all refer to commitment to being present. To be present is not passive presence, but active participation. For Marcel, being human is a choice for fidelity or participation, or the lack of it. Fidelity or participation implies a commitment towards those issues that affect society such as the quality and dignity of life. Non-participation is a refusal to take part in solving social issues. From this perspective we can better understand Biko's critique of African preachers who can be described as non-participant individuals in that they did not commit to the collective desire which was freedom and dignity. In my view, globalisation that is met by a participant community will result in a globalisation of the empathy.

Biko's idea of an engaging religion and Marcel's notion of a participatory religion has implications towards the context of globalisation and multiculturalism. A participatory religion would foster social cohesion in context of xenophobia and racism. Commenting on the hospitality of the African culture, Biko's (1987:41) says,

> We enjoy man for himself. We regard our living together not as an unfortunate mishap warranting endless competition among us but as a deliberate act of God to make us a community of brothers and sisters jointly involved in the quest for a composite answer to the varied problems of life.

I add that globalisation and multiculturalism have brought our differences closer. From the perspective of Biko and Marcel, a participatory religion deals with issues concerning racism and inequalities. For example, in South Africa, race and status are the variables in the way people live. 'White' dominated churches are located in rich neighbourhoods while black churches are in poor neighbourhoods. While this may be understood as consequence of economic factor, it also reveals lack of participation.

The idea of participation also provides critique for the Christian idea of individual salvation. If being religious is participating then teachings such as working out one's personal salvation towards heaven becomes heretical teachings within the church (de Lacoste 1995:72).

Conclusion

The paper thinks alongside Biko and Marcel on the meaning of religion and its social responsibility. First, using Biko and Marcel, the public social responsibility of religion within a context of multiculturalism would constantly redefine of God in view of the people's experiences. God should not be defined by our narrow experiences but by evolving human experiences. For example, in my view this aspects speaks to how slow the church is evolving in redefining God in view of alternative sexualities that are different to the norm. Second a religion with social responsibility should participant by engaging the social ills affecting the society. Religion, from the perspective of embodiment should relocate to the experiences of those suffering.

References

Biko, S. 1987a. We Blacks. In Stubbs, A. (ed.): *Steve Biko 1946-1977: I Write What I Like. A Selection of His Writings*. Oxford: Heineman.

Biko, S. 1987b. Some African Cultural Concepts, In Stubbs, A. (ed.): *Steve Biko 1946-1977: I Write What I Like. A Selection of His Writings*. Oxford: Heineman.

Biko, S. 1987c. The Church as Seen by a Layman. In Stubbs, A. (ed.): *Steve Biko 1946-1977: I Write What I Like. A Selection of His Writings*. Oxford: Heineman.

Biko, S. 1987d. Black Consciousness and the Quest for a True Humanity. In Stubbs, A. (ed.): *Steve Biko 1946-1977: I Write What I Like. A Selection of His Writings*. Oxford: Heineman.

Baudrillard, J. 1983. *Seduction*. Paris: Editions Galilee.

Bhengu, M.J. 1996. *Ubuntu: The Essence of Democracy*. Rudolph Steiner Press.

Comaroff, J. & J. Comaroff 1986, Christianity and Colonialism in South Africa. *American Ethnologist* 13: 1-22.

de Lacoste, G. 1995. Gabriel Marcel's Body-As-A-Subject: A Pre-eminently Postmodern Notion. *Journal of French and Francophone Philosophy*, 7,1: 69-82.

Dube, Z. 2016, Strengthening the Ubuntu Social Canopy after the Afrophobic Attacks. *Verbum et Ecclesia* 37,1: a1461. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v37i1.1461

Dube, Z. 2014. The Discursive Cultural Representations of Gentiles: A Contextual Approach using Migration Theory. *In die Skriflig* 48,1: Art. #1380, 7 pages. http://dx.doi. org/10.4102/ids.v48i1.1380.

Dube, Z. 2013. God Send His Son: Is Salvation Meta-Narrative a Superstructure of Gender Bias*? Journal of Religion and Gender in Africa* 19,2,November: 5-22.

Giddens, A. 1990. *The Consequences of Modernity.* Cambridge. England: Polity Press.

Fukuyama, F. 1989. The End of History. *The National Interest* 16: 3-18.

Horkheimer, M. & T. Adorno 1972. *The Dialectic of Enlightenment*. New York: Herder and Herder.

Louis, R.C. 1976. *The Philosophy of Gabriel Marcel: A Re-evaluation*. Michigan: University of Microfilms International.

Maluleke, T. 2008. May the Black God Stand, Please! Biko's Challenge to Religion. In Mngxitama, A., A. Alexander & N. Gibson (eds.): *Contesting the Legacies of Steve Biko*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Marcel, G. 1984, Gabriel Marcel: An Autobiography Essay. In Schlipp, P.A. & L.E. Hahn (eds.): *The Philosophy of Gabriel Marcel*. La Salle: Open Court.

Marx, K. 1887. *Capital: A Critique of Political Economy*. Volume 1. Moore, S. & E. Aveling (transs.). Moscow: Progress Publisher.

Mbiti J.S. 2015, *Introduction to African Religion.* Long Grove, Illinois: Waveland Press.

Mngxitama A., A.S. Alexander & N.C. Gibson 2008. *Biko Lives!: Contesting the Legacies of Steve Biko*. New York :: Palgrave Macmillan.

Ndungane. N. 2003, *A World with a Human Face: A Voice from Africa*. New Africa Books.

Oliphant, A. 2008. A Human Face: Biko's Conception of African Culture and Humanism. In Mngxitama, A., A. Alexander & N. Gibson (eds.): *Contesting the Legacies of Steve Biko.* New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Shutte, A. 2001. *Ubuntu: An Ethic for a New South Africa.* Pietermaritzburg, Cluster Publications.

Straus, E. & M. Machado 1984. Gabriel Marcel's Notion of the Incarnate Being. In Schlipp, P.A. & L.E. Hahn (eds.): *The Philosophy of Gabriel Marcel*. La Salle: Open Court.

Vellem, V.S. 2015. Black Theology of Liberation: A Theology of Life in the Context of Empire. *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36: 1-6.

Theorising Steve Biko's 'Human Face' Challenge

Zorodzai Dube
New Testament Studies
University of Pretoria
zorodube@yahoo.com; zoro.dube@up.ac.za

Confronting the Exclusive Dominance of Christianity in Zimbabwe's Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus through Africanisation

Dennis Masaka
Sarah Yeukai Mukungurutse

Abstract

In the light of the Christian religion's exclusive dominance of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus (9154) in present day Zimbabwe, what could be a more attractive way to also incorporate the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe? In answer to this question, we will first situate the exclusion of the indigenous religion from the syllabus in the context of the colonial experience that demeaned and considered it as unqualified to be part of the syllabus. This has given rise to the exclusive dominance of the Christian religion in the syllabus. Second, the current Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus is critiqued with the objective of highlighting that its exclusive dominance by the Christian religion ought to be contested. Third, we argue that it is necessary for the government to Africanise the curriculum so that it genuinely accommodates both the indigenous people of Zimbabwe's religion and other religions including Christianity. This is a matter of justice that seeks not only to establish parity between the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and others, but also to reject the contestable position that there are some religions that are more superior to others. Though some have attempted to critique the dominance of the Christian religion in the so-called 'Religious Studies' syllabus, no one has pointedly and systematically undertook to propose the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in present day Zimbabwe in the manner that we intend to do. The novelty of this article thus resides in its attempt to employ the Africanisation discourse in order to democratise the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in present day Zimbabwe.

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a10

Keywords: divinity, syllabus, Christianity, colonisation, Africanisation, multi-religion

Introduction

The questioning of the continued dominance of the Christian religion in religion-related subjects in 'postcolonial' Zimbabwe's school curriculum is not new. The works by Museka (2012a), Museka (2012b) and Gwaravanda, Masitera & Muzambi (2013), and Machingura & Mugebe (2015) are some that have attempted a critique of the *status quo* and its tendency to sideline the religion[1] of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe from the curriculum. Our task in this article is to compliment the brilliant scholarly efforts that have already been made so far by specifically focusing on the critique of the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus[2].

We note that the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus is exclusively dominated by content that is derived from the Christian religion at the expense of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe (ZIMSEC Divinity 9154). This is despite the fact that the National Culture Policy of Zimbabwe (2015: 24) stresses the need 'to promote respect and tolerance among different religions, beliefs and value-systems in the country'. In light of this situation, we seek its Africanisation: a task which we suggest ought to be driven by the government. By this, we mean that the syllabus ought to be realistically changed so that it accommodates both the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and other religions[3] (see Chemhuru 2016: 419; Ramose 2016: 546-

[1] Though, the indigenous ethnic groups in Zimbabwe have indigenous religions that they identify with, we use the term 'religion' in reference to these religions, because of the apparent commonalities that they share.

[2] Throughout this article, by 'Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus', we are referring to the Zimbabwe School Examinations Council (ZIMSEC), Divinity 9154, Advanced Level syllabus that is in use from 2013 to 2018. The Cambridge Advanced Level Divinity syllabus, which is still written mainly in some private schools in Zimbabwe, is excluded from the present article. The reason for our focus on the former is that it is locally designed and is written in all public schools.

[3] We are happy to note that part of the fundamental changes to the 'Advanced Level Divinity syllabus' that this article proposes have started to be

547; Mungwini 2016: 524). In doing so, it is inadequate to expect students to simply apply what they learn from the Christian religion to their existential situation. This, to us, reflects cosmetic changes to the syllabus that do not realistically speak to the necessity of Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus which we seek to defend in this article. This constitutes our point of departure in this article.

As we critique the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus, our thesis differs from that of Museka (2012a), Museka (2012b), Gwaravanda, Masitera & Muzambi (2013), and Machingura & Mugebe (2015). While these thinkers focus primarily on the Junior Certificate and Ordinary Level teaching of religious education (except in the case of Museka (2012b) who makes reference to the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus), our focus is pointedly on the limitations of the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus in respect to its exclusive dominance by one religion. Yet, the religious demographics in Zimbabwe point to a diversity of religions that the various segments of the population adhere to: Christians[4] 81.66%, Ethnoreligions 15.86%, Agnostics 1.01%, Muslims 0.73%, Bahai 0.32% and Others 0.42% (Gwaravanda, Masitera & Muzambi 2013: 222). In the light of the diversity of religions which segments of the population of Zimbabwe adhere to, it is curious that Christianity exclusively dominates the Advanced level Divinity syllabus. In light of this *status quo*, we call for the Africanisation of this syllabus.

We contend that the realistic change to the present Advanced Level Divinity syllabus is necessary in order to enable the co-existence of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and other religions. We consider the call for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus as a novel contribution to the already existing literature on the necessity of the liberation of the so-called 'Religious Studies syllabus' in Zimbabwe from its exclusive

implemented beginning 2017 with this syllabus being replaced with 'Family and Religious Studies syllabus' which has, as its contents, Indigenous Religion, Judaism, Christianity and Islam. However, those who wrote Advanced Level Divinity examinations in 2017 were still using the curriculum which we are critiquing in the present article.

[4] Even though, demographically, Christianity appears to be the dominant religion in Zimbabwe, it can be noted that the self-confessed Christians in Zimbabwe also doubles up as adherents of the indigenous religion (Chavhunduka 2001: 4).

dominance by the Christian religion. As we shall submit later on in the article, this fundamental change in the content of the curriculum necessarily ought to be accompanied by a change of the title of the present syllabus. We will argue that the title 'Divinity', as it is employed in reference to the syllabus, is contentious in regard to its focus.

The method that informs this study is the historical-analytic method. This is basically a combination of the historical and analytic methods. The historical method involves the discussion of how history helps in understanding the present and mapping the future (Schneider 1963: 201) while the analytic method involves the critical analysis and interpretation of basic concepts (Owolabi 2001: 150-151) that are used in a certain discourse in order to draw lessons that could be used to interpret the present and inform the future. As stated by Kosterec (2016: 84), '... one uses an analytic method to obtain, decode or make explicit information which is hidden, encoded or entailed by the information in a pre-existing knowledge base'.

The historical-analytic method is relevant to this study because it combines the discussion on how the past has and continues to influence the present and shape the future as well as the critical analysis of such connections with the objective of drawing certain conclusions. In this regard, we find it necessary to look at how the colonial encounter in Zimbabwe accounts for the present situation and how such a *status quo* could be changed so that things could be perceived and done differently in future. An analysis of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe shows that it exclusively draws its content from the Christian religion: a position that has been in existence since the inception of colonial rule in the country. Having noted the untenable situation whereby the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe has been excluded from the official curriculum, we suggest its Africanisation so that the indigenous people's religion co-exists with other religions such as Christianity.

In pursuit of the objective of this article, we have set the following as points of discussion. We begin by noting how Zimbabwe's colonial experience has led to the partial destruction of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and the elevation of Christianity to the position of exclusive dominance of the school syllabus. It is this injustice that was inaugurated through colonialism which remains in place up to the present day. In the second section, we critique the current Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus. The objective is to highlight its problematic exclusive dominance by the Christian religion. In the third section, we present a case for the Africanisation of the

Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus. Reasons for the necessity of such an undertaking are stated. We argue that the liberation of the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus in Zimbabwe from its exclusive dominance by the Christian religion is long overdue. This is especially necessary given that its recipients in Zimbabwe are predominantly the indigenous people whose religion is curiously excluded from the subject content. We, therefore, seek to argue that this is an act of injustice that ought to be remedied through the Africanisation of the syllabus. We now proceed to show how colonialism has led to the partial destruction of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and the elevation of the Christian religion to the position of the sole and authentic religion that deserves exclusive dominance of the school syllabus.

Colonialism and the Indigenous Religion

From the period of colonialism to the present neo-colonial period in Zimbabwe, hegemony has remained the defining character of the relations between people from the dominant culture and the indigenous people (Shamuyarira 1975: 57; Bourdillon 1976: 9-15; Belfiglio 1978: 197; Mungazi 1985: 196; Hungwe 1994: 1). In the quest to subjugate the indigenous people of Zimbabwe, their membership to human beings *qua* human beings was conveniently doubted. The denial of the humanity of the indigenous people and indeed their religion laid the ground for the imposition of the hegemonic powers' paradigm and the attempts at destroying that of the indigenous people. This is true of the manner in which the religion of the indigenous people was denigrated and replaced with the Christian religion.

In order to impose their own religion and thought systems on the indigenous people, the colonial settlers and their missionary accomplices had to conveniently deny the existence of a religion among the indigenous people of Zimbabwe, that deserved recognition and respect as their own (Gelfand 1968: 65; Gelfand 1981: 62-65; see *also* Wiredu 2003: 27; Wiredu 1998: 17; Taiwo 1998: 9; Kaoma 2016: 63). For this reason, the indigenous people of Zimbabwe disliked missionaries and their colonial counterparts (Gelfand 1968: 69). As a result of the resistance that the imposition of the Christian religion faced, the colonial settlers and missionaries had to force the indigenous people to embrace it (Shropshire 1933: 411; Zvobgo 1976: 42; Zvobgo 1986: 43). Since the missionary activities and colonisation were administered simulta-

neously, it is reasonable to consider these two as operating in common purpose in order to attain the colonial project (Parker 1960: 175; White 1996: 18; Smit 2016: 24; Kaoma 2016: 66-67).

The hegemonic people's religion was considered as important in grounding and shaping '... the professional, academic and moral training of their subjects' (White 1996: 18). It was also intended to pacify the dominated people so that they could regard colonisation and the imposition of Christianity as positive developments (Hungwe 1994: 6). Perhaps Hilliard III's (1978: 112) contention that colonialism turned the truth upside down captures the manner in which the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe was trivialised and suppressed. It was assumed that the hegemonic culture had a template of what religion is and ought to be (see Jeater 2005: 1 & 3). What the indigenous people of Zimbabwe regarded as religion was dismissed as such on the basis of the template of the hegemonic culture. With reference to the 'lenses' that the colonial authorities used to perceive the indigenous people of Zimbabwe, Jeater (2005: 1) argues that 'most of these lenses distorted rather than clarified their view of the African people in front of their eyes'. This hazy understanding of the conquered people might explain the contestable views about them, their belief and thought systems.

In defending the imposition of Christianity on the indigenous people of Zimbabwe, Keigwin (1923: 17) reports that 'the fundamental necessity of Christian teaching for those who have been led to abandon much of what was to them their religion should always be recognised'. The assumed superiority of the hegemonic culture's own civilisation[5] and religion over those of the indigenous people provided the basis for the imposition of their religion on the indigenous people. Yet, as Gelfand (1981: 62) argues, 'the Black man never asked for this 'civilisation' but was expected to receive it with open hands'.

[5] There is a widespread, though contestable, tendency by some people from the dominant culture to consider themselves as the sole authors of civilisation. As a result, people from other geopolitical centres are excluded from the genus that has contributed to world civilisation (see Austin 1975: 28; Gelfand 1968: 66; Gelfand 1981: 62; Jeater 2005: 2). Yet not all civilisations are 'Western' in origin. In fact people from other geopolitical centres have always contributed to global civilisation. It is contestable for some people from the dominant culture to appoint themselves as the sole authors of civilisation which, as a matter of necessity, ought to be accorded transcultural appeal and dominance.

The denigration of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe has led to its exclusion from the school and university curricula. As Chitando (2005: 181) argues, 'the current low status of ATRs[6] in the academic study of religion is largely due to the tendency by missionaries to minimise the indigenous traditions of Africa'. It was considered as not worth placing it at the position of parity with the dominant culture's religion (Ndlovu-Gatsheni 2007: 188). In fact, the indigenous religion did not fit the dominant culture's understanding of religion (Viriri 2004: 350). As a result, the religion of the dominant culture, that is, Christian religion, became the sole religion that was taught in the school curriculum.

It was the principal responsibility of missionary societies to establish a significant number of schools (Chimhundu 1992: 97; Morris 1930: 38) and to 'educate' the indigenous people of Zimbabwe to accept the superiority of Christianity and its agents (Gelfand 1968: 66). Since their objective in Zimbab-we and elsewhere was to spread and convert people to the Christian religion, the education that they imparted had a strong bias to the Christian teachings (Murray 1935: 229; Colclough, Löfstedt, Manduvi-Moyo, Maravanyika & Ngwata 1990: 35; Chimhundu 1992: 96; Summers 1994: 5; Chitando 2001: 177).

The religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe was relegated to a case study of what religion ought not to be. As Gelfand (1968: 65) argues in reference to the missionary's lowly view of the indigenous people's religion: 'yet-with certain notable exceptions-he did not bother to inquire any further as to the beliefs of the African but adopted a superior attitude based practically entirely on first impressions'. The injustice of the decision to exclude the religion of the indigenous religion from the school curriculum is indisputable. This was indeed an alienating experience (Pwiti & Ndoro 1999: 143). Yet, the indigenous people were expected to be grateful to the dominant culture for graciously introducing to them that which they did not have in their culture, that is, a 'civilised' religion (see Taiwo 1998: 9-10). The assumed absence of a 'civilised' religion among the indigenous people of Zimbabwe before the arrival of the colonial settlers is considered as a fact of history. However, this is contestable. The indigenous people of Zimbabwe indeed had a religion that spoke to their lived experiences but which the dominant culture simply denigrated and trivialised.

We take the deliberate exclusion of the indigenous people's religion

[6] By ATRs, Chitando (2005: 181) is referring to African Traditional Religions.

from the school curriculum as an attempt at destroying it. It is largely incontestable that the Christian missionaries were eager to destroy the religion of the indigenous people (Chavhunduka 2001: 3) for some reasons. The missionaries and colonial settlers knew that the indigenous people of Zimbabwe were strongly attached to their religion (Zvobgo 1981: 42). As a result, they resisted the colonial system and attempts at converting them to Christianity during the 1896-7 uprisings (Zvobgo 1981: 42). The religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe was considered as one of the catalysts for their spirited resistance to colonisation and conversion to Christianity (Msellemu 2013: 146). Military force had to be used in order to end opposition to the imposition of colonial rule and Christianity. In order to completely destroy the spirit of resistance among the indigenous people, the religion of the indigenous people became a target for suppression (Zvobgo 1980: 42). This was done in order to weaken its influence on the indigenous people (Pwiti & Ndoro 1999: 147). For Zvobgo (1980: 43), 'schools became nerve centres of Christian work by serving as places where Christian values and beliefs were systematically inculcated'.

The suppression of indigenous people's religion and its exclusion from the school curriculum enabled the missionaries and colonial settlers to rule without much resistance. However, this did not totally succeed in suppressing and breaking the bond of the dominated people with their own paradigms. The indigenous people continued to uphold belief in their own religion (Chavhunduka 2001: 3) even though the dominance of one religion was entrenched and foisted through the school curriculum. The resilience of the indigenous religion in the face of serious attempts at totally destroying it gives us hope that it can be resurrected from this *status quo*.

Quite surprisingly, at 'independence' in 1980, the basic character of colonial education was retained by the new government. In the sphere of religion, the Christian religion retained its exclusive dominance of the Advanced level Divinity syllabus. The curriculum and the administration of examinations remained the preserve of the University of Cambridge in Britain. Even though the Zimbabwe government expressed the need to localise the Ordinary and Advanced level examinations as way back as 1983, Zimbabwe School Examinations Council Act (ZIMSEC ACT 1994) was enacted in 1994 with the first ZIMSEC Advanced level examinations being written in 2003. The stated political reason for the localisation of the curriculum is that 'localization ensures the end of colonial curricula in Zimbabwe' (http://www.zimsec.co.zw/about-zimsec/).

Yet, localisation did not translate to the co-existence of the Christian religion and other religions such as that of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe. The reason for the failure to change the syllabus could be located in the tenuous nature of the 'independence' that Zimbabwe attained in 1980. It was basically 'independence' in name but in reality, very little has been done to overturn the prejudicial narrative pertaining to the status of indigenous religion when compared to the Christian religion. Below, we seek to carry out a critical analysis of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus with the objective of establishing the need to change it so that it also derives part of its content from the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe.

The Current Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus (9154)

We begin this section by noting that it is unclear why the syllabus is referred to as 'Divinity'. The term 'divinity' seems to point at some supernatural being that is considered as having some powers to control human life and the environment in general (Smith 2016: 279-280). Yet the content designated as thus is not solely confined to some 'divinity' but covers various aspects of the religious belief system of some people. As a result, the term 'divinity' becomes misleading. In the light of the contentious nature of the term 'divinity', we use it with caution in the present article. In addition, even if its use is to be granted, its monotheistic and mono-focal stance shows that its content does not embrace other 'divinities' and the belief systems that can be derived from or attributed to them. It is possible that, besides the Christian 'divinity', there are other 'divinities' in existence. In this light, the suggested change to this syllabus ought to embrace diverse 'divinities'.

Because of the contentious and mono-focal nature of the term 'divinity' in describing the content of the syllabus, we suggest that it ought to be replaced with the title 'Advanced Studies of Religions'. We propose this name in the light of the equally contentious nature of the term 'Religious Studies' (Smit & Chetty 2016: 153). Considered as a purely academic discipline, the term 'Religious Studies' seems not to capture the rigorous intellectual endeavour that the subject pursues. To call it 'Religious Studies' is to dilute its disinterested, critical and objective attributes. The implication of such naming is that the parameters within which religion is 'studied' are set and defined by the religion being studied. It simply becomes a 'religious study' of a particular religion and not an objective and truly detached study which can

be done by anyone irrespective of whether one is a believer or not.

Yet a thoroughly academic study of religions ought to be conceived as operating at a level different from the subject matter being studied. For the study of religion to attain a truly objective and unbiased mode, it ought to be strictly considered as a study 'of' religion. As a study 'of' religion, it ought to proceed from a position of detachment and objectivity which will then render its outcome a truly academic study of the subject matter. Our consideration of the 'Advanced Studies of Religions' as a 'second-order activity' and religion as a 'first-order activity' is informed by Hick's (1990: 1-2) thesis that 'philosophy of religion' is a 'second-order activity' while religion is considered as a 'first-order activity'. Religion becomes the normative discipline that is critically studied at the meta-level. In our view, the critical, unbiased and objective study of religions is captured in the proposed title 'Advanced Studies of Religions'. The reference to 'religions' is actually an announcement of our resolve to reject the questionable stance that the Christian religion is the only authentic one and worthy of being studied (see Smit and Chetty 2009: 340). We now turn to the analysis of the so-called Divinity syllabus.

Three papers constitute the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus. The papers are 9154/1, 9154/2 and 9154/3. Students are supposed to study two of these three papers of which 9154/1 is compulsory. Paper 9154/1 is concerned with issues pertaining to the section of the Christian Bible called the 'Old Testament'. Papers 9154/2 and 9154/3 are focused on the study of the defined sections of the Christian Bible called the 'New Testament'. In this connection, it appears that the issues that constitute the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus are purely defined by the geography and the people who reside in this geographic space. Any attempts at making them transcultural in appeal and application are outright conjecture. On the basis of this position, we seek to argue that the syllabus totally does not speak to the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe.

As stated in the introduction of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus (ZIMSEC Divinity 9154):

> The syllabus gives the students the opportunity to: 1. develop knowledge and understanding of some key religious teachings and issues in the Old Testament and New Testament; 2. develop skills in interpreting and comparing views expressed in recent academic study in the chosen areas; 3. attempt an informed response to religious and

> moral issues arising out of their study; 4. demonstrate application of major lessons or issues learnt to the Zimbabwean context.

The first point to note and put to question here is that the students are expected to study and attain knowledge of the 'Old Testament' and 'New Testament'. Even though it is important to learn religions from other geopolitical centres, it is imperative for the indigenous people of Zimbabwe to also study and know their own indigenous religion.

This is the major limitation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus. The impression drawn from such a syllabus is that the Christian religion is the sole and authentic religion that deserves exclusive dominance of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe. Yet to accept this view is to disregard the fact that the indigenous people have their own religion that reflects their own lived experiences. As Museka (2012b: 55) argues, 'no opportunity is provided for open and genuine educational engagement with other religious systems'.

The denigration and downgrading of the religion of the indigenous people to the level of a peripheral religion that does not deserve to co-exist with the Christian religion in the school curriculum was considered as necessary in the dominant culture's civilising mission. The content of the present Advanced Level Divinity syllabus reflects this questionable thinking. Keigwin (1923: 12) actually identified religion and education as 'powerful agencies' that fostered 'progress' among the indigenous people. The imposition of the Christian religion on the indigenous people was actually taken as a positive move in rescuing them from their 'dark' past (Challiss 1982: 113). This is contestable because the imposed colonial education and religion have been blamed for attempting to destroy indigenous religion and education. Far from being an agent of 'progress', the exclusive dominance of the Christian religion in the syllabus was and remains an alienating experience (Lebakeng, Phalane & Dalindjebo 2006: 73).

Magesa (1997: 16) submits that there has been emphasis on the need for interreligious dialogue with the objective of promoting worldwide peace. In fact, realistic dialogue between Christianity and the indigenous religion has failed to materialise (Chavhunduka 2001: 3). As Magesa (1997: 16) argues, 'on the contrary, contact between Christianity and African Religion has historically been predominantly a monologue, bedevilled by assumptions prejudicial against the latter, with Christianity culturally more vocal and

ideologically more aggressive. Therefore, what we have heard until now is largely Christianity speaking about African Religion, not African Religion speaking for itself'.

We concur with Magesa (1997: 16) that Christianity has, for long, put to silence the religion of the indigenous people. Instead of seeking dialogue between Christianity and the indigenous religion, efforts were actually made to destroy the indigenous religion (Chavhunduka 2001: 3). Yet for realistic dialogue to be achieved, it ought to proceed from the position of parity and respect of each other's religions. The lack of dialogue that leads to the co-existence between Christianity in particular and the indigenous religion is apparently noticeable in the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe which is exclusively dominated by the Christian religion.

With reference to the teaching of religion, Museka (2012a: 25) argues that the curriculum does not reflect the cultural diversity of the people who constitute the Zimbabwean society. This is true of the present Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe. Students are exclusively taught some aspects of the Christian religion as if they do not have their own religions that speak to their peculiar cultural experiences. Yet, what is taught in the school system and the so-called formal education institutions has significant impact on the impressions and minds of the students. If one religion is taught in these institutions and others are left out, the unexpressed thought is that that which is included in the syllabi is superior to that which is not. As a result, the religion that is not included in the curriculum faces near total extinction as the curriculum of the school system is mistaken as the authentic arbiter of that which is worthy of study and that which is not.

The exclusion of the indigenous religion from the content of the present Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe becomes a serious threat to the prospects of its continued existence. The requirement for students to 'demonstrate application of major lessons or issues learnt to the Zimbabwean context' (ZIMSEC Divinity 9154) is deceptive and contentious as we will demonstrate below. The idea that this requirement may foist on the students is that they do not have a religion that is worth studying. It becomes necessary to study a religion that does not speak to their lived experiences and then attempt to draw and apply some 'lessons' learnt from it to their peculiar lived experiences. Understood in this way, this requirement is detrimental to the continued existence of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe. In light of this situation, we seek to argue that the syllabus ought to be

Africanised. We now turn to a discussion on the prospects of Africanising the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe.

Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus

The term 'Africanisation' shares some similarities with some terms in that it does not admit of a single and uncontentious definition. It is a term that has been understood differently by those who have attempted to define it (Van der Walt 1997: 55, Horsthemke 2004: 571; Horsthemke 2006: 454; Nkoane 2006: 52). Yet, as Botha (2007: 205) states, 'the dominance of Western supremacy in the past and the resistance against it play a major role in the epistemology of Africanisation'. The pursuit of the various definitions that have been ascribed to the term 'Africanisation' is not the mandate of the present article. What we seek to do is to draw the basic idea that we think aptly defines this term. In this regard, we appeal to Ramose's (1998) understanding of Africanisation. For Ramose (1998: vi), Africanisation '... holds that different foundations exist for the construction of pyramids of knowledge. It holds further that communication is possible between the various pyramids. It disclaims the view that any pyramid of knowledge is by its very nature eminently superior to all the others'.

The recognition of the diversity of religions is important in refuting the contestable thinking that there is one religion that necessarily ought to exclusively dominate the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe. For the purposes of the present article, the term 'Africanisation' is used to refer to the realistic change of the *status quo* that excludes the indigenous people's paradigm from what is taught and studied so that the syllabus embraces it and other paradigms. In respect to the objective of the present article, Africanisation calls for the co-existence of the indigenous people's religion and other religions in the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus. This is a direct response to the exclusion of the religion of the indigenous people from the syllabus.

Museka (2012a: 25), Museka (2012b: 56), Gwaravanda, Masitera & Muzambi (2013: 230), and Machingura & Mugebe (2015: 136) appeal to what they refer to as the 'multi-faith approach' as a corrective to the present exclusive dominance of the Christian religion in the study of religion. According to these authors, the 'multi-faith approach' recognises the diversity of religions through incorporating them into the syllabus and teaching them.

This is a brilliant proposal. While we agree with them in regard to the objective of this proposal, we seek to differ with them in regard to the terminology that ought to be used in order to capture this commendable proposal.

The thesis that we defend is that religion is not reducible to faith. Religion is much broader and expansive in respect to its scope compared to faith. In fact, faith is just but a constituent part of religion. Faith's fixation with the 'belief' in the unknown and unproven renders it inadequate to capture the truly academic stance of the study of religions. In this light, we propose the use of the term 'multi-religion approach' in place of the term 'multi-faith approach'. By this reasoning, the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus ought to genuinely allow the co-existence of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and other religions.

However, for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus to be attained, the reality of the existence of diverse religions first ought to be accepted. The acceptance of the reality of indigenous religion is not an easy task in the light of the level and extent of its demonisation in present day Zimbabwe-a problem that originates at the inception of the missionary and colonial rule in Zimbabwe (Chavhunduka 2001: 3). The intriguing part to this problem is that even after the end of direct colonial rule in Zimbabwe; the Christian religion's indigenous converts continue to portray their own indigenous religion in a negative way. We attribute this to enduring mental colonisation. This is an outcome of their colonial experience that denigrates the indigenous religion and exclusively promotes the Christian religion. This is despite the removal of those who foisted the Christian religion on the indigenous people of Zimbabwe from positions of direct political control.

In this connection, mental decolonisation of the indigenous people becomes imperative if the contestable denigration of the religion of the indigenous people is to be refuted and rejected. Though it has proven to be a difficult task to deconstruct the mental colonisation that the indigenous people have endured, it is a worthwhile endeavour if the indigenous religion is to be resurrected from its position of forced dormancy. The supposed superiority of the Christian religion over the indigenous religion ought to be rejected. It ought to be rejected because religion principally reflects the circumstances and lived experiences that produce it. It becomes questionable to attempt at ranking religions.

In the light of the exclusive dominance of the Christian religion in the education curriculum, Museka (2012a: 25) calls for a 'paradigm shift' in order for the curriculum to embrace the cultural diversity of the Zimbabwean society.

This is considered as necessary in order for other religions, including that of the indigenous people, to be included in the changed curriculum. While Museka (2012a: 25) suggests a 'paradigm shift' as a corrective to the exclusive dominance of the syllabus by one religion, we seek to differ and suggest a 'paradigm change' in respect to the present Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe.

A 'paradigm change' demands a realistic transformation of the *status quo*, that is, a change of a fundamental nature. The established way of doing things ought to be transformed so that a completely new way of doing things is established. In arguing thus, we are inspired by Ramose's (2003b: 137-138) thesis that realistic change of the educational curriculum is possible if there is a 'paradigm change' and not a 'paradigm shift'. A 'paradigm shift' is tenuous because it has to be attained within the already existing and established parameters (Ramose 2003b: 137). Yet a 'paradigm change' seeks to dismantle these established parameters. The reasoning is that a 'paradigm shift' does not realistically overturn the *status quo* but simply lead to cosmetic changes. In the context of this study, the dominance of the Christian religion in the syllabus is retained. The need for a 'paradigm change' becomes imperative if parity between diverse religions in the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus is to be established. We now turn to a consideration of some reasons why it is necessary to Africanise the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe.

Reasons for Africanising the Syllabus

It is necessary to state and explain reasons that we consider as important in justifying the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe. The *first point* for discussion pertains to the dominance of the school system in imparting knowledge to the recipients. The school system as it exists in present day Zimbabwe has colonial roots. When the missionaries and the colonial settlers settled in Zimbabwe they imposed their school system on the indigenous people (MacKenzie 1993: 46).

This school system was principally foisted to impart the Christian doctrine and the barest of education designed to enable the indigenous people to be of useful service to the missionaries and colonial settlers (Taylor 1923: 2; Trevor 1927: 99; Shropshire 1933: 415-416; Peck 1966: 67; Austin 1975: 43; Challiss 1979: 220; Zvobgo 1981: 13; MacKenzie 1993: 50; Summers 2011:

134)[7]. Those who controlled the school curriculum employed it to attain their own objectives. As Apple (1993: 222) argues:

> the curriculum is never simply a neutral assemblage of knowledge, somehow appearing in the texts and classrooms of a nation. It is always part of a selective tradition, someone's selection, some group's vision of legitimate knowledge. It is produced out of the cultural, political, and economic conflicts, tensions, and compromises that organize and disorganize a-people.

The content of the curriculum that the missionaries and colonial settlers imposed on the indigenous people of Zimbabwe was derived from their own paradigm and not that of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe (Peck 1966: 7). In order to reverse the *status quo*, this curriculum ought to be duly changed. This is necessary if we are to infuse into it the content that speaks to the lived experiences of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe. Most importantly, the content of what is taught influences the way and manner in which we access reality. If the content exclusively focuses on a non-indigenous paradigm, then its recipients are likely to conclude that they do not have a paradigm worth studying or simply that it is non-existent.

This has serious implications on these people's humanity. The content which is taught and indeed its authors or those associated with it are likely to be considered as having unparalleled superiority. The recipients of this content are thus considered as, and can indeed, through time, consider themselves as inferior to those who design and provide content for the curriculum. As Nyamnjoh (2012: 134) argues, the recipients of colonial education can suffer

[7] As Bacchus (1993: 65) remarks, '… the colonial authorities were always aware of the potential social disruption which might be caused by having more 'educated' individuals in the colonies than the number of 'suitable' jobs available for them. To prevent this from happening they used 'practical education' partly to dampen the students' occupational aspirations and de-emphasise their preparation for white collar jobs. In addition, they severely limited the provision of educational facilities especially at the higher levels while the focus of the curriculum offered in the primary schools became symbolised by 'the Gospel and the Plough'. In this context, religion was indeed used as opium of the masses'.

'... self-doubt, self-deprecation, and self-annihilation'. It is a situation that requires the concerned people to resurrect from it and reassert themselves as equal contributors to the production of knowledge. In this light, it is imperative to change the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus so that part of its content is derived from and speaks to the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe. We thus consider Carnoy's (1974: 1) thesis that 'for an institution to play an important role in society, it must be 'legitimate': people who use it must believe that it serves their interests and needs' as important to our call for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus. As it is presently constituted, the syllabus does not save the indigenous people's 'interests and needs' in so far as it excludes content from their religion.

Second, in Zimbabwe's secondary school system, the 'Advanced Level' is the normal gateway to tertiary education. In the light of its importance as a feeder to tertiary education, its curriculum ought to surely allow the co-existence of the indigenous people's knowledge paradigm and others. The same ought to be necessarily done to prior levels of education. This is important because the content of the primary and secondary schools' curricula greatly influences what is taught at tertiary level. It becomes imperative for this curriculum to embrace the contribution of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe to the stock of knowledge. In this light, if the indigenous people's religion is excluded from the primary and secondary levels' syllabi, its chances of being studied at tertiary level are diminished.

Though the universities in Zimbabwe that offer humanities may allow their students to study the indigenous religion, it is not given the same level of importance as given to the study of the Christian religion. While the study of the Christian religion has a solid base that stretches way back to pre-school, the indigenous religion does not have the same firm base in the school curriculum. It is not surprising that at tertiary institutions, the study of religion of the indigenous people is given less importance compared to that of the Christian religion. In this light, it becomes necessary to change the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus so that it incorporates the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe. This will enable students who decide to pursue 'studies of religions' at tertiary level to take the study of indigenous religion seriously. Indeed, we consider the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus as a way of reasserting the parity of the indigenous religion and others.

Third, the indigenous people of Zimbabwe have a right to learn their own religion in addition to other religions. This speaks to the necessity of

justice. It is necessary for them to also learn a religion that derives from their own existential situation. Despite its contested meaning, the term 'democracy' emphasises the imperative to observe and respect the freedoms of individuals. This could be extended to the freedoms of individuals to know and study their own religions in addition to other religions. As Ramose (2003b: 137) argues, the change of paradigm is necessary if natural and historical justice is to be attained by the dominated people. Indeed the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus requires such a fundamental change so that it allows the co-existence of the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe and other religions.

Connected to the above, the liberation of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe will remain a mere possibility if it does not translate to embracing the indigenous people's paradigm in all facets of life and state functions. The indigenous people ought to be allowed to speak for and of themselves (Ramose 2003a: 118). The era where people from the dominant culture ascribe themselves the prerogative to define and speak for the indigenous people ought to come to an end. As Nkrumah (1965: x) argues, a state that is under the control of hegemonic powers is not in control of its affairs. This insight that we draw from Nkrumah (1965: x) is important as we seek to justify our thesis for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in present day Zimbabwe. The present syllabus basically confirms the view expressed by Nkrumah (1965: xiv) that the independence that the indigenous conquered people of Africa have attained is nominal. Realistic independence in respect to the study of religion ought to mean the wholesale change of the *status quo* with the objective of establishing parity between the indigenous people's religion and others (see Mndende 1994: 123). However, the present constitution of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus does not speak to the realistic independence of the people of Zimbabwe.

The Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus is actually one attempt at attaining its realistic independence from the control of the dominant culture. By this reasoning, we seek to dispel the notion that independence necessarily means proceeding in the same way and pattern as was done before by those who were in direct control of the indigenous people before 'independence'. Independence ought to reside in the manner in which the indigenous people deconstruct the *status quo* so that it accommodates their voice and paradigm that were previously suppressed and ignored. The Advanced Level Divinity syllabus is one example of a relic of the hegemonic relations between the colonial settlers and the indigenous people of Zimbabwe

that urgently require to be realistically changed.

Implicit in our call for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus, is the imperative to liberate the minds of its recipients. We proceed to argue that though the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus is important in enabling the co-existence of the indigenous people's religion and others, it will remain a tantalising possibility if the indigenous people's minds remain conditioned to think that they do not have a paradigm of thought which is their own. It is important for the indigenous people of Zimbabwe to realise that their present condition of dependence on people from the dominant culture in regard to philosophy, epistemology and, in particular, religion is not testimony to the absence of the same from among them. It is indeed an outcome of the condition of conquest that they endured that reduced them to barely inferior beings that cannot be considered to have attributes that their conquerors had (Tawse-Jollie 1927: 100; Huggins 1953: 625; Whitehead 1960: 194; Jeater 2005: 9).

It becomes imperative to seek the mental liberation of the indigenous people so that they can freely resuscitate their religion so that it can compete with other religions in the transformed curriculum. As observed by Museka (2012b: 65-66), attempts at enabling the co-existence of religions through changing the curriculum has faced resistance principally from the indigenous people themselves. For Museka (2012b: 65-66), some indigenous people, especially those who categorise themselves as Christians, reject the co-existence of the Christian religion and other religions such as the indigenous one. This shows that though externally the indigenous people of Zimbabwe claim to have attained independence from the direct control by people from the dominant culture, they are still in very much in colonial mode.

Since the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus and the examinations are designed and prepared by an indigenous examinations board, it remains curious why the curriculum retains an exclusively Christian paradigm. As Wiredu (1998: 21) argues, if it is not because of the colonised condition of mind, '…ordinary common sense dictates that one should not jettison what is one's own in favor of what has come from abroad for no reason at all'. It is instructive here to also appeal to Nkrumah's (1965: ix) thesis that colonialism has mutated into neo-colonialism. Both colonialism and neo-colonialism are systems of domination. As colonialism mutated into neo-colonialism, nothing fundamentally changed.

The overt display of dominance by people from the dominant culture

has been conveniently replaced by covert means of entrenching dominance. The curriculum is one such means through which the dominant culture retains its dominance over the indigenous people. However, as wa Thiong'o (1981: 129) argues, '…like colonialism before it, neo-colonialism has not completely succeeded in silencing the resistance culture'. This enduring existence of the 'resistance culture' among the indigenous people gives hope for the quest to fundamentally change the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus so that it allows the co-existence of the indigenous religion and other religions.

Concluding Remarks

In this article, we have attempted to present a case for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in present day Zimbabwe. The motivation behind such a contention is that this syllabus is exclusively dominated by a religion that is non-indigenous despite the fact that the indigenous people of Zimbabwe have their own religion that speaks to their existential circumstances. Yet, the religion of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe is excluded from content of this syllabus which students are supposed to study. In the light of this anomaly, we have suggested the Africanisation of this syllabus as a corrective to the present situation. We considered this dimension as a novel contribution to the debate on the need to transform the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus.

In concluding this article, we seek to suggest that the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus in Zimbabwe can be enhanced by way of putting in written form aspects of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe's religion that still exists in oral form. It goes without saying that the other religions that the indigenous religion has to compete with in the transformed curriculum such as the Christian religion have sizable published materials on them. The same cannot be said of the indigenous religion (see Museka 2012b: 62).

By so suggesting, we are not defending the thesis that the written word is superior to the oral one. Our contention is that the written literature is the one in use in the school system. It is thus imperative for the indigenous people of Zimbabwe to put their religion in written form so that its literature can co-exist with literature from other religions. This literature from the indigenous religion and other religions can then be used to create an Africanised cur-

riculum. But, as we have argued in this article, the mental liberation of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe is imperative if they are to consider their own religion as comparable to religions from other geopolitical centres. Mental liberation of the indigenous people of Zimbabwe becomes necessary in advancing the thesis for the Africanisation of the Advanced Level Divinity syllabus.

References

Apple, M.W. 1993. The Politics of Official Knowledge: Does a National Curriculum Make Sense? *Teachers College Record* 95, 2: 222-241.

Austin, R. 1975. *Racism and Apartheid in Southern Africa: Rhodesia*. Paris: The UNESCO Press.

Bacchus, M.K. 1993. Education for Development: A 'Critical Approach' to Instruction in Developing Countries. *India International Centre Quarterly* 20, 4: 59-78.

Belfiglio, V.J. 1978. A Case for Rhodesia. *African Affairs* 77, 307: 197-213.

Botha, Maria Magdalena 2007. Africanising the Curriculum: An Exploratory Study. *SAJHE* 21, 2: 202-216.

Bourdillon, M.F.C. 1976. *Myths about Africans: Myth-making in Rhodesia*. Gwelo: Mambo Press.

Carnoy, M. 1974. *Education as Cultural Imperialism*. New York: David Mckay Company, Inc.

Challiss, R.J. 1982. Phelps-Stokesism and Education in Zimbabwe. *Conference on Zimbabwean History: Progress and Development*. Harare: University of Zimbabwe.

Challiss, R.J. 1979. Education Planning for Zimbabwe: The Problem of Unreliable Historical Perspectives. *Zambezia* VVII, ii: 215-241.

Chavhunduka, G.L. 2001. Dialogue among Civilisations: The African Religion in Zimbabwe Today. *Occasional Paper No.1*: 1-9.

Chemhuru, M. 2016. Pursuing the Agenda of Africanising Philosophy in Africa: Some Possibilities. *South African Journal of Philosophy* 35,4: 418-428.

Chitando, E. 2001. Beyond Phenomenology: Teaching African Traditional Religions in a Zimbabwean University. *Zimbabwe Journal of Educational Research* 13, 2: 177-195.

Chitando, E. 2005. Missionary Attitudes towards African Traditional Religions and Hinduism: A Comparative Survey. In Koschorke, K. & J.H. Schjorring (eds.): *African Identities and World Christianity in the Twentieth Century*. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.

Colclough, C., J.I. Löfstedt, J. Manduvi-Moyo, O.E. Maravanyika & W.S. Ngwata 1990. *Education in Zimbabwe: Issues of Quantity and Quality. Education Division Documents, No. 50*. Stockholm: SIDA.

Gelfand, M. 1968. *African Crucible: An Ethico-religious Study with Special Reference to the Shona-speaking People*. Cape Town, Wynberg & Johannesburg: Juta & Company, Limited.

Gelfand, M. 1981. *Ukama: Reflections on Shona and Western Cultures in Zimbabwe*. Gwelo, Salisbury & Gokomere: Mambo Press.

Gwaravanda, E.T., E. Masitera & P. Muzambi 2013. Religious Studies and Globalisation: A Critique of Zimbabwe's Current Religious Studies Ordinary Level Syllabus. *Alter*nation Special Edition 10: 221-248.

Hick, J. 1990. *Philosophy of Religion*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey.

Hilliard III, A.G. 1978. Equal Educational Opportunity and Quality Education. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 9, 2: 110-126.

Horsthemke, K. 2004. Knowledge, Education and the Limits of Africanisation. *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 38, 4: 571-587.

Horsthemke, K. 2006. The Idea of the African University in the Twenty-first Century: Some Reflections on Afrocentrism and Afroscepticism. *SAJHE* 20, 4: 449-465.

Huggins, G. 1953. Developments in Southern Rhodesia. *Journal of the Royal Society of Arts* 101, 4904: 624-634.

Hungwe, K. 1994. Educational Policy in African Colonial Contexts: The Case of Instructional Media in Southern Rhodesia (1930-1980). *African Study Monographs* 15, I: 1-36.

Jeater, D. 2005. Imagining Africans: Scholarship, Fantasy, and Science in Colonial Administration, 1920s Southern Rhodesia. *The International Journal of African Historical Studies* 38, 1: 1-26.

Kaoma, K.J. 2016. African Religion and Colonial Rebellion: The Contestation of Power in Colonial Zimbabwe's Chimurenga of 1896-1897. *Journal for the Study of Religion*, 29,1: 57-84.

Keigwin, H.S. 1923. Native Development. In Wilson, N.H. (ed.): *NADA: The Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department Annual, 1923*. Salisbury: Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department.

Kosterec, M. 2016. Analytic Method. *Organon F* 23, 1: 83-101.

Lebakeng, J.T., M.M. Phalane & N. Dalindjebo 2006. Epistemicide, Institutional Cultures and the Imperative for the Africanisation of Universities in South Africa. *Alternation*, 13, 1: 70-87.

Machingura, F. & F. Mugebe 2015. The Multi-Faith Approach Gap in Light of the Zimbabwe Junior Secondary and 'O' Level Religious Studies Syllabi. *Zimbabwe Journal of Educational Research* 27, 1: 136-164.

Magesa, L. 1997. *African Religion: The Moral Traditions of Abundant Life*. Nairobi: Paulines Publications Africa.

Mackenzie, C.G. 1993. Demythologising the Missionaries: A Reassessment of the Functions and Relationships of Christian Missionary Education under Colonialism. *Comparative Education* 29, 1: 45-66.

Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education. *Family and Religious Studies Syllabus, Forms 5& 6*. Harare: Curriculum Development Unit.

Morris, S.E. 1930. At the Vacation Course of Bantu Studies, University of Cape Town, 6th January to 24th January, 1930. In Spicer, N.H.D.(ed.): *NADA: The Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department Annual, 1930*. Salisbury: Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department.

Msellemu, S.A. 2013. Common Motives of Africa's Anti-colonial Resistance in 1890-1960. *Social Evolution & History* 12, 2: 143-155.

Mndende, N. 1994. *African Religion and Religion Education*. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts, to the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Cape Town, March 1994.

Mungazi, D.A. 1985. Educational Innovation in Zimbabwe: Possibilities and Problems. *The Journal of Negro Education* 54, 2: 196-212.

Mungwini, P. 2016. The Question of Recentring Africa: Thoughts and Issues from the Global South. *South African Journal of Philosophy* 35, 4: 523-536.

Murray, A.V. 1935. Education under Indirect Rule. *Journal of the Royal African Society* 34, 136: 27-268.

Museka, G. 2012a. The Religious Dimension to Intercultural Values and Citizenship Education: A Call for Methodological Re-Consideration in Zimbabwe's Religious Education Curriculum. *Zimbabwe Journal of Educational Research* 24, 1: 25-35.

Museka, G. 2012b. Exorcising the Colonial Jinx: Towards Reconciling Diversity and Pedagogy in Zimbabwe's Religious Education Curriculum.

The Journal of Pan African Studies 5, 1: 55-68.

The National Culture Policy of Zimbabwe (2015). Harare: Ministry of Sport, Arts and Culture.

Ndlovu-Gatsheni, S.J. 2007. Re-Thinking the Colonial Encounter in Zimbabwe in the Early Twentieth Century. *Journal of Southern African Studies* 33, 1: 173-191.

Nkoane, M.M. 2006. The Africanisation of the University in Africa. *Alternation*, 13, 1: 49-69.

Nkrumah, K. 1965. *Neo-Colonialism: The Last Stage of Imperialism*. New York: International Publishers.

Nyamnjoh, F.B. 2012. 'Potted Plants in Greenhouses': A Critical Reflection on the Resilience of Colonial Education in Africa. *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 47, 2: 129-154.

Owolabi, K.A. 2001. The Quest for Method in African Philosophy: A Defense of the Hermeneutic-Narrative Approach. *The Philosophical Forum* XXXII, 2: 147-163.

Parker, F. 1960. Life and Education in Southern Rhodesia. *The Phi Delta Kappan* 41, 4: 174-179.

Peck, A.J.A. 1966. *Rhodesia Accuses*. Salisbury: The Three Sisters.

Pwiti, G. & W. Ndoro 1999. The Legacy of Colonialism: Perceptions of the Cultural Heritage in Southern Africa, with Special Reference to Zimbabwe. *The African Archaeological Review* 16, 3: 143-153.

Ramose, M.B. 1998. Foreword. In Seepe, S. (ed.): *Black Perspective(s) on Tertiary Institutional Transformation.* Florida: Vivlia Publishers & the University of Venda.

Ramose, M.B. 2003a. I doubt, therefore African Philosophy Exists. *South African Journal of Philosophy* 22, 2: 113-126.

Ramose, M.B. 2003b. Transforming Education in South Africa: Paradigm Shift or Change? *SAJHE/SATHO* 17, 3: 137-143.

Ramose, M.B. 2016. Teacher and Student with a Critical Pan-epistemic Orientation: An Ethical Necessity for Africanising the Educational Curriculum in Africa. *South African Journal of Philosophy* 35, 4: 546-555.

Shamuyarira, N.M. 1975. Zimbabwe's Liberation through Self-Reliance. *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political* 1, 55: 55-77.

Shropshire, D. 1933. Native Development in Southern Rhodesia. *Journal of the Royal African Society* 32, 129: 409-423.

Smith, M.S. 2016. Monotheism and the Redemption of Divinity in Ancient

Israel. In Niditch, S. (ed): *The Wiley Blackwell Companion to Ancient Israel*. West Sussex: John Wiley & Sons Ltd.

Smit, J.A. 2016. J.T. van der Kemp and his Critique of the Settler Farmers on the South African Colonial Frontier (1799-1811). *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29, 1: 6-56.

Smit, J.A. & D. Chetty 2009. Advancing Religion Studies in Southern Africa. *Alter*nation Special Edition 3: 331-353.

Smit, J.A. & D. Chetty 2016. Reflecting on a Decade of Religion Studies Implementation in the FET Phase 1: Case Study of Gauteng, South Africa. *Journal for the Study of Religion* 29, 2: 134-156.

Schneider, D. 1963. The Historical Method in the Teaching of History. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 40, 4: 199-209.

Summers, C. 2011. Boys, Brats and Education: Reproducing White Maturity in Colonial Zimbabwe, 1915-1935. *Settler Colonial Studies* 1: 132-153.

Summers, C. 1994. Educational Controversies: African Activism and Educational Strategies in Southern Rhodesia, 1920-1934. *Journal of Southern African Studies* 20, 1: 3-25.

Taiwo, O. 1998. Exorcising Hegel's Ghost: Africa's Challenge to Philosophy. *African Studies Quarterly* 1, 4: 3-16.

Taylor, H.J. 1923. Preface. In Wilson, N.H. (ed.): *NADA: The Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department Annual, 1923*. Salisbury: Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department.

Trevor, T.G. 1927. Native Education from an Employer's Point of View. In Taylor, G.A. (ed.): *NADA: The Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department Annual, 1927*. Salisbury: Southern Rhodesia Native Affairs Department.

Tawse-Jollie, E. 1927. Southern Rhodesia: A White Man's Country in the Tropics. *Geographical Review* 17, 1: 89-106.

Van Der Walt, B.J. 1997. *Afrocentric or Eurocentric? Our Task in a Multicultural South Africa*. Potchefstroomse Universiteit vir Christelike Hoër Onderwys.

Viriri, A. 2004. The Contribution of Missionaries to Shona Lexicography. *Lexikos* 14: 349-358.

wa Thiong'o, Ngugi 1981. *Writers in Politics: A Re-engagement with Issues of Literature & Society*. Oxford & Nairobi: James Currey.

Wiredu, K. 1998. Toward Decolonizing African Philosophy and Religion. *African Studies Quarterly* 1, 4: 17-46.

Wiredu, K. 2003. On Decolonizing African Religions. In Coetzee, P.H. & A.P.J. Roux (eds.): *The African Philosophy Reader: A Text with Readings.* Second Edition. London & New York: Routledge.

White, B.W. 1996. Talk about School: Education and the Colonial Project in French and British Africa (1860-1960). *Comparative Education* 32, 1: 9-25.

Whitehead, E. 1960. Southern Rhodesia. *International Affairs (Royal Institute of International Affairs 1944-)* 36, 2: 188-196.

Zimbabwe School Examinations Council Act (ZIMSEC ACT 1994).

Zimbabwe School Examinations Council. Available at: http://www.zimsec.co.zw/about-zimsec/. (Accessed on 23 December 2017.)

Zimbabwe School Examinations Council (ZIMSEC), Divinity 9154, Advanced Level Syllabus, Examinations Syllabus for 2013-2018.

Zvobgo, C.J.M. 1976. Shona and Ndebele Responses to Christianity in Southern, Rhodesia 1897-1914. *Journal of Religion in Africa* 8, 1: 41-51.

Zvobgo, C.J.M. 1981. African Education in Zimbabwe: The Colonial Inheritance of the New State, 1899-1979. *Issue: A Journal of Opinion*, 11, 3/4: 13-16.

Zvobgo, C.J.M. 1986. Aspects of Interaction between Christianity and African Culture in Colonial Zimbabwe, 1893-1934. *Zambezia* XIII i: 43-57.

Zvobgo, R.J. 1980. *Government and Missionary Policies on African Secondary Education in Southern Rhodesia with Special Reference to the Anglican and Wesleyan Methodist Churches 1934 - 1971.* Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Educational Studies, University of Edinburgh.

Dennis Masaka
Great Zimbabwe University
Masvingo, Zimbabwe
dennis.masaka@gmail.com; and dmasaka@gzu.ac.zw

Sarah Yeukai Mukungurutse
Zimbabwe Open University
Marondera
Zimbabwe
sarahyeukai@gmail.com; and mukungurutses@zou.ac.zw

‘Citizens of both Heaven and Earth’: Pentecostalism and Social Transformation in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya[1]

Ezra Chitando
Henrietta Nyamnjoh
Damaris Parsitau

Abstract

As Pentecostalism enjoys unparalleled growth in most parts of sub-Saharan Africa, greater attention has been paid to its problematic expressions by some scholars. Media images of the abuse of believers in different contexts have been widely circulated. These include sexual abuse by charismatic (male) prophets, financial scandals, as well as the degrading treatment of clients/members by forcing them to eat grass/snakes and other questionable acts. While conceding that these aspects are challenging, this article seeks to provide a more balanced perspective by highlighting the extent to which selected Pentecostal churches in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya have sought to contribute to social reconstruction in their respective countries. By examining the sermons and teachings on personal responsibility and having effective marriages by the Pentecostal leaders, the article contends that they mobilise their members and audiences to become agents of social transformation. The article highlights the potential role of Pentecostalism in social reconstruction in the selected countries.

Keywords: Social transformation, social restructuring, competition, personal development, marriage, religion as strategic resource

[1] This article emerged out of a multi-country study, ‘Propelled by the Spirit: Pentecostalism, Innovation and Competition in Kenya, South Africa and Zimbabwe’, supported by the Nagel Institute.

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a11

Introduction

Pentecostalism is one of the fastest growing types of religion in sub-Saharan Africa (see for example, Kalu 2008; Adogame 2011; Asamoah-Gyadu 2013 & Lindhardt 2015). Being a highly mobile form of religious expression, Pentecostalism has spread quickly in the region. In general, it is a highly confident and abrasive religion that seeks to sweep its competitors aside. In reality, however, Pentecostalism faces competition from the more established religions of the region. These include the 'mainline churches' (Catholic and Protestant), Islam and other 'world religions', as well as African Indigenous Religions. In some countries such as South Africa and Zimbabwe, younger systems of beliefs and practices, such as Rastafari, are active on the spiritual market in which Pentecostalism is a player (Chawane 2014; Sibanda 2012). In order to survive and thrive in such a heavily subscribed market, Pentecostalism has had to be creative. However, the quest to succeed has generated a lot of criticism against Pentecostalism in the region.

In South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya, the countries that we have selected for this article, Pentecostalism has been receiving negative media coverage. In particular, some (male) Pentecostal pastors have been reported in the local media as abusing women who approach them for healing and counselling. In other instances, Pentecostal pastors are accused of embezzling funds, forcing their followers to do humiliating acts such as eating grass and snakes, drinking petrol 'believed to have been transformed into 'apple juice' or selling 'anointed pens' as well as undertaking other acts that are deemed controversial in the public sphere. Although Pentecostals are themselves quite adept at using the media (Asamoah-Gyadu 2015: 157), they have endured negative publicity. We acknowledge that the aspects raised in the critiques of Pentecostalism are quite relevant and require serious reflection, in the public interest.

However, in this article we seek to focus on the extent to which selected Pentecostal churches in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya are contributing towards social restructuring by encouraging their members and all citizens to challenge corruption, work hard and transform their families, communities and nations. While we focus on a selection of churches, we are aware that there are notable variations among Pentecostal churches in Africa, ranging from the 'charismatic' to the more socially conscious, and prophetic. In this regard, we use 'Pentecostal churches' in a fluid sense that are

interchangeable to denote at any one point one of the above churches that occasionally fashion their teachings beyond prophetic and prosperity gospel to reflect the socio-economic and political trends of the time or the calendrical events such as Valentine's day, Mother's day, Father's day and Women's day. Recognizing Chammah Kaunda's (2015) critique that many African Pentecostals struggle with political literacy, that is, understanding political dynamics in order to avoid naïve endorsements of dominant politicians, we realise the need for a more balanced review of the contribution of Pentecostal churches to social transformation in the selected African countries. To take such a stance, however, is not to suggest that the Pentecostal movement has suddenly become one massive force that will transform Africa's fortunes for the best. Rather it is to maintain that there is need to acknowledge some positive aspects and developments within the movement.

Due to space and methodological considerations, we utilise the South African case studies in greater detail, while bringing in data from the Zimbabwean and Kenyan contexts to amplify the points raised. The specific Pentecostal groups that we focus on are the Ark of the Glory Church (AG) and Christ Embassy (CE) (Cape Town, South Africa, though coming from Nigeria), the United Family International Church (UFIC) (Harare, Zimbabwe, and DR Congo respectively) and Jubilee Christian Church (JCC) (Nairobi, Kenya). Data for the article were gathered by the researchers in the three settings during fieldwork, March – July 2016. In addition, the researchers have been involved in studying Pentecostalism in diverse contexts over the past seven years. Alongside interviews and participant observation, we also got additional information from the churches' television programmes, videotapes, audiotapes, CDs and other electronic media (Parsitau & Mwaura 2010: 97). Space considerations prevent us from providing historical accounts of the emergence and growth of these churches.

Background and Context

As we have noted above, Pentecostalism has become one of the most significant forms of religious expression in Africa. The region in which Pentecostalism has been experiencing remarkable growth is also the same region where major social and political changes have been taking place. For example, the HIV and AIDS epidemic has been causing serious social

upheaval, especially before the availability of life saving medication to most of the people living with HIV who require the medication. The same region also faces questions relating to politics and governance, development, addressing corruption and others. Although some publications have addressed Pentecostalism's engagement with politics (for example, Ranger 2008) and development (Freeman 2012), there are glaring gaps in examining how individual Pentecostal pastors and/or their ministries seek to mobilise their members and the larger society to embrace values and practices that lead to social transformation.

One of the most contentious issues relating to the rapid expansion of Pentecostalism in Africa relates to whether the movement serves any meaningful and transformative role in society. In his earlier work, Paul Gifford (1988) deployed a conspiracy theory and contended that the fast growing movement was a result of the Religious Right in the USA, and that it was sponsored to achieve definite political goals in the region. Writing some years later, but offering a similarly negative assessment, was Frans Verstraelen (1998) who argued that Pentecostal churches did not appear keen to become agents of social transformation. Perhaps these two scholars with very strong Catholic backgrounds wished to see the Pentecostal churches following the example of the Catholic Church of standing up for justice in different African countries. In this article, we argue that perhaps in response to such criticisms, or a result of becoming more established, some Pentecostal groups have taken the challenge to contribute towards social transformation seriously.

We are convinced that, like a double-edged sword, religion can cause both harm and good in society. Scholars such Scott Appleby (2000) and, Ter Haar and Bussitil (2005) have drawn attention to the capacity of religion to contribute towards both violence and peace/development. In this article, we have chosen to focus on the extent to which selected Pentecostal churches in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya have sought to be agents of social transformation. As Walsh and Kaufman (1999) have shown, religion has been deployed as a strategic resource to get citizens to be more actively involved in social and political programmes.

Agbiji and Swart (2015) have provided a very balanced and informative review of the role of African Traditional Religions, Christianity and Islam in social transformation. They contend that the famed African religiosity can serve as the basis for fighting negative practices such as poverty and corruption in Africa. However, they are convinced that religious leaders

have been complacent and complicit in the continent's struggle against poverty and corruption. They argue that most religious leaders have abdicated their prophetic role and have promoted fatalistic theologies that rob citizens of their agency. They reach the following conclusion:

> Despite its negative exploitation by some of its practitioners and by some African leaders, religion is a positive force that is necessary for the moral, socio-political and economic transformation of African societies. Religion fulfils a crucial role through its provision of a frame of reference for the critical examination of existing social value systems. All religious traditions uphold moral values such as virtue, justice, the sanctity of human life, equality and human dignity. These moral values are reflected in the scriptures of the various literary religions – Christianity and Islam – and in the oral tradition of African Traditional Religion. Religious practitioners should therefore be self-critical and maintain a critical stance towards socio-political and economic institutions (Agbiji & Swart 2015: 15).

Through aggressive media campaigns, Pentecostal churches seek to mobilise Africans to reject poverty and embrace/work for prosperity. For example, in Kenya, JCC has a Media Ministry and runs monthly Church magazines, produces and sell CDS, DVDs, videos and music albums. The Church heavily uses billboards/posters/ hand bills, websites and is characterised by a heavy consumption of social media: twitter, face book, WhatsApp, Instagram and others. This pattern is replicated in South Africa by the AGGC and CE, and in Zimbabwe by the UFIC. In particular, they use the internet to empower their followers and others to be actively involved in social transformation. According to J. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu:

> The point is that the leadership of contemporary Pentecostals extensively uses modern media, and the internet has been embraced as a divinely inspired breakthrough in contemporary mission endeavors. It has become common for their leaders to sign off radio, television, or even actual church services and revival meetings with direct appeal to patrons, requesting them to stay connected through the internet. The usual catchphrase is, 'We are on the internet', followed by a reference to the internet address (Asamoah-Gyadu 2015: 158).

Pentecostalism and the Quest to Empower Responsible Citizens: Examples from South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya

The foregoing sections have drawn attention to the background and context in which Pentecostalism has experienced remarkable growth. In particular, the need for religion to be relevant to the daily struggles of their members and other citizens was underscored. One of the most devastating critiques of missionary Christianity is that it moulded members who were so preoccupied with heaven that they were of no earthly relevance. With its hyper-religiosity and overemphasis on prayer as the panacea for all ills, Pentecostalism faces a real risk of failing to equip its members with knowledge and skills to become agents of social transformation this side of heaven. In this section, we seek to highlight how selected Pentecostal churches in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya have sought to mould responsible citizens.

Following the demise of apartheid in 1994, post-apartheid South Africa (SA) enshrined in its constitution the freedom of worship (SA constitution, 15.1). The same freedom of worship is guaranteed in the national constitutions of Zimbabwe and Kenya. However, due to historical reasons, in practice mainline Catholic and Protestant forms of religious expression tend to dominate, although these countries acknowledge religious pluralism on paper. In all these countries, for example, African Traditional Religions struggle for official recognition (Chitando, Chiwara & Shoko 2013), while Pentecostalism and Islam in Kenya continue to fight for space (Parsitau 2008).

However, the freedom of religion espoused in the constitutions of the three African countries has resulted in the proliferation of new religious movements, especially Pentecostal churches. In South Africa the end of apartheid gave hope to the black masses: the end of poverty, improvements in standard of living and hope of a complete overhaul of inequality and wealth redistribution. Although there have been significant gains, such transformation has not taken place at a meaningful pace as many would have liked; with the majority of the population still unable to redress their financial situation. There is high unemployment, poverty and increased number of people in squatter camps (Bhorat & Kanbur 2006). Zimbabwe and Kenya have also experienced massive social inequalities, with ruling elites achieving significant economic advancement, while the majority of the citizens wallow in poverty. In such contexts, the danger is real that functionalist approaches to religion can dominate; namely, citizens resorting to religion as a means to an end. In such

instances, religion becomes a clutch that members of churches and other citizens utilize in an effort to cope with serious socio-economic and political problems (Chitando, Gunda & Kugler 2013).

Similarly, a high rate of violence, disease (HIV/AIDS and TB) alcohol/drug abuse, divorce and teenage pregnancies and xenophobia (Deacon *et al*. 2009; Crush 2008; Landau 2012), indicates a continued social deterioration. Pentecostal pastors have capitalised on this in their sermons to enhance personal development as a prelude to a wider social change in the society among Christians and the larger society. Following the prevailing social misery and a sense of neglect by the governments, some Pentecostal preachers have taken up the role of 'voices for the voiceless'. By the same token, others have sought to empower by offering seminars on business management and ways of income generation, as well as provide minimal soft loans as start-ups. This is done by appealing to congregants with designated cultural capital to offer such training. In South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya, Pentecostal preachers have sought to energise their audiences to be assertive, challenge corruption and set their countries on trajectories of growth and development. Although they are cautious in tackling political elites, and are sometimes seen as colluding with them, their teachings on personal empowerment and engendering the commitment towards personal and Africa's growth remains significant.

Personal Empowerment for National Dynamism: Technologies of the Self

Against this backdrop, and drawing on sermons and teachings of the AGLC and CE in Cape Town, South Africa, Pentecostal preachers in these churches see their role within the framework of winning souls, as well as enlisting the help of theological sermons/teachings to win the battles to shape the direction of social change and personal development of Christians (Robbins 2010) and create their own self-empowering communities (Barreiro 2010). Armed with a sense of spirituality and communitarianism, therefore, preachers see their roles to be messianic and believe that they are fulfilling a prophetic mission of God to transform the country, win souls and create a re-awakening and social change amongst Christians. Conversely, Christians, especially immigrants are attracted to these churches and their teachings as a result of the basic 3Rs that

have been sought in the church in contrast to the wider receptive society which has classed them at the margins. Hirschman (2004) identifies three Rs for understanding the motives of immigrant involvement in a religious community - refuge, respect, and resources. This therefore engenders a win-win situation for both immigrants and the church whose agenda is to grow the church with Christians who have 'offered their lives to Christ' in exchange for spiritual and social development through the scriptures. Underpinning these, Christians who have often been relegated to the margins, have found a new sense of humanity through the 3Rs. Involvement in a religious community provides both sanctuary and self-esteem for the immigrant. While R – resource is often associated with Weber's elaboration of the latent economic consequences associated with religion (Connor 2009), resource, nevertheless, stretches beyond the economic and includes the social benefits associated with involvement in a religious community (Zhou *et al.* 2002). How do Pentecostal churches in these countries seek to mould Christians to be both spiritual and good citizens whose daily lives emulate the teachings of Jesus? In Zimbabwe, for instance, the UFIC challenges its members to stand apart in terms of rendering quality service to fellow citizens. In Kenya, the JCC's vision is, '… to teach, train and equip the body of Christ with the word of faith so that the believers can live a victorious life'[2].

Emphasizing personal freedom and collective accountability, Pentecostal preachers/Christians confront the destructive forces of power, repression and accumulated wealth with a message of servanthood, liberation and community sharing, while others have drawn on their spiritual resources to understand and cope with their challenges. Christians are challenged not to sacrifice their moral and Christian values for earthly reward. In particular, leaders of Pentecostal churches challenge Africans to own up and take personal responsibility for whatever happens in their lives. A form-critical analysis of the sermons in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya shows that although there is reference to ancestral curses as threatening the prosperity of individuals and families, there an emphasis of individuals taking charge of their lives through embracing agency. Pentecostal church leaders are keen to have Africans re-write the African story by being accountable and taking responsibility for their actions, in-actions and mis-actions. Reflecting on the story of Samson in Judges 13-16, Quayesi-Amakye writes:

[2] JCC Vision Statement, articulated by Kathy Kuina, Nairobi, 19/07/2016.

> The African continent is blessed with enormous human and material resources. Unfortunately, like Samson most Africans, if not all, have become blind to the realities around them. Pitifully, instead of acknowledging their self-induced negligence, many Africans delight in playing the blame game that always sees the West as the culprit. It is true that the West has a role in the persistent impoverishing of the African continent. But the fact still remains that like Samson this has been possible because Africans have chosen to make sport of themselves (2011: 169).

In Zimbabwe, the UFIC preaches a message of personal responsibility and maximising on the opportunities that God has given to Africans. Building on the theme that 'Africa is too rich to be poor', Emmanuel Makandiwa, the founder, has charged that while Africa has a definite place in God's plan of salvation, Africans are not aware of the resources that they sit on. In a sermon on 'Judgement Night 4', an annual event that attracts thousands of participants from within Southern Africa and beyond, Makandiwa challenged Africans to rewrite their narrative:

> We have everything that we need in Africa, but look at you…so poor
> If Africa was to be taken away from its citizens, you would be amazed at what it would become!
> As Africans we are good at complaining, not at fighting![3]

Through their sermons and the 'authority vested in them by God', they conscientize the Christians and the larger society. Conscientization is not a new phenomenon, but could be traced back to the campaigns and works of Freiré Paulo in Brazil from the 1960s, which helped the church confront manifestly unjust social structures; one that has been taken up by Pentecostal pastors. For this to be achieved, Pentecostal preachers create a 'free social space and communities in which religious piety can be fused with aspirations for a better life' (Self 1992; Barrreiro 2011) to empower and animate their followers who are usually the lower middle class or underprivileged, and form the bulk of their Christians. In other words, the objectives of the preachers are twofold – to use theology to give rationale to the church's mission of repentance and

[3] Sermon by Emmanuel Makandiwa, Mt. Hampden, 26/09/2016.

casting ones' problem(s) to Jesus and to awaken or conscientize the masses, equipping them with tools for reflection about the realities of their lives thereby making them true ambassadors of Jesus. In some instances, it is undertaking some of the social services that governments are unable to carry, such as education and outreach programmes. However, this section will focus on concientization for personal development.

Personal development is regarded as integral to the struggle for national development. It is envisaged that individuals who are confident and aware of their dignity and worth will contribute towards the transformation of their families and nations. Across the three countries, the verse, 'You are a chosen people, a royal priesthood' (1 Peter 2: 9) was a favourite for many preachers and it found resonance in the audiences. It expresses the Pentecostal notion of having been taken from 'nobodiness' to 'somebodiness', and the notion of God as the one who lifts beggars from the dungeons and seats them with princes (Psalms 113: 8). Writing on the preaching in selected Pentecostal churches in Kenya, Parsitau makes the following observation:

> The sermons and messages normally revolve around the theme of self-worth and positive engagement with life. Thus, there is a lot of spiritual inspiration and motivational talks in these churches. This kind of teaching holds potential to empower the disempowered. In these churches they are taught that their lives have meaning, value and agency (Parsitau 2014: 188).

The political and economic systems of South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya are dominated by rapacious elites who do not hesitate to show off their wealth. Those wielding political power in particular fly off to global capitals, spewing the rhetoric of 'Africa rising' at a time when many of their citizens are, in fact, sinking. The presidents of these African countries can afford to undertake countless trips outside their respective countries at a time when their citizens are demanding that they demonstrate greater love, care and concern for them. Most citizens feel (and, indeed, are) excluded from the political and economic systems of their countries. Pentecostal preachers reassure them that while they may not feature in the plans of the politicians, God knows each one of them personally. If politicians only visit them in their constituencies to look for votes towards elections, God knows the citizens by name, having known each one of them before having formed them in their mothers' wombs (Jeremiah 1:5).

Pentecostalism energises believers to contribute towards social transformation by appreciating their strategic position in society.

Focusing on the inequalities in South Africa the preacher at Christ Embassy, Cape Town implores those in positions of power to 'cease to do evil and learn to do right, pursue justice and champion the course of the oppressed'. He draws on the book of Isaiah 1:1, 10–20, and calls on Christians not to be blind to the injustices against the weak and marginalised in society just as in Isaiah's day which was a time of deep injustice and Israel's religion was blind to the injustices. Similarly, he also calls on Christians to be tolerant towards migrants and desist from xenophobic attacks against them given their marginal position in society. Just as Isaiah availed himself to proclaim righteousness, the preacher said, so too as those who through their positions, and Christians at large can make meaningful change in society by following Isaiah's example. As Camroux (2004: 243) opines, 'no real social change is possible unless men and women come to share that experience'.

Another significant area where the Pentecostal churches under study seek to make a difference in terms of social reconstruction is the institution of marriage, which we discuss briefly in the next section.

'Marriage is not easy, but wedding is easy'

Following an increase in single-parenthood, high rates of divorce and unfaithfulness, these churches have directed their sermons to speak to this social 'cancer' that is tearing down the fabric of the society and the nuclear family, resulting in what is regarded as uncontrolled youth that are engaged in crime and self-destruction. However, there is an idealisation and preoccupation with the notion of a neat and well defined notion of the family. The idea is that there is a father, mother and 'lovely' children. In South Africa, Kenya and Zimbabwe, Pentecostal churches place emphasis on marriage as the one strategic institution that needs to be protected if communities and nations are to thrive. Often, this has resulted in the denial of sexual diversity and silencing of homosexuals in Africa (see for example, Van Klinken & Chitando 2016).

Using their sermons, one theme that is echoed among the different churches that we studied is that of personal development through faithfulness/love. Whereas CE focuses on these themes within the framework of its regular Sunday preaching, AGLC chose to follow dedicated days of the

calendars of the month, such as Mother's Day (08 May 2016) and Father's Day (19 June 2016). The UFIC and JCC use regular Sunday preaching and sessions for couples and for the singles to impart teachings on marriage.

The above heading captures the theme of love, faithfulness and responsibility – what it takes to be a mother or the head of a family (father) in a marital relationship preached on 08 May, 2016 and 19, June 2016 being Mother's Day and Father's Day respectively in South Africa in AGLC. The sermons on these dates address the themes of divorce and unfaithfulness and bringing up children in a Christian way to emphasise the role of the family as the pillars of the church and nation building. Using the metaphor of a garden, on Mother's Day, the preacher alluded to couples as being each other's garden that must be taken care of; developed and nurtured to produce good yields. Also, the yields are the children entrusted to them by God and who should be brought up according to God's teachings. Drawing from Colossians 3: 8-19, Pastor Isaiah[4] underscored that 'marriage is based on Agape love and physical relationship. Divorce is a wound and a child is more psychologically affected when there is divorce than death because death is natural while divorce is not'[5].

The pastor noted that in contemporary South Africa 'the man and the woman have separate agendas, resulting in too many divorces because we follow our desires and not that of God. Too often we see a culture when a woman is between the ages of 26-30 years old, they just want a child because they feel they can raise a child alone'[6]. However, 'Colossians 3: 8-19 tells us that couples must work in reciprocity and their relationship should be founded on love. Love equals faithfulness and faithfulness is the key to marriage, and true love is proven 20-30 years down'[7]. Both the UFIC and JCC use the founders as examples of complementarity in marriage. They use the 'glamour founding couples' to emphasise the possibility of husbands and wives working together to have viable marriages. While in practice this might gloss over tension in marriage, there is an effort to present effective marriages as possible.

Focusing on some of the women in the Bible, Pastor Isaiah of the AGLC, restated the theme of responsibility, love and the power of a mother over her family. Citing three of the women – Rebecca, Eve and Sarah – from

[4] All names used for AGLC and CE are pseudonyms.
[5] Sermon by Prophet Isaiah, AGLC, Cape Town: 08/05/2016 (Mother's Day).
[6] See footnote 5.
[7] See footnote 5.

the examples, he underscores how as 'mothers, women exert a powerful role in their families. God gave them a great influence to lead and not to mislead'. He maintained that 'the most important structure is the house, and God wants you to set the house in order before the church. If the house is not in order, God will not agree with you'. He used the example of Rebecca (the wife of Isaac and mother of Esau and Jacob) in the Bible who went to the temple to consult God about the destiny of her children. He explicated that 'every mother has the prophetic responsibility and insight to take care of their children. As a mother, use the potential that you have!'[8] In contrast, he used the stories of Eve and Sarah, the princess who misled their husbands. Eve disobeyed God and Sarah did not believe in God's promise because she was impatient. He cautioned that when one is disobedient or impatient 'you are no longer using reason but emotion, which can destroy the family'. This use of positive and negative examples of women illustrates gender ambivalence in Pentecostalism (Eriksen 2014).

Pursuing the theme of responsibility and love, on June 19, Father's Day, gave Pastor Eleanor the opportunity to speak to the men of her congregation. Drawing on the book of Ephesian 5: 25-26 and 4-6, Pastor Eleanor noted that 'being a father denotes responsibility. A man is a roof, umbrella, and provider because it is stated in the bible. A man is a man not to intimidate but to show love. He must be accessible to his wife and children and should be faithful in their marriage'[9].

Complementing his wife, Pastor Eleanor, Pastor Isaiah denounced the idea of men following their desires, which often derails them and takes them farther away from God. Nonetheless, by being 'doers and followers of the word' helps them to focus. He does so eloquently by drawing examples from the books of Joshua 10: 1-10 and 14, Luke 5:5 and Luke 7. He called on Christians not to be afraid to follow the plan of God than rest their hopes on politicians who often fail them. It is time to 'Switch To Other Person/Plan/Place' (STOP) – God's plan and a place He (God) wants them to be. 'As a Christian, your life is 3D because that is the great plan of God, if you trust the right person, follow his plan and be at the right place, nobody can tell you that you are a failure because they need a spiritual glass to see through your life'[10].

[8] Sermon by Prophet Isaiah, Cape Town: 08/05/2016 (Mother's Day).
[9] Sermon by Pastor Eleanor, Cape Town: 19/06/2016 (Father's Day).
[10] Sermon by Prophet Isaiah, Cape Town: 19/06/2016 (Father's Day).

Discussion

Prima facie, the selected themes from the churches under study do not seem to speak to each other. However, engaging these themes within the historical context of apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa, and postcolonial struggles in Zimbabwe and Kenya, we argue that despite the giant strides by the governments to return to democracy, the countries are still plagued by high unemployment, poverty and a feeling of frustration amongst black Africans at the slow pace of socio-economic change and freedom. While there is political freedom, economic freedom is yet to be achieved, causing tensions that play out in the public sphere resulting in high violence, crime, xenophobia, inequality, teenage pregnancy and drug abuse in post-apartheid South Africa (Panday *et al.* 2009: 14; Landau & Ramjathan-Keogh 2005) and in independent Zimbabwe and Kenya. There is growing frustration in these countries that the political elites have not done enough to ensure that their citizens enjoy prosperity. Making a case further of the link between religion and politics Martin Luther King (cited in Camroux 2004: 243) forcefully asserted that:

> Any religion that professes to be concerned about the souls of men (sic) and is not concerned about the slums that damn them, the economic conditions that strangle them, and the social conditions that cripple them, is a spiritually moribund religion awaiting burial.

The correlation between the choices of the themes of the sermons, therefore, speaks to these issues because as Christians and those with positions to effect change, the need of attunement to these sufferings motivate people to confront social injustice and work toward creating a better world (Porterfield 2005) that seeks to lift the vast majority of the population from the slums of Africa, not simply because one is obliged to do so, but because it is morally right in terms of the teachings of the religions – to champion the voices of the voiceless. As a result of poverty, many young girls have resorted to trading sex for money, while some men, unable to look after their children due to unemployment, tend to renege on their parental duties or become alcoholics, leading to wife abuse. Consequently, there is a significant rate of single mother-headed households or as a result of divorce.

Through recurrent themes of xenophobia, marginality, social exclusion and injustice, numerous Pentecostal churches have sought to create

awareness among her Christians of the need to stay focused and to re-align themselves to teachings of the scriptures as religion can motivate people on a very deep level to work towards a peaceful and just world. Citing the scripture of Jesus as a refugee, Nell (2009: 239) emphasizes the need for Pentecostals be attentive to the plight of others for 'anyone who follows and believes in this Christ will treat refugees with the utmost respect and dignity, when they suffer their pain, bewilderment and uncertainty it must also touch our own lives. We are bound together in a common humanity'. The good news of freedom and liberation preached by Pentecostal churches in these countries, therefore, is to quell the meaninglessness that has taken over the lives of many citizens. It is believed that when Christians submit to the teachings of Jesus, there will be lower crime rates, parents would be responsible towards their children, and teenage girls would delay sex until marriage, as they are taught that their bodies are the temple of God (Parsitau 2009). Their lives should be examples for others around them to emulate. Perhaps it is in this respect that Camroux (2004: 344) maintains that 'Christianity at its best has always been both a personal and a social religion – not one chosen to the exclusion of the other'. And if Christianity is to be a divine instrument in this time, neither politics nor spirituality is enough. Both must go together .

Addressing the issues of marriage, love and infidelity, Christians are called upon to put their own lives in order before using up their energy on more collective solutions (Williams 2007: 186). Pentecostalism thus offers the appeal of sobriety, family focus and increased self-worth. This is because Pentecostal churches have come to realise that the moral fabric of any society rests with a stable family and when the family structures begin to crumble, by extension the society also faces a similar decay.

The messages by Pentecostal preachers, therefore, have sought to address the crises/needs of their members, while building on distinct possible interpretations using the narratives of South Africa's apartheid legacy and the aspirations of many citizens in Zimbabwe and Kenya. Pentecostalism envisages that as individuals and families are transformed, so will the nations be led to 'righteousness and prosperity'. In the Pentecostal scheme of things, the 'wickedness' of individuals must be overcome before they can work for the greater social good. Corruption and bad governance can be overcome when vibrant, God-fearing families emerge, Pentecostalism suggests. These ideas have moved from Pentecostalism and have permeated mainline churches in Ghana (Omenyo 2002), Kenya (Parsitau 2007) and other African countries.

Conclusion

In South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya, dynamic Pentecostal churches that seek to mobilise their members and the larger society to contribute towards social transformation have emerged. This is done by calling upon Christians to exercise a higher level of spirituality that surpasses all forms of intolerancea and injustices, but that that is imbued with 'tenderness of conscience' (Nell 2009). In this article, we have examined the context in which such churches have emerged. We drew attention to the notable challenges that have characterised post-apartheid South Africa, and independent Zimbabwe and Kenya. We highlighted how political elites have decided to 'eat on behalf' of the majority of their citizens. In contexts characterised by anxiety and feelings of marginalisation, Pentecostal churches that preach the dignity of individuals and functional families have emerged, and through their teachings seek to provide 'normative orientation and a sense of self-worth' (Portes & Rumbaut 2006:301) in the face of uncertain circumstances, especially when deviating from the teachings of the 'word'. These Pentecostal churches remind their members and other clients that they are 'citizens of both heaven and earth' and must contribute towards the transformation of their families, churches and countries.

Acknowledgment: This research is part of a Templeton funded project on Christianity and social change in Contemporary Africa through Calvin College.

References

Adogame, A. (ed.) 2011. *Who is Afraid of the Holy Ghost? Pentecostalism and Globalization in Africa and Beyond*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.

Agbiji, O.M. & I. Swart. 2015. Religion and Social Transformation in Africa: A Critical and Appreciative Perspective. *Scriptura* 114,1: 1-20.

Appleby, R.S. 2000. *The Ambivalence of the Sacred: Religion, Violence, and Reconciliation*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.

Asamoah-Gyadu, J.K. 2013. *Contemporary Pentecostal Christianity: Interpretations from an African Context*. Eugene, Oregon: Wipf and Stock.

Asamoah-Gyadu, J.K. 2015. 'We are on the Internet': Contemporary Pentecostalism in Africa and the New Culture of Online Religion. In Hackett,

R.I., J. Soares & B.F. Soares (eds.): *New Media and Religious Transformations in Africa*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Barreiro, A. 2010. *Basic Ecclesial Communities: The Evangelization of the Poor*. Eugene, Oregon: Wipf and Stock**.**

Bhorat, H. & R. Kanbu. 2006. Introduction: Poverty and Wellbeing in Post-apartheid South Africa. In Bhorat, H. & R. Kanbu (eds): *Poverty and Policy in Post-Apartheid South Africa*. Cape Town, HSRC Press.

Camroux, M. 2004. Religion and Politics. *The Expository Times* 342-344.

Chawane, M.H. 2014. The Rastafarian Movement in South Africa: A Religion or Way of Life? *Journal for the Study of Religion* 27,2: 214-237.

Chitando, E., A. Chiwara & T. Shoko. 2013. Religious Pluralism in a 'Christian Nation': Examining Religion in Zimbabwe's Constitution. *Southern Africa Peace Review Journal* 2,2: 140-159.

Chitando, E., M.R. Gunda & J. Kügler (eds.). 2013. *Prophets, Profits and the Bible in Zimbabwe*. Bamberg: University of Bamberg Press.

Connor, P. 2009. International Migration and Religious Participation: The Mediating Impact of Individual and Contextual Effects. *Sociological Forum* 24,4: 779-803.

Crush, J. (ed.) 2008. *The Perfect Storm: The Realities of Xenophobia in Contemporary South Africa*. Southern African Migration Project.

Deacon, H., L. Uys & R. Mohlanhlane 2009. HIV and Stigma in South Africa. In Rohleder, P., L. Swartz, S. Kalichman & L. Simbayi (eds.): *HIV/AIDS in South Africa 25 Years On: Psychosocial Perspectives*. New York: Springer.

Eriksen, A. 2014. Sarah's Sinfulness: Egalitarianism, Denied Difference and Gender in Pentecostalism. *Current Anthropology* 55, Supplement 10: 262-270.

Freeman, D. (ed.) 2012. *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Gifford, P. 1988. *The Religious Right in Southern Africa*. Harare: Baobab.

Hirschman, C. 2004. The Role of Religion in the Origins and Adaptation of Immigrant Groups in the United States. *International Migration Review* 28: 1206-1234.

Kalu, O. 2008. *African Pentecostalism: An Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kaunda, C. 2015. Pentecostal Pastors as Public Intellectuals? An African Hermeneutic for Public Engagement. In Moyo, H. (ed.): *Pastoral Care in*

a Globalised World: African and European Perspectives. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster.

Landau, L. 2012. *Exorcising the Demons Within: Xenophobia, Violence and Statecraft in Contemporary South Africa*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Landau, L., K. Ramjathan-Keogh & S. Gayatri. 2005. *Xenophobia in South Africa and Problems Related to It.* Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand. (Forced Migration Working Paper Series No.13. Forced Migration Studies Programme.)

Lindhardt, M. (ed.). 2015. *Pentecostalism in Africa: Presence and Impact of Pneumatic Christianity in Postcolonial Societies*. Leiden: Brill.

Nell, Ian 2009. The Tears of Xenophobia: Preaching and Violence from a South African Perspective. *Practical Theology in South Africa* 24,2:229-247.

Omenyo, C. 2002. *Pentecost Outside Pentecostalism: A Study of the Development of the Charismatic Renewal in the Mainline Churches in Ghana*. Zoetermeer: Boekencentrum.

Parsitau, D.S. 2007. 'From the Periphery to the Centre': The Pentecostalization of Mainline Christianity in Kenya. *Missionalia* Special Issue on African Pentecostalism, 35,3: 85-111.

Parsitau, D.S. 2008. God vs. Allah: Islam, Christianity and the Contest for Public Space in Kenya. *International Sociological Association (ISA) E-bulletin* 3,10: 3-43.

Parsitau, D.S. 2009. 'Keep Holy distance and abstain till He comes': Interrogating a Pentecostal Church Discourses and Engagements with HIV/AIDS and the Youth in Kenya. *Africa Today* 56,1: 44-64.

Parsitau, D.S. 2014. *The Civic and Public Roles of Neo-Pentecostal Churches in Kenya, 1970-2010.* Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, School of Humanities and Social Science, Kenyatta University, Nairobi, Kenya.

Parsitau, D.S. & P. Mwaura 2010. God in the City: Pentecostalism as an Urban Phenomenon in Kenya. *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae* 36,2: 95-112.

Panday, S., M. Makiwane, C. Ranchod & T. Letsoalo 2009. *Teenage Pregnancy in South Africa - With a Specific Focus on School-going Learners*. Child, Youth, Family and Social Development. Pretoria: Department of Basic Education, Human Sciences Research Council.

Porterfield, A. 2005. *Healing in the History of Christianity*. Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Portes, A. & R.G. Rumbaut 2006. *Immigrant America: A Portrait.* Berkeley, CA: University California Press

Quayesi-Amakye, J. 2011. Spirituality and Social Transformation: The Samson Syndrome and National Progress – Judges 13-16. *Africa Journal of Evangelical Theology* 30,2: 165-176.

Ranger, T.O. (ed.) 2008. *Evangelical Christianity and Democracy in Africa*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Robbins, J. 2010. Anthropology, Pentecostalism, and the New Paul: Conversion, Event, and Social Transformation. *South Atlantic Quarterly* 109,4: 633-652.

Ter Haar, G. & J. Bussutil (eds.) 2005. *Bridge or Barrier? Religion, Violence and Visions for Peace*. Leiden: Brill.

Self, E.C. 1992. Conscientization, Conversion, and Convergence: Reflections on Base Communities and Emerging Pentecostalism in Latin America. *The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies*14,1: 59-72.

Sibanda, F. 2012. The Impact of Rastafari Ecological Ethic in Zimbabwe: A Contemporary Discourse. *Journal of Pan African Studies* 5,3: 59-76.

Van Klinken, A. & E. Chitando (eds.) 2016. *Public Religion and the Politics of Homosexuality in Africa*. Oxford: Routledge.

Verstraelen, F.J. 1998. *Zimbabwean Realities and Christian Responses: Contemporary Aspects of Christianity in Zimbabwe*. Gweru: Mambo Press.

Walsh, T.G. & F. Kaufman (eds.) 1999. *Religion and Social Transformation in Southern Africa*. St Paul, Minn.: Paragon House.

Williams, P.J. 2007. The Sound of Tambourines: The Politics of Pentecostal Growth in El Salvador. In Smith, L.C. (ed.): *Pentecostal Power: Expressions, Impact and Faith of Latin American*. Leiden: Brill.

Zhou, M., C.L. Bankston III & R.Y. Kim. 2002. Rebuilding Spiritual Lives in the New Land: Religious Practices among Southeast Asian Refugees in the United States. In Min, P.G. & J.H. Kim (eds.): *Religion in Asian America: Building Faith Communities.* Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Ezra Chitando
Department of Religious Studies, Classics and Philosophy
University of Zimbabwe
Harare
chitsa21@yahoo.com

Henrietta Nyamnjoh
African Centre for Cities
University of Cape Town
henrietta.nyamnjoh@uct.ac.za

Damaris Parsitau
Department of History, Philosophy and Religious Studies
Egerton University
Kenya
dparsitau@yahoo.com

‘The Glory is Here!’ Faith Brands and Rituals of Self-Affirmation for Social Responsibility in Kenya[1]

Loreen Maseno

Abstract

Female Pentecostal-Charismatic (PC) church leaders have a quest to legitimize their leadership at all levels. This quest for acceptability and legitimacy to the congregation they lead can be daunting especially in the context of a male dominated religious field such as we have in Kenya. Some female PC leaders in Kenya manage the desires and beliefs of their audiences through religious programmes and slogans that enhance social participation and solidarity. This article examines the programme and slogan ‘The Glory is here’ broadcasted by one Kenyan female PC church leader, Margaret Wanjiru of Jesus is Alive Ministries (JIAM). Through the faith brand ‘The Glory is here’, Wanjiru, in the marketing of religion, distinguishes herself from others in the market place and promotes her product and services in order to develop a consumer base. Her programme as a female PC Televangelist functions as an empowering ritual of self-affirmation of women. Both her faith brand and repeated rituals of self-affirmation serve to enhance her solidarity with women of all ages, and serve as social and psychological support to the community.

Keywords: faith brand, self-affirmation, female Pentecostal-Charismatic leaders, social responsibility, Kenya

[1] This article is based on a conference paper presented at the 9th International and Interdisciplinary Glopent Conference, which took place on the 10-11 June 2016, Uppsala University, Sweden. I acknowledge the very helpful feedback provided during the conference.

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a12

Introduction

Female Pentecostal-Charismatic (PC) church leaders overtly and covertly negotiate their claims to religious leadership. This quest for acceptability and legitimacy in the group they lead can be daunting especially in the context of a male dominated religious field such as we have in Kenya. Some female PC leaders manage the desires and beliefs of their audiences through religious programmes which enhance social participation and solidarity among women in Kenya. As ritual processes that impact on society in socially complex ways, it functions as a social responsibility system and system of intervention, for, with, and on behalf of women. It also importantly impacts on the production of a variety of forms of social relations, that patterns social cohesion among women, and as such, also impacting society more broadly speaking.

There is a consensus that religious beliefs contribute to levels of adult social responsibility (Rossi 2001:227). According to Rossi, social responsebility is multifaceted and much more inclusive than mere membership of formal associations or volunteerism related to formal organizations. To her, this includes normative obligations and provisions of social support, care giving and financial assistance at the family level, and also to the community at large (Rossi 2001:128). As female leader, Margaret Wanjiru is strategically positioned to do just this. She propagates and inculcates religious beliefs and moral values and also provides ethical direction, with the aim of supporting socially responsible behaviour in the community (see Frederick 1986).

This article first introduces Margaret Wanjiru and the origins of her ministry. It also highlights her induction into and debut on televangelism. She decided on television as medium for her ministry, because it provides the opportunity to advance not only the propagation of her own faith message, but also the branding and managing of her faith brand. Rather than focusing on specific programme footage, the article focuses on how Margaret Wanjiru has managed to found and propagate her faith brand through televangelism, and through it, to encourage and empower fellow women (Kalu 2008: 149). An important part of her approach is an emphasis on rituals of self-affirmation. These rituals have meaning not only for her audience, but also reflexively, for herself. They provide spiritual support and foster solidarity with the communities comprising her consumer base. They also importantly serve as tools of empowerment, through a process through which she encourages her audience to take up social responsibility for themselves, their families and

communities, and, in so doing, to cultivate social cohesion with dignity, self-respect, and integrity.

Introducing Margaret Wanjiru and JIAM

Margaret Wanjiru was born in 1961 into a polygamous family in Kahuguini, Kiambu Kenya. As a youth she was a member of the Anglican church of Kenya[2]. Since her father was an alcoholic, her mother had to fend for the family[3]. They found themselves impoverished and having to live within Nairobi's Kangemi slums where she grew up in poverty, even as her mother made and sold illicit brews to educate and feed the children. Kangemi slums is located in a small valley on the outskirts of Nairobi city, on the road connecting Nairobi and Naivasha. It has a population of over 150,000 people and its southern border connects with another large slum known as Kawangware.

By the age of sixteen, Wanjiru had become pregnant[4]. Before she knew what was happening she conceived the second time, despite the many warnings she had received from her mother (Kalu 2008:150). Indeed, studies indicate that living in extreme environments like slums impacts sexual and reproductive health. This is essentially so since slum communities are often characterized by a lack of basic infrastructure, high risk of sexual and gender-based violence, high levels of substance abuse, poor livelihood opportunities and poor schooling facilities, all of which negatively impact young women aged between 15-22 years (Beguy *et al.* 2014). In general, it has been indicated that over 13,000 girls drop out of school in Kenya annually, due to early

[2] See http://www.dacb.org/history/aics-kenya.html Accessed on 13.3.16.

[3] Wanjiru herself repeats this often in her church services. When she proclaims her message, it comes with the support of her own experience, that she has had to fend for herself and her two children.

[4] There seems to be inaccuracies and imprecisions in some of the information Wanjiru has supplied to interviewers and researchers. This came to light from media revelations following her debut into the political arena in 2007 when one James Kamangu insisted that he had formally married her according to Kikuyu traditions. Consequently, the age at which she became pregnant differs in several accounts. According to Parsitau, she was seventeen (Parsitau 2011:134). Kamangu's account brings her age to about 19 or 20. Clearly, the exact age when she became pregnant remains contested to date.

childbearing (Muganda-Onyando *et al.* 2008). For a while, Wanjiru got a job as a house servant in Nairobi, in order to feed her children (Mwaura 2002:202). Wanjiru's mother took up the responsibility to raise her two children. While working as a servant, she returned to school and completed her elementary education.

Later, she got a cleaning job, and enrolled for a marketing diploma course. In this course, Wanjiru learnt the process or technique of promoting, advertising, selling and distributing a product or service. She later got a job as a marketer for Marlboro cigarettes which she did so well, that she moved up the ranks (Kalu 2008:150-151). The JIAM website states that her discipline and determination to succeed resulted in rapid promotions and various accomplishments until she became a sales and marketing executive for a multinational firm in Nairobi. She later went on to form her own business in the city excelling as an entrepreneur[5].

In March 1991, Wanjiru attended a crusade by the Nigerian preacher, Emmanuel Eni where she converted to Christianity, and turned away from the path she had earlier walked (Kalu 2008:151). Eni is a Nigerian evangelist renowned for his book *Delivered from the Powers of Darkness* (Eni 1987)[6]. In this book, Eni claims to have been married to a woman from the spirit world and became an agent of Satan. According to Gifford, this is a continent-wide best seller in the religious domain (Gifford 2004: 85). This struck a chord in Wanjiru who had been initiated into witchcraft at a young age when a wizard convinced her mother to subject her and her siblings to witchcraft rituals for protection from evil spirits (Mwaura 2008:282). Later in life, she associated with dark powers of witchcraft to enable her to be a successful marketer and to outwit her competitors. After Wanjiru's conversion she soon started preaching the gospel in the streets with a group of South African Christians of the World Intercessory Ministry (Parsitau 2011: 134-135).

Jesus is Alive Ministries (JIAM) was founded by Wanjiru in September 1993. Currently it has a membership of over 11,000 members[7]. In 1997 she was ordained a minister, and in 2002 a Bishop by Archbishop Arthur Kitonga of the Redeemed Gospel Church. Wanjiru is the second woman to be ordained a Pentecostal Bishop in Kenya after Margaret Wangari, Bishop of the

[5] See https://www.jiam.org/bishops-profile/ Accessed on 1.3.16

[6] See also Ellis and Ter Haar (1998); and Corten, Marshall-Fratani (2001).

[7] See https://www.jiam.org Accessed on 1.3.16

Church of the Lord in Kiambu County. This position, combined with her political interests have ushered her even more into the limelight. As a female Bishop within the patriarchal religious landscape of Kenya, controversial perspectives commonly emerge on gender roles in ministry. And, in this complex context, she is standing her ground very well.

Whereas she started street preaching in the early 1990's, she moved to her Haile Selassie premises in 1998. In the same year, she began her televised show 'The Glory is here' (Parsitau 2011: 134). Her ministry has a vibrant media look with website live-streaming, you-tube postings, flyers and numerous activities on face book and twitter. JIAM has ventured into diaspora communities of Uganda, South Africa, United States, Australia and the United Kingdom. Besides being a televangelist, she is also a business-woman running the Glory Investment Fund, the *Faith Digest* magazine, fleets of buses, cafeterias and a bible school. She is a beautiful woman with over twenty two other services during the week, each drawing large crowds. She can be said to have challenged the conservative Pentecostals that restrict the levels of women's ritual status (Kalu 2008:151-152). She has an academic background in marketing and Theology.

Wanjiru's Debut into Televangelism and her Faith Brand

We have already noted that Wanjiru was involved in aggressive marketing as a salesperson for the Marlboro cigarettes company outlet in Kenya. Through her work she was able to climb the ranks in marketing to senior positions. Thus, marketing for Wanjiru should not be considered strange. According to Harri Englund, Pentecostalism in Africa have initiated and developed numerous social aspects and related practices to their ministries, e.g. the commodification of goods and services, the development of numerous transnational connections and relationships in Africa and various kinds of relationship with Africa's diasporas, the utilising and operationalising of the mass media in the interests of their programmes and projects, and also to intervene and address the numerous crises in public health (Englund 2011:15).

JIAM TV programme 'The Glory is here' started broadcasting on national TV close to prime time, every evening, from as early as 1998. Very few men and women in the religious circles could air their programmes at the time. She organized herself and her congregants to fund this enterprise and

ensured that each programme was broadcast. This was at a time when current media and streaming options were not common. Thus, it was a very expensive venture. It is therefore important to see how she packaged her message and produced her faith brand.

Owing to the overcrowded commercial environment and noisy popular culture, it follows that branding is an indispensable tool in the propagation of one's movement, and its values and beliefs, in a rising mediatizing and digitising world. Mara Einstein asserts that:

> Religious organizations have taken on names, logos and personalities and slogans that allow them to be heard in a cluttered, increasingly competitive marketplace …. Faith brands, like their secular counterparts exist to aid consumers in making and maintaining a personal connection to a commodity product (Einstein 2008: xi).

Consequently, to her, religious products and institutions have become branded in much the same way as consumer products. Branding includes making meaning and giving consumers a product or a service to think about and engage, as a total package (Einstein 2008:91, 94). Wanjiru's main rationale and motivation that she gives her audience, to likewise associate with, imitate or replicate and practice, are the lessons from her own life. For the branding of JIAM, as well as the propagation of her faith brand, the media is essential. Moreover, she was a pioneering and currently is, a leading Pentecostal Bishop in Kenya, and her programmes are aired consistently in weekly programmes on national TV. Today, she is a household name in Kenya. Indeed, she even runs a print magazine alongside her television and social media programmes, called *Faith Digest* (Kalu 2008:151). Further, in 2007, she was listed among the 50 most influential women in East Africa by *True Love*, a leading women's Magazine in Kenya, for enabling spiritual empowerment to thousands of people through her outreach (Parsitau 2011: 134).

As people started and kept watching 'The Glory is here', the programme became a household name, and very few in Kenya can say they do not know the programme and its host. Clearly, Wanjiru made use of marketing strategies, where the message is to be repeated as often as possible and be packaged so as to ensure loyalty and allegiance to the same brand. Even as other products in the market are propagated through the media, in order to raise awareness of them, and to buy into them, so, what we see here, can the

religious, or spiritual products, in the form of faith brands, be given popular meaning and awareness through marketing. Hence, religion and marketing are deemed to be mutually beneficial and not contesting (Einstein 2008:74).

Faith brands create financial value for their owners, become part of a culture and create various forms of loyalty to commodity products availed by religious organizations (Einstein 2008:91). These products include a wide array of items that enhance spiritual progress such as television programmes which have a readily recognizable name and logo. They can go further to include books, live streams, a pastor, a spiritual practice, religious courses, DVD's and CD's or a combination of these created to aid target consumers. These products are expanding by the day, and may even include film and screen plays by various religious groups. Key is that these spiritual products are readily identifiable. The programme the 'Glory is here' was known to belong to one Wanjiru and no one else. At all times, she was the minister in the programmes and was given prime airtime. Essentially, Einstein points out that when marketing is introduced into a category, it alters the assumptions therein of the category. Thus, when Religion is marketed, it acts just like other branded products (Einstein 2008: 75). Consequently, with the marketing of spirituality comes the idea that religion, like any other good, is a product for which consumers can shop, can be tailored into individual preferences and its consumers can expect convenience and perhaps entertainment from its marketers.

For Wanjiru, it seems, to be a producer of religious goods, and use marketing and media tools for her faith brand, has come naturally, given her background. Ultimately, the use of these systems, helped Wanjiru to develop a consumer base that constitutes a sizable block of religious groups in Kenya. By getting into the public domain of Television broadcasting, Wanjiru continues to invite more people to her audience. This audience is vast in range and array. She is promoting her particular faith brand, and it is continuing to grow.

The Glory Is Here

The catch phrase, 'The Glory is here', was developed in the late 1990's by Wanjiru as she made her debut into televangelism. This was her form of meaning-making of her understanding of the Christian gospel. She sought to

bring across a positive message of self-affirmation and self-assertion in the present. Her packaging of the gospel was unique in the midst of the noisy religious outlets and popular culture, in that it impacted people's dignity and self-esteem. In this context, the term 'televangelism' in the American sense of the word is not wholly applicable to Wanjiru and in some cases, the broader African religious media scene. In the American usage, televangelists are evangelical and Pentecostal ministers whose religious ministries which most often than not, exclusively revolve around their television or radio programmes, whereas in the African context, televangelists are often leaders who lead by example, and are leaders of visible churches or ministries. They are not just faces on television and voices on the radio. They are living among the people, and the people can testify as to their lives and their social commitments for the improvement of the quality of life of people. Consequently, televangelism, when used in Africa, is often used in a broader sense, than in America (Ihejirika 2009:21).

In theological terms, firstly, the notion of 'glory' signifies the presence of God. To lay claim to this glory in a way produces meaning for her consumer base. It suggests that, if God is somewhere, and if there is a God, God is present with people in their own circumstances. This, for many constitutes an invitation, to also join in the glory and presence of God. It follows that if God's glory is with people, God is understood to be present in their own circumstances, sanctioning their lives, and all their meetings, assemblies, and prayers, with goodness. In Wanjiru's theological understanding, the significance of this phrase, points to an identity which is part of the overall eschatological drama of the Kingdom of God. It is eschatological, in that it is the hope-for future that reaches into the present (Kline 2001). And, Wanjiru's message and its impact can be likened to the parables of Jesus in the Bible. The 'glory of God' references the belief in the overall presence of the Kingdom of God, as a 'tensive symbol' (Scott 1989:58)[8], among humankind. As tensive symbol it opens up to many meanings which allows for a variety of interpretations in a large variety of social contexts.

Secondly, due to Wanjiru's own life story, she can give content to the belief in the presence of the 'glory of God'. For her, to appear on and for having become such a successful TV personality in Kenya, shows, existentially that it

[8] The parable is a type of discourse or narrative that was used in Jewish tradition.

is indeed possible for a girl from the slums to rise to the level of becoming a National TV personality. Wanjiru's life story which traces her rise from extreme poverty and difficulty, to where she is now, suggests an element of some visible 'glory' or success. In part, she reflects what people desire in terms of their own hopes for success. Presently, she somewhat embodies what the glory may be thought to be in individual lives.

Furthermore, the origin of this slogan, according to Wanjiru, is a vision she had, which lasted nine hours. In this vision, summarily stated, God showed her a black book with writings inside but no title. What she saw next was that God touched it with a finger, drew a map of Africa, and wrote on it, 'The Glory is here: Africa shall be saved' (Parsitau 2014: 128). This was, when financially she was rock bottom. Following a prompting from God, she ventured into the TV ministry. She started her half hour televised religious programme 'The Glory is here', that was first aired on KBC and Family TV and later on, started a programme on KTN (Parsitau 2014:131). In her account, this vision-event, gave rise to her success with JIAM. In her understanding, the notion of 'glory' is present in all life's circumstances: 'Let the God of all Glory show you His glory for when one sees that glory one will be free in all areas'[9].

Another rendering that Wanjiru has of her notion of 'glory', is that it is based theologically in Exodus 33, where Moses asked God to show him His, i.e. God's glory. Her take on this is that, Moses' desire was to have much more of God. God promised to answer that prayer. God said to Moses that signs would follow him. Wanjiru teaches her followers that, in order for Moses' followers to know that God's glory was with him, Moses would experience all of Gods goodness, he would experience that it is God who protects, guides and fights all his battles; Moses would experience that God is the Almighty who chooses to show grace and mercy to them that He wishes to show. These are the dimensions that she encourages her congregation to desire, and to live out. As her congregants, she encourages them to do as Moses, so as to experience the same glory that Moses did[10].

Maintaining a faith brand comes along with its backlash that disparages and points out flaws of the personality associated with the brand. For Wanjiru, a female Pentecostal church leader, and single mother who at the same time was making an attempt into the political arena, she became the target

[9] See https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KtwQcWrr4Dg. Accessed 1.3.2016
[10] See https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KtwQcWrr4Dg. Accessed 1.3.2016

of a sexist backlash from her competitors and the media who sought to discredit her. Indeed, her influence and its backlash even moved to the sphere of satire, caricature and comedy plays on national TV such as redykyulass[11]. Thus, it was clear who was being imitated when reference was made to her.[12] However her faith brand continues to assert forms of self-affirmation for many women across East and Central Africa, and ultimately, her legitimacy.

Yet, in the promotion of her faith brand, 'the Glory is here', inevitably, Wanjiru is negotiating and transforming her own self-legitimation. As a female preacher in a religious field, her claims to religious leadership is fraught with those who would wish to cast doubt on her suitability. If God's glory is here, and God is here, then what she and her congregation are doing is sanctioned by God, thus, legitimate. What follows is an enumeration of how this programme, 'The Glory is here' acts as a ritual of self-affirmation particularly for an African female residing in sub-Saharan Africa.

Rituals of Self Affirmation and Social Responsibility

The programme, 'The Glory is here' was initially broadcast by Kenya Broadcasting Corporation (KBC) TV and Radio. It later on moved to Family TV and Radio 316. From 2009 to 2011, 'The Glory is here' was aired once a week, every Monday night by KTN at 9:45pm (Parsitau 2014:254). Now it airs on Family TV on Sunday at 8:30 pm and a repeat on Thursday morning at 10:00 pm (Parsitau 2014:252). Wanjiru presents herself stylishly and well groomed each time she is on live broadcast. Her office is well furnished and is testament to good taste. She shares her personal story of hard work,

[11] Redykyulass comprised of three young college students who were stand-up comedians. The trio's performances focused on Kenyans' way of life and was quite entertaining to many Kenyans.

[12] After her decision to run for a parliamentary seat in 2007 and her engagement announcement, a flurry of media reports surfaced. Granted her spheres of influence in popular culture, this occurrence became a national dialogue with phone in's, letters to the editors, cartoons and newspaper editorials paying attention to her life (Parsitau 2011: 136). Her later political achievements included contesting and winning the Starehe parliamentary seat (2007), contesting and loosing as Senator of Nairobi (2013) and most recently, contesting and loosing as Governor of Nairobi (2017).

determination and moving up the corporate ladder, a story of one moving from rags to riches. A story she attests can hold true for anyone else in the audience.

According to Jonathan Walton, televangelists wield influence and do have a large income base that enables them to air their services. His critical assessment shows that many of these preachers, in their sermons and other media, promote ideologies that reinforce injustice, patriarchy, and inequality, by way of cultural myths. One of such myths is that success is attainable by any hard working person, thus ignoring the structural constraints on financial opportunities, even though they encourage conspicuous consumption (Walton 2009:215). To him, it is clear that television has a unique ability to codify certain norms and behaviours, but, at the same time, strengthen cultural myths (Walton 2009: 178-179).

Pentecostal imagery normally features success and wealth, hiding the pain, suffering and poverty that attract people to these churches (Asamoah-Gyadu 2004). Besides this criticism of opulence and ideological warps that emanate from these groups, Walton argues that some televangelism is valuable and succeeds in motivating its audience, even the direst of circumstances, as they provide a personal strength and motivation, to confront and resist what audiences understand to be unjust. In the Kenyan case, this would include an economically unjust and sexist society while in the American case, it additionally includes racial injustice. The value of televangelism to Wanjiru's audience serves to provide social support to those who are in the midst of such oppressive situations. Her ministry further participates in care giving and offers various forms of assistance for families through counselling, mentorship, marriage programmes thus impacting many.

The location of her church, in downtown Nairobi makes it accessible by the down-trodden and socially marginalised, the many who lack the comforts of life and can hardly make ends meet. Such are those who seek a way out of the injustices that society and the political class have continued to put them through. Televangelism for Wanjiru's audience is a way forward beyond glass ceilings that had for a long time seen male preachers dominating the religious field and as such, her broadcasts fit neatly into the category of 'rituals of self-affirmation' (Walton 2009: 173). For the many women mishandled in many arenas of life, a Kenyan female PC leader speaks to their plight, also confronting sexism in the church and in society.

Self-affirmation in this case flows both ways, to the audience and again to the minister, Wanjiru. In affirming her connection to God and his glory,

affirming her female personhood and her priesthood, she dispels traditional sexist religious shackles that celebrate the patriarchal models that rule supreme in some of the Pentecostal and mainline churches. Wanjiru's sermons demonstrate a clear engagement with African women's theology and appeals to women's experience. This entails taking seriously women's experiences and drawing from them for theological reflection. Such a position is particularly a political commitment to the emancipation of women. As an African woman, taking from African women's theology, she attends and appeals to several themes central to African Women's Theology, such as community, empowerment, liberation, a liberative ecclesiology, a Christology for women, and a feminist ecology and missiology (Maseno-Ouma 2014). These themes speak to individual social challenges, many women face, even as she herself provides solidarity and social support to countless women.

Wanjiru is deemed as a trail-blazer by thousands of women (Parsitau 2011:134). Wanjiru also entered the political arena, a road on which very few women leaders dare to venture. She is noted as a person that can be looked up to in admiration for such determination. For the many single mothers who have to raise their children alone, an experience that Wanjiru has had to go through, her broadcasts affirm such persons. According to Kalu, Margaret Wanjiru has also managed to empower fellow women who have established churches (Kalu 2008: 149). In this manner, through her programmes, she gives back to the community. Yet this affirmation is not only a one-way street, but also produces and reproduces opportunities for Wanjiru's own self-legitimation.

In order to understand televangelism as a ritual of self-affirmation, it is important, as Walton points out, to understand the social and religious context into which the preacher speaks, thus making the preachers' message significant to the audience (Walton 2009:215). This article has already indicated in part the contexts of sexism and economic injustices in Kenya. Whereas Walton focussed on male televangelists in America whom he appraises as promoting the strong black man hypermasculinist hero, it is interesting to see how Wanjiru from a developing country, comes onto the scene and negotiates her standing on national TV, in order to critique sexism in the religious and political arenas, and affirm not only herself but all women. Clearly, a hypermasculinist hero cannot be promoted by Wanjiru owing to her realities and the experiences of African women which play a key role in Wanjiru's reflection and theologising. Yet, it can be said, she has created her own category.

Conclusion

This article has considered faith brands and rituals of self-affirmation which contribute to activities that directly advance social goals. When these are placed alongside each other, they redefine emerging Pentecostalism on the African continent. The faith brand 'The Glory is here' for Wanjiru opens spaces for rituals of self-affirmation. Through televangelism and the JIAM ministry, Wanjiru develops a consumer base, connected to her faith brand in the society in which she operates. Within this milieu she furthers religious beliefs which contribute to levels of adult social responsibility for herself and her congregations. Clearly, 'The Glory is here' may literally neither be here nor there, but the use of this slogan, especially as it links up with her own rise from the slums of Nairobi, distinguishes Wanjiru from other faith brands. This distinction makes her products accessible while at the same time Wanjiru as a personality becomes important in relation to this brand.

'The Glory is here', like other faith brands can be noted to be useful largely in Pentecostal circles. These are said to be seeker sensitive churches whose members would go on to seek for themselves products that are spiritually engaging. It would be interesting to see whether these patterns described here are also applicable across fellow religious traditions. On the other hand, the type of religion promoted through religious marketing emphasizes a 'consumer-friendly, feel-good, easy listening type of Christianity' (Einstein 2008:179). This ultimately masks the reality of the product and may dupe newcomers into a set of values while at the same time, leaving them with a religious worldview which is insufficient to cope with life's setbacks existentially and in reality. Wanjiru's televangelism emphasizes on self-affirmation, dignity and self-esteem, both for her audience and herself. This empowerment serves to address notions of individual social responsibility in all the areas of life, such as the domains of work, family and community.

References

Asamoah-Gyadu, K. 2004. Pentecostal Media Images and Religious Globalization in Sub-Saharan Africa. In Horsfield, P., M. Hess & A. Medrano (eds.): *Belief in Media: Cultural Perspectives on Media and Christianity*. Aldershot, UK: Ashgate Publishers.

Beguy D., J. Mumah & L. Gottschalk 2014. Unintended Pregnancies among

Young Women Living in Urban Slums: Evidence from a Prospective Study in Nairobi City, Kenya. *PLoS ONE* 9,7: e101034. doi:10. 1371/journal.pone.0101034.

Corten, A. & R. Marshall-Fratani (eds.) 2001. *Between Babel and Pentecost: Transnational Pentecostalism in Africa and Latin America*. USA: C. Hurst & Co. Publishers.

Einstein, M. 2008. *Brands of Faith. Marketing Religion in a Commercial Age*. New York: Routledge.

Eni, E. 1987. *Delivered from the Powers of Darkness*. Ibadan: Scripture Union.

Englund, H. (ed.) 2011. *Christianity and Public Culture*. USA: Ohio University Press.

Ellis, S. & G. ter Haar 1998. Religion and Politics in sub-Saharan Africa. *Journal of Modern African Studies* 36,2:175-201.

Frederick, W. 1986. Towards CSR3: Why Ethical Analysis is Indispensible and Unavoidable in Corporate Affairs. *California Management Review* 28,Winter: 126-141.

Gifford, P. 2001. *Ghana's New Christianity: Pentecostalism in a Globalising African Economy*. London: Hurst and Company.

Horrigan, B. 2010. *Corporate Social Responsibility in the 21st Century: Debates, Models and Practices across Government, Law and Business.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Ihejirika, W. 2009. Research on Media, Religion and Culture in Africa: Current Trends and Debates. *African Communication Research* 2,1:1-60.

Kalu, O. 2008. *African Pentecostalism: An Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kalu, O. & A. Low 2008. *Interpreting Contemporary Christianity: Global Processes and Local Identities*. New York: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.

Kline, M. 2001. *Glory in Our Midst. A Biblical-Theological Reading of Zechariah's Night Visions*. USA: Two Age Press.

Maseno-Ouma, L. 2014. *How Abanyole African Widows Understand Christ: Explaining Redemption through the Propagation of Lineage.* New York: Edwin Mellen Press.

Muganda-Onyando, R. & M. Omondi 2008. *Down the Ddrain: Counting the Cost of Teenage Pregnancy and School Dropout in Kenya.* Nairobi: Center for the Study of Adolescence.

Mwaura, P.N. 2008. Gendered Appropriation of Mass Media in Kenyan Christianities: A Comparison of Two Women-led African Instituted

Churches in Kenya. In Kalu, O. & A. Low (eds.): *Interpreting Contemporary Christianity: Global Processes and Local Identities*. New York: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.

Mwaura, P.N. 2002. 'A stick plucked out of the fire': The Story of Rev. Margaret Wanjiru of Jesus is Alive Ministries. In Phiri, I.A. *et al.* (eds.): *Hidden Histories of Women of Faith in Africa.* Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Oduyoye, M. 2001. *Introducing African Women's Theology*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.

Parsitau, D. 2014. *The Civic and Public Roles of Neo-Pentecostal Churches in Kenya (1970-2010).* Unpublished PhD thesis, Kenyatta University.

Parsitau, D. 2011. 'Arise O ye daughters of faith'. Women, Pentecostalism and Public Culture in Kenya. In Englund, H. (ed.): *Christianity and Public Culture in Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge Centre of African Studies.

Rossi, A. 2001. Developmental Roots of Adult Social Responsibility. In Rossi, A. (ed.): *Caring and Doing for Others: Social Responsibility in the Domains of Family, Work, and the Community*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Rossi, A. 2001. Domains and Dimensions of Social Responsibility: A Sociodemographic Profile. In Rossi, A. (ed.): *Caring and Doing for Others: Social Responsibility in the Domains of Family, Work, and the Community*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Scott, B. 1989. *Hear then the Parable: A Commentary on the Parables of Jesus*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press.

Walton, J. 2009. *Watch This! The Ethics and Aesthetics of Black Televangelism*. New York: New York University Press.

Websites

http://www.dacb.org/history/aics-kenya.html Accessed on 13.3.2016
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KtwQcWrr4Dg. Accessed 1.3.2016
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KtwQcWrr4Dg. Accessed 1.3.2016
https://www.jiam.org/bishops-profile/ Accessed on 1.3.2016
https://www.jiam.org Accessed on 1.3.2016

Faith Brands and Rituals of Self-Affirmation for Social Responsibility

Loreen Maseno
Department of Religion, Theology and Philosophy
Maseno University; and
Humboldt Research Fellow
University of Bayreuth
Loreen.Maseno@uni-bayreuth.de; and loreenmas@gmail.com

Where ‘heaven and earth’ meet: Religion and Social Responsibility

Jaco Beyers

Abstract

In this discussion the question to be addressed, will not be as much as to present direction in the format of religious participation in social responsibilities. Such a question assumes that religion does indeed have a social responsibility. This discussion here rather wants to question the question: does religion indeed have a social responsibility? There are two possible positions on this: (i) it is obvious that religion has a social responsibility and should act upon it; and (ii) it is not so obvious that religion has a social responsibility and should refrain from social participation in social issues. Both positions are supported by good arguments. The former position is supported by the assumption that human nature is filled with virtue and humans have the moral capacity to influence society in a positive way. The religious idealists are convinced that an utopian society can be created on earth; almost make heaven touch earth. The second position is underlined by the argument that human virtue and moral capacity is over-estimated. Reinhold Niebuhr (1936) elaborated on this matter. Society is however much rather governed by self-interest and ignorance even under the veil of religion. There are dangers (i.e. reductionism, selectivism, antagonism and utopianism) involved when religion participates in social activities. The discussion here wants to present a third possible way by suggesting a tempered approach when religion participates in social activities. Rather individuals ought to be educated to act morally and responsibly in society.

Keywords: social responsibility, religion, utopia, Reinhold Niebuhr, individual, alienation

Electronic ISSN: 2519-5476; DOI: https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2017/sp19a13

1. Introduction

Why are we talking about the social responsibility of religion? Does religion have that kind of responsibility, and what does that responsibility look like? What is it that religion does to and for society? Is it only religion that can do it for and to society or are there other institutions capable of doing similar tasks better?

In a current South African context of social and political turmoil, religious bodies participate in politics and social issues. A pattern of violent destructive protests by communities and students has recently emerged. These protests are presented as the expression of human and democratic rights to remind government of the expectation for them to provide services. Religious communities participate in these protests. Compare in this regard the South African Council of Churches (SACC) report entitled 'Unburdened Panel', revealing the extent of state capture (S. Stone, *The Citizen* 2017-05-08), revealing corruption and bad governance, calling in effect for a vote of no confidence in government.

Publishing a written report is a passive effort to convey knowledge and inform citizens of how their rights are ignored. Should religious bodies do more than just keep society informed about injustices? What should be the impact of religious movements on community mobilisation?

The question as to the social responsibility of religion implies a discontinuity as well as a continuity between the two spheres of society and religion. A more nuanced differentiation would be to distinguish between religion and politics. Such separation (discontinuity) of politics and religion is the result of modernity (Goosen 2009:1). Politics is no longer grounded in a divine sanction, as used to be the case during a medieval (predominantly Christian) European social structure, a social structure which also influenced the form of colonial government in South Africa. No clear separation between religion and politics governed medieval society. The will of the king was the will of the divine; the will of the divine was the will of the king. This principle was continued in a colonial government system where the government determine the law of the country. Think in this regard on laws supporting and maintaining the apartheid system. The Law is divinely sanctioned. Those opposing the Law is opposing divine determination. This scenario however changed in a postmodern, post-colonial context. This process of alienation is not only prevalent between leadership structures and society at large, but this

alienation also plays out between individual members of society.

We are now reflecting on a post-medieval (temporal perspective), African (geographical perspective), multi-religious (religious perspective) democracy (political perspective). It is no longer a religious-intolerant theocracy, monarchy or social-oppressive bureaucracy.

Politics is through separation from religion, now considered to be grounded in autonomous human power. Religion is set up as an autonomous sphere besides politics. The will of the people governs the people. Religion is a private matter and an autonomous institution which does not need to be consulted for political decisions. Only during recent postmodern thinking the urge to merge spheres resulted in synergic relations of spheres. Especially in an African context the connectedness of all spheres and institutions are eminent. Compare in this regard Mbiti (1969:1) when he describes Africans as being 'notoriously religious'. It would then be impossible to separate religion from other spheres of existence, implying that religion will play a role in society and politics. Based on this understanding of reality religion does have a social responsibility. The interconnectedness of things are better understood when Krüger's (1995:101) concept of conditionality is applied.

This article wants to delineate the two possible ways in which religion can stand in relation to social responsibilities. On the one hand religion is seen as autonomous but not superior to social matters. Both spheres co-exist peacefully. On the other hand it is obvious that religion and society need to interact and reciprocally influence. Before however describing and evaluating both positions, it is necessary to understand the concepts of religion and social responsibility.

2. What is Religion?

It remains an extremely difficult task to define religion (Smith 1991:17). To this, Braun (2000:4) and Schilderman (2014:176) concede. For Smith, the inadequate existing multitude of definitions for 'religion' is an indication that the term should be discarded as it has become unusable. It is not the purpose of this discussion to attempt addressing the problem of defining religion. This has been dealt with elsewhere (cf. Beyers 2010:2). Cox (2010:3–7) suggests that studying the groups of definitions has more value than studying the definitions themselves.

Smith's (1991) explanation of how religion ought to be viewed provides valuable insights. Understanding religion is never an unbiased endeavour. The culture of the researcher always plays a role. Culture contributes to the spectacles through which religion is viewed (1991:18). For too long, Smith argues (1991:52), has Western understanding determined the way in which religion is perceived, and that which can be deemed religious. Western thought has produced names for the world religions. The way of studying religions is the result of the Western scholarly processes.

A Western understanding of what constitutes religion caused scholars to divide the world into religious (i.e. everything resembling Western and European traditions and culture) as opposed to no-religion (i.e. everything non-Western) parts. Alongside this process, the Enlightenment developed the notion that knowledge resides only in facts. Facts can only be studied empirically. A study of the transcendental is therefore redundant since the transcendental proved to be inaccessible to empirical scrutiny. In contrast, human reaction and responses to the transcendental can be studied empirically. This idea already excluded many expressions of religions as it presumed all religions focus on transcendence as an objective divine existence. Not all religions follow this structure.

Smith (1991:53 footnote 2) suggests that, instead of referring to religion, it is more appropriate to talk about 'cumulative traditions'. Traditions have contexts and history. The concept of religion tends to call to mind a structured system of beliefs. This includes the understanding of faith. There are more words to refer to these phenomena that Western minds have provided with names over time (Smith 1991:52). Smith suggests names such as 'piety', 'reverence', 'faith', 'devotion', 'God-fearing'. These terms do not necessarily call to mind an organised system, emphasising that it is outdated to think of religions as monolithic blocks consisting of sets of fixed beliefs and practices existing parallel to one another, meeting and engaging with one another. Much rather we should think of religion in terms of fluent beliefs and practices being influenced and influencing others.

After carefully indicating that the concept of religion is in fact a concept originating from a Western (modern) stance of naming and analysing the human environment and behaviour, Smith comes up with a solution as to the problem of transposing the Western concept of religion onto world religions. His (Smith 1991:50) suggestion is to discard the term religion altogether. His argument maintains that the term religion is misleading,

confusing and unnecessary. The term religion hampers the understanding of people's faith and traditions. This hampering is caused by our attempt to conceptualise faith and traditions into what we refer to as religion. As indicated earlier, Smith recommends the terms piety, tradition, faith and religiosity in the place of religion. Wiredu (1998:32) argues that (an) African understanding(s) of religion differs from Western understanding(s) of reality. Laws applied to activities in the physical world in Western understanding does not exclude activities ascribed to spiritual activities in an African understanding.

Smith's suggestion can be employed as a method of studying the belief systems (or religions) of the world. The value of Smith's analysis lies in the making scholars aware that studying a religion is not complete without taking note of the religiosity or cumulative tradition lying at the foundation of the religious expressions.

The way in which Smith presents the object of study as cumulative traditions, piety or religiosity is important in an African context. Since the concept 'religion' has convincingly been proven by Smith to have a Western origin, it by default does not apply to what we want to study in an African context. When considering discovering the social responsibility of religion, it is indeed important to start off by asking about our understanding of religion. This article has a bias towards a Western understanding of the concept of religion, although different ways of understanding religion is mentioned and acknowledged here. This bias towards Christianity is evident already in the title to this article. Although the concept of 'heaven' rather has more meaning within the Abrahamic faiths, the intention is to illustrate how the actions qualifying as social responsibility is connected to and in relation to that which is considered sacred or 'holy', to use the fairly neutral concept of Rudolf Otto (1932).

3. What is Social Responsibility?

As how to define the concept social responsibility, several dimensions may assist us. McWilliams and Siegel (2001) define social responsibility as 'actions that appear to further some social good, beyond the interest of the firm and that which is required by law'. Corporate social responsibilities (CSR) is defined by the European Commission (2001) as 'a concept whereby companies integrate social and environmental concerns in their business operations and in

their interaction with their stakeholders on a voluntary basis'. Although these two definitions derive from a business point of view, it clarifies the general understanding of social responsibility.

Based on these insights I would suggest a definition for social responsibility as the voluntarily actions of members of society addressing social and environmental concerns in order to serve the social good. Social responsibility is therefore directed to give meaning and to heal and to provide in needs. It also reflects an attitude of a willingness to act upon injustice in society. Social responsibility then refers to the actions and attitudes of individuals and groups to participate in ensuring the survival and self-realisation of those in a particular society. Social responsibility refers to the things people do for and to society which others can or cannot do for themselves. It can even be described as assisting society to reach a level of wholeness or participation in mitigating processes in order to create harmony in society.

As to the relationship between religion and social responsibility research done by Brammer, Williams and Zinkin (2006) provides valuable insight. Their research focussed on the relationship between religious denominations and individual attitudes towards Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). Some of the important results of their research is worth mentioning.

The essence of religious involvement in social responsibility is for Brammer et al (2006:229) the moral and ethical prescriptions which are consistent with religious doctrines and that provide guidance for ethical conduct in society. Religious affiliated individuals make more ethical decisions in terms of judgment, action and behaviour which is based on the individual's religious values (Brammer *et al.* 2006:231), such as fairness, truthfulness and trustworthiness. Common religious values can be reduced to the one Golden Rule to treat others like you would want them to treat you (Brammer *et al.* 2006:231). This includes showing love and respect for others as these are expected to be shown reciprocally.

Brammer *et al.* (2006:231) also indicated how religious affiliated people are more prone to participate through business in social responsibility than the non-religious. Religious people seem to have an awareness and willingness to participate and react to the need of others, even if the others are not stakeholders in their business.

The fact of the matter is that not only religious people have an attitude

of willingness to address the need in society. Non-religious people may also exhibit a willingness to participate in social actions. The differentiation can be made between a social responsibility directed at merely human needs, closer defined as humanitarian and altruistic characteristics of such actions. On the other hand a religiously motivated participation in social responsibility may be encountered. The religious motivation can be causal (in terms of expectation of divine reward or salvation for good deeds performed) or legalistic (a divine command to love the other) or religious-ethical (a lifestyle exhibiting acts of love based on religious convictions). Even intra-religiously there might be different opinions and motivation as to participate in social responsibility. Within a particular religion there might exist different interpretations as to the desirability of and ways of participation in social responsibility. Two distinct lines can however be identified: social responsibility due to concern for human needs and social responsibility due to religious motivation.

The question would be why would religion take up responsibilities in society? The very ethical nature of religion is to help others, assist, heal, make a difference, provide meaning and protect the marginalised. These characteristics can be based on universal values and ethics to which religions subscribe (compare Brammer *et al.* 2006:229). From a religious point of view, participating in social issues may be to correct social injustices in order to establish a just and honest society. The correction to social issues introduced by religions may be an attempt to re-create an idealised environment on earth. One might say religions want to restore a paradise environment, bring about an utopia, re-creating 'heaven' on earth. The early Christian theologian Augustine (354-430 CE) divided reality into the idealised City of God as opposed to the City of Man (Earthly existence). Augustine envisioned an environment governed by divine principles where no evil or injustice exist. This idealised city of God however has not yet replaced the evil and unjust earthly City of Man where selfishness abounds. Religious participation in social issues may then be perceived as the attempt to bring about the downfall of the City of Man and replace it with the wonderful City of God, bringing 'heaven' close to earth. As we today still live in the City of Man, so to speak, it is an environment devoid of justice and abundance for all in society. Besides ethics, the way in which religions participate in social responsibilities today may be grounded in an utilitarian understanding of religion. Max Weber might be of some assistance here.

4. Social Responsibility and Religion

For Max Weber a sociological discussion of religion does not focus on religion but rather the effect religion has on human's social interaction and economic action (Weber 1966:xxi). Weber is not interested in the essence of what constitutes religion but much rather in the type of social behaviour religion constitutes (1966:1). Weber is focussed on determining the meaning of religious behaviour as exhibited by subjective experiences, ideas and purposes of the individuals concerned (Kippenberg 2011:72). It is clear for Weber that religious actions are casuistic (1966:1): religious actions are performed in order to achieve a specific end, which Weber believes is predominantly an economic concern.

For Weber (1966:xxvii) it is clear that there is no society which does not possess something that can be called religion. All societies have religion. Human relationships with the supernatural is functional. Weber (1966:xxviii,11) indicates how 'primitive man' seeks the assistance of the supernatural for earthly concerns (i.e. health, long life, assistance in war etc.). According to Weber (1966:11) the ancient Roman religion remained *religio,* which signifies a close bond between human and 'cultic formulae and a concern for the spirits *(numina)'*. The principle in Roman *religio* was that all actions in daily life have some religious significance (Weber 1966:11).

For Weber (1966:126) religion have different functions for different social classes[1]. Weber differentiates broadly the society of his time between the intellectuals and the laity (1966:125-126). For Weber (1966:119) the intellectuals have over the history of all major world religions played a decisive role in the development of religion. This is echoed by Berger (1999:10) when he identifies an 'international subculture' consisting of 'Western-type higher education', a 'globalized elite culture', which influences society. Berger (1999:11) suspects that in society religious upsurges are motivated not only by religious motives, but also by a populist protest and resistance against secular elite. It still needs to be investigated whether current political unrest and protests in South Africa are also due to populist protest against the secular elite Berger identifies. Due to the influential role intellectuals have played in the past, Berger (1999:13) suggests that a religious upsurge in the future might

[1] Whether the same structural differentiation exists today in all societies is questionable. The principle however that different levels of society have different expectations of religion still applies.

occur among the 'disenchanted post-modernist academics'. What we perhaps today see in South Africa is a combined effort by the disenfranchised and disillusioned labour class supported by the intellectual elite protesting against the inability of government to provide in the needs of society.

Both groups, intellectuals as well as laity, have different expectations of religion, according to Weber. For the intellectual strata of society religion assists humans to discover ultimate meaning of human existence, and thus to find unity with oneself, with fellow humans and with the cosmos (Weber 1966:125). The lower intellectual (laity) levels of society seek in religion a moral and ethical compass (Weber 1966:126). Salvation religion probably, according to Weber (1966:101), has its origin among socially privileged groups. For intellectuals religion provides salvation in as far as it provides in the inner need (Weber 1966:124). Such salvation is theoretical and systematic and not the kind of salvation from external conditions of despair which characterises the religion of the lower classes of society (Weber 1966:215). This theoretical and systematic approach to salvation of the intellectuals causes what Weber calls the 'flight from the world', characterising the religion of the intellectuals (1966:125).

Weber's differentiation of classes in society is not as simplistic as to divide society in two opposing categories: intellectuals and laity. The differentiation is must more complex. Especially within the lower middle class, Weber (1966:95) identifies a wide variety and even contrasting experiences of religion. The lower middle classes according to Weber (1966:96) tend towards congregational religion, salvation religion and towards rational, ethical religion. This tendency among the lower middle class is economically motivated. Middle class existence is not closely connected to nature as peasantry is (Weber 1966:97). This religious tendency among the lower middle classes is opposed to the tendency of the peasantry (Weber 1966:96).

Lower middle class existence is based on economic activity. Economic activity requires rational abilities from the middle class in terms of calculations and innovation. It is also clear for Weber (1966:97) that the lower middle class exists in a world with a utilitarian expectation: hard work will result in products to sell, selling requires exchange and compensation. This leads Weber to conclude that the lower middle classes live by a rational world view with an ethical understanding of labour (1966:97). The middle class also has the resources to assist and help lower classes who do not have access to similar resources.

It is clear from Weber's theory that different social classes have different functions for religion. For the economic privileged classes, religion does not need to produce salvation. Religion for the economic privileged has the function of legitimizing their life pattern and social status in society (Weber 1966:107). For Weber it is also clear that there is a connection between social well-being and divine approval. Good fortune experienced by the individual is therefore a sign of divine approval. The opposite being divine disapproval of existence as expressed in human misfortune (Weber 1966:108). This may relate to Brammer's (2006:231) contention that religious participating in social issues may be motivated differently according to religious convictions. Good deeds are divinely rewarded. Participating in society in order to bring about social good, may be divinely rewarded. Good fortune of the privileged are then legitimized religiously.

Religion is not static. Weber indicates that changes in religion are obvious to take place under certain conditions. When the privileged ruling classes loose political control or political influence, religion is determined to take on a salvific form (Weber 1966:121,122). Social responsibility can then be perceived to be one such salvific form religion can take on. Religion is then regarded as the 'saviour' of humankind in need. Religion is the last straw to grasp in this world filled with despair. Religions will enable people to share and assist the less-privileged. Religions will guide social behaviour towards a harmonious existence.

Weber reminds us of the social functionality of religion. Even participating in social responsibility may be with ulterior motivation: I participate in restoring social justice, but social good due to my participation is only the by-effect. The true goal is attaining selfishly divine reward upon participating in restoring social good.

A further implication of Weber is that religion is viewed as just another means to an end, and at that not a very honest means. According to the German philosopher, Reinhold Niebuhr good individuals filled with love for others, whether religiously motivated or not, could change the world. The moment when individuals unite in a group, the morality however change, no longer able to bring about social good. Social morality is questioned and critiqued by Niebuhr. Can religion really exercise its social responsibility to assist in attaining such a noble goal as social good?

For Niebuhr (1936) human nature cannot guarantee that it has the best interest for society at heart. For Niebuhr (1936:xi) the individual does have the

moral fibre to acknowledge the need of others and be able to refrain from egoistically searching for their own good. Individuals may even have sympathy and consideration for others. They may have a sense of justice (Niebuhr 1936:xi). This however proves difficult for groups or society at large. Collectively the moral egoism of individuals tend to create an immoral society (1936:xi) where the needs of members of society is ignored and each individual search egoistically for its own good. Niebuhr's (1936:xii) argument is directed against those in society who argue that religious people will maintain the good moral fibre in society directing society towards that which is good for all. Human collective behaviour results from human natural impulses which cannot be checked by reason or conscience. Collective human power may result in oppression of others. This power-hold cannot be dislodged unless power, and not reason, is used against it (Niebuhr 1926:xii). It is no longer acceptable to argue that gradual development of human intelligence will result in resolving social problems.

The reasons for this difference in moral behaviour between individuals and groups is on the one hand the absence of what Niebuhr (1936:xii) calls a 'rational social force', keeping natural impulses of society in check, and on the other hand the compounded egoistic impulses of individuals resulting in a collective egoism.

For Niebuhr social problems cannot be resolved only through endeavouring to reach 'social intelligence' (1936:xiv), but '... social injustice cannot be resolved by moral and rational suasion alone, … Conflict is inevitable' (Niebuhr 1936:xv). This is confirmed when Niebuhr indicates that conflict caused by the uneven distribution of power in society cannot be resolved rationally as long as power is distributed unequally (Niebuhr 1936:xvii). To appeal to the morality of the oppressing party to end injustice, will result in no solution. As this is Niebuhr's argument: '… naïve confidence in the moral capacity of collective man …' will not bring about social change (1936:xix). This naivety is to be observed with some religious leaders believing that an oppressive government will act with justice once reminded of their moral obligation towards justice in society. Those thinking religion or reason can solve social problems fail to '… recognise the stubborn resistance of group egoism to all moral and inclusive social objectives …' (Niebuhr 1936:xx). The bottom line for Niebuhr is that the overestimation of human virtue and moral capacity leads to the failure of searching for solutions within religion and reason to bring about social good.

As to this sceptic understanding of the role of religiously induced morals and ethics and the role of reason, Niebuhr concludes that conflict will inevitable mark differences between social groups. Not ethics but politics should govern inter-group relations (Niebuhr 1936:xiii).

In this regard Niebuhr does identify a social responsibility of religion. For him religion must contribute through education to the humanising of individuals and purge society of as much of egoism as possible (1936:xxiv). This can lead to a situation where the needs of others in society are recognised and the equality of all in society is acknowledged. The social responsibility of religion is for Niebuhr therefore limited to the individual. Due to the low moral capacity of society group morality will not be changed even by religious intervention.

5. Positions Religion can Take on Towards Social Responsibility

If religion then does participate in social responsibilities, how should religion go about this participation? There are two possible existing ways how people perceive the presence of religion in society.

Position 1

The main function of religion is to maintain vertical relations with the divine. This is based on an understanding of religion as human relation with the transcendental (the holy). This relation is culturally and contextually determined. The statement on the function of religion also assumes with bias the location of the transcendental in the realm above as is the presentation within Abrahamic faiths. All religions can however relate to this construct of religion in terms of the human relationship to that which is considered to be of ultimate meaning.

Religion is traditionally perceived to be concerned with higher faculties (i.e. values and spiritual matters). Religion is concerned with the relationship between humans and the spiritual realm, the transcendental or 'The Holy' as Otto (1932) referred to it. Existence on earth is then a replication of the existence of the divine: love and peace and harmony. It can be metaphorically stated that this position focuses on 'as it is in heaven'.

Religion can educate citizens, infusing them with moral values to act as autonomous and responsible individuals in society. As institution religion however cannot act as pressure group. Then religion will exercise power horizontally, misdirecting its actual focus away from that which is considered to be the main focus of religion. In this position religion can only speak out against social injustices and oppression in society. Religion as institution cannot participate in any social struggle, as its focus is on maintaining relationship with the divine[2]. The only social relevance religion has is to provide moral support for society in its struggles. If religion is concerned with earthly existence it is only interested in creating utopia; a society which reflects a heaven-like harmony of peace and abundance for all.

This position may be resembled among many different religious orientations and even among those with a preference not to affiliate with any religion. Mysticism and orthodoxy may reflect this position as well.

Position 2

This position views religion as a purely social phenomenon where individuals with similar convictions and needs to express spirituality form a natural group in society. Religion as a naturally formed group is immersed in society and its struggles. Religion then is perceived to have the task to mobilise and support individuals to combat injustice and oppression. Religion can become the leader in social struggles, getting its proverbial hands dirty with social matters. Religion must participate in social struggle as it is concerned with human dignity and wholeness. Religion then becomes completely a social institution similar to many other social institutions which are fully engaged with human needs. Religion can participate in social matters under the guise of being guided by a religiously inspired code of ethics. In this position the focus of religion is on earthly matters (horizontal relations) only. This position can metaphorically be labelled as focussed on 'as it is on earth'.

This orientation of religion can be witnessed among many faith based organizations focussing on accomplishing some social goal (i.e. health, education, human rights). Their struggle is morally based and grounded within some religious system.

[2] Again a bias towards Abrahamic faiths is evident here.

6. Dangers of Social Responsibility

These two positions described above may lead each in its own case to some precarious consequences. The participation of religion in any social struggle is limited. Some of these limitations include reductionism, selectivism, antagonism and utopianism.

Reductionism

Religious participation in social issues may lead to reducing the focus of religion to either ethics, social injustices or focussing on the need of humanity. Within these reductionist positions religion loses its *sui generis* character and becomes similar in motivation and expression to other social groups, such as social awareness groups and NGO's. The focus of religion is then limited to humanitarian needs.

Selectivism

Religion participating in social matters is guided by the culturally determined ethics and morals of a particular religious community. If religion elects the universal ethics governing society it again ends up in reducing its focus to common human good. When selecting values and ethics to govern its social participation religion may end up electing a particular set of values. Whose values and ethics will that be? Religion participating in social matters cannot represent the interests of only one particular group in society. Religion cannot represent electively and exclusively. It must represent common human interest.

Antagonism

This danger is linked to the previous danger. When religions end up as representatives of different factions in society. Religions endeavouring to accomplish the common good in society may end up opposing one another as they drive opposing agendas in society. We see this often in social struggles when religious factions support opposing political positions in society.

Utopianism

The social ideal religions try and create may be so idealised that it can never

be accomplishable. The perceived reality can never become empirical reality. Religions then end up chasing abstractions unable to realise them in a social context. Envisioning an environment devoid of injustice and oppression and poverty might be the ideal, but the accomplishment of it may be totally unrealistic. In this sense religions cannot contribute to the alienation of society from reality. That what is sociably achievable must be presented in real terms. Religion can have this social responsibility of maintaining a sober awareness of reality. Simultaneously religion must maintain the balance of the ideal as set up over against reality. This leads to a new position as opposed to the two positions (Position 1 and Position 2) already discussed above.

7. New Position

Religion must bridge alienation. The divide between heaven and earth, the divide between ideal and reality must be overcome. In a newly suggested Position 3, the vertical (Position 1 'As it is in heaven') and horizontal position (Position 2 'As it is on earth') are combined as to create an environment called Position 3 'As on earth as it is in heaven'. The goal is to abide on earth by divine example.

Within Position 3 people with religious convictions participate in social struggle, speaking out against injustices, participate passively in peaceful protests, giving voice to the marginalised, seeking help for those who are in need. This position seeks participation on a broader level. Religious groups in society unite in order to speak out against injustices together. The focus is on ecumenical (interfaith, inter-religious) participation.

Individuals are trained and encouraged to participate in social issues in a responsible way. Religions as institutions do not participate. Religions support individuals to act responsibly (compare Brammer *et al.* 2006:231). Individuals act in such a way as they expect others to treat them (Brammer *et al.* 2006:231). The focus on the individual is due to Niebuhr (1936:xx) identifying that the moral fibre of society is not as strong as the moral convictions of the individual.

Religions can instil in individuals the responsibility of sharing. Recognising the need of others and acknowledging the equality of members of society is already an attempt at bridging the alienation between individuals. If there is one way in which religion can contribute to what Niebuhr (1936:xxiv) refers to as the 'humanising of the individual', religion can teach the individual

about the importance of giving. Giving is not only providing in the need of others, but giving is recognising the needs others may have and acknowledging the equality of all members of society.

8. Sharing the Gift

Religion has the social responsibility to instil the value of sharing. In his seminal work, *The Gift* (1990), Marcel Mauss describes the way in which the actions of sharing and giving functioned within primitive societies.

Marcel Mauss' research during the early 20th century was to establish the logical reasons why people in society act in certain ways. There must be a logical reason behind behaviour. The research by Mauss must be read against the background of the social theory of utilitarianism. Utilitarianism according to Caillé (2012:3) is the theory that humans as individuals are only interested in that which holds advantage and benefit for them. The individual tries along rational thoughts to optimise pleasure and luck and minimalize discomfort and pain. All human action in society can be reduced to instrumental rationalism. Nobody merely acts, perform actions or just do things. All actions is preceded by a thorough process of rational contemplation. Humans act consciously.

Utilitarianism assumes that humans act in order to accomplish something. Actions are directed at attaining a particular goal. Our actions are not clinically or mechanically. We think before we act. At times we may act unconsciously but then it is actions based on traditional behaviour at reaching a particular goal. Humans are constantly considering what is in it for me? How can I attain maximum benefit with the least effort?

This social theory guided Mauss in his search for the reasons behind human actions. Mauss in following Durkheim, tries to indicate that there might be different reasons than economic reasons why people perform actions. In order to test his hypothesis, Mauss investigates the phenomenon of the gift as it functioned among primal cultures. For Mauss the purpose is to determine whether in a modern context people still give with the same primitive principles in mind. What is the logic behind actions to give and to share?

Mauss focusses his research on the communities living on the Pacific Ocean islands as well as Australia and tribal communities in North America. These communities tend to exhibit the traditions and customs of the most primitive communities and cultures. How these communities exist, Mauss reckons, is an indication of how all primitive communities existed. Their

actions and customs reveal something of the principles guiding early human behaviour, revealing something of original human nature.

In a changing environment, we today live in a world governed by different principles than early human societies. Our question would be then to determine what principles should govern our societies today to enable an existence where all in society share in resources necessary for all. Religions as facilitators to enable the sharing of resources can perhaps learn from early societies what principles should guide our actions.

To give, to share seems like good practice today, almost as logical behaviour. Mauss indicates that what we today accept as logical and spontaneity was governed in earlier times by strict rules, unwritten laws governing actions of individuals in societies.

In primal and ancient agrarian communities to give and to share was a rule, a law. To give functioned along three principles: to give, to receive and to give in return (Mauss 1990:39). The principle to give was considered a reciprocal, causal and respectful action expected from all.

Reciprocality

Reciprocality governed all actions in primitive communities. In modern political and economic systems reciprocality still functions as guiding principle (Caillé 2012:1). Reciprocality refers to the mathematical principle of equilibrium. A balance in relations must be maintained. In social context this implies that when one party gives a gift, the expectation is that the other party will also give a gift of equal value.

A gift may not be turned away. That is a sign of animosity, just as is not giving a gift in return (Mauss 1990:13, 41). Just as insulting is giving a gift of lesser value in return.

The principle of giving a gift does not apply to the giving of alms and charity (Caillé 2012:5). The gifts under questions are mere symbols (Caillé 2012:5). Mauss indicated that the gifts to be given does hold some spiritual dimension. The gift becomes an expression of the spirit of the giver. The spirit of the giver is in fact mixed with the gift itself (Mauss 1990:20). By giving the giver is in fact giving something of him-/herself. The one receiving receives a gift from the heart of the other and needs to answer in similar fashion. Thus the lives of the one giving and the one receiving are inextricable connected (Mauss 1990:20).

The exchange of the gift can even be framed within the structure of honour and shame. By giving the individual establishes his/her own status and position of honour in society (Caillé 2012:5). By not giving the individual loses a position of status and honour and accumulates shame. To give is expected from everyone in society, not only the affluent who has much to give. The abundance of the harvest, or the spoils of the hunt becomes occasions to share with fellow members of society. By not inviting others to share the giver ends up with shame. Caillé (2012:5) indicates that it might happen that the one giving may end in a situation where he/she ends up with insufficient resources. Such conditions qualifies for a bigger amount of honour.

Gifts are Symbolic

The gift may in some cases have no utilitarian value. Mauss indicated how in some situations people gave one another a gift of a shell, with no obvious use besides its aesthetic value (Mauss 1990:23). The willingness to exchange gifts is a symbol of the recognition of established social relations (Caillé 2012:5). The assumption underlying the principle is an egalitarian society where everyone possess something. All have something to give. By giving people recognise and confirm the bonds binding them together. By not giving, social bonds are broken.

Causality

Mauss identifies a direct link between giving and receiving (1990:22). The one does not exclude the other but follows logically on the other. There exists a logical sequence: I give and you give (*do ut des*) (Mauss 1990:ix). The causal principle has often been applied within tribal religions. Sacrifices to the gods had an expectation of the gods respond upon receiving a gift by delivering a gift in return (Mauss 1990:ix).

There exists a responsibility in society to give, to receive and to respond with a gift in return (Mauss 1990:43). An invisible force governs this obligation and responsibility (Mauss 1990:43). Relationships are maintained by the constant giving of gifts. The response of a gift can be expected: one who receives a gift must respond with a gift of equal value. By not giving a gift relations break down and the one not giving loses status and accumulates shame in society.

This principle identified by Mauss confirms the anti-utilitarian principle in society. Mauss proves that the social action of giving has no rational, selfishly motivated goal. The only way to explain this responsibility of giving is through the logic of sympathy (Caillé 2012;6). Each individual does experience some benefit and advantage in the relationship where gifts are exchanged. But this comes at a price. I can only receive once I have given. Within this dichotomy selfishness becomes unselfishness (Caillé 2012:6).

Honour and Shame

Within the structure of honour and shame the responsibility to give becomes a means to accumulate honour. To give is therefore not a veiled attempt at acquiring wealth nor power, but it is the urge to receive acknowledgement in society (Caillé 2012:7). Mauss wanted to indicate that the element of the gift causes humans to function anti-utilitarian. Humans do not seek with every action for that which holds value, pleasure and luck, but humans have the deep urge to acquire acknowledgement within society and be known as a giver (Caillé 2012:7). By giving the individual receives honour in society. The opposite of course also applies. By not giving the individual acquires shame.
The guiding principle for social behaviour becomes honour. Honour is the commodity which are competed for. Honour is assigned and cannot be claimed. The individual is therefore dependent on society for recognition. The individual needs to keep on giving in order to be regarded as a giver. A society aware of the needs of others, need to be givers of gifts. Religions can remind society of this guiding principle to be givers to and sharers with others. By reminding others of the responsibility of reciprocal giving, taking care of those in need, and reaffirming relations through the gift, society reflects something of a harmony only present through divine ordination. A society willing to give and thereby reaffirming relations are objecting to alienation and seeking reconnection with one another. A society willing to give and share is a place where heaven and earth meet.

9. Conclusion

Religions seem undeniable to have a social responsibility. Even accepting the fact of having a social responsibility there are some conditions to adhere to.

Niebuhr's warning of the deep seeded immoral nature of humankind must be a warning. Group morality cannot be trusted to bring about social good. Niebuhr suggests that religion has a social responsibility only towards the individual; humanising the individual and purging egoism from the individuals as much as possible. This bridges the schism of alienation between individuals in society.

The utilitarian principle guiding human behaviour in society provides another warning in the sense that human actions must always be considered as selfishly directed at the own goal and benefit. The warning of reductionism must also be kept in mind. Social responsibility of religions can easily be reduced to humanitarian and altruistic purposes, helping humankind for the sake of humankind. The focus cannot be on earthly needs only. Neither can the focus remain on recreating 'heaven' on earth, fixating on the utopian paradise-like existence wished for by all humans. A balance is necessary.

This article suggests a balance of responsible social responsibility. Religions cannot shy away from their responsibility to assist society in realising their own existence. But earthly existence is not only material. Religions provide a spiritual dimension by encouraging humans to treat one another with respect, recognising the humanity and value of human life in the other, mending alienation. To give to others, is not an obligation, but a reciprocal responsibility. Religions have to instil in human ethical fibre the principle of sharing with one another. Only through recognising the guiding principle of giving the Gift to others, can society acknowledge their social responsibility towards fellow members of society. To make society aware of this responsibility, is the responsibility of religions.

References

Augustine, St. 1950. *The City of God.* Dods, M. (trans.). New York: The Modern Library: A Division of Random House.

Berger, P.L. 1999. The Desecularization of the World. In Berger, P.L. (ed.): *The Desecularization of the World: Resurgent Religion and World Politics.* Grand Rapids, Michigan: WB Eerdmans Publishing Company.

Beyers, J. 2010. What is Religion? An African Understanding. *HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies* 66,1: Art. #341, 8 pages. DOI: 10.4102/hts.v66i1.34.

Brammer, S., G. Williams & J. Zinkin 2006. Religion and Attitudes to Corporate Social Responsibility in a large Cross-Country Sample. *Journal of Business Ethics* 71, 229-243.

Braun, W. 2000. Religion. In Braun, W. & T. McCutcheon (ed.): *Guide to the Study of Religion.* Cassell: London.

Caillé, A. 2012. *Anti-Utilitarianism, Economics and the Gift-paradigm.* Available at: www.revuedumauss.com.fr/media/ACstake.pdf. (Accessed on 30 April 2012.)

Cox, J.L. 2010. *An Introduction to the Phenomenology of Religion.* New York: Continuum Publishing Group.

European Commission 2001. Promoting a European Framework for Corporate Social Responsibility. Green Paper, 264, Brussels, Belgium.

Goosen, D.P. 2009. Tussen Katedrale en Kastele: Oor die Teologies-politieke Probleem. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 65,1: Art. #155, 10 pages. DOI: 10.4102/hts.v65i1.155.

Kippenberg, H.G. 2011. Max Weber: Religion and Modernization. In Clarke, P.B. (ed.): *The Oxford Handbook of the Sociology of Religion.* Oxford University Press: Oxford.

Krüger, J.S. 1995. *Along Edges: Religion in South Africa.* Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Mauss, M. 1990. *The Gift: The Form and Reason for Exchange in Archaic Societies*. Halls, H.D. (trans.). New York: W.W. Norton.

McWilliams, A. & D. Siegel 2001. Corporate Social Responsibility: A Theory of the Firm Perspective. *Academy of Management Review* 26, 117-127.

Mbiti, J.S. [1969] 1989. *African Religions and Philosophy.* Second Edition. Heinemann: Gaborone, Botswana.

Niebuhr, R. 1936. *Moral Man and Immoral Society: A Study in Ethics and Politics.* Charles Scribner's Sons: New York.

Otto, R. 1932. *Das Heilige: über das Irrationale in der Idee des Göttlichen und sein Verhältnis zum Rationale.* München: C.H. Beck'sche Verlag Buchhandlung.

Schilderman, H. 2014. Defining Religion: A Humanities Perspective. In Schilderman, H. (ed.): *The Concept of Religion: Defining and Measuring Contemporary Beliefs and Practices.* Brill: Leiden.

Smith, W.C. 1991. *The Meaning and End of Religion.* Fortress Press: Minneapolis.

Stone, S. 2017. S.A. Council of Churches Releases Scathing Report on State

Capture. *The Citizen* 2017-05-08. Available at: www.city-press.news24.com/News/sas-council-of-churches-releases-scathing-report-on-state-capture-20170518. (Accessed on 12 June 2017.)

Weber, M. 1966. *The Sociology of Religion.* Fischoff, E. (trans.). London: Methuen and Co.

Wiredu, K. 1998. Toward Decolonizing African Philosophy and Religion. *African Studies Quarterly* 1,4: 17 - 46.

Jaco Beyers
Department Science of Religion and Missiology
University of Pretoria
jaco.beyers@up.ac.za

Contributors

Jaco Beyers is associate professor in Science of Religion and programme manager for Biblical and Religion Studies at the University of Pretoria. After completion of his undergraduate studies at the University of Pretoria he served as church minister. During this period he completed post-graduate studies. He attended and studied at the Universities of Bayreuth, Marburg and Heidelberg in Germany. He was also recently guest lecturer at the University of Vienna (2014) and University of Porto (2017). Fields of research include world religions, secularisation and theology of religions. Contact details:

Suleiman Chembea holds a PhD in Islamic studies from the Bayreuth International Graduate School of African Studies (BIGSAS), University of Bayreuth, Germany; Master of Arts (Religion), and Bachelor of Education (Arts) Degrees from Moi University, Kenya. He served as Associate Lecturer of Religion at Moi and Mount- Kenya Universities, Mombasa Campuses. His research interests include *waqf*s (Religious endowments), Religious acculturation, Religion and Politics, and Muslim-Christian relations. Contact details: chembea.suleiman@uni-bayreuth.de

Joseph Chita holds a Masters of Education in Religious Studies from the University of Zambia and Masters in International Education and Development (Oslo Metropolitan University). He coordinated the Norwegian Masters (NOMA) – sandwich programme (Oslo Metropolitan University, Afhad University for Women, and The University of Zambia). He is a lecturer in the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Zambia. His area of interest in research includes Religion and society. Contact details: chonochitajoseph@gmail.com; joseph.chita@unza.zm

Ezra Chitando is a Professor in History and Phenomenology of Religion in the Department of Religious Studies, Classics and Philosophy at the University

of Zimbabwe and Theology Consultant on HIV and AIDS for the World Council of Churches. He holds a Dphil from the University of Zimbabwe. He has published on various themes in sole authored volumes, edited books, refereed journals and chapters in books.

Zorodzai Dube holds a PhD in New Testament studies from the University of Oslo. Currently he is senior lecturer in New Testament Studies at the university of Pretoria. His research interests are in African Biblical hermeneutics, Embodiment hermeneutics and Healing during the New Testament times. Contact details: zoro.dube@up.ac.za

AbdulGafar Olawale Fahm is a native of Nigeria. He received his B.A. in Islamic Studies from University of Ilorin, Nigeria. He obtained his M.A. from International Islamic University Malaysia and his Ph.D. in the same University. His areas of interest are Islamic Spiritual Culture, Contemporary Issues, and Islamic Thought. In addition, Dr. Fahm is a Lecturer in Department of Religions, University of Ilorin, Nigeria. He has published papers in various journals amongst which is "Islam as an Embodied Faith for the Young Minds: Aisha Lemu and Religious Education in Nigeria" in *Journal of Religious Education* and "Islamic Ethics and Stem Cell Research" published in *Islam and Civilisational Renewal*. Contact details: fahm.ao@unilorin.edu.ng

Roderick Hewitt is a graduate of Kings College, University of London with MPhil and PhD in theology. He has served as the Academic Leader for Theology and Ethics and also for Research and Higher Degrees in the School of Religion Philosophy and Classics, University of Kwa Zulu Natal, South Africa. He is Associate Professor in Systematic Theology and lectures in African Theologies in the Diaspora, Ecumenical Theology and Missiology. In addition to his peer reviewed journal articles and book chapters he has co-edited books including the acclaimed 2016 WCC /Regnum Book, "Ecumenical Missiology- Changing Landscapes and New Conceptions of Mission". His seminal Book is the 2012 Cluster publication, Church and Culture. Professor Hewitt is a Jamaican with global ecumenical experience, having served as an Executive staff with responsibilities for Education in Mission for the Council for World Mission and later for two terms as its Moderator. He currently serves the organization as Chairman for its Programme Reference Group and a

consultant with the WCC Conference on World Mission and Evangelism and the World Communion of Reformed Churches. Contact details: Hewitt@ukzn.ac.za

Dennis Masaka holds a Doctorate in Philosophy from the University of South Africa (UNISA). He teaches philosophy at Great Zimbabwe University in Zimbabwe where he is a senior lecturer in the Department of Philosophy & Religious Studies. Currently, his main research focus is on the quest for epistemic liberation for the subaltern communities with a special focus on Africa. Contact details: dennis.masaka@gmail.com; and dmasaka@gzu.ac.zw

Loreen Maseno is a Humboldt Fellow, University of Bayreuth, Germany. She has more than twelve years of teaching experience at undergraduate and graduate levels, both locally and internationally. Her research interests include Feminist theology and ecology, Gender and sexuality, African literature and Theology, Religion and Media. Additionally, she is a Senior Lecturer, Department of Religion, Theology and Philosophy, Maseno University. Contact details: loreenmas@gmail.com

Sarah Yeukai Mukungurutse is a lecturer at the Zimbabwe Open University in Zimbabwe where she is a Programme Coordinator in the Department of Languages and Literature Studies. Her research interests include communication, language and literature as well ODL issues. She is currently pursuing her PhD studies at the University of Free State in South Africa. Contact details: sarahyeukai@gmail.com, mukungurutses@zou.ac.zw

Nelly Mwale lectures at the University of Zambia in the Department of Religious Studies. Her research interests are in Catholicism and the public sphere, religion and education, African Religions, and Zambian Church history. She has widely published on these areas. She holds a Master of Education in Religious Studies from the University of Zambia. Contact details: nelmwa@gmail.com/nelly.mwale@unza.zm.

Henrietta Nyamnjoh is a research fellow at African Centre for Cities, University of Cape Town. She was a 2017 Carnegie Fellow through the African Humanities Program, and during her tenure researched on Religion and healing among Cameroonian migrants in Cape Town. Her research interests include

migration and mobility, transnational studies, and migrants' urban transformation/appropriation and migration and health. Additionally, she is also interested in understanding religion in the context of migration and migrants' experiences of seeking health care in Cape Town and Johannesburg. Henrietta has researched and published on migrants' appropriation of Information and Communication Technologies, Hometown Associations and migrants' everyday lives. Contact details: henrietta.nyamnjoh@uct.ac.za

Damaris Seleina Parsitau (Ph.D.) is a Sociologist of Religion and Gender with a focus on Pentecostal Christianity and Gender. She is also the Director of the Institute of Women, Gender and Development Studies (2012-2018) at Egerton University in Kenya, a Centre of excellence in gender research, leadership, mentorship, policy making and advocacy for gender equity and equality in Kenya. Dr Parsitau is also the immediate former Echidna Global Scholar 2017 at the Brookings Institutions, Centre for Universal Education (CUE), Washington DC, USA. Parsitau holds a Ph.D in Religion, Gender and Public Life from (Kenyatta University), an MA in Sociology of Religion (University of Nairobi) and a Bachelor of Arts in History, Egerton University. Currently, is a visiting Research Associate and Fellow at the College of Williams and Mary in Williamsburg, in Virginia USA and the University of South Africa (UNISA) respectively. Parsitau has previously held Visiting Research Fellowships at the University of Cambridge in the UK and the University of Edinburgh in Scotland. Parsitau has over twenty years' experience in teaching, research, leadership training and mentorship. She is also well travelled and is highly published in peer reviewed journals and book chapters, with two forthcoming manuscripts. Parsitau has a strong multi-disciplinary background and is well grounded in social science research. Contact details: dparsitau@yahoo.com

Storia Cynthia Seitisho is an ordained Minister of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa. She holds a Master of Theology Degree in Gender, Religion and Health with the University of KwaZulu-Natal. She is currently serving in the Limpopo District, Letaba Circuit where her research in food autonomy and maternal health led to the establishment of a vegetable garden in the remote village of Mashobye. Her passion is the empowerment of women in the rural areas of Sub-Saharan Africa and Southern Africa in particular. Contact details: storias@msn.com

Lilian Cheelo Siwila is a lecturer in the School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics. She is currently the Programme leader for Systematic Theology. She has also worked extensively in the field of Gender and sexuality, Theology and Culture. She is a member of the Circle of Concerned African Women Theologians, CHART, Ujamaa and AARS. Her research interests include Gender and Culture, Sexual and reproductive health and its interface with Theology, and Social and economic trends in contemporary theologies. Contact details: Siwila@ukzn.ac.za

Johannes A. Smit (DLitt) is a graduate of the University of Durban-Westville (now University of KwaZulu-Natal), founding editor of the SAPSE journal *Alter*nation and served as research chair of the Humanities for some years. He has a lifelong commitment to interdisciplinary learning and critical research capacity development in the Arts and Humanities. He is former Dean and Head of School of the School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics, as well as of the School of Arts (Acting) at UKZN. He teaches Comparative Religion (main focus Christianity), and is the founder of the postgraduate Programme in Religion and Social Transformation in 2000. Contact details: smitj@ ukzn.ac.za

*Alter*nation
Guidelines for Contributors

Manuscripts must be submitted in English (UK). If quotations from other languages appear in the manuscript, place the original in a footnote and a dynamic-equivalent translation in the body of the text or both in the text.

Contributors must submit one computer-generated copy of the manuscript to the editor(s). The computer-generated copy must be in Word for Windows, and must have an Abstract and Keywords. It must also be submitted in the Alternation style.

Manuscripts should range between 5000-10000 and book reviews between 800-1200 words. However, longer articles may he considered for publication.

Attach a cover page containing the following information: The corresponding author's full name, address, e-mail address, position, department, university/ institution, and telephone/ fax numbers. A brief summary of the biodate of all authors must be attached too.

Maps, diagrams and posters must be presented in print-ready form. Clear black and white or colour digitised photos (postcard size) or diagrams in pdf or jpeg may also be submitted.

Use footnotes sparingly. In order to enhance the value of the interaction between notes and text, we use footnotes and not endnotes.

Authors may use their own numbering systems in the manuscript.

Except for bibliographical references, abbreviations must include full stops. The abbreviations (e.a.) = 'emphasis added'; (e.i.o.) = 'emphasis in original'; (i.a.) or [...] = 'insertion added' may be used.

The full bibliographical details of sources are provided only once at the end of the manuscript under **References**. References in the body of the manuscript should follow the following convention: Mkhize (2017:14) argues .... or, at the end of a reference/quotation: .... (Ngwenya 2017:20f).

The surname and initials of authors as these appears in the source must be used in the **References** section.

Review articles and book reviews must include a title as well as the following information concerning the book reviewed: title, author, place of publication, publisher, date of publication, number of pages and the ISBN number.

In the text as well as the **References**, all book, journal, newspaper and magazine titles must be in italics.

The format for the References section is as follows:

Journal article by one author

Fulela, B. 2008. Checking the Post: Derrida and the Apartheid Debate. *Alternation* 15,2: 11 – 37. Available at: http://alternation.ukzn.ac.za/Files/docs/15.2/02%20Fulela.pdf. (Accessed on 08 May 2017.)

Journal article by two authors

Mkhize, N. & N. Ndimande-Hlongwa 2014. African Languages, Indigenous Knowledge Systems (IKS), and the Transformation of the Humanities and Social Sciences in Higher Education. *Alternation* 21,2: 10 – 37. Available at: http://alternation.ukzn.ac.za/Files/docs/21.2/02%20Mkh.pdf. (Accessed on 08 May 2017.)

Book by one author

Moran, S. 2009. *Representing Bushmen: South Africa and the Origin of Language.* Rochester: University of Rochester Press. (Rochester Studies in African History and the Diaspora, Book 38.)

Book by one editor

Smit, J.A. (ed.) 1999. *Body, Identity, Sub-cultures and Repression in Texts from Africa.* Durban: CSSALL.

Book by two editors

Dhunpath, R. & R. Vithal (eds.) 2012. *Alternative Access to Higher Education: Underprepared Students or Underprepared Institutions?* Cape Town: Pearson Publishers.

Chapter in an edited book

Smit, J.A. & J. van Wyk 2001. Literary Studies in Post-apartheid South Africa. In Zegeye, A. & R. Kriger (eds.): *Culture in the New South Africa after Apartheid.* Volume 2. Cape Town: Kwela Books & History on Line.

Translated book

Foucault, M. 1977. *Discipline and Punish.* Sheridan, A. (trans.). New York: Pantheon.

Online resource

Jansen, J. & P. Vale (Co-chairs.) 2011. *Consensus Study on the State of the Humanities in South Africa: Status, Prospects and Strategies.* Pretoria: Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf). Available at: https://www.assaf.org.za/files/2011/09/2011-Humanity-final-proof-11-August-2011.pdf. (Accessed on 08 May 2017.)

***Alter*nation Special Edition 19, 2017**
Electronic ISSN 2519-5476

Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of the Arts and Humanities in Southern Africa

ARTICLES

Johannes A. Smit, Lilian Siwila and Denzil Chetty Editorial: Religion and Social Responsibility 1
Johannes A. Smit Social Responsibility and Power I: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions For and On Behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) 12
Johannes A. Smit Social Responsibility and Power II: J.T. van der Kemp's Interventions For and On Behalf of the Khoikhoi on the Eastern Cape Frontier (1801 – 1806) 45
S.A. Chembea *Waqf*s and the Dynamics of Muslim Charity in Secular Milieus, Kenya, 1900 – 2010 88
Roderick R. Hewitt Ecclesial Leadership and Social Responsibility within the African Context of Economic Injustice 115
Nelly Mwale and Joseph Chita The Church's Social Responsibility in Zambia: The Catholic Response to the 2016 Prejudiced Attacks on 'Others' 132
Storia Sietisho and *Lilian Cheelo Siwila* Religion as Situated Knowledge for Social Transformation: The Case of the Mashobye Women's Manyano of Limpopo Province 157
AbdulGafar Olawale Fahm Muslim Women and Social Responsibility in Nigeria: Contributions of the Federation of Muslim Women's Associations in Nigeria (FOMWAN) 175
Zorodzai Dube Theorising Steve Biko's 'Human Face' Challenge alongside Gabriel Marcel's Embodied Hermeneutics 192
Dennis Masaka and *Sarah Yeukai Mukungurutse* Confronting the Exclusive Dominance of Christianity in Zimbabwe's Advanced Level Divinity Syllabus through Africanisation 206
Ezra Chitando, Henrietta Nyamnjoh and *Damaris Parsitau* 'Citizens of both Heaven and Earth': Pentecostalism and Social Transformation in South Africa, Zimbabwe and Kenya 232
Loreen Maseno 'The Glory is Here!' Faith Brands and Rituals of Self-Affirmation for Social Responsibility in Kenya 252
Jaco Beyers Where 'Heaven' and Earth Meet: Religion and Social Responsibility 268
Contributors 290

PRINT CONNECTION Tel (031) 202-7766; 202-7766